

DOCKETED

Docket Number:	16-OIR-06
Project Title:	Senate Bill 350 Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group
TN #:	227139
Document Title:	Draft Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group 2018 Annual Report
Description:	Item 3a. Draft Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group 2018 Annual Report
Filer:	Kristy Chew
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	2/21/2019 3:59:24 PM
Docketed Date:	2/21/2019

DRAFT

**Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group
2018 Annual Report**

**Version 1.0
February 21, 2019**

Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group Purpose

The purpose of the [Disadvantaged Communities] Advisory Group pursuant to Pub. Util. Code § 400(g), is to advise the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) and the California Energy Commission (Energy Commission) regarding the development, implementation, and impacts of proposed programs related to the Clean Energy and Pollution Reduction Act of 2015 (also known as Senate Bill 350) in disadvantaged communities.

The Advisory [G]roup will review and advise the CPUC and Energy Commission on proposed programs established in compliance with SB 350.

Specifically, the Advisory Group will provide advice on programs related to renewable energy, energy efficiency, transportation electrification, distributed generation and clean energy research and development programs and determine whether those proposed programs will be effective and useful in disadvantaged communities.

- *Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group Charter*

~ In Memory of Waudieur Rucker-Hughes ~



Photo Credit: File photo by Stan Lim, [The Press-Enterprise/SCNG](#)

Commented [JG1]: This is a proposed inclusion, either with or without the photo. If the DACAG wishes to use the photo, we will want to make sure the photo credit / permission is acceptable to the *Press Enterprise*.

Table of Contents

Summary.....	5
2018 DACAG Members.....	5
2018 Priorities.....	6
Equity Framework.....	7
Overview.....	7
DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ADVISORY GROUP.....	7
EQUITY FRAMEWORK.....	7
Definition of Disadvantaged Communities.....	8
Process for Comments and Input Activities.....	9
Mechanism to Comment on Existing and Emerging Programs.....	9
Comment Activity.....	10
Priority Workgroup Reports.....	10
CPUC Draft.....	10
Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan Workgroup Report.....	10
Process.....	11
High Level Recommendations.....	11
AB 617 Workgroup Report.....	12
Energy Equity Indicators Report.....	13
Conclusion.....	13
Appendices?.....	13
▪ DACAG Charter?.....	13
▪ SB 350?.....	13
▪ AB 617?.....	13
▪ AB 523?.....	13
Summary.....	5
2018 DACAG Members.....	5
2018 Priorities.....	6
Equity Framework.....	7
Definition of Disadvantaged Communities.....	7
Process for Comments and Input Activities.....	8

Commented [JG2]: We could leave a blank page here, if the DACAG thinks it necessary.

Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar

Mechanism to Comment on Existing and Emerging Programs.....	9	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Comment Activity.....	9	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Priority Workgroup Reports.....	10	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan Workgroup Report.....	10	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Process.....	10	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
High Level Recommendations.....	10	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
AB 617 Report.....	11	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Energy Equity Indicators Report.....	11	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Conclusion.....	11	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
Appendices?.....	12	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
DACAG Charter?.....	12	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
SB 350?.....	12	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
AB 617?.....	12	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
AB 523?.....	12	Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Font: +Body (Calibri), Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Font: +Body (Calibri), Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Font: +Body (Calibri), Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Font: +Body (Calibri), Check spelling and grammar
		Formatted: Default Paragraph Font, Check spelling and grammar

Summary

In early 2018, the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) and the California Energy Commission (CEC) jointly approved members of a new advisory group consisting of representatives of disadvantaged communities who will provide advice on state programs proposed to achieve clean energy and pollution reduction. The creation of the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG) fulfills a requirement in Senate Bill 350, the Clean Energy and Pollution Reduction Act of 2015.

Commented [JG3]: Propose using "DACAG" as a consistent acronym in this report the place of "Advisory Group" to differentiate DACAG from other advisory groups.

The DACAG was created to advise both the CEC and the CPUC on how programs can effectively reach and benefit communities disproportionately burdened by pollution and socio-economic challenges, including rural and tribal communities.

~~Program areas include renewable energy, energy efficiency, and transportation electrification. The DACAG will provide advice on programs related to renewable energy, energy efficiency, transportation electrification, distributed generation and clean energy research and development and determine whether those proposed programs will be effective and useful in disadvantaged communities.~~

The DACAG members represent the diverse nature of disadvantaged communities throughout the state, reflecting the different rural and urban, cultural and ethnic, and geographic regions.

Formatted: Heading 2

2018 DACAG Members are:

- Stephanie Chen, Energy and Telecommunications Policy Director at the Greenlining Institute
- Kevin Day, Tribal Chairman of the Tuolumne Me-Wuk Tribal Council (served until November, 2018)
- Jana Ganion, Sustainability and Government Affairs Director, Blue Lake Rancheria Tribe (appointed November, 2018)
- Stan Greschner, Chief Policy and Business Development Officer at GRID Alternatives
- Angela Islas, Community Health Worker at Central California Asthma Collaborative
- Roger Lin, Senior Attorney at the Center for Race, Poverty, and the Environment
- Adriano Martinez, Staff Attorney at Earthjustice
- Jodi Pincus, Executive Director at the Rising Sun Energy Center
- Andres Ramirez, Clean Energy Director at Pacoima Beautiful
- Waudieur Rucker-Hughes, President of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), Riverside Branch (Note: Ms. Rucker-Hughes passed away on July 13, 2018. This membership position will be filled according to processes outlined in the DACAG charter.)
- Phoebe Seaton, Co-Director and Attorney at the Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability
- Tyrone Roderick Williams, Director of Development at Sacramento Housing and Redevelopment Agency and Director of the Sacramento Promise Zone.

The ~~DACAG~~ charter states that the ~~Advisory Group~~ DACAG may hold meetings on key issues related to the design and implementation of clean energy programs, with respect to potential benefits and impacts in disadvantaged communities. The charter also requires that the ~~Advisory Group~~ DACAG shall submit an annual report listing the SB 350 programs ~~the DACAG has they have~~ reviewed and ~~providing its~~ written feedback to the CPUC and ~~Energy Commission~~ CEC on the effectiveness and usefulness of those ~~clean energy~~ programs on disadvantaged communities. The ~~Advisory Group~~ DACAG will also report summaries of its meetings and may choose to provide written recommendations or advice to the CPUC and ~~Energy Commission~~ CEC in addition to its annual report.

Initial 2018 Priorities

~~Since the~~ In its 2018 meetings, the ~~DACAG has been meeting it has~~ established the following priorities for review and feedback:

~~5~~ initial priorities

- CEC Electric Program Investment Charge (EPIC) program
 - ~~(in~~ With a focus particular ~~pursuant to AB 523)~~
- Energy Storage
- DAC-Net Metering
- SJV Affordable Energy Proceedings
- Climate Adaptation proceedings

In its 2018 meetings the DACAG has taken the following actions: ~~and taken the following actions:~~

- The ~~California Energy Commission~~ CEC provided Equity Indicators in SB 350 Low-Income Barriers Study.
 - o The DACAG identified the Equity Indicators as a critical tool and prioritized-defined further development of the indicators among the DACAG's priorities.
- The DACAG crafted, and adopted for its use, an Equity Framework, included below. Importantly, the Equity Framework includes a "Definition of Disadvantaged Communities" which is broadly inclusive. The major components of this definition were included in the *CA Public Utilities Commission's Draft Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan.*

Formatted: Normal

Commented [JG4]: Please check that I have described this work correctly.

Commented [JG5]: Was the "Definition of Disadvantaged Communities" taken up elsewhere by the commissions?

- The DACAG^s provided proposed changes to CPUC’s Environmental ~~Justice/ and~~ Social Justice Action Plan
- The DACAG provided recommendations to the ~~e California Energy Commission~~ CEC and ~~California Public Utilities Commission~~ CPUC to aid in the implementation of AB 617
- The DACAG provided a letter with recommendations regarding the CPUC proceeding R.15-03-010, examining affordable energy options in San Joaquin Valley communities.

Equity Framework

Overview

The purpose of the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG) pursuant to Pub. Util. Code § 400(g), is to advise the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) and the California Energy Commission (CEC) regarding the development, implementation, and impacts of proposed and existing programs related to the Clean Energy and Pollution Reduction Act of 2015 (also known as Senate Bill 350) in disadvantaged communities.

The DACAG adopted an Equity Framework on September 28, 2018, which will guide the activities and advocacy of the DACAG to the Commissions and other state agencies.

This Equity Framework is intended to guide the DACAG as it moves forward in discussing and commenting on various proceedings and programs before the CPUC and CEC ensuring that access and adequate resources reach the implementation stage and benefit communities in a meaningful and measurable way.

The Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group will work with the Commissions, and other the State agencies as appropriate, to ensure the Equity Framework is applied across all climate related policies, bills, proceedings, requests for proposals, and programs to ensure that equity is front and center when considering any climate investment/intervention in the State.

[Note: **this is this e-version of the Equity Framework document** included as Appendix D of the *CA Public Utilities Commission's Draft Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan*. **The formatting has been edited slightly for inclusion in this report.**]

DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ADVISORY GROUP EQUITY FRAMEWORK

The impact of climate change on low-income and disadvantaged communities can exacerbate existing inequities but can also be an opportunity to level the playing field through intentional interventions that address climate impacts on these communities directly.

The Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group would like the State to adopt an Equity Framework to work in conjunction with the Guiding Principles of the Advisory Group set forth in the Charter of the

Formatted: Heading 2

Formatted: Normal

Formatted: Heading 2, Left

Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group. The Equity Framework can be applied across all climate related policies, bills, proceedings, requests for proposals, etc. to ensure that equity is front and center when considering any climate investment/intervention in the State.

This Equity Framework is intended to guide the Advisory Group as it moves forward in discussing and commenting on various proceedings and programs before the CPUC and CEC ensuring that access and adequate resources reach the implementation stage and benefit communities in a meaningful and measurable way. This is the second draft of this document that incorporates all comments made at the August 21 Advisory Group meeting.

Definition of Disadvantaged Communities

As defined in the Energy Equity Indicator's tool, the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG) will adopt as the definition and advocate for equitable programming to reach all of the following communities (including community residents, workers, and businesses):

- CalEnviroScreen, as defined by Cal EPA,
- Tribal Lands,
- Census tracts with area median household income/state median income, less than 80%, and
- Households with median household income less than 80% of Area Median Income (AMI).

Formatted: Heading 3

FRAMEWORK

1. Health & Safety

Energy policies and programs should be observed through the lens of public health to identify impacts and utilize findings to optimize the health and well-being of California's most vulnerable communities, as well as, advance health interventions related to climate change by educating Disadvantaged Communities about disproportionate health impacts related to climate change and providing ways to value health benefits and impacts, build resiliency, mitigate climate related illnesses, injury and deaths and reduce climate related healthcare costs.

2. Access & Education

Access and Education are key to ensuring that Disadvantaged Communities benefit from clean energy technologies, energy efficiency, and other environmental investments by 1. focusing on special outreach efforts, 2. ensuring that these interventions are applicable and that the communities' interests and needs are represented, and 3. communities receive culturally relevant and sensitive education to prepare for climate resilience. The Advisory Group strives to remove barriers to participation, as identified in the SB 350 Barriers Report and other barriers, through means such as training, funding and support for CBO and educational institutions rooted in disadvantaged communities, ensuring community based businesses are competitive in solicitations, adequate information is disseminated regarding careers and education, and tracking and evaluating progress of such efforts is necessary for these interventions to be successful.

3. Financial Benefits

All investments in clean energy technologies, energy efficiency, and other environmental investments, should benefit all disadvantaged communities directly providing financial benefits, incentives and cost savings while also considering affordability and rate impacts.

4. Economic Development

Climate policies and programs should invest in a clean energy workforce by ensuring California has a trained and ready workforce prepared to improve our infrastructure and built environment as well as bring green technologies to market by: 1. promoting and funding workforce development pathways to high-quality careers in the construction and clean energy industries, including pre-apprenticeship and other training programs, 2. Setting and tracking hiring targets for low-income, disadvantaged, and underrepresented populations (including women, re-entry, etc.) to enter these industries, 3. ensuring that these careers are high-road, with a career-ladder, family-sustaining wages and with benefits, 4. training the next generation of climate leaders and workers for the clean energy economy, and 5. supporting small and diverse business development and contracting.

5. Consumer Protection

Climate related policies and programs should not create incentives for predatory lending or exploitation of communities for financial gain. Programs should have adequate consumer protection measures, disclosures, and accountability measures to ensure that financially vulnerable customers are not taken advantage of or otherwise compromised.

Process for Comments and Input Activities

[DACAG 2018 Annual Report: Update and Report on Existing Proceedings](#)

At the October 30, 2018 [Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group \(DACAG\) meeting](#), [the we-DACAG](#) appointed a working group to draft the April 2017-April 2018 annual report. -The working group consists of Jodi Pincus, Tyrone Roderick Williams, Stan Greschner, Adrian Martinez, and Roger Lin.

At the November 30, 2018 [meeting, the -theDACAG Advisory Group](#) identified the need to report on its established mechanism to comment on existing proceedings or programs at the CEC and CPUC. The following details the adopted mechanism and [the our-DACAG's](#) first effort to follow such procedure.

[Mechanism to Comment on Existing and Emerging Programs](#)

At the September 28, 2018 [Advisory GroupDACAG meeting](#), [the we-DACAG](#) identified three priority areas, including “review existing and emerging programs and proceedings and determine how to review, engage and comment on issues.” [The We-DACAG](#) subsequently requested CEC and CPUC legal staff recommendations on how our body would do so in active, pending or contemplated proceedings. [CPUC and CEC -s staff](#) recommended the following mechanism:

Commented [JG6]: Which staff is this referring to? Is CEC/CPUC correct here?

- An ~~Advisory Group~~ [DACAG](#) member may raise any proceeding or program for the full ~~Group~~ [DACAG](#) to consider commenting upon.
- The ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) member must then request that this item be placed on the agenda for subsequent deliberation, and if applicable, action by the ~~Advisory Group~~ [full DACAG](#) subject to Brown Act requirements.
- If the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) member proposes a written comment, the written comment should also be placed on a subsequent meeting agenda, subject to Brown Act requirements.
- At the subsequent meeting to deliberate submission of a comment, the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) may [edit the proposed comment in](#) "real-time," ~~edit the proposed comment,~~ and subject [it](#) to public comment.

At the October 30, 2018 ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) meeting, ~~the DACAG~~[we](#) clarified with CEC and CPUC staff that this mechanism is appropriate. Further, ~~we~~[the DACAG](#) confirmed that there was no need for the ~~DACAG~~[Advisory Group](#) to formally join an active proceeding as a party, and could:

- Send (via email) its comment to the presiding Administrative Law Judge(s) and Assigned Commissioner(s).

Comment Activity

At the November 30, 2018 ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) meeting, the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) deliberated whether to comment on the CPUC's open proceeding, Rulemaking 15-03-010, "Order Instituting Rulemaking to Identify Disadvantaged Communities in the San Joaquin Valley and Analyze Economically Feasible Options to Increase Access to Affordable Energy in those Disadvantaged Communities."

At the same meeting, the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) provided real-time edits to a proposed comment, resulting in the attached comment, which the ~~Advisory Group~~ [DACAG](#) voted to submit into the record of proceedings.

The same day, the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) transmitted this comment to the presiding Administrative Law Judges and Assigned Commissioner for Rulemaking 15-03-010. The Administrative Law Judges requested that the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) also:

- Serve the comment from the ~~Advisory Group~~[DACAG](#) on all parties to the proceeding.

Priority Workgroup Reports

CPUC Draft

[Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan Workgroup Report](#)

Process

Workgroup One, Environmental and Social Justice (ESJ), consists of Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG) members: Jodi Pincus, President and Executive Director of Rising Sun Center for Opportunity (Rising Sun), Angela Islas, Policy Advocate for the Central California Asthma Collaborative (CCAC) and Andres Ramirez from Pacoima Beautiful. At the September 28, 2018~~th~~ DACAG teleconference meeting, Workgroup One was tasked to work with the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) on the ~~Environmental Justice Social Justice~~ (ESJ) Plan, utilize and incorporate the DACAG's Equity Framework ([see Equity Framework above](#)) to edit and strengthen the plan for future adoption.

During the month of October 2018, Workgroup One's first task was to - within the group - review and incorporate the DACAG's Equity Framework to the CPUC's ESJ plan to present at the October 30th in-person DACAG meeting. Each member was given a one- to two-day timeframe to look over the document and incorporate the Equity Framework. The task was completed and Workgroup One presented an update of the current integration of the Equity Framework to the CPUC's ESJ Plan at the October 30th in-person meeting.

After the October 30th in-person meeting, Workgroup One was tasked to share the CPUC's ESJ Plan with the DACAG members to provide additional edits, comments and/or suggestions to improve the draft CPUC goals and objectives, as well as address if the DACAG's Equity Framework had been integrated into the plan effectively. The Advisory Group was given a two-week timeframe to provide feedback to the workgroup. One week before the November 30, 2018~~th~~ teleconference meeting, Workgroup One members revised and refurbished the CPUC's ESJ Plan to ~~later have it~~ be submitted to the CPUC's Public Adviser to the DACAG web page for public view. At the November 30, 2018~~th~~ teleconference meeting, Workgroup One presented alongside with Advisory Member Phoebe Seaton's Leadership Counsel Policy Advocate, Leslie Martinez on reviewing the edits, comments and suggestions to the ~~Advisory Group~~ DACAG, CPUC staff members and California Energy Commission (CEC) staff members. There was a motion for a vote to adopt the edits to the CPUC's ESJ Plan - motion approved 7-0. After the November 30, 2018~~th~~ teleconference meeting, the document was passed on to the CPUC to incorporate the comments and present it to the advisory group at the next in-person meeting scheduled for January 25~~th~~, 2019.

High Level Recommendations

Workgroup One came up with several recommendations to include in the CPUC's ESJ plan. Below are high-level recommendations:

- Incorporate the DACAG Equity Framework into the CPUC's ESJ plan and incorporate identified changes and edits to the plan
- Include the DACAG Equity Framework's definition of Disadvantaged Communities as part of the section of the plan that defines ESJ Communities

- Increase the number of defined goals from 8-10 to include changes to the goal language and add two new goals highlighted below (please note that more substantive changes were made to the body of each goal redlined in the ESJ plan). Below are the recommended goals and language:
 - Goal 1: Use CPUC’s planning, permitting, and regulatory role to advance social and environmental justice goals
 - Goal 2: Increase investment in clean energy resources to benefit ESJ communities, especially to improve local air quality, address negative health impact, financial benefits, economic and workforce development, and consumer protection
 - Goal 3: Strive to improve access to high-quality water, communications, and transportation services for ESJ communities
 - Goal 4: Increase climate resiliency in low-income and disadvantaged communities
 - Goal 6: Increase economic benefit to and financial benefits to ESJ Communities
 - Goal 5: Enhance outreach and public participation opportunities in order for ESJ communities to meaningfully participate in the CPUC’s decision-making process
 - Goal 6: Enhance enforcement to ensure safety and consumer protection for ESJ communities
 - Goal 7: Promote economic and workforce development opportunities in ESJ communities
 - Goal 8: Promote access and education ensuring that ESJ communities will benefit from and participate in CPUC programs and proceedings
 - Goal 9: Improve training and staff development related to environmental and social justice issues within the CPUC’s jurisdiction
 - Goal 10: Monitor the CPUC’s environmental and social justice efforts to ensure that they are achieving their objectives

[AB 617 Workgroup Report](#)

[Add?](#)

[Adrian Martinez \(EarthJustice\), Angela Islas \(CCAC\), Roger Lin \(UC Berkeley School of Law\) and Phoebe Seaton \(Leadership Counsel\)](#)

[The AB 617 workgroup convened to provide recommendations about how the California Public Utilities Commission \(CPUC\) and California Energy Commission \(CEC\) can aid in the implementation of the first-year round of communities under Assembly Bill 617. Based on a review of some of the issues faced by the initially defined communities in AB 617, the subcommittee put forth a recommendation on November 30, 2018 requiring staff of the CPUC and CEC to provide a report back in six months on their collaborative efforts with the California Air Resources Board \(CARB\). The report back should come in the Spring of 2019. The subcommittee also recommends that this group engages with CPUC and CEC](#)

[following the report back to ensure that the complementary goals of AB 617 \(lead by CARB\), CPUC and CEC move forward to improve air quality in the most impacted areas by addressing various pollution sources that contribute to air quality concerns.](#)

Energy Equity Indicators [Workgroup Report](#)
Add?

Conclusion
Add

[Exhibits?](#)

[Exhibit A – Equity Framework?](#)

Formatted: Highlight

Formatted: Heading 3

[Appendices?](#)

- [DACAG Charter?](#)
- [SB 350?](#)
- [AB 617?](#)
- [AB 523?](#)

Formatted: Highlight