



BrightSource

DOCKET

11-AFC-4

DATE APR 18 2012

RECD. APR 18 2012

April 18, 2012

Pierre Martinez
Project Manager
Systems Assessment & Facility Siting Division
California Energy Commission
1516 Ninth Street, MS-15
Sacramento, CA 95814

SUBJECT: Applicant's Supplemental Response #3 to CEC Staff Data Request Set 1A
(11-AFC-4)

Dear Mr. Martinez:

Rio Mesa Solar I, LLC, Rio Mesa Solar II, LLC, and Rio Mesa Solar III, collectively the "Applicant" for the Rio Mesa Solar Electric Generating Facility project ("Rio Mesa SEGF"), submit this Supplemental Response #3 to CEC Staff Data Request Set 1A. Applicant's Supplemental Response #2 (docketed on April 16, 2012) contained draft versions of Tables 5.1E-1R1 and 5.1G-2R1, relating to air quality. The attached Supplemental Response #3 contains the final versions of Tables 5.1E-1R2 and 5.1G-2R2.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Todd Stewart
Senior Director of Project Development

TABLE 5.1E-1R2 (REVISED APRIL 2012)
 Screening Level Risk Assessment Results

Risk Methodology	Project Impacts <u>with MWMs</u>
Modeled Residential Cancer Risk (in one million)	
Residential: Derived (OEHHA) Method at PMI	4.38 <u>0.8</u>
Residential: Derived (OEHHA) Method at maximally impacted residential receptor	0.40 <u>0.15</u>
Modeled Worker Cancer Risk (in one million)	
Worker Exposure: Derived (OEHHA) Method at PMI	0.24 <u>0.12</u>
Modeled Acute and Chronic Impacts	
Acute HHI—1-hour RELs	0.003 <u>0.0007</u>
Acute HHI—8-hour RELs	0.002 <u>0.0007</u>
Chronic HHI	0.0007 <u>0.0004</u>

Table 5.1G-2R2 (Revised April 2012)

Summary of Combined 1-hr NO₂ Results (Modeled Maximum Impacts plus Background)

Pollutant	Averaging Time	Combined Impact Three Projects (µg/m ³)	Background Concentration (µg/m ³)	Total Concentration (Modeled Impact plus Background) (µg/m ³)	NAAQS (µg/m ³)	CAAQS (µg/m ³)
NO ₂	1-hr (max)	194 <u>166</u> ^a	92.4	286 <u>258</u>	--	339
	1-hr (98th percentile)	149 <u>158</u> ^a	78.0 ^c	167 <u>171</u> ^b	188	--

Note:

^a ~~Highest 1-hour average NO₂ impacts occur during emergency engine testing at the Proposed Project.~~

^b Total concentrations shown for 1-hour NO₂ are modeled project impacts combined with concurrent hourly NO₂ monitoring data (Tier 4 analysis in Section 3.6 of the modeling protocol). This value represents the five-year average of the annual 1-hr NO₂ 98th percentile (modeled impact plus background) for each year (2006 to 2010) as required by June 28, 2010 EPA 1-hr NO₂ NAAQS guidance document.

^c Background concentration shown is the three-year average of the 98th percentile values (2008 to 2010), in accordance with the form of the federal standard.



**BEFORE THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT
COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA
1516 NINTH STREET, SACRAMENTO, CA 95814
1-800-822-6228 – WWW.ENERGY.CA.GOV**

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION
FOR THE RIO MESA SOLAR
ELECTRIC GENERATING FACILITY**

DOCKET NO. 11-AFC-04
PROOF OF SERVICE
(Revised 2/27/12)

APPLICANTS' AGENTS

BrightSource Energy, Inc.
Todd Stewart, Senior Director
Project Development
1999 Harrison Street, Suite 2150
Oakland, CA 94612
tstewart@brightsourceenergy.com

BrightSource Energy, Inc.
Michelle Farley
1999 Harrison Street, Suite 2150
Oakland, CA 94612
mfarley@brightsourceenergy.com

BrightSource Energy, Inc.
Brad DeJean
1999 Harrison Street, Suite 2150
Oakland, CA 94612
e-mail service preferred
bdejean@brightsourceenergy.com

APPLICANTS' CONSULTANTS

Grenier and Associates, Inc.
Andrea Grenier
1420 E. Roseville Parkway,
Suite 140-377
Roseville, CA 95661
e-mail service preferred
andrea@agrenier.com

URS Corporation
Angela Leiba
4225 Executive Square, Suite 1600
La Jolla, CA 92037
angela_leiba@urscorp.com

COUNSEL FOR APPLICANTS

Ellison, Schneider, & Harris
Christopher T. Ellison
Brian S. Biering
2600 Capitol Avenue, Suite 400
Sacramento, CA 95816-5905
cte@eslawfirm.com
bsb@eslawfirm.com

INTERESTED AGENCIES

Mojave Desert AQMD
Chris Anderson, Air Quality Engineer
14306 Park Avenue,
*Victorville, CA 92392-2310
canderson@mdaqmd.ca.gov

California ISO
e-mail service preferred
e-recipient@caiso.com

Bureau of Land Management
Cedric Perry
Lynnette Elser
22835 Calle San Juan De Los Lagos
Moreno Valley, CA 92553
cperry@blm.gov
elser@blm.gov

INTERVENORS

Center for Biological Diversity
Lisa T. Belenky, Senior Attorney
351 California Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94104
e-mail service preferred
lbelenky@biologicaldiversity.org

Center for Biological Diversity
Ileene Anderson
Public Lands Desert Director
PMB 447, 8033 Sunset Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90046
e-mail service preferred
ianderson@biologicaldiversity.org

**ENERGY COMMISSION –
DECISIONMAKERS**

CARLA PETERMAN
Commissioner and Presiding Member
CPeterma@energy.state.ca.us

KAREN DOUGLAS
Commissioner and Associate Member
e-mail service preferred
kldougla@energy.state.ca.us

**ENERGY COMMISSION –
DECISIONMAKERS (cont.)**

Kourtney Vaccaro
Hearing Adviser
e-mail service preferred
kvaccaro@energy.state.ca.us

Galen Lemei
Advisor to Commissioner Douglas
e-mail service preferred
glemei@energy.state.ca.us

Jennifer Nelson
Advisor to Commissioner Douglas
e-mail service preferred
jnelson@energy.state.ca.us

Jim Bartridge
Advisor to Commissioner Peterman
jbartrid@energy.state.ca.us

ENERGY COMMISSION STAFF

Pierre Martinez
Project Manager
pmartine@energy.state.ca.us

Lisa DeCarlo
Staff Counsel
e-mail service preferred
ldecarlo@energy.state.ca.us

Eileen Allen
Commissioners' Technical
Advisor for Facility Siting
e-mail service preferred
eallen@energy.state.ca.us

**ENERGY COMMISSION –
PUBLIC ADVISER**

Jennifer Jennings
Public Adviser's Office
e-mail service preferred
publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us

DECLARATION OF SERVICE

I, Darin Neufeld, declare that on April 18, 2012, I served and filed copies of the attached, dated April 18, 2012. This document is accompanied by the most recent Proof of Service list, located on the web page for this project at: [<http://www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/riomesa/index.html>].

The document has been sent to the other parties in this proceeding (as shown on the Proof of Service list) and to the Commission's Docket Unit or Chief Counsel, as appropriate, in the following manner:

(Check all that Apply)

For service to all other parties:

- Served electronically to all e-mail addresses on the Proof of Service list;
- Served by delivering on this date, either personally, or for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service with first-class postage thereon fully prepaid, to the name and address of the person served, for mailing that same day in the ordinary course of business; that the envelope was sealed and placed for collection and mailing on that date to those addresses NOT marked "e-mail preferred."

AND

For filing with the Docket Unit at the Energy Commission:

- by sending electronic copies to the e-mail address below (preferred method); *OR*
- by depositing an original and 12 paper copies in the mail with the U.S. Postal Service with first class postage thereon fully prepaid, as follows:

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION – DOCKET UNIT
Attn: Docket No. 11-AFC-4
1516 Ninth Street, MS-4
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512
docket@energy.state.ca.us

OR, if filing a Petition for Reconsideration of Decision or Order pursuant to Title 20, § 1720:

- Served by delivering on this date one electronic copy by e-mail, and an original paper copy to the Chief Counsel at the following address, either personally, or for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service with first class postage thereon fully prepaid:

California Energy Commission
Michael J. Levy, Chief Counsel
1516 Ninth Street MS-14
Sacramento, CA 95814
mlevy@energy.state.ca.us

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct, that I am employed in the county where this mailing occurred, and that I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the proceeding.

Original Signed by

Darin Neufeld

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

1516 NINTH STREET
SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-5512
www.energy.ca.gov



TO: *All Parties*

Date: February 27, 2012

RE: **RIO MESA SOLAR ELECTRIC GENERATING FACILITY**

Proof of Service List

Docket No. 11-AFC-04

Attached is the **newly revised** Proof of Service List for the above-mentioned project, current as of February 27, 2012. Please pay particular attention to the **new** filing instructions.

Energy Commission regulations (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 20, § 1210) require, in addition to any electronic service, that a paper copy be served in person or by first class mail except where a party requests to receive an electronic copy when one is available. Individuals and groups on the Proof of Service list who prefer to receive filings by e-mail and do not require a paper copy shall inform the Hearing Adviser assigned to the proceeding.

The Proof of Service list for this matter will delineate those individuals and groups and it is sufficient to serve those individuals with an e-mailed copy only. Those not so delineated must be served with a paper copy in addition to any e-mailed copy that the filing party chooses to provide. Signatures may be indicated on the electronic copy by “**Original Signed By**” or similar words. The original signed copy or an electronic copy shall be filed with the Energy Commission’s Dockets Unit.

Unless otherwise specified in a regulation, all materials filed with the Commission must also be filed with the Docket Unit. (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 20, § 1209(d).) Some regulations require filing with the Commission’s Chief Counsel instead of the Docket Unit. For example, Section 1720 requires a petition for reconsideration to be filed with the Chief Counsel and served on the parties. Service on the attorney representing Commission staff does not satisfy this requirement. This Proof of Service form is not appropriate for use when filing a document with the Chief Counsel under Title 20, sections 1231 (Complaint and Request for Investigation) or 2506 (Petition for Inspection or Copying of Confidential Records). The Public Advisor can answer any questions related to filing under these sections.

New addition(s) to the Proof of Service are indicated in **bold font** and marked with an asterisk (*). Additionally, if two or more persons are listed on a Proof of Service List with a single address, only one physical copy of a document need be mailed to the address.

Use this newly revised list for all future filings and submittals. This Proof of Service List will also be available on the Commission's Project Web Site at:

[\[http://www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/riomesa/index.html\]](http://www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/riomesa/index.html)

Please review the information and contact me at sharris@energy.state.ca.us or (916) 654-3893, if you would like to be removed from the Proof of Service or if there are any changes to your contact information.

Sandra Harris
Hearing Adviser's Office

Attachment