Docket Number:	17-BUSMTG-01
Project Title:	2017 Business Meeting Transcripts
TN #:	222075
Document Title:	Transcript of the 12/13/2017 Business Meeting
Description:	N/A
Filer:	Cody Goldthrite
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	12/29/2017 1:59:07 PM
Docketed Date:	12/29/2017

BUSINESS MEETING

BEFORE THE

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

In	the Matter))17-BUSMTG-01
	Business	Meeting)

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

THE WARREN-ALQUIST STATE ENERGY BUILDING

ART ROSENFELD HEARING ROOM - FIRST FLOOR

1516 NINTH STREET

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 95814

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 13, 2017
10:00 A.M.

Reported by: Peter Petty

APPEARANCES

Commissioners

Robert Weisenmiller, Chair Karen Douglas David Hochschild Andrew McAllister

Staff Present: (* Via WebEx)

Drew Bohan, Executive Director Kourtney Vaccaro, Chief Counsel Eunice Murimi, Public Adviser's Office Cody Goldthrite, Secretariat

	Agenda Item
Michael Calcal	2
Michael Sokol	∠
*Alana Mathews	2
Thomas Gates	3
Ingrid Neumann	4
Hally Cahssai	5
Shaun Ransom	6
Pilar Magana	7, 8
Michael Sokol	9

Others Present (* Via WebEx)

Interested Parties

Gregory C. Mahoney, City of Davis	4
*Jonathan Palacios-Avila, StratosFuel, Inc.	4
*Joseph Oldham, CALSTART Clean Transportation	6
Center	

Public Comment(* Via WebEx)

Larry McLaughlin, Advanced Transportation and Renewable Energy Inland Empire/Desert Community College Region College of the Desert Proceedings 7

Items

1. CONSENT CALENDAR

9

Page

- a. THE GOVERNMENT OF SCOTLAND
- b. NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF STATE ENERGY OFFICIALS (NASEO)
- c. BLYTHE ENERGY PROJECT PETITION TO AMEND (99-AFC-08C)
- d. PALOMAR ENERGY CENTER PROJECT PETITIONS TO AMEND (01-AFC24C)
 - i. Proposed order approving a petition to: (1) modify multiple air quality conditions of certification to ensure consistency with the San Diego County Air Pollution Control District air permit language; and (2) upgrade to the advanced gas path technology for two existing General Electric Frame 7-FA combined-cycle gas turbines. The proposed changes to the license would not result in significant environmental impacts, and the facility would remain in compliance with all applicable laws, ordinances, regulations, and standards.
 - ii. Proposed order approving a petition augmenting cooling tower makeup water with fire hydrant flushing water and storm water captured onsite. The order would approve changes to Conditions of Certification SOIL&WATER-5 and 6. The proposed changes to the license would not result in significant environmental impacts, and the facility would remain in compliance with all applicable laws, ordinances, regulations, and standards.
- 2. PROPOSED ADOPTION OF THE CHARTER ESTABLISHING THE SENATE BILL 350 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES ADVISORY GROUP

10

I N D E X (Cont.)

3.		FORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION TRIBAL ULTATION POLICY	16
4.	CITY	OF DAVIS	21
5.	CITY	OF CLOVIS	27
6.		VATIVE MOBILITY DEMONSTRATIONS WITH -EMISSION VEHICLES, GFO-16-605	28
	a.	STRATOSFUEL, INC.	
	b.	CALSTART, INC.	
	С.	ENVOY TECHNOLOGIES, INC. Proposed resolution approving Agreement ARV-17-012	
	d.	ENVOY TECHNOLOGIES, INC. Proposed resolution approving Agreement ARV-17-013	
7.	GLOB	AL ALGAE INNOVATIONS INC.	36
8.		ARCH AND DEMONSTRATIONS TO DECARBONIZE SPORTATION FUEL, GFO-16-901	39
	a.	LAWRENCE LIVERMORE NATIONAL SECURITY LLC.	
9.	IMPL	USSION OF ENERGY COMMISSION PROGRESS RE: EMENTATION OF THE CLEAN ENERGY AND POLLUTION CTION ACT OF 2015 (SB 350)	43
10.	Minu	tes	46
11.	Lead	Commissioner or Presiding Member Reports	46

12. Chief Counsel's Report

- a. In the Matter of U.S. Department of Energy (High Level Waste Repository) (Atomic Safety Licensing Board, CAB-04, 63-001-HLW); State of California v. United States Department of Energy (9th Cir. Docket No. 09-71014)
- b. Energy Commission v. United States Department of Energy (2nd Cir. Docket No. 17-1798).
- c. Communities for a Better Environment and Center
 for Biological Diversity v. Energy Commission
 (Court of Appeal, First Appellate District,
 #A141299)
- e. Helping Hand Tools and Robert Simpson v. Energy Commission (San Francisco Superior Court Case #CPF-17-515576)
- f. National Electrical Manufacturers v. Energy Commission (Federal District Court, Eastern District of California, #2:17-cv-01625)
- g. Energy Commission v. United States Department of Energy (Federal District Court, Northern District of California, #17-cv-03406)
- h. City of Los Angeles, acting by and through, its Department of Water and Power v. Energy Commission (Los Angeles Superior Court, Case No. BS171477)

Pursuant to Government Code section 11126(e), the Energy Commission may also discuss any judicial or administrative proceeding that was formally initiated after this agenda was published; or determine whether facts and circumstances exist that warrant the initiation of litigation, or that constitute a significant exposure to litigation against the Commission, which might include:

12.	Chief	Counsel's Report (Cont.)	73
ć	a.	The U.S. Department of Energy's actions to delay effective dates and failures to complete certain energy conservation standards and test procedures for appliances.	
1	b.	The licensing process for a nuclear waste storage repository at Yucca Mountain, Nevada.	
	С.	Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program grant ARV-10-016 with the City of San Jose, including its subcontractor JUM Global, and the lawsuit between the two (5:16-cv-01462-HRL, United States District Court, Northern District of California [San Jose]).	
13.	Execu	utive Director's Report	73
14.	Publi	ic Adviser's Report	76
15.	Publi	ic Comment	76
Adjou	rnmer	nt	78
Report	ter's	s Certificate	79
Transcriber's Certificate		80	

- 2 DECEMBER 13, 2017 10:09 a.m.
- 3 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Good morning. We're a
- 4 little late. We had a fire alarm, but let's do the Pledge
- 5 Of Allegiance.
- 6 (Whereupon, the Pledge of Allegiance
- 7 was recited in unison.)
- 8 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: We're going to start the
- 9 business meeting with a minute of silence for Mayor Ed Lee.
- 10 David?
- 11 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Yeah, before we do if I
- 12 could say a few words? Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- So 2017 has been a very difficult year on many,
- 14 many levels and gotten a lot more difficult on Monday
- 15 evening at 10:30. Mayor Lee passed away and left two
- 16 daughters and a loving wife behind.
- 17 He has been a dear friend for almost 20 years.
- 18 And when I was appointed, I talked to Chair Weisenmiller
- 19 about where I wanted to be sworn in. And I decided in my
- 20 hometown of San Francisco. And the Chair came down and
- 21 Mayor Lee gave the keynote.
- 22 And I don't think you need to be a flashy
- 23 personality to be a great leader. You don't need to be
- 24 internationally famous to be a great leader. You need to
- 25 have integrity. You need to have a big heart. And you can

- 1 tell a great deal about the content of a man's character by
- 2 how they treat people, not above them in the ladder of
- 3 power, but below them. And you can tell the most about how
- 4 the people -- how they treat people who are at the bottom
- 5 of that ladder.
- 6 And I watched Ed Lee, over the years even as a
- 7 Mayor, taking calls at night from tenants making \$18,000 a
- 8 year on fixed income and treating them like they were the
- 9 most important people in the world. He listened. He was
- 10 incredibly generous.
- 11 And as a Chinese American, you look at that
- 12 story, the first -- other than Willie Brown and Dianne
- 13 Feinstein, every single Mayor of San Francisco has been a
- 14 white man. And the Chinese American story is a difficult
- 15 story. Coming first to the gold rush and working the
- 16 railroads and the Chinese Exclusion Act, a history of
- 17 discrimination and being boxed out of political power. And
- 18 I feel this maybe particularly strongly marrying into a
- 19 Chinese family -- all my nephews and nieces and cousins.
- 20 But for Mayor Lee to rise to become the force he was I know
- 21 my children, my nieces and nephews; they see someone looks
- 22 like them and they know that they can rise too.
- 23 And it's a big loss for the City of San
- 24 Francisco and for the state. And so with that I'd ask for
- 25 a moment of silence in his memory.

- 1 (Whereupon, a moment of silence
- was observed.)
- 3 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Thank you.
- 4 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Let's go to the Business
- 5 Meeting. Let's start with Item 1, the Consent Calendar.
- 6 We're going to break that up and deal first with items a,
- 7 c, d, e, f. And then we'll deal with the -- so let's -- do
- 8 I have a motion on the first part.
- 9 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: I move those items.
- 10 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Second.
- 11 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Okay. All those in
- 12 favor?
- 13 (Ayes.)
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: So those pass 4-0.
- 15 Commissioner Scott is necessarily absent today.
- 16 And Commissioner McAllister is recusing himself on item b,
- 17 so let's hold off for a minute.
- 18 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: So just for the record,
- 19 the reason I'm recusing myself is that the item concerns
- 20 NASEO, the National Association of State Energy Officials.
- 21 And I'm on the Board. I'm a Vice Chair of the Board of
- 22 NASEO, so I wanted to recuse myself for this vote.
- 23 (Commissioner McAllister exits the room.)
- 24 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: So now that Commissioner
- 25 McAllister has left the room, I wanted to voice my support

- 1 for this item. NASEO is a very important organization and
- 2 it helps us both coordinate with other state energy
- 3 agencies on efficiency in other states. And also learn and
- 4 exchange ideas and best practices. It's a really,
- 5 particularly in today's environment, a really important way
- 6 of advancing, especially energy efficiency and other
- 7 partnerships. So I will move approval of this item.
- 8 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: I would second the item
- 9 moved with one request, which is at some point when it's
- 10 convenient for Commissioner McAllister it would be great to
- 11 get a presentation to the rest of the Commission about what
- 12 some of the highlights are. I know we've been a part of
- 13 this for a number of years, but just what are the most
- 14 interesting and compelling things we're learning from other
- 15 states. But I would second the item.
- 16 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Okay. All those in
- 17 favor?
- 18 (Ayes.)
- 19 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: This passes 3-0 as
- 20 Commissioner Scott is not here and Commissioner McAllister
- 21 recused himself.
- Let's go back to Item 2. Staff?
- MR. SOKOL: All right. Good morning, Chair and
- 24 Commissioners. I'm Michael Sokol, filling in on this item
- 25 on behalf of Public Adviser Alana Mathews this morning.

- 1 So I'm pleased to present for your adoption today
- 2 the Senate Bill 350 Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group
- 3 Resolution and Charter.
- 4 Senate Bill 350, as codified in California Public
- 5 Utilities Code Section 400(g) mandates the Public Utilities
- 6 Commission and the Energy Commission to establish an
- 7 advisory group consisting of representatives from
- 8 disadvantaged communities. The advisory group shall review
- 9 and provide advice on proposed clean energy and pollution
- 10 reduction programs, and determine whether those programs
- 11 will be effective and useful in disadvantaged communities.
- 12 In determining the effectiveness and usefulness
- 13 of those programs the advisory group shall consider the
- 14 extent to which those programs meet three criteria.
- The first is to increase access to clean energy
- 16 technologies in disadvantaged communities.
- 17 The second is to maintain or enhance the
- 18 affordability of energy services in disadvantaged
- 19 communities by considering potential rate impacts of any
- 20 proposed programs.
- 21 And the third is to increase the benefits of
- 22 clean energy programs in disadvantaged communities by, for
- 23 example supporting growth in local employment and small
- 24 business development as well as other non-energy benefits
- 25 including reducing pollutants and health risks.

- 1 Resolution E-4893 Draft from December 14th, 2017,
- 2 Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group will be considered
- 3 at the Public Utilities Commission as well.
- 4 So on August 1st, 2017 the CPUC and the Energy
- 5 Commission released a joint staff proposal to generate
- 6 public interest and solicit feedback on the structure and
- 7 responsibilities of this advisory group. The staff
- 8 proposal provided recommendations on advisory group size,
- 9 meeting frequency, general range of subjects to be covered,
- 10 as well as expected responsibilities. The proposal
- 11 addressed a number of questions to stakeholders to give
- 12 more shape to membership and the scope of work.
- 13 The CPUC and Energy Commission received informal
- 14 comments on the proposal through August 17th, of 2017 and
- 15 incorporated this important feedback into the draft of the
- 16 charter and resolution you're considering today.
- 17 The draft charter and resolution were posted on
- 18 November 1st for public review with a 30-day comment
- 19 period. We received two comments, which were considered in
- 20 presenting this final version today.
- 21 Lastly, the CPUC and the Energy Commission also
- 22 posted a request for applications for the advisory group,
- 23 which should be submitted to the agencies by December 22,
- 24 2017 for consideration by the two Commissions.
- 25 The resolution has been provided in your Business

- 1 Meeting backup materials for your consideration of adoption
- 2 today. Thank you. And I would be happy to answer any
- 3 questions you might have.
- 4 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 5 Let's see, do we have any comments from anyone in
- 6 the room? Okay, I believe we have the Public Adviser on
- 7 the phone.
- 8 MS. MATHEWS: Hello, can you hear me?
- 9 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Yes.
- MS. MATHEWS: Okay, so I'm here to answer any
- 11 questions that the Commissioners may have. But I did want
- 12 to emphasize that we have worked for almost a year with the
- 13 California Public Utilities Commission. I believe Melicia
- 14 Charles is there today. I don't know if she wants to make
- 15 any comments, but I at least want to acknowledge her
- 16 leadership and efforts in working with our agency to draft
- 17 this document resolution and help us shepherd the process
- 18 to get the advisory committee formed.
- 19 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Anyone else on the line,
- 20 public that had comments?
- 21 (No audible response.)
- MR. SOKOL: So Chair, I just wanted to mention
- 23 quickly too that the Public Utilities Commission would have
- 24 had a staff person here, Melicia Charles. The train was
- 25 delayed and so they are stuck in the Bay Area. So they can

- 1 respond later.
- 2 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Okay. That's good.
- Okay, so Commissioners -- so let's transition to
- 4 the Commissioners. Commissioner Scott asked me to read her
- 5 comments on this, so I want to do so and I'll start out.
- 6 "So, I would like to thank both Alana Mathews and
- 7 Mike Sokol for all the great work they have put in to
- 8 developing this charter. I'd also like to thank our PUC
- 9 colleagues, including Commissioner Guzman-Aceves and
- 10 Commissioner Rechtschaffen and their teams. It's really
- 11 been a collaborative effort, getting this across the finish
- 12 line. Adopting the charter today will be a big step
- 13 forward in getting this advisory group up and running.
- "The advisory group will serve a critical role in
- 15 helping us better understand how programs resulting from SB
- 16 350 can be most effective and useful to disadvantaged
- 17 communities throughout the state. So I support moving this
- 18 item forward.
- 19 "I would also like to echo the December 22nd due
- 20 date for applications and encourage those of you who may be
- 21 interested to consider applying. And those of you, who
- 22 know of others that might be interested in participating on
- 23 this advisory board, please pass the application
- 24 information on to them. Thank you."
- 25 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: So Commissioners, any

- 1 other comments or questions?
- 2 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Well, just strong support
- 3 for the item and really appreciate the hard work and
- 4 interagency collaboration that went into this. It's really
- 5 important that we be able to hit the ground running with
- 6 this advisory committee. And really set up a forum where
- 7 we can get the benefit of people's engagement with us on
- 8 these important issues and get their help, and so I'm
- 9 really happy to see this step.
- 10 So I see Commissioner McAllister has a comment.
- 11 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Yeah, I just wanted to
- 12 really double down on Commissioner Scott's message and
- 13 encourage people to apply. And it'd be great if we got a
- 14 lot of diverse range of applications with people with
- 15 different skill sets from different places, different
- 16 disadvantaged communities, because there's an amazing
- 17 amount of diversity across the state. I'm personally
- 18 interested in people with multi-family housing skills and
- 19 financial skills and just really skills that'll help the
- 20 direction that the group provides. And we don't want
- 21 necessarily everybody saying it exactly from the same
- 22 hymnal. We really want to understand and be able to deepen
- 23 these issues in a very functional and substantive way. So
- 24 that takes both vision and skills.
- 25 And so hopefully we can get a good diverse group.

- 1 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: So I'll move approval of
- 2 this item.
- 3 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Second.
- 4 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 5 (Ayes.)
- 6 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: So this passes 4-0.
- 7 Thank you.
- 8 MS. MATHEWS: Thank you.
- 9 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Let's go on to Item 3,
- 10 California Energy Commission Tribal Consultation Policy.
- MR. GATES: Good morning. My name is Thomas
- 12 Gates. I'm the Energy Commission's Tribal liaison.
- In December 2014, in response to Governor Brown's
- 14 Executive Order B-10-11 and the Resources Agency Tribal
- 15 Consultation Policy, the Energy Commission adopted a tribal
- 16 consultation policy per Order No. 14-12103. The policy
- 17 provides guidance to the Commission and informs California
- 18 Native American tribes on how we are to ensure effective
- 19 tribal consultations.
- In September 2014 and just prior to adopting the
- 21 2014 policy, the California Environmental Quality Act was
- 22 amended per Assembly Bill 52. AB 52 detailed a formal
- 23 tribal consultation process for CEQA projects.
- 24 Certain elements of the amendment were to be
- 25 worked out over the next couple of years. For example, the

- 1 Office of Planning and Research was directed to update the
- 2 CEQA guidelines by July 1st, 2016. Because there was some
- 3 uncertainty to how the CEQA amendment was to be
- 4 implemented, and because the draft 2014 policy was
- 5 generally consistent with the amendment, staff advised the
- 6 Commissioners to adopt the policy at that time.
- 7 Three years have passed. Implementation of the
- 8 AB 52 CEQA amendment has generally settled and has
- 9 culminated in a June 2017 Office of Planning and Research
- 10 Technical Advisory entitled, "AB 52 and Tribal Cultural
- 11 Resources in CEQA." Staff has revised the Energy
- 12 Commission's policy to formally acknowledge the CEQA
- 13 amendment.
- In preparing the revised policy, staff has
- 15 notified all 164 Native American Heritage Commission listed
- 16 tribes of its intent to revise policy.
- 17 Staff held one tribal meeting in Southern
- 18 California, staff held one tribal meeting in Northern
- 19 California and staff held one tribal web-conference
- 20 meeting. These meetings were held jointly with the
- 21 California Public Utilities Commission, which is developing
- 22 its own tribal consultation policy. In total, 15 tribes
- 23 participated in those meetings.
- 24 Two tribes provided written comment. Staff has
- 25 responded to the two tribes and has made revisions to the

- 1 draft revised policy that reflect those tribal comments.
- In addition, staff has routed the draft revised
- 3 policy through an internal review process, including
- 4 multiple reviews by the Siting Division, Chief Counsel's
- 5 Office, Executive Office, and the Public Adviser's Office.
- 6 Staff has also held an Energy Commission Deputy
- 7 Director's meeting where the draft revised policy was also
- 8 reviewed.
- 9 Staff recommends the Energy Commission adopt the
- 10 proposed revisions to the Tribal Consultation Policy.
- 11 Thank you and I'm available for any questions.
- 12 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you. Are there any
- 13 comments from anyone in the room? Anyone on the line.
- 14 (No audible response.)
- Okay. Let's transition to the Commissioners.
- 16 Commissioner Douglas?
- 17 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: So just some brief
- 18 comments. I've worked closely with Mr. Gates and a number
- 19 of staff on the revisions to the consultation policy.
- 20 First off, the consultation policy has been very
- 21 helpful and very important for the Energy Commission and
- 22 our relationship with tribes and in carrying out the
- 23 Governor's Executive Order. It sets up a great framework
- 24 for consultation and it helps us really know what to do and
- 25 when to reach out and how to reach out and make those

- 1 connections at the right time.
- These revisions as Tom noted, both respond to
- 3 changes in state guidelines and also reflects some of our
- 4 experience with implementing the consultation policy that's
- 5 in effect today. And it also reflects us thinking through
- 6 how to take the next step on this policy, which is to
- 7 really go beyond the excellent tribal consultation and
- 8 outreach that's been done within the Siting Division itself
- 9 and with a focus on cultural resources or real energy
- 10 planning. And help it bring it into other parts of the
- 11 Energy Commission where tribes also have an interest
- 12 whether that be certainly aspects of ethics, certainly
- 13 aspects of the Alternative and Renewable Fuels and
- 14 Transportation Program; likely in many areas energy
- 15 efficiency and renewables and so on.
- We're really seeing a much greater engagement and
- 17 interest among some of the tribes that we've been working
- 18 with and talking to. So in some ways, some of the
- 19 revisions to this policy look to make the policy more user-
- 20 friendly in a broader range of context rather than assuming
- 21 that it is focused on, for example, review of a proposed
- 22 renewable energy project or a review of proposed project.
- 23 So we added a little flexibility in there to make it work.
- 24 And you know there's also been an interest that's
- 25 reflected in this policy in engaging other divisions at a

- 1 higher level in being part of the consultation process.
- 2 And I was wondering if Tom, you or Drew, would like to
- 3 briefly describe that so the Commissioners kind of know
- 4 what role their deputies will be playing in consultation.
- 5 MR. GATES: Specifically to how we will broaden
- 6 out to the other divisions. We anticipate quarterly
- 7 meetings. We have identified assistant tribal liaisons
- 8 within each division. So each Deputy Director could either
- 9 be that assistant or can delegate someone else amongst
- 10 their staff that might be in a unique position to also
- 11 understand the policy and interact with tribes.
- 12 We will then do these quarterly meetings where we
- 13 will continue to develop and implement the policy on some
- 14 of the other ideas like training, a tribal summit, energy
- 15 summit. And also through that quarterly meeting, but also
- 16 in addition as the need arises my office will be available
- 17 to assist in any specific consultations that might happen
- 18 between the tribe and another division.
- 19 So we had our first quarterly meeting a couple of
- 20 weeks ago. And we anticipate continuing that into the New
- 21 Year and following through with that to see how we can best
- 22 implement this policy.
- 23 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Thank you.
- 24 So the last comment I'll make is that we actually
- 25 carried out the review of the proposal of changes to our

- 1 policy and the public meetings that we had in concert with
- 2 the California Public Utilities Commission, which is
- 3 putting in place its first tribal consultation policy.
- 4 So we had a really good process of exchanging
- 5 ideas and information with them, planning that process and
- 6 implementing and carrying out these two public meetings.
- 7 Well, not public meetings, these two meeting with tribes
- 8 plus a WebEx with tribes together. And that was a good
- 9 experience and good partnership. And Tom is in very close
- 10 touch with the folks at the CPUC, who've been designated to
- 11 be on point. So we'll be able to, I think, provide better
- 12 information and better response to tribal interests, with
- 13 that connection and the close working relationship with the
- 14 CPUC on this issue.
- So with that, I'll move approval of this item
- 16 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Second.
- 17 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 18 (Ayes.)
- 19 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: This passes 4-0. Thank
- 20 you.
- 21 Let's go on to Item 4, City of Davis.
- MS. NEUMANN: Good morning Chair Weisenmiller and
- 23 Commissioners. My name is Ingrid Neumann from the Building
- 24 Standards Office. I'm here to present Item 4 City of
- 25 Davis.

- 1 Local governmental agencies wishing to enforce
- 2 their locally-adopted energy standards are required to
- 3 apply to the Energy Commission for a finding that the local
- 4 energy standards will require buildings to be designed to
- 5 consume no more energy than permitted by the adopted
- 6 statewide energy standards found in Title 24 Part 6. This
- 7 finding can be made by the Commission once a complete
- 8 application has been received. The complete application is
- 9 posted for a 60-day comment period and the Executive
- 10 Director issues a written recommendation on the
- 11 application.
- 12 A complete application consists of the following:
- 13 1) The proposed energy standards 2) The local governmental
- 14 agency's findings and supporting analysis on the energy
- 15 savings and cost effectiveness of the proposed energy
- 16 standards. 3) A statement or finding by the local
- 17 government agency that the local energy standards will
- 18 require buildings to be designed to save energy when
- 19 compared to energy consumption levels permitted in Title
- 20 24, Part 6. 4) And four, any findings determinations,
- 21 declarations, or reports required pursuant to the
- 22 California Environmental Quality Act.
- 23 Staff has reviewed the City of Davis's
- 24 application and has found that the application was complete
- 25 as of October 11th, 2017 consisting of items 1 through 4

- 1 mentioned previously. No public comments have been
- 2 received by the Energy Commission during the 60-day comment
- 3 period, which ended on December 11th. Subsequently, the
- 4 Executive Director issued a written recommendation, in
- 5 which he recommended approval of this item.
- 6 On September 12th of this year, Davis's City
- 7 Council approved the adoption of Ordinance 2512, requiring
- 8 all new single-family residences to be 30 percent more
- 9 energy efficient and all new multi-family dwellings to be
- 10 25 percent more energy efficient than required by the 2016
- 11 Energy Standards.
- 12 These compliance margins correspond to meeting
- 13 CALGreen Tier 2 for energy efficiency. The City of Davis
- 14 will require that these targets be met by a combination of
- 15 additional energy efficiency measures, as well as
- 16 installation of solar photovoltaics where solar PV size is
- 17 determined by the amount which would offset 80 percent of
- 18 the total estimated building electricity use for a combined
- 19 fuel residence.
- The approach is consistent with the methodology
- 21 included in the Energy Commission's proposed model solar PV
- 22 ordinance. The City of Davis's staff worked closely with
- 23 PG&E, Davis Energy Group and Misti Bruceri & Associates to
- 24 adopt the cost-effectiveness study that was submitted with
- 25 the City's complete application.

- 1 The City of Davis determined that the addition of
- 2 additional efficiency measures and a PV system, as
- 3 described in Ordinance 2512 provided a cost benefit ratio
- 4 of 1.23 for single- family residences and 1.40 for multi-
- 5 family buildings. The cost-effectiveness study was heard
- 6 and approved by the Davis City Council, on September 12th,
- 7 2017.
- 8 Staff found the application to be complete and
- 9 confirmed a reduction of energy consumption required by the
- 10 local ordinance. Staff therefore recommends the findings
- 11 be approved and the Energy Commission resolution to be
- 12 signed.
- I am available to answer any questions you may
- 14 have, as is Greg Mahoney, Chief Building Official with the
- 15 City of Davis. Thank you.
- 16 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 17 First, are there any comments from anyone in the
- 18 room? Any comments from anyone on the line? Unless the
- 19 Davis official wants -- do you want to say anything?
- 20 Please, come on up.
- 21 MR. MAHONEY: Good morning, Commissioners. My
- 22 name is Greg Mahoney. I'm the Assistant Director of
- 23 Community Development and Sustainability for the City of
- 24 Davis and I'm just submitting this Reach Code for your
- 25 approval.

- 1 I did want to thank Marshall Hunt in the Codes
- 2 and Standards group at PG&E and also the firms that worked
- 3 on the cost-effectiveness study, which were Davis Energy
- 4 Group, Misti Bruceri & Associates and EnerCom.
- 5 And we feel that it's consistent with the City
- 6 Council goals and also the California Energy Action Plan
- 7 policy directive to support Reach Code. So I'm happy to
- 8 answer any questions that you may have.
- 9 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Great. Thank you.
- 10 Commissioners, anybody, Commissioners?
- 11 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Nobody else? Okay.
- 12 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Okay. Commissioner
- 13 McAllister, why don't I turn to you.
- 14 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Yeah. So this is under
- 15 my purview since I oversee Title 24, Part 6. And I really
- 16 appreciate the City of Davis coming in.
- 17 And this is another of a growing line, not that
- 18 long yet, but a growing line of cities who've really done
- 19 amazing things. And I really appreciate Ingrid and your
- 20 team's and Christopher's team's support of all of the
- 21 vetting and just all the work that goes into getting these
- 22 approvals done, interacting with the City.
- 23 So I do have a disclosure that I want to make. I
- 24 don't have a conflict, but you all know that I'm about to
- 25 start a construction project. It's sort of my learning

- 1 laboratory here. And the demo happens next week of the
- 2 existing building that's on the property, but I do live in
- 3 Davis. I am going to be submitting a building application
- 4 to the City. We have not done that yet, so I don't
- 5 actually have anything pending in front of the City on this
- 6 front. But I did want everybody to know.
- 7 So I'm not going to recuse myself, but I just
- 8 wanted to make it clear. And in fact I'll be subject -- if
- 9 we're approved I'll be subject to this. And I'm actually
- 10 pretty excited about that, because we need to walk the
- 11 walk. And I think the City of Davis has a reputation and I
- 12 think it's earned that as being pretty much by the book in
- 13 terms of enforcing the code. And so that's a good thing
- 14 that we need to support.
- 15 At the same time, we look at how to streamline
- 16 the code, how to make it easier, more understandable for
- 17 people including contractors and lay people and everyone
- 18 involved, so that it does permeate the economy. And not
- 19 just for new construction, but also for retrofit
- 20 applications, because that's really kind of our bugaboo at
- 21 this point is making sure that people know what code
- 22 applies to HVAC replacements and all that kind of stuff.
- 23 So I'm certainly supportive of this item. I'm
- 24 thinking I'm going to learn some lessons that bring me back
- 25 to the 2022 Code and we'll be able to do even better. But

- 1 we've all got to be subject to the same -- you know we live
- 2 in a state and presumably a nation of laws, and so we want
- 3 to make sure what we're doing fits the bill.
- 4 So with that, I'll end it. And well,
- 5 Commissioner Douglas wants to make a comment. Okay.
- 6 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Yeah, I just wanted to
- 7 briefly say I live in Davis too and definitely support the
- 8 City's leadership on this item. So if you want to make a
- 9 motion, go ahead.
- 10 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: So I'll move this item.
- 11 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Second.
- 12 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 13 (Ayes.)
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: 4-0. Thanks.
- 15 Let's go on to Item 5 City of Clovis.
- 16 MS. CAHSSAI: Good morning, Commissioners. My
- 17 name is Hally Cahssai and I'm with the Efficiency Division.
- 18 The City of Clovis is seeking a 1.8 million ECCA
- 19 loan to retrofit over 3,500 interior and exterior lighting
- 20 fixtures with LED technology, in 10 city-owned properties.
- 21 The total cost for this project is estimated to be 1.88
- 22 million, of which 48,000 will be funded using the
- 23 anticipated rebate incentives from the utility company.
- 24 And the remainder with the ECCA loan at 1 percent.
- 25 Upon completion, this project will save

- 1 approximately 695 megawatt hours of electricity annually
- 2 and reduce the City's utility expenses by an estimated
- 3 \$128,000 annually. If the Commission approves this loan,
- 4 the project will start in the spring of 2018. The simple
- 5 payback for this project is 14.3 years, based on the loan
- 6 amount.
- 7 Staff has determined that this loan request
- 8 complies with all the program requirements. I'm here today
- 9 to seek your approval. Thank you.
- 10 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 11 First, any public comment from anyone in the
- 12 room? How about on the line?
- 13 (No audible response.)
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Okay. So let's
- 15 transition to the Commissioners. Commissioner McAllister?
- 16 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: No.
- 17 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: I would move the item.
- 18 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Second
- 19 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 20 (Ayes.)
- 21 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: This item passes 4-0.
- 22 Thank you.
- MS. CAHSSAI: Thank you.
- 24 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Let's go on to Item 6,
- 25 Innovative Mobility Demonstrations with Zero Emission

- 1 Vehicles.
- 2 MR. RANSOM: Good morning, Commissioners. My
- 3 name is Shaun Ransom, staff with the Fuels and
- 4 Transportation Division's Zero Emission Vehicle and
- 5 Infrastructure Office. I am here today to present four
- 6 agreements for possible approval. The proposed agreements
- 7 were awarded under the Innovative Mobility Service
- 8 Demonstrations with Zero Emission Vehicles.
- 9 The goals of the solicitation were to demonstrate
- 10 the use of zero emission vehicles in innovative mobility
- 11 services such as car-sharing and ride-hailing, and provide
- 12 an increased awareness of clean vehicle technologies. Four
- 13 agreements are presented to demonstrate innovative mobility
- 14 options in the Bay Area, Sacramento and North San Joaquin
- 15 Valley, Fresno, and Riverside and Ontario. The proposed
- 16 agreements are as follows:
- 17 A Proposed resolution approving StratosFuel for a
- 18 \$684,000 grant to develop a fuel cell electric car-sharing
- 19 platform. This project was recommended for funding to
- 20 demonstrate innovative electric mobility services in
- 21 Riverside and Ontario. This project will also utilize the
- 22 hydrogen refueling network in the area and benefit the
- 23 surrounding communities. StratosFuel will deploy 15 Toyota
- 24 Mirais for a 1 year demonstration.
- 25 The second project, a proposed resolution

- 1 approving CALSTART for a \$750,000 grant. This project will
- 2 develop and demonstrate a ride-hailing transportation
- 3 option for community college students who are attending
- 4 Fresno City College. The route will travel through Kerman
- 5 and Fresno and will provide ride services to rural areas
- 6 west of Fresno using battery electric vehicles. CALSTART
- 7 will deploy 6 Chevy Volts for a 1 year demonstration.
- 8 The third project is a proposed resolution
- 9 approving Envoy Technologies for about a \$749,000 grant to
- 10 demonstrate an innovative car-sharing program in the
- 11 Sacramento Metro and North San Joaquin areas. The project
- 12 will provide electric vehicles in affordable multi-unit
- 13 housing developments and familiarize drivers with battery
- 14 electric vehicles. Envoy will deploy 30 Volkswagen E-golfs
- 15 and install 15 Level 2 chargers during the 1 year
- 16 demonstration.
- 17 And the fourth project is a proposed resolution
- 18 approving Envoy Technologies for about a \$749,000 grant to
- 19 demonstrate an innovative car-sharing program in the Bay
- 20 Area. The project will also provide electric vehicles to
- 21 residents in affordable multi-unit housing developments and
- 22 familiarize drivers with battery electric vehicles. Envoy
- 23 will deploy 30 Volkswagen E-golfs and install 15 Level 2
- 24 chargers during the 1 year demonstration.
- 25 If approved, the Energy Commission will provide

- 1 \$2.93 million in Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle
- 2 Technology Program funds.
- 3 Staff is requesting the Commissioner support and
- 4 approval of these proposed projects. I'm happy to answer
- 5 any questions you may have. Thank you
- 6 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 7 First, are there any comments from anyone in the
- 8 room? Then let's go on the line? And so I was going to
- 9 say I think we have the -- I think all three of the groups
- 10 are on the line. I assume maybe just for questions, so but
- 11 certainly if anyone wants to speak up go ahead.
- MR. PALACIOS-AVILA: Hello, this is Jonathan with
- 13 StratosFuel.
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Hi.
- MR. PALACIOS-AVILA: Hi. How's it going?
- 16 Yes, I have a comment regarding the innovative
- 17 mobility demonstration with zero emission vehicles. Again,
- 18 my name is Jonathan. I'm with StratosFuel. We are very
- 19 excited to be recommended for funding. It's an honor for
- 20 the CEC to do so. And part of our whole scope of work
- 21 we're looking to accomplish this is to further the Energy
- 22 Commission's publicly funded hydrogen stations through use
- 23 of fuel cell electric vehicles and to do so by introducing
- 24 these vehicles to disadvantaged communities.
- 25 And we think it's a great opportunity to do that

- 1 and the further the state's goal of reducing greenhouse gas
- 2 emissions. And especially in impacted areas that have high
- 3 levels of greenhouse gas emissions such as Riverside and
- 4 San Bernardino County. Thank you.
- 5 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 6 All right, yeah so if you want to say anything go
- 7 ahead, otherwise we'll move on to the third speaker. Okay.
- 8 Yeah, let's do it.
- 9 (Off mic colloquy.)
- 10 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Okay. Mr. Oldham, if you
- 11 want to say something okay. If you want to just hang on
- 12 for questions that's also good.
- MR. OLDHAM: Hello?
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Hello, go ahead.
- MR. OLDHAM: Yes, this is Joseph Oldham with the
- 16 CALSTART Clean transportation Center. And I would just
- 17 like to thank the Commission for recommending the approval
- 18 of our project in Fresno County. We're very excited about
- 19 this project to use all battery electric Chevy Volts to
- 20 demonstrate to high school students, or actually college
- 21 students, opportunities for our car sharing and ride
- 22 mobility from the rural communities, which have basically
- 23 been kind of out of the mainstream in terms of looking at
- 24 electric propulsion system vehicles. So we're really
- 25 excited about this project.

- 1 And I'm available to answer any questions that
- 2 the Commission may have.
- 3 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Yeah. This is
- 4 Commissioner Hochschild. I have a question for you. I
- 5 know one of the barriers for ride sharing with electric
- 6 vehicles has been the charge time. And Electrify America,
- 7 the VW settlement money is doing 5,000 chargers in the next
- 8 20 months with a really, really new fast charger. I think
- 9 it's a 20 miles per minute of charge. And I'm just
- 10 curious, the chargers you intend to use for these vehicles,
- 11 if you could share a little bit about the charge time. Are
- 12 they Level 2 or Level 3 or something different?
- MR. OLDHAM: They're Level 2. They're 75 amp
- 14 Level 2's, so they're 18 kilowatt chargers. So they can
- 15 charge the Volts fairly quickly. The Volt though has about
- 16 well conservatively 240 miles of range. And so the
- 17 distances that these vehicles will travel, we believe will
- 18 be well within their range capacity without having to do a
- 19 mid-day charging. But Fresno City College is installing
- 20 Level 2 chargers and as these vehicles have layover time at
- 21 City College they will be able to use those chargers, as
- 22 well as the chargers that are located at Fresno County EOC,
- 23 which will be the basis for the operations of the vehicles.
- 24 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Thank you.
- MR. OLDHAM: Thank you.

- 1 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thanks. So we'll
- 2 transition to Commissioners. Commissioner Scott asked me
- 3 to read a statement on this item also. So let me do that.
- 4 "We are really changing the way people move with
- 5 growing trends in car-sharing and ride-hailing services.
- 6 It is important that as we make these transitions we do it
- 7 in a smart way, integrating zero and near zero emission
- 8 vehicles where we can.
- 9 "The projects being proposed today meet multiple
- 10 objectives of the Alternative Renewable Fuel and Vehicle
- 11 Technology Program. They are demonstrating zero emission
- 12 technologies, including both battery electric and fuel cell
- 13 electric in innovative applications, providing clean
- 14 transportation options, as well as education and exposure
- 15 opportunities to many California residents who may not
- 16 otherwise have access to these vehicles, helping to address
- 17 the state's climate goals and clean air standards and
- 18 providing good representation to geographical diversity,
- 19 touching on multiple regions throughout the state.
- 20 "I think the staff did a great job developing
- 21 this solicitation and the potential projects are a
- 22 reflection of that. I am excited about the potential of
- 23 these projects and would like to support moving them
- 24 forward."
- 25 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Well, just as a comment

- 1 maybe building on that. I agree ride sharing is really
- 2 changing the transportation sector and we need to be in
- 3 that with alternative fuels and vehicles as well to help --
- 4 it's a great opportunity as well to build exposure to these
- 5 vehicles among a larger group of the population than would
- 6 be necessarily ready to jump up and lease or buy one of
- 7 them. So I see a lot of opportunity here.
- 8 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Yeah, there are a number
- 9 of cities in China which are transitioning all their taxis
- 10 to zero emissions. Shenzhen, as you know, and sort of
- 11 Beijing is moving in that direction. So I think in the
- 12 California context it's probably more moving ride-sharing
- 13 than taxi services at this point. But again, buses too
- 14 obviously.
- 15 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: I'll --
- 16 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: One final observation,
- 17 I think the ride-hailing approach, getting EVs into those
- 18 fleets is actually a really strategic move. It's one of
- 19 the challenges we funded. A lot of people in California
- 20 have never been in an EV and unless you are friends with an
- 21 early adaptor you wouldn't.
- 22 And I think you look at how transportation is
- 23 changing; the ride-hailing is taking off like a rocket.
- 24 And I think it's a great way to just expose the public to
- 25 EVs. And the way it works people get in, they try it, they

- 1 like it. And I think this is a great way to get a lot more
- 2 people in to the vehicles that wouldn't otherwise get in,
- 3 so I certainly approve the approach.
- I would, unless there's further comments, I'd
- 5 move the item.
- 6 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Second.
- 7 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 8 (Ayes.)
- 9 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: It passes 4-0. Thank
- 10 you.
- 11 Let's go on to Item 7 Global Algae Innovations,
- 12 Inc.
- MS. MAGANA: Good Morning Chair Weisenmiller and
- 14 Commissioners. I'm Pilar Magaña with the Research and
- 15 Development Division and am presenting the following two
- 16 items for approval. Both of these items are funded through
- 17 general funding for climate change research, development
- 18 and demonstration for California's transportation sector.
- 19 The following projects were selected for funding
- 20 through a one-time directive under either an EPIC or a
- 21 natural gas research funding. The one-time expenditure
- 22 authority for \$15 million was to support research to reduce
- 23 petroleum use, drive greenhouse gas reductions and improve
- 24 air quality from California's transportation sector.
- 25 The proposed projects under this program are

- 1 designed to inform near-term adoption and implementation of
- 2 low carbon fuels to address critical research needs not
- 3 addressed in current research programs.
- 4 While other programs such as the Alternative and
- 5 Renewable Fuels and Vehicle Technology Program have focused
- 6 on upgrading of biofuels there is a need to focus on the
- 7 conversion processes of waste feedstocks to an intermediate
- 8 fuel using advanced technologies that can be upgraded using
- 9 existing infrastructure such as refineries.
- 10 The first project is with Global Algae
- 11 Innovations and was selected through a federal cost share
- 12 solicitation. The purpose of this solicitation was to
- 13 provide funding to applicants that were successful in
- 14 receiving federal funding, specifically for projects that
- 15 focused on low carbon fuel research and development.
- The project secured funding through a Federal DOE
- 17 opportunity for \$1.2 million that focused on project
- 18 development for pilot scale manufacturing of biofuels,
- 19 bioproducts and biopower. The purpose of this project is
- 20 to design a pilot-scale algae fuel production facility for
- 21 the production of bio-oil.
- 22 Through this agreement Global Algae Innovations
- 23 will work with UC San Diego to design and complete the
- 24 front-end loaded preliminary planning of this facility.
- 25 Additional efforts include the site evaluation and

- 1 selection, lifecycle analysis, techno-economic analysis,
- 2 and business plan development for the facility.
- 3 This work will build off of existing validation
- 4 work previously completed that sought to improve the
- 5 economics of algae production at a larger scale. And this
- 6 work will focus on the design of a California-specific
- 7 facility with plans to eventually build the pilot facility
- 8 in either Riverside County of Imperial Valley.
- 9 Furthermore, Global Algae Innovations will
- 10 conduct research to expand the library of local algae
- 11 strains available for use in a future pilot plant. And
- 12 research will be conducted at UC San Diego's Cal-CAB algae
- 13 research center and biological fuel station.
- 14 In addition to the \$1.2 million in federal
- 15 funding received, Global Algae Innovations will be
- 16 providing an additional 600,000 in match funding.
- 17 I'd be happy to answer any questions.
- 18 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 19 Any comments from anyone in the room, anyone on
- 20 the line?
- 21 (No audible response.)
- CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: So we'll transition to
- 23 Commissioners. I'm the Lead on Research and Development,
- 24 so I'll say a few words on this.
- 25 As you know our program has actually has very

- 1 limited scope on transportation fuels. And this, I think
- 2 the next one are sort of unique programs where we got some
- 3 funds to basically do some research to really support the
- 4 low carbon fuel standards. We also have gotten some other
- 5 money that's dealing with more with some of the adaptation
- 6 question for our petroleum infra structure. So again, we
- 7 got a little bit of money. I think we were surprised about
- 8 how many actual projects were there, which could have --
- 9 where we could be matching federal funds. And this is
- 10 certainly one of them. It's certainly an interesting
- 11 application and great people to support it.
- 12 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Well, I think it's a
- 13 really exciting application. I would be -- and I hope it's
- 14 an extremely successful project. We certainly need this
- 15 kind of application, so I'm in strong support. I'll move
- 16 approval.
- 17 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Second.
- 18 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 19 (Ayes.)
- 20 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: So this passes 4-0.
- 21 Thank you.
- Let's go on to Item 8 Research and Demonstrations
- 23 to Decarbonize Transportation Fuel.
- MS. MAGANA: Okay. This next item is a project
- 25 with Lawrence Livermore National Lab and was selected under

- 1 a low carbon fuels research and demonstration solicitation.
- 2 The purpose of this solicitation was to support
- 3 the pilot-scale demonstration of thermochemical conversion
- 4 systems for the production of bio-oil that can be upgraded
- 5 to low carbon drop-in renewable diesel. The intent was to
- 6 fund advanced systems that can utilize California-based
- 7 feedstocks resulting in an intermediate fuel product that
- 8 when upgraded is fungible with existing infrastructure and
- 9 vehicle technologies.
- 10 The purpose of this project is to demonstrate a
- 11 technology called auto-thermal process intensified
- 12 pyrolysis for the production of bio-oil. This pyrolysis
- 13 technology under this agreement has many advantages over
- 14 conventional pyrolysis systems.
- The proposed technology developed by Iowa State
- 16 University simplifies the design of the pyrolysis reactor
- 17 eliminating a number of the components typically included
- 18 in a pyrolysis system, thereby reducing both the capital
- 19 and operating costs. This system design will also allow
- 20 for the construction of smaller modular systems that can be
- 21 distributed and scaled to be suitable for a variety of
- 22 facilities using a variety of feedstocks.
- 23 Successful testing has already been conducted
- 24 using this system at the lab scale and this project will
- 25 scale up to a pilot plant.

- 1 While this technology has been tested using
- 2 agricultural waste, it shows great promise to address the
- 3 excessive amount of woody biomass available in California.
- 4 Lawrence Livermore National Lab will also be
- 5 conducting extensive testing on the quality of the bio-oil
- 6 being produced and developing a commercialization pathway
- 7 for the bio-oil to ensure the compatibility with existing
- 8 infrastructure for upgrading.
- 9 ARB has also shown interest in working with
- 10 Lawrence Livermore National Lab to develop an LCFS pathway
- 11 for this project. And the demonstration site for this
- 12 project is at Sierra Pacific Industries' sawmill in Camino,
- 13 California. And approximately \$1.4 million will be
- 14 provided in match funding.
- 15 Thank you for your consideration. If you have
- 16 any questions I'd be happy to answer them.
- 17 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 18 Any comments from anyone in the room, anyone on
- 19 the line?
- 20 (No audible response.)
- 21 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: So transition to
- 22 Commissioners again. Again as Lead Commissioner I'll say a
- 23 few words on it.
- I think everyone knows we have an incredible
- 25 problem with our dead trees and trying to find

- 1 applications. We're doing some research projects. This is
- 2 a good example of one to try to convert the woody biomass
- 3 to something useful on the energy side. And these are
- 4 fairly difficult to pull off, but so we're certainly trying
- 5 different technologies and this is one of those. So we
- 6 certainly encourage people to support it.
- 7 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: I strongly agree on that
- 8 point.
- 9 Commissioner McAllister, you have a comment?
- 10 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: A little on the field,
- 11 but it's kind of interesting. And so Sierra Pacific is
- 12 obviously a big integrated, global company really, but
- 13 based in California and uses lots of wood in California.
- 14 But they actually have a lot of businesses that are
- 15 relevant for this Commission including being one of the
- 16 most prominent window manufacturers in the country. And
- 17 so their supply chain is they harvest the wood from their
- 18 forests and they make really beautiful wood-framed windows
- 19 and control the whole supply chain and really make
- 20 beautiful products that are relatively affordable for
- 21 people to do efficient buildings.
- 22 So anyway, just it's nice to see them sort of
- 23 really taking advantage of that supply chain and exploring
- 24 these kinds of opportunities.
- 25 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Well, they certainly on

- 1 the biomass side have had probably the only cost effective
- 2 projects the PUC has seen, so far.
- 3 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Yeah, so really a
- 4 leader in a lot of different fields. So I'll move this
- 5 item.
- 6 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Second.
- 7 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those favor?
- 8 (Ayes.)
- 9 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: This passes 4-0 again.
- 10 Thanks.
- 11 Let's go on to Item 9, the Discussion of Energy
- 12 Commission Progress Re: Implementation of Clean Energy and
- 13 Pollution Reduction Act of 2015. Michael?
- MR. SOKOL: All right. Good morning,
- 15 Commissioners. So I just have a very brief update on the
- 16 SB 350 front today. In addition to the adoption of the
- 17 advisory group charter that you heard just earlier this
- 18 meeting, there were two other updates I wanted to provide
- 19 to you.
- 20 The first is regarding the integrated resource
- 21 planning greenhouse gas emission reduction targets for
- 22 utilities. SB 350 requires the California Air Resources
- 23 Board to adopt individual targets for planning purposes in
- 24 integrated resource plans. But as part of that is it's in
- 25 coordination with the Energy Commission and the Public

- 1 Utilities Commission. And so we had a couple of workshops
- 2 earlier this year with those other agencies. Staff has
- 3 been working to develop the methodology that we would
- 4 recommend to the Air Resources Board for getting to
- 5 publicly owned utility-specific targets.
- And we are working currently to finalize a memo
- 7 with the intent of putting that on our docket as interim
- 8 guidance for what our recommendation would look like to the
- 9 Air Resource Board. And so the intent is to get that memo
- 10 on our docket at the end of this year. And then support
- 11 Air Resources Board in the formal process, as it moves
- 12 forward next year.
- 13 The second item is related to the SB 350 Low-
- 14 Income Barrier Study implementation. And this is on the
- 15 development of an Energy Equity Indicators Tracking
- 16 Progress Report. And staff has been working for the better
- 17 part of this year on developing a range of indicators that
- 18 can be used to track the performance of clean energy
- 19 programs in low-income disadvantaged communities with the
- 20 intent of putting out a tracking progress report. Likely
- 21 early next month, is the target at this point and so you'll
- 22 hear more about the specifics of some of those indicators
- 23 at a future meeting.
- And of course, we'll be happy to offer briefings
- 25 as needed, but wanted to let you know that we're in the

- 1 final stages of coming up with a draft tracking progress
- 2 there that we'll be unveiling shortly here.
- 3 So happy to take any questions or any comments
- 4 from Commissioners.
- 5 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: No, just on the
- 6 tracking progress or on the metrics for the low-income I
- 7 think that's just usually important. I think we all agree
- 8 and Commissioner Scott's not here today, so I'm sure she
- 9 would have comments on that. But those metrics I think are
- 10 to see change at the Commission and broadly in government,
- 11 but certainly here is that we're trying be more informed
- 12 and more accountable and use metrics that we can actually
- 13 go measure out there and be accountable too. So I think
- 14 that's really a positive. I think staff's doing a great
- 15 job on that. It's a tough job actually and I think we're
- 16 making good progress. So thanks.
- 17 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Mike, I just wanted to
- 18 thank you. You've been -- this has been a long process
- 19 with a lot of moving parts and you've been really attentive
- 20 to all the details. And we really, really appreciate it.
- 21 With that I would move the item, unless there's other --
- 22 did we not use -- is this informational. Do we need to
- 23 approve anything on the subject?
- 24 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: No. It's just a report,
- 25 so okay.

- 1 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Okay.
- 2 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Yeah, I was just going to
- 3 note on the metrics this will be the first time, so there
- 4 are certainly data gaps, which we can fill over time. But
- 5 the notion is not to get hung up on shooting for perfection
- 6 at which point we'd never get this one done, as opposed to
- 7 taking a step-by-step approach.
- 8 So again thanks, Mike.
- 9 Let's go on to minutes.
- 10 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Move approval.
- 11 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Second it.
- 12 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: All those in favor?
- 13 (Ayes.)
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: The minutes are approved
- $15 \quad 4-0$.
- 16 WEISENMILLER: Lead Commissioner or Presiding
- 17 Member Reports, so I'm going to lead with Commissioner
- 18 Scott's comments. And then I'll speak at the end too on my
- 19 own, but just so we're clear this is Commissioner Scott.
- 20 And she wants to recognize exceptional staff at our end-of-
- 21 year Business Meeting.
- "And so although I am unable to be here in person
- 23 today I'd like to share my sincere appreciation for staff
- 24 and the great work, dedication, and commitment they have
- 25 demonstrated throughout the year.

- 1 "The successes we experience here at the Energy
- 2 Commission are built on the efforts of our staff and 2017
- 3 has been a year for making progress, particularly for those
- 4 of us working in the transportation space.
- 5 "If you would be so kind to indulge me, I may
- 6 highlight some of the Energy Commission's 2017
- 7 transportation accomplishments briefly at the January
- 8 Business Meeting. And I will include a few brief FTD thank
- 9 yous at that time."
- I think obviously we'll accommodate her on that.
- "Until then, my heartfelt thanks to the FTD team
- 12 and the work they carry out each day. They are
- 13 transforming transportation in California due in no small
- 14 part to their laudable work.
- 15 "As Lead Commissioner on the implementation of
- 16 the recommendations in the SB 350 Barrier Study I can't
- 17 thank Michael Sokol enough for his continued leadership as
- 18 well as a special coordination on all things SB 350-
- 19 related. I also want to thank Alana Mathews, Jana Romero,
- 20 and Galen Lemei.
- 21 "This is my first year of serving as the Chair of
- 22 the Western Interstate Regional Advisory Board and I would
- 23 like to thank Grace Anderson, Al Alvarado, Justin Cochran,
- 24 Chris McLean, and the team for their continued support.
- 25 "I want to thank Drew Bohan, Siva Gunda, Matt

- 1 Coldwell and Siva's team for developing a robust draft
- 2 Transportation Energy Demand Forecast." I was going to say
- 3 amen to that.
- 4 "Melissa Jones-Ferguson and Vince Vicari from our
- 5 Media team have worked in close coordination with me and my
- 6 team ensuring that we are up to speed and fully engaged on
- 7 media opportunities.
- 8 "Barry Steinhart, Sarah Smith, Jose Torres from
- 9 OGA have always provided great legislative support. Thanks
- 10 to all of you for your great work this year.
- "I would like to acknowledge former Executive
- 12 Director Rob Oglesby who retired in September and our new
- 13 Executive Director, Drew Bohan, for being able to seemly
- 14 step into his new role as well as Kourtney Vaccaro for the
- 15 thoughtful leadership they display and the high standard
- 16 they set for the Commission each and every day.
- "It goes without saying that without my wonderful
- 18 team, Rhetta, Matta and Monica this job would be much
- 19 harder. They help keep me organized and increase the
- 20 bandwidth of my office and overall do an amazing job. And
- 21 they're a lot of fun too. I couldn't ask for a better set
- 22 of people to work with.
- "And finally, to my fellow Commissioners I
- 24 continue to appreciate the experience and expertise you
- 25 bring to the Commission. It's been a true joy working with

- 1 you. Thank you to everyone at the Commission who helped
- 2 make 2017 such a productive and inspiring year."
- 3 So with that, Commissioner McAllister?
- 4 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: So well, I'm not going
- 5 to read my whole huge list of people to thank today, but
- 6 maybe we can all do that in January. I don't know, after
- 7 our New Year's celebration. In some ways I'm really glad
- 8 to get 2017 behind me, but I'm going to go down a few
- 9 things that I did between the last meeting and now, just
- 10 the notable couple of things.
- But first I just want to leave at a high level
- 12 thanking everyone in the Efficiency Division for their
- 13 amazing work. I mean, every business meeting you all know
- 14 we just have just a marching forward of many different
- 15 fronts on the efficiency side of things where we have big
- 16 goals. And I think in the 350 scheme of things it might be
- 17 the kind of most complex and arguably the most difficult
- 18 piece of 350 to double efficiency. And it has a lot of
- 19 different fronts and a lot of stakeholders and a lot of
- 20 complexity.
- 21 And our staff is just amazing keeping dozens and
- 22 dozens of plates spinning and keeping my office
- 23 information. Certainly Brian Early, Martha Brook, my
- 24 advisers this year have been just phenomenal. And I
- 25 certainly want to reiterate certainly Drew and Kourtney.

- 1 You guys, Drew, welcome again, I'll say you really hit the
- 2 ground running, sprinting really. And Kourtney as well,
- 3 just the sage kind of counsel from both of you actually to
- 4 help really kind of keep the right barriers up and keep us
- 5 moving in the right direction.
- And then just in challenges that I've faced this
- 7 year I really appreciate my colleagues up and down the
- 8 Commission. I mean, from really everyone here in the
- 9 building, but most directly my fellow Commissioners for all
- 10 their support this year. It hasn't been an easy year for
- 11 me in some pretty central ways.
- I guess I'll just make a couple of highlights of
- 13 things you might find interesting since the last business
- 14 meeting. I was able to spend a week in Australia and it
- 15 was covered by -- the invite came from and was covered by
- 16 the Australian Energy Efficiency Council, another big
- 17 conference there, Australia-wide conference on energy
- 18 efficiency. And there's a particular opening this year for
- 19 the efficiency discussion there.
- 20 And there are a lot of parallels. You know,
- 21 Australia and the U.S. have a lot in common. There are a
- 22 lot of big differences, a number of big differences. They
- 23 still have a -- well and certainly differences with
- 24 California. Australia has a heavily coal-based energy
- 25 system, and I think the most carbon intensive generation

- 1 fleet in the world or pretty close to it. And are having a
- 2 conversation about how to get beyond their large coal
- 3 plants that are at the end of their life and so efficiency
- 4 has got to be a key strategy for them. And so people were
- 5 very open to that message, so it was very -- they certainly
- 6 got the most out of me in terms of the media and utilizing
- 7 the time I was there for best effect. And so now it looks
- 8 like we're going to get a nice delegation of Australians in
- 9 for the Climate Summit next September. So that will I
- 10 think be helpful.
- 11 Let's see, yesterday I participated in a rates
- 12 workshop over at the PUC and really with the goal of kind
- 13 of coordinating and just kind of helping highlight the fact
- 14 that we are very interested in the rates discussion as well
- 15 and making sure that that's sort of present at our sister
- 16 agency. So I was happy to see that happen, not exactly
- 17 clear what the next steps are to getting to more dynamic
- 18 rates. But it's at least a pretty robust conversation
- 19 that's happening over there, which is good.
- 20 On the first LBL had an event, sort of really a
- 21 science event symposium in memory of Art Rosenfeld, which
- 22 was really a beautiful thing. It has Steve Chu gave a
- 23 talk. John Holdren came out to give the final wrap-up
- 24 keynote. John Holdren, really the de facto leader of the
- 25 science resistance at this point and just an amazing human

- 1 being in person, but visionary leader and just very
- 2 inspiring as he always was when he was out here at Berkeley
- 3 and continues to be now that he's on the other coast. It
- 4 must be, at some point, kind of heart-wrenching for him to
- 5 see a lot of the work that he did with the Obama
- 6 Administration come undone or disrespected really. But he
- 7 has a big heart and he's working to make the best of the
- 8 situation in doing his part. Amory Lovins was there, Arun
- 9 Majumdar, so really it was a kind of a who's who of the
- 10 science and energy field and it was just a very inspiring
- 11 day.
- We gave a talk down at the ZNE Schools Awards
- down in Pasadena a couple of weeks ago and that was really
- 14 inspiring too. A lot of schools are doing Zero Net Energy
- 15 and there's just much innovation going on and learning.
- 16 And beautiful leadership by school administrations and
- 17 taking advantage of the Prop 39 money and kicking in some
- 18 of the utility ratepayer portfolio funds and just figure
- 19 out ways to get it done, so very inspiring.
- 20 And let's see, I guess I did want to highlight a
- 21 couple of other things. You may or may not know that the
- 22 FHA -- speaking of reversing previous administration's
- 23 policies' the FHA has gone back on the PACE Policy, which
- 24 they've now decided not to buy mortgages that have PACE
- 25 liens on them. So that's a setback federally, but again

- 1 there's kind of a California resistance on some of that.
- 2 We'll see how it pans out, but we dealt with that issue.
- 3 The state was hopeful that that message would get to
- 4 Washington, but it didn't seem to, so a very negative
- 5 message from HUD on that front.
- And finally, we've been having a lot of
- 7 conversations about the fire recovery. You know, many,
- 8 many people reaching out saying how do we turn this tragedy
- 9 into an opportunity. And I guess having been through this
- 10 in San Diego a decade or so ago, and having come up with
- 11 programs and run programs to help people rebuild green down
- 12 after the '05, '06 fires in San Diego I'm certainly
- 13 encouraging those efforts.
- But I'm also kind of giving people a little bit
- of a reality check in terms of just the challenges that
- 16 people who've been burned out face are just multiple. And
- 17 most of them don't have to do with rebuilding energy
- 18 efficiently. They have to do with getting their kids back
- 19 in school and figuring out where they're going to live and
- 20 all of those near-term things. Dealing with insurance and
- 21 whether they're even going to move back to the same place.
- 22 But so those decisions will get made and those
- 23 rebuilding projects will happen. And so there's, I guess
- 24 our call should be to help facilitate to help encourage
- 25 those discussions, to work with the local governments and

- 1 the building authorities there in each place. To put in
- 2 place strategies, so that when they do get increasing
- 3 applications for rebuilding they can effectively marshal
- 4 the resources to help people rebuild in the best way they
- 5 can not only to comply with code, but to go beyond code.
- 6 And so a lot of really good will in that conversation, a
- 7 lot of people working on it and contributing pro bono
- 8 effort to help it happen. The local government's really
- 9 interested in it, so now that we've got big, big
- 10 communities that have been affected by fires in Northern
- 11 California and Southern California I think we ought to be
- 12 thinking about a statewide conversation. So hopefully we
- 13 can keep engaged on that and help marshal something that
- 14 comes out strategically appropriate.
- So that's it for now.
- 16 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: All right. Thank you.
- 17 I've got a brief report on the last couple of weeks and
- 18 then a number of thank yous as well.
- On the offshore wind issue we've had a number of
- 20 conversations and one high-level meeting with Department of
- 21 Defense, Department of Interior, and the services that
- 22 provided assessments on offshore wind and the conflicts
- 23 along the Central Coast with military operations. We had a
- 24 really good discussion about just to better understand what
- 25 some of the issues are. That will be part of a series of

- 1 discussions going forward.
- I had the opportunity to speak at Western
- 3 Regional Partnerships in Arizona. It was a really nice
- 4 event, well-attended, a lot of both federal officials and
- 5 also state energy officials. And my panel was Energy
- 6 Policy Changes and the Implications of Those Changes for
- 7 Western States. And so, of course, from the Department of
- 8 Energy there was very much a perspective along the lines of
- 9 the rulemaking proposed by Department of Energy that would
- 10 support baseloads such as coal facilities, nuclear
- 11 facilities.
- 12 And I was there to provide much more of a
- 13 California perspective, which is not just prospective
- 14 policy, but also here's what we've done. Here's what we've
- 15 changed in our electricity system. These are our needs.
- 16 This is the direction we're going and we're really going in
- 17 a direction where for a whole host of reasons some policy-
- 18 driven and some market-driven, those same resources are
- 19 really both priced out of our market. And also not what's
- 20 needed, we need flexibility. We need more -- lower zero
- 21 GHG resources and we have various means by which to fill
- 22 those needs. And there are many opportunities for us to
- 23 work collaboratively with other western states in the
- 24 Western Regional Partnership region to help meet those
- 25 needs. So it was really, I think beneficial that I was

- 1 able to be at that event.
- I also, for the very first time and maybe the
- 3 Chair will tell me if it was the first time ever for an
- 4 Energy Commission, had the opportunity to speak at the
- 5 Society of Naval Architects and Marine Engineers, SNAME, in
- 6 the Bay Area. It was a new one for me to be --
- 7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Indiscernible)
- 8 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Yes, the SNAME.
- 9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: SNAME?
- 10 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Yes, the SNAME, the
- 11 Society of Naval Architects and Marine Engineers. It was a
- 12 very technical heavy room made up of people who are marine
- 13 architects and naval -- naval architects and marine
- 14 engineers. They design and build ships and structures that
- 15 go in the ocean. And obviously, it was the offshore wind
- 16 interest that led them to invite me to be there. And it
- 17 was fun and fascinating conversation and a nice group of
- 18 folks many of whom actually came out of various programs at
- 19 Berkeley and knew each other from the Berkeley Engineering
- 20 Department at UC Berkeley.
- 21 So going to some of my thank yous I really like
- 22 to take a moment in December and recognize the hard work
- 23 and collective effort that it take us as an organization to
- 24 get our work done. You know, Commissioners try to guide
- 25 and we try to -- you know, we set policy and we work with

- 1 staff, but really the hard work gets done by folks in this
- 2 building at all levels from developing policy and carrying
- 3 out workshops and making sure things get posted on time.
- 4 And making sure that we're looking at legal and policy and
- 5 stakeholder and just checking all the boxes we need to
- 6 check and doing a really good job on that.
- 7 And so in my world as the Lead Commissioner for
- 8 Siting I've been on every active siting case or amendment
- 9 committee in 2017, largely with Commissioner Scott who has
- 10 been a wonderful partner on these cases. Also with
- 11 Commissioner McAllister who has also been a wonderful
- 12 partner on these cases. And I continue to be involved
- 13 compliance and some enforcement and legal matters as
- 14 needed.
- 15 As the attorney Commissioner I try to spend some
- 16 little extra attention on the Legal Office and work with
- 17 the Chief Counsel to help make sure that the Legal Office
- 18 has the support it needs. Thanks to Drew Bohan for
- 19 stepping in and his energy and dedication, I think are
- 20 going to be -- and new ideas and carrying forward some
- 21 existing policies that have been really good. And I think
- 22 I'm really excited to have you here.
- 23 So I want to give a big thank you to staff in the
- 24 Siting Division. This year we've worked on about eight. A
- 25 lot of these have been really major critical

- 1 infrastructure. They've been complex and hard cases. They
- 2 include some of the projects needed, for example at
- 3 Huntington Beach and Alamitos to meet our one-through
- 4 cooling deadlines and help maintain reliability in Southern
- 5 California. It was really, really important that we get
- 6 the job done of reviewing and moving through the process on
- 7 those projects. They're both, Huntington Beach and
- 8 Alamitos, under construction as we speak. And I had a
- 9 chance to go to kind of a dedication that AES put together
- 10 for Huntington Beach just yesterday. And I got a nice --
- 11 well maybe two days ago this week.
- 12 In any case, it takes about 30 staff to move
- 13 through an end review of an application. It includes
- 14 project managers, engineers, biologists, archeologists,
- 15 attorneys, project assistants and more. They work really
- 16 hard to get these projects through the process, but the
- 17 Siting Division does a lot more. They have really improved
- 18 the way they handle in processing time on amendments.
- 19 They're thinking really hard about how to make compliance
- 20 documents more accessible, more transparent. And they're
- 21 working hard to do more site visits of projects and just
- 22 help project owners and help make sure projects are being
- 23 operated in compliance with their permits.
- 24 They also have a really important role on
- 25 planning and have done a particularly good job. I'm the

- 1 state representative on the BOEM, Bureau of Ocean Energy
- 2 Management in California Renewable Energy Taskforce, which
- 3 is a group of federal, state agencies, military and
- 4 federally-recognized tribes coordinating on offshore wind.
- 5 I'm not the only state representative. There are a number
- 6 of other -- many other state agencies on this, but I helped
- 7 coordinate this effort.
- 8 And so the staff in the Siting Division have
- 9 provided really critical support to that effort on outreach
- 10 and data collection. And they've really brought some of
- 11 the skills that they honed in working in the desert and
- 12 working in the Central Valley and working in other parts of
- 13 the state to this effort as well.
- I want to thank Kristy Chew. Her role as
- 15 Technical Advisor to the Commissioners on Siting, she has
- 16 been invaluable. As well as the attorneys, hearing
- 17 officers and support staff who help us keep that going and
- 18 Kourtney for her leadership here.
- I thank the Public Adviser, everyone in the
- 20 Public Adviser's Office, the Cultural Resources Unit, Tom
- 21 Gates, Gabriel Roark, Matthew Braun and Jessica Bonitz,
- 22 they've been wonderful in many respects, but particularly
- 23 in the work with tribes and tribal consultation.
- On the Consent Calendar today we had an MOU with
- 25 the Government of Scotland. That MOU was to exchange

- 1 information and give us access to experience in Scotland on
- 2 dealing with reviews of offshore wind and also learning
- 3 about the projects that have been built off of Scotland.
- 4 Scotland has about 25 percent of the total offshore wind
- 5 resource in Europe. They've developed 197 megawatts of
- 6 operational projects. They've got over 4 gigawatts of
- 7 permitted projects and the world's first floating offshore
- 8 wind farm is in Scotland and recently began delivering
- 9 power to the Scottish Electrical Grid in October of this
- 10 year.
- 11 So we have a lot to learn from our colleagues in
- 12 Scotland and it's a really great opportunity, not only for
- 13 Energy Commission staff, but also and maybe more
- 14 importantly Coastal Commission and Ocean Protection
- 15 Council, California Department of Fish and Wildlife. And
- 16 part of the purpose of that MOU is not just to inform us,
- 17 but to provide a way for our colleagues in other state
- 18 agencies to get access to this kind of data and
- 19 experiencing information.
- 20 So let's see, so I want to give a quick thank you
- 21 finally to Paul Jacobs, the Energy Commission's Deputy for
- 22 Compliance Assistance and Enforcement; Barry Steinhart, our
- 23 Legislative Director; Albert Lundeen and his media team. I
- 24 already said thank you to Kourtney and Drew and my
- 25 Executive Assistant Ollie Awolowo without whom I would be

- 1 completely underwater most of the time and my advisers, Le-
- 2 Quyen Nguyen and Jennifer Nelson, about whom I could say
- 3 the same thing. And so with that, thank you.
- 4 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: Well, ditto to all that
- 5 and my thanks as well to my team, the Renewables team, and
- 6 Kourtney, Drew and everyone who keeps the trains running
- 7 here thank you to you all.
- 8 A quick update on my trip to Europe and the
- 9 Climate Summit, so I spoke at the UN Sustainable Innovation
- $10\,\,$ Forum at the Climate Summit. One thing I just wanted to
- 11 point out, the Governor partnered with former New York City
- 12 Mayor Mike Bloomberg on a big structure right outside the
- 13 Summit that said, "America's Pledge, we're still in," and
- 14 listed the 300 cities and states and all their commitments.
- 15 And they had people handing out leaflets and they had a big
- 16 poster and it was really just, I think an important
- 17 statement to make about all the work that we're doing with
- 18 all of our colleagues and allies around the country. And I
- 19 think there's a lot of gratitude for that from the other
- 20 parties.
- I spoke also at the launch of the International
- 22 Energy Agency's new report. And actually they have done
- 23 some very innovative things including some short videos
- 24 about -- so last year I think the world's largest source of
- 25 new electric generation. And it's a grid with solar and

- 1 they did a whole little video about this. And in a few
- 2 minutes I'm going to ask Albert to show a short one we're
- 3 going to be releasing around the tracking progress report.
- I spoke at the World Energy Council in Berlin, at
- 5 50Hertz and a few other places. But I just to repeat the
- 6 obvious the eyes of the world are on California. We are
- 7 seen as a county, and just incredible interest at every
- 8 level. I did my best to channel each of you. Mr. Chair is
- 9 on R&D and Commissioner McAllister on efficiency and
- 10 Commissioner Scott on transportation and Commissioner
- 11 Douglas on study and planning. I did my best, but you
- 12 can't match what you all do.
- I am also making progress on -- I committed to
- 14 visit all 44 publicly owned utilities around the state. I
- 15 think when I finish that, I'm at probably about 38 now I
- 16 will be the only person to have done that. And I say that,
- 17 because I don't think anyone else would be foolish enough
- 18 to make such a commitment.
- 19 But each one had been fascinating and we were at
- 20 Victorville. Courtney Smith and I went to Victorville last
- 21 week and they were at zero percent renewables. And you
- 22 engage them, you find out what's going on and they're going
- 23 to surpass their goals. And I -- particularly the small
- 24 utilities, their staff is very limited and I really
- 25 appreciated the engagement.

- 1 I also had an interesting visit right next to
- 2 Victorville is the BYD Factory, so this is a new -- the two
- 3 electric bus companies in the United States who are both
- 4 manufacturing in California. BYD has 800 employees. They
- 5 have sales in 15 states. I asked why they selected
- 6 California and it's because of the policy. It's created
- 7 the market, the proximity to their customers, and just a
- 8 quick snippet on kind of what the economics are.
- 9 So the buses retail for 700 K, a conventional bus
- 10 is 450, so you've got a 250 K delta. But what they're
- 11 doing, they can sell at 450 and finance the rest, because
- 12 it's \$50,000 a year of savings. Because the fuel costs are
- 13 so much less and the maintenance costs are so much less, so
- 14 I am really excited about the role of buses. And also the
- 15 ability to help with renewable integration, particularly
- 16 now as they're moving now in to school buses, which are
- 17 plugged in during the day. So great to see, I would
- 18 highly, highly commend any of you that are interested to go
- 19 visit that facility. It's a great tour. It's in Lancaster
- 20 and I think they're expanding quite rapidly as is Proterra.
- 21 As we've been meeting this morning, I just
- 22 checked the news and it looks like the House and Senate
- 23 have come to agreement on the tax bill. The question on my
- 24 mind is what is the fate of the \$7,500 EV tax credit?
- 25 That's hugely, hugely consequential. It got a very low

- 1 score from the CBO, I think only 200 million so it doesn't
- 2 provide -- taking it away doesn't really provide much
- 3 money. But it has a very negative impact on our state's
- 4 goals in reducing pollution in the transportation sector,
- 5 so we will see where that lands. I know the utilities and
- 6 the OEMs have been working hard to save it, but not clear
- 7 to me at this point.
- 8 I did want to say also yes, on the Climate
- 9 Summit my understanding is there will be 3,000 credentialed
- 10 dignitaries coming from around the world in September to
- 11 attend that in San Francisco. And obviously, we'll do
- 12 everything we can in any way possible, all of us here to
- 13 support that. But I think it's a very timely thing. I'm
- 14 really thrilled to see the Governor leading on that. And I
- 15 wanted to urge everyone who has not yet seen the Governor's
- 16 appearance on 60 Minutes last Sunday he was phenomenal. It
- 17 made me even prouder to be in California really. I want to
- 18 encourage everyone to see that.
- 19 So with that, Albert, if we could just show the
- 20 short videos. We're going to be tweeting this out publicly
- 21 with the tracking progress report.
- 22 [Audio issues with video.]
- 23 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: What? It wouldn't be a
- 24 proper presentation without a technical challenge.
- 25 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: The version we stream out

- 1 will be smooth when --
- 2 COMMISSIONER HOCHSCHILD: It's not much longer.
- 3 It just goes on to show one of the statistics we developed
- 4 we pulled out California from the U.S. economic gross stat
- 5 and we compare California's economic growth since 2000 with
- 6 the rest of the United States. And so California's at --
- 7 we've gone up 40 percent, our GP since 2000 and the rest of
- 8 the country 28 percent, and so that's kin of the point
- 9 we're making. We can do all this clean energy progress and
- 10 still have it be healthy for the economy.
- 11 So thanks to -- if we can -- no need to play the
- 12 rest, but we get the point. My thanks to the video team
- 13 and to Albert for helping. And that's it for me.
- 14 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Great. No, thank you. I
- 15 was going to say actually the first time the Governor went
- 16 to China there was a group who stayed behind and visited
- 17 BYD at their factory. Actually it's Build Your Dreams and
- 18 I've been there a second time in my various trips to China,
- 19 so it's certainly pretty impressive. But I think the
- 20 Governor's outreach really was a key factor in getting them
- 21 to come to Lancaster and to California.
- I'll talk a little bit about things I've done and
- 23 then end of the year thank yous. And I'll be brief on
- 24 major things.
- I think I just wanted to fly the Aliso Canyon

- 1 situation again. We've got three pipes out there to the
- 2 major supply source, so looking at the winter. We put out
- 3 a technical assessment. We got some comments. We've
- 4 basically finalized the technical assessment including
- 5 mitigation measures. And we have posted -- (music
- 6 interrupts briefly.) Yeah, if we can just -- anyway, we
- 7 have posted or are posting the comments to that moving
- 8 forward.
- 9 Probably the comment that has gotten the most
- 10 reaction was that Picker and I sent a letter to the
- 11 supervisors in L.A. County pointing out that they've been
- 12 pretty vociferous about shutting down Aliso Canyon down
- 13 now. At the same time they are permitting additional gas
- 14 development at Porter Ranch and so we've asked them to put
- 15 a moratorium on those developments. And so far that's not
- 16 been well received by them and certainly the building
- 17 industry does not like the suggestion. And at the same
- 18 time the PUC is working on its ability to do that through
- 19 regulatory move going forward.
- 20 But again, it's pretty serious. I certainly
- 21 encourage any and every one in Southern California to
- 22 conserve energy this winter. And we're certainly trying to
- 23 have some innovative programs out of the utilities to do
- 24 that. You know, we have enough problems with our electric
- 25 demand response, but anyway trying to get gas demand

- 1 response going forward. And so anyway it's going to be
- 2 important.
- We'll shift gears now to the thank yous. I think
- 4 I'm going to just start at the basics and then sort of talk
- 5 broadly. I mean, as Chair I interact with a lot of the
- 6 agency and I'll try not to repeat what's been hit so far,
- 7 but anyway or at least the ones I've dealt with mostly.
- 8 And you know, the key thing for me obviously is
- 9 my core staff. As Karen said just in terms of every day
- 10 basically marching along and helping us get things done I
- 11 certainly want to start with my next, Kevin, is my Chief of
- 12 Staff who is really helping pull things together
- 13 continually on stuff. And at the same time certainly
- 14 Catherine Cross and now with Jann Mitchell, in terms of
- 15 trying to get some sense of what I'm supposed to be doing
- 16 at any given time they're critical to do that and to just
- 17 deal with the realities of scheduling.
- 18 And with Catherine out we had a lot of people who
- 19 stepped in to help in that, so I certainly want to thank
- 20 all of them. I mean, Cathy Graber came back from
- 21 retirement and was sort of critical for a while. Doris
- 22 Yamamoto, Laura obviously, but just it was great the way
- 23 people stepped in to try to help as we were dealing with
- 24 that crisis.
- 25 And I think everyone has acknowledged, so moving

- 1 out a little bit broader from the office -- and I'll talk
- 2 about the other members of our office as I go along --
- 3 obviously Rob and Drew have been critical for the running
- 4 of this agency and sort of the reset we've done here. And
- 5 Rob particularly for his six years of service as our
- 6 Executive Director was a critical reset in legislative
- 7 relationships and just the management of this place.
- 8 At the same time I spent a lot of time last year
- 9 on sort of international stuff and certainly my
- 10 international team: Alana Sanchez, Michael Murza, Fan Dai
- 11 at the Governor's Office have been critical, particularly
- 12 on the China work, the Mexico work. Emilio has certainly
- 13 helped on the Mexico. It's really we've talked a lot about
- 14 how to have an impact on climate it has to be not just
- 15 California, but we really have to be sort of helping the
- 16 rest of the world learn off of our successful policies
- 17 moving forward to address greenhouse gas emissions.
- 18 This year I've been the Lead on the IEPR, so a
- 19 lot of thanks to a lot of people. Heather Raitt and her
- 20 team are just phenomenal I think in terms of the support
- 21 they give in that activity. And again, certainly we want
- 22 to thank them going forward.
- You know, in terms of one aspect of what I did on
- 24 the IEPR this year was obviously climate change adaptation
- 25 is really important in this Administration, so we had a

- 1 real focus there. My adviser Pam Doughman sort of did a
- 2 great job on climate adaptation and mitigation efforts,
- 3 also the metrics. But with that obviously on the
- 4 mitigation a lot of these people: Guido Franco and Susan
- 5 Wilhelm were sort of critical for pushing that along.
- Jana Romero really helped me on the Scoping Plan
- 7 that's been sort of a two-year effort. I think she thought
- 8 she escaped it going to the Chief Counsel's Office, she
- 9 didn't. And who knows whether it's done this year or
- 10 continues on its next balance. So obviously it's on a
- 11 five-year cycle and they start a little bit early and are
- 12 slowly catching up.
- 13 And I think as everyone has noted, I mean
- 14 certainly Kourtney is a key part of the basically
- 15 functioning of this organization. And we feel good about
- 16 the advice we're getting in that area and how the office is
- 17 moving. Certainly I think we all have had the opportunity
- 18 to work with the Gabe Herrera on a lot of these EPIC or
- 19 renewable stuff. He's a real workhorse there. And Allan
- 20 Ward, I mean we do a lot of contracts and a lot of
- 21 contracting and it's really critical that be done well.
- Obviously our Business Meetings, I mean we have a
- 23 Secretary that takes a huge roll there. I mean, Cody has
- 24 been phenomenal in terms of thank you for keeping things
- 25 running smoothly here as is Chester. I think again, I want

- 1 to thank you for dealing with and making sure that as we
- 2 are dealing with the public that it goes smoothly.
- In terms of my areas tend to be -- I wanted to
- 4 talk about sort of on the one hand the Executive Office
- 5 pieces and talk a little bit about the divisions I've
- 6 worked with. But certainly Lisa has done a phenomenal job
- 7 on auditing. I mean, this is something I'm not quite sure
- 8 how the agency has been around for as long as it has
- 9 without having a strong audit function. But it's really
- 10 important that people know that we take our contracts
- 11 seriously. And that we also ensure the public is getting
- 12 the value for their money.
- 13 I think Albert Lundeen and his staff have been
- 14 critical on the communication side. You know, I think
- 15 we're -- we basically want to really talk about how to get
- 16 the message out on what we're doing I think he's certainly
- 17 really stepped up the unit there. We have a lot more now
- 18 on the social media side. Give us the example this is the
- 19 sort of work that Vince and Katie have been doing in terms
- 20 of really getting that going.
- 21 And I want to thank Michael Ward for his efforts
- 22 to support us on R&D too in getting the message out. We've
- 23 got a lot of good blogs, but it's like does if the tree
- 24 falls in the forest does anyone know if no one hears?
- 25 Where similarly we do a lot of good work here, but if we

- 1 don't really make it easy for people to know what we're
- 2 doing then the place is never going to get the recognition
- 3 it needs.
- 4 In terms of the small office obviously Barry and
- 5 his shop have done a great job on the legislative side.
- 6 You know, again I think all of you know my first year as
- 7 Chair one of my priorities was really resetting the
- 8 legislative relationship, which was horrendous at that
- 9 point.
- I think all of us appreciate Michael Sokol's work
- 11 on the 350. And certainly appreciate Alana Mathews as a
- 12 Public Adviser. Certainly the compliance work has been
- 13 huge to get that done as Karen mentioned.
- Many of you probably haven't dealt with Justin
- 15 Cochran much, but I mean he's been critical not only in
- 16 emergency response, but also the nuclear stuff. But
- 17 certainly I can tell you all weekend when I was getting the
- 18 updates from the various utilities on how many people were
- 19 out of fire or how many acres he was sort of working
- 20 through that. Also trying to figure out if we were going
- 21 to have issues on those people trying to evacuate, did that
- 22 mean somebody would have gasoline shortages or what was
- 23 happening to not just to our power infrastructure, but to
- 24 our gas infrastructure, petroleum infrastructure. So
- 25 certainly Justin, Gordon Schremp, and Ryan Eggers are huge

- 1 resources for us in those areas.
- I think certainly in terms of going back to
- 3 Laurie ten Hope and sort of the Research and Development,
- 4 Laurie and Linda have both done a great job. Again, as I
- 5 said we had to reset from the Legislature sort of end it to
- 6 getting a lot of -- getting a program together that was
- 7 very solid and moving forward. We got a great decision out
- 8 of the PUC on the next step on the EPIC Program, which was
- 9 good. So again, I think there's a lot of hard work, but
- 10 it's sort of paying off.
- 11 Certainly, I want to thank Mike Gravely for his
- 12 work with us in the military. That's been a key
- 13 relationship. It's been important. Obviously on the IEPR
- 14 and other areas I interact a lot with Sylvia on her shop.
- 15 And again, the analytical part is really important. I
- 16 think all of us -- I want to particularly note Andrea Gough
- 17 who is now retiring who has had many years of public
- 18 service here.
- 19 I think as we've gone through the IRP process
- 20 certainly Melissa Jones, Garry O'Neil, Paul Deaver, Dave
- 21 Vidaver have all taken a key role in getting that together.
- 22 Certainly hats off to Al for helping us work
- 23 through our relationship with the PUC on putting in place
- 24 an MOU or an interagency agreement actually, on the
- 25 transmission siting.

- 1 And finally, for Aliso Canyon has really been a
- 2 challenge for all of us and Lana Wong and Caty Elder have
- 3 been really instrumental in helping the state just really
- 4 stay on top of the Aliso stuff with very solid analysis.
- 5 So again, there are a lot of people. We could
- 6 probably go all day if we really tried to cover everyone.
- 7 And I think hopefully the high points and those of you that
- 8 I somehow forgot, again apologies. But again I appreciate
- 9 everyone's hard work and dedicated public service. I think
- 10 certainly it's really important in these days to set the
- 11 right milestones or do those investments for California.
- 12 And I think we have a lot of dedicated staff who are
- 13 basically helping us trying to change, help transform
- 14 California and help us deal with the challenge of this
- 15 climate.
- 16 So again, thanks to everyone for a very solid
- 17 year and looking forward to next year, right?
- 18 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Well, thank you.
- 19 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Yeah. Okay, Chief
- 20 Counsel's Report.
- MS. VACCARO: Nothing today.
- 22 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Executive Director's
- 23 Report?
- MR. BOHAN: Well, you're going to hear a lot of
- 25 repeats, but I think it's important to mention names. So

- 1 I'm going to go very quickly, but I have as I say mostly
- 2 repeats, but not exclusively. First, the five of you with
- 3 Janea not being here, I want to thank personally for your
- 4 confidence, support and guidance. And on behalf of staff
- 5 your dedication, because you make it interesting and
- 6 exciting to come to work every day. You really do.
- We're finalizing our 2017 Accomplishments Report
- 8 and our successes are the result of a tremendous team. And
- 9 we're not going to mention every one of them, but we're
- 10 nearly 700 strong. And it really is a reflection of the
- 11 work of every one of us here. You provide the policy
- 12 leadership and the vision and staff work to carry that out.
- 13 Second, I want to thank the EO support team
- 14 headed by Gaylene Cooper and Laura Castaneda. They work
- 15 tremendously well independently and they're also just a
- 16 nice team and get along well and are able to get an awful
- 17 lot done as a consequence.
- 18 Third, and you've mentioned them all, but the
- 19 seven deputies. Laurie ten Hope is here, Courtney Smith,
- 20 Rob Cook, Dave Ashuckian, Sylvia Bender, Shawn Pittard and
- 21 John Kato.
- 22 Fourth, Barry Steinhart and Albert Lundeen, Paul
- 23 Jacobs and Lisa Negri and Heather Raitt, who is finishing
- 24 one IEPR as she starts another. Not unlike painting the
- 25 Golden Gate Bridge, it's just an ongoing cycle.

- 1 (Laughter.) Mike Sokol, you mentioned, but he's been asked
- 2 to do way too much, but somehow manages to do even more.
- 3 Justin, Chair, you mentioned Justin Cochran. He wears two
- 4 hats, both as your Nuclear Adviser and as our Emergency
- 5 Coordinator and he's really helped to elevate our game in
- 6 both of those areas.
- 7 You also mentioned Alana Mathews, she's a very
- 8 effective representative for us. And she's also just
- 9 collaborative and really easy to get along with. And I
- 10 also want to thank Kourtney Vaccaro who consistently
- 11 provides the organization's, but me personally, tremendous
- 12 counsel and excellent judgement.
- And last but not least, we've had lots of folks
- 14 join us this year and we've had 18 departures. And I just
- 15 want to call attention to two. You've mentioned Rob
- 16 Oglesby, we've talked about him at some length at past
- 17 meetings for his tremendous service to the organization.
- 18 And another one that you may have heard of, but may not
- 19 have is Steve Bonta who has been with us for two decades.
- 20 He's been tireless. He's probably the guy if there's
- 21 anybody in the building at 10:00 o'clock at night it's
- 22 Steve Bonta and he'll really be missed. He's focused on
- 23 two things: both the security of our system so that we
- 24 maintain a stable, strong, secure IT system and he's been
- 25 really good at focusing on the business needs of the

- 1 organization and not just sort of technical centric.
- 2 So with that I thank you all very much.
- 3 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 4 Public Adviser Report?
- 5 MS. MURIMI: Nothing to report.
- 6 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you.
- 7 We have one public comment, please
- 8 Mr. McLaughlin?
- 9 MR. MCLAUGHLIN: Good morning, Commissioners. My
- 10 name's Larry McLaughlin. I'm the Regional Director for the
- 11 Community College System in the Inland Empire Desert
- 12 Region. I work with clean energy and transportation
- 13 programs among the community colleges in my region.
- I also work with a lot of colleagues in the
- 15 community college system on energy-related programs that
- 16 agree with me on the point that providing professional
- 17 level education as well as education and information to our
- 18 future workforce will help facilitate the adoption of clean
- 19 energy technologies.
- 20 So along those lines, I'm here to tell you a
- 21 little bit about a workshop that my colleagues and I have
- 22 partnered with the Stone Edge Farm Microgrid to develop.
- 23 It's called "Microgrids introduction to microgrid
- 24 applications, technologies, value and economics." And we
- 25 had the privilege of piloting that workshop at Stone Edge

- 1 Farm on October 4th and 5th with a group of commercial
- 2 developers. We had representatives from a couple of the
- 3 cities: City of Berkeley, City of Oakland. We had the
- 4 representative from the community college system, both on
- 5 the facility side and the program side to learn about the
- 6 concepts, the value propositions of microgrid
- 7 implementation.
- 8 So we plan to do these periodically. We plan to
- 9 do them at Stone Edge Farm and we may be doing the
- 10 microgrid workshops in the southern part of the state as
- 11 well. I'm here in town to go to a meeting tomorrow and
- 12 pitch the Microgrid workshops to a taskforce of community
- 13 college facilities' directors. And the idea is that
- 14 community colleges are excellent possibilities for
- 15 microgrid implementation, community college campuses. And
- 16 so we're going to talk about that workshop and the kind of
- 17 information that we'll be able to provide them, to maybe
- 18 get them started down this path.
- 19 So while I was here I wanted to bring this by and
- 20 to let you know what we're up to. And that we look forward
- 21 to providing these in the future and I'd certainly be happy
- 22 to keep you posted on our progress. Okay.
- 23 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thank you. Please
- 24 definitely keep us posted on that. I mean, we've got a
- 25 major activity now coming up with a roadmap for microgrids

1 from the R&D side. And I'm going to say I think we have 2 out now sort of a major solicitation for microgrids as our 3 next step. I obviously can't talk about any proposal that has been submitted there are the status, but again it's a 4 5 major emphasis of our RD&D Program. And we've certainly 6 done a lot of work with educational institutions in the 7 military. 8 MR. MCLAUGHLIN: Thank you very much. Yeah, 9 we'll look for that and we have tried to participate in 10 some of the roadmap workshops regionally. And we're 11 learning along with everyone, trying to get the information 12 out too. Thank you. 13 CHAIRMAN WEISENMILLER: Thanks. And thank you, 14 thanks for being here. 15 This meeting's adjourned. 16 (Adjourned the Business Meeting at 11:51 a.m.) 17 --000--18 19 20 21 22 23 24

25

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and

place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were reported by me, a certified electronic court reporter and a disinterested person, and was under my supervision thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 29th day of December, 2017.

PETER PETTY CER**D-493 Notary Public

TRANSCRIBER'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were transcribed by me, a certified transcriber and a disinterested person, and was under my supervision thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 29th day of December, 2017.

1

Myra Severtson Certified Transcriber AAERT No. CET**D-852