

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

DOCKET	
07-OIIP-1	
DATE	JUN 16 2008
RECD.	JUN 16 2008

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the
Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework
and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse
Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement
Policies.

Rulemaking 06-04-009
(Filed April 13, 2006)

**ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION
AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

In the Matter of:

AB 32 Implementation: Greenhouse Gases

Docket 07-OIIP-01

**REPLY COMMENTS OF THE
LOS ANGELES DEPARTMENT OF WATER AND POWER
ON POLICIES REGARDING EMISSION ALLOWANCE ALLOCATION,
FLEXIBLE COMPLIANCE, TREATMENT OF COMBINED HEAT & POWER,
NON-MARKET-BASED EMISSION REDUCTION MEASURES AND EMISSION CAPS,
AND GREENHOUSE GAS MODELING RESULTS**

LeiLani Johnson Kowal, Environmental Supervisor
Legislative and Regulatory Affairs
Los Angeles Department of Water and Power
111 North Hope Street, Room 1536
Los Angeles, CA 90012
(213) 367-3023 office phone
Email: LeiLani.Johnson@ladwp.com

James Caldwell, Jr., Assistant General Manager
Environmental Affairs
Los Angeles Department of Water and Power
111 N. Hope Street, Room 1021
Los Angeles, CA 90012
(213) 367-0926 office phone
Email: James.Caldwell@ladwp.com

June 16, 2008

**REPLY COMMENTS OF THE
LOS ANGELES DEPARTMENT OF WATER AND POWER
ON POLICIES REGARDING EMISSION ALLOWANCE ALLOCATION,
FLEXIBLE COMPLIANCE, TREATMENT OF COMBINED HEAT & POWER,
NON-MARKET-BASED EMISSION REDUCTION MEASURES AND EMISSION CAPS,
AND GREENHOUSE GAS MODELING RESULTS**

In accordance with Rule 14 of the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the Public Utilities Commission (“CPUC” or “Commission”) of the State of California, the Los Angeles Department of Water and Power (“LADWP”) hereby files the following Reply Comments submitted in response to the Administrative Law Judges’ Rulings, dated April 16, 2008, May 1, 2008, May 6, 2008, May 13, 2008, and May 20, 2008, in CPUC Rulemaking R.06-04-009 (“Rulemaking”) and California Energy Commission (CEC) Docket # 07-OIIP-1.

The LADWP remains committed to partnering with the State to achieve the goals of Assembly Bill 32 (AB 32) to reach 1990 greenhouse gas (GHG) emission levels by 2020. Our burden of shifting our portfolio from high-carbon resources to zero- and low-carbon resources is no small task and we have fully embraced our responsibility to make that transformation happen as early as possible, and not wait until 2012 when formal compliance begins. This commitment drives our clear and undeniable compliance path for AB 32 – to continue investments in aggressive energy efficiency programs and renewable energy projects to reach our goal of 35% renewables by 2020 as first priority and to rely on an emissions allowance trading market only as a secondary compliance alternative. The LADWP continues to support quantifiable emission reductions with enforceable, declining, entity-specific emission caps. The best, most responsible and transparent use of LADWP ratepayer dollars is to reduce our emissions directly and not divert those limited dollars into a cap-and-trade auction to purchase emission allowances from unknown sources. The LADWP cannot support an allowance allocation methodology or auction that diverts our ratepayer dollars into state coffers, to other utilities, or to other market participants, and away from the very investments that are needed to help the State achieve its AB 32 emission reduction goals. Proponents of market

mechanisms have relied heavily on economic theory, simply because real-world applications of cap-and-trade have provided less than “rosy” examples of successful implementation. Absent are examples that avoid market manipulation, gaming, windfall profits, and market power – all key concerns and risks associated with cap-and-trade.

The LADWP fully and enthusiastically supports the State’s efforts to increase renewables to 33% by 2020 statewide as a foundational strategy to implementing AB 32, and will continue to work with State agencies to address the regulatory and environmental barriers to achieving that goal.

An overwhelming number of parties recognize that increasing renewables beyond 20% is both prudent and necessary to ensure that California maximizes long-term, permanent, and verifiable emission reductions and puts the State on a path to a low-carbon economy.¹ At the same time, it is critical that California begin in earnest to tackle the regulatory and environmental hurdles to building renewable energy resources, including the planning and construction of transmission and streamlining the permitting processes. As shown by the E3 modeling, the pricing signals sent by cap-and-trade alone cannot be expected to motivate developers to overcome the transmission and land use issues associated with renewables, let alone to drive the long-term capital investments required to make that significant shift in energy production for California.

The cost effectiveness of direct emission reductions through renewables must be compared to realistic future costs for fossil generation.² Currently, the price of oil has hit a record high of \$140 per barrel. Natural gas prices typically follow the trend at a 10:1 ratio. As such, it is very likely that natural gas prices will rise to \$14 per MMBtu. As drought conditions

¹ CEERT at 11-12, GPI at 31, NRDC at 31-32, LADWP at 6, CCUE/CURE at 2, CalWEA/LSA at 7.

² CEERT at 16, Community Environmental Council at 3, NRDC at 8.

persist in the West and hydro generation declines, increased natural gas generation will likely increase natural gas demand and prices.

The LADWP looks forward to working with the Joint Commissions, the Air Resources Board, and AB 32 stakeholders to continue to explore and evaluate cap-and-trade design issues in the context of the Scoping Plan. It has become evidently clear that a California-only cap-and-trade program is not viable, and that a cap-and-trade program must be developed in the context of a broader regional and/or national effort. The economic modeling conducted by E3 provides a good starting point for evaluating cap-and-trade policy options, but by no means has it been adequately reviewed, vetted, and evaluated to rest upon it the critical decision of how to distribute emission allowances within the electricity sector. The model must be able to evaluate allocation options such as fossil-based fuel differentiation that may provide useful insights into other allowance allocation methodologies that may better address the staff's evaluation criteria related to distributional impacts. This is important not just within the context of the California electricity sector, but also a multi-sector AB 32 program and also the Western Climate Initiative (WCI) regional cap-and-trade program.

LADWP appreciates the efforts of the Joint Commissions to utilize this proceeding to explore the complex issues surrounding electricity sector emission reduction strategies and cap-and-trade design. Parties, including LADWP, have gained valuable insights that help bring to the surface different perspectives and considerations. LADWP remains committed to the successful implementation of AB 32 and to reducing our GHG emissions. We will continue to actively engage in the ARB Scoping Plan process and work with others to develop a viable GHG emission reduction program.

CONCLUSION

The LADWP appreciates the opportunity to provide these reply comments to the CPUC and CEC for your consideration.

Dated: June 16, 2008 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ LEILANI JOHNSON KOWAL

LeiLani Johnson Kowal, Environmental Supervisor
Legislative and Regulatory Affairs
Los Angeles Department of Water and Power
111 North Hope Street, Room 1536
Los Angeles, CA 90012
(213) 367-3023 office phone
Email: LeiLani.Johnson@ladwp.com

/s/ JAMES CALDWELL, JR.

James Caldwell, Jr., Assistant General Manager
Environmental Affairs
Los Angeles Department of Water and Power
111 N. Hope Street, Room 1021
Los Angeles, CA 90012
(213) 367-0926 office phone
Email: James.Caldwell@ladwp.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the attached:

**REPLY COMMENTS OF THE
LOS ANGELES DEPARTMENT OF WATER AND POWER
ON THE PROPOSED DECISION OF PRESIDENT PEEVEY:
INTERIM OPINION ON GREENHOUSE GAS REGULATORY STRATEGIES**

on all known parties to R.06-04-009 by transmitting an e-mail message with the document attached to each party named in the official service list, updated June 13, 2008. See attached service list. I served a copy of the document on those without e-mail addresses by mailing the document by first-class mail addressed as follows:

See attached service list.

I also caused courtesy copies to be delivered as follows:

VIA OVERNIGHT MAIL

Commissioner President Michael R. Peevey
California Public Utilities Commission
State Building, Room 5218
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

VIA OVERNIGHT MAIL

ALJ Jonathan Lakritz
California Public Utilities Commission
State Building, Room 5020
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

VIA OVERNIGHT MAIL

Commission Chair Jackalyne Pfannenstiel
California Energy Commission
1516 Ninth Street, MS-29
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512

VIA OVERNIGHT MAIL

ALJ Charlotte TerKeurst
California Public Utilities Commission
State Building, Room 5117
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

Executed this 16TH day of June 2008, at Los Angeles, California.

LeiLani Johnson Kowal, Environmental Supervisor
Legislative and Regulatory Affairs
Los Angeles Department of Water and Power
111 N. Hope Street, Room 1536
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Phone: 213-367-3023
E-Mail: Leilani.Johnson@ladwp.com

CPUC R. 06-04-009 Service List

Sent via e-mail to:

abb@eslawfirm.com	californiadockets@pacificorp.com	dws@r-c-s-inc.com
abonds@thelen.com	carla.peterman@gmail.com	echiang@elementmarkets.com
achang@nrdc.org	carter@ieta.org	edm@cpuc.ca.gov
adamb@greenlining.org	case.admin@sce.com	egw@a-klaw.com
aeg@cpuc.ca.gov	cathy.karlstad@sce.com	ehadley@reupower.com
agc@cpuc.ca.gov	cbaskette@enernoc.com	ej_wright@oxy.com
agrimaldi@mckennalong.com	cbreidenich@yahoo.com	ek@a-klaw.com
aimee.barnes@ecosecurities.com	cchen@ucsusa.org	ekgrubaugh@iid.com
ajkatz@mwe.com	cem@newsdata.com	eks@cpuc.ca.gov
akbar.jazayeri@sce.com	cf1@cpuc.ca.gov	ELL5@pge.com
akelly@climatetrust.org	cft@cpuc.ca.gov	elvine@lbl.gov
alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com	charlie.blair@delta-ee.com	emahlon@ecoact.org
aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com	chilen@sppc.com	emello@sppc.com
alho@pge.com	cjw5@pge.com	epoole@adplaw.com
amber@ethree.com	ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net	e-recipient@caiso.com
andrew.bradford@constellation.com	ckrupka@mwe.com	etiedemann@kmtg.com
andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org	clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov	ewolfe@resero.com
andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com	clark.bernier@rlw.com	ez@pointcarbon.com
anita.hart@swgas.com	clyde.murley@comcast.net	farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net
annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk	cmkehrein@ems-ca.com	fiji.george@el Paso.com
annette.gilliam@sce.com	colin.petheram@att.com	filings@a-klaw.com
apak@sempraglobal.com	cpe@cpuc.ca.gov	fjs@cpuc.ca.gov
arno@recurrentenergy.com	cpechman@powereconomics.com	fstern@summitblue.com
atrial@sempra.com	cswoollums@midamerican.com	fwmonier@tid.org
atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com	curt.barry@iwpnews.com	gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com
Audra.Hartmann@Dynergy.com	curtis.kebler@gs.com	gblue@enxco.com
aweller@sel.com	Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation.com	george.hopley@barcap.com
bbaker@summitblue.com	cynthia.schultz@pacificorp.com	ghinners@reliant.com
bbc@cpuc.ca.gov	daking@sempra.com	GloriaB@anzaelectric.org
bbeebe@smud.org	Dan.adler@calcef.org	glw@eslawfirm.com
bblevins@energy.state.ca.us	danskopec@gmail.com	gmorris@emf.net
bcragg@goodinmacbride.com	dansvec@hdo.net	gpickering@navigantconsulting.com
bdicap@caiso.com	dave@ppallc.com	gregory.koiser@constellation.com
bernardo@braunlegal.com	david.zonana@doj.ca.gov	grosenblum@caiso.com
beth@beth411.com	david@branchcomb.com	gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com
Betty.Seto@kema.com	david@nemtzw.com	gxl2@pge.com
bill.chen@constellation.com	davidreynolds@ncpa.com	harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com
bill.schrand@swgas.com	dbrooks@nevp.com	hayley@turn.org
bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us	deb@a-klaw.com	hcronin@water.ca.gov
bjl@bry.com	deborah.slone@doj.ca.gov	hgolub@nixonpeabody.com
bjones@mjbbradley.com	dehling@king.com	hoerner@redefiningprogress.org
bkc7@pge.com	derek@climateregistry.org	hurlock@water.ca.gov
blm@cpuc.ca.gov	dhecht@sempratrading.com	HYao@SempraUtilities.com
bmcc@mccarthyaw.com	dhuard@manatt.com	hym@cpuc.ca.gov
bmcquown@reliant.com	Diane_Fellman@fpl.com	info@calseia.org
Bob.lucas@calobby.com	dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net	jack.burke@energycenter.org
bpotts@foley.com	dil@cpuc.ca.gov	Jairam.gopal@sce.com
bpurewal@water.ca.gov	dkk@eslawfirm.com	james.keating@bp.com
brabe@umich.edu	dks@cpuc.ca.gov	janill.richards@doj.ca.gov
brbarkovich@earthlink.net	dmacmull@water.ca.gov	jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com
BRBc@pge.com	dmetz@energy.state.ca.us	jason.dubchak@niskags.com
brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com	dniehaus@semprautilities.com	jbf@cpuc.ca.gov
burtraw@rff.org	douglass@energyattorney.com	jbw@slwplc.com
bushinskyj@pewclimate.org	dseperas@calpine.com	jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com
bwallerstein@aqmd.gov	dsh@cpuc.ca.gov	jci@cpuc.ca.gov
bwetstone@hotmail.com	dsoyars@sppc.com	JDF1@PGE.COM
C_Marnay@lbl.gov	dtibbs@aes4u.com	jd@eslawfirm.com
cadams@covantaenergy.com	dwang@nrdc.org	jdoll@arb.ca.gov
	dwood8@cox.net	jeanne.sole@sfgov.org

CPUC R. 06-04-009 Service List

jeffgray@dwt.com	kjinnovation@earthlink.net	ntronaas@energy.state.ca.us
jen@cnt.org	kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com	nwhang@manatt.com
jenine.schenk@apses.com	kkhoja@thelenreid.com	obartho@smud.org
jennifer.porter@energycenter.org	klatt@energyattorney.com	obystrom@cera.com
JerryL@abag.ca.gov	kmills@cfbf.com	ofoote@hkcf-law.com
jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com	kmkiener@fox.net	pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us
jf2@cpuc.ca.gov	kowalewskia@calpine.com	pburmich@arb.ca.gov
jgill@caiso.com	krd@cpuc.ca.gov	pduvair@energy.state.ca.us
jgreco@caithnessenergy.com	kyle.l.davis@pacificorp.com	pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com
jhahn@covantaenergy.com	kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com	phanschen@mofo.com
jimross@r-c-s-inc.com	kyle_boudreaux@fpl.com	Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us
jj.prucnal@swgas.com	lars@resource-solutions.org	philm@scdenergy.com
jjensen@kirkwood.com	Laura.Genao@sce.com	pjazayeri@stroock.com
jk1@cpuc.ca.gov	lcottle@winston.com	ppettingill@caiso.com
jkarp@winston.com	ldcarlo@energy.state.ca.us	pseby@mckennalong.com
jkloberdanz@semprautilities.com	leilani.johnson@ladwp.com	psp@cpuc.ca.gov
jlaun@apogee.net	liddell@energyattorney.com	pssed@adelphia.net
jleslie@luce.com	lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us	pstoner@lgc.org
jluckhardt@downeybrand.com	lisa_weinzimer@platts.com	pthompson@summitblue.com
jm3@cpuc.ca.gov	llorenz@semprautilities.com	pvalen@thelen.com
jnm@cpuc.ca.gov	llund@commerceenergy.com	pw1@cpuc.ca.gov
jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net	lmh@eslawfirm.com	pzs@cpuc.ca.gov
Joe.paul@dynegy.com	Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com	rachel@ceert.org
john.hughes@sce.com	lpark@navigantconsulting.com	ralph.dennis@constellation.com
johnredding@earthlink.net	lrdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com	ram@cpuc.ca.gov
jol@cpuc.ca.gov	lrn@cpuc.ca.gov	randy.howard@ladwp.com
josephhenri@hotmail.com	lschavrien@semprautilities.com	randy.sable@swgas.com
joyw@mid.org	ltenhope@energy.state.ca.us	rapcowart@aol.com
jsanders@caiso.com	ltt@cpuc.ca.gov	ray.welch@navigantconsulting.com
jscancarelli@flk.com	marcel@turn.org	rhelgeson@scppa.org
jsqueri@gmssr.com	marcie.milner@shell.com	RHHJ@pge.com
jst@cpuc.ca.gov	mary.lynych@constellation.com	rhwisner@lbl.gov
jtp@cpuc.ca.gov	mclaughlin@braunlegal.com	richards@mid.org
julie.martin@bp.com	mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com	rick_noger@praxair.com
jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com	mflorio@turn.org	rita@ritanortonconsulting.com
jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com	mgarcia@arb.ca.gov	rkeen@manatt.com
jxa2@pge.com	mgillette@enernoc.com	rkmoore@gswater.com
karen@klindh.com	mhyams@sfwater.org	rmccann@umich.edu
karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org	Mike@alpinenaturalgas.com	rmiller@energy.state.ca.us
Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com	mjd@cpuc.ca.gov	rmm@cpuc.ca.gov
kbowen@winston.com	mmattes@nossaman.com	rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us
kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com	mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com	robert.pettinato@ladwp.com
kdusel@navigantconsulting.com	monica.schwebs@bingham.com	Robert.Rozanski@ladwp.com
kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com	mpa@a-klaw.com	roger.montgomery@swgas.com
keith.mccrea@sablau.com	mprior@energy.state.ca.us	rogerv@mid.org
kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov	mrw@mrwassoc.com	ron.deaton@ladwp.com
kelly.barr@srpnet.com	mscheibl@arb.ca.gov	rprince@semprautilities.com
ken.alex@doj.ca.gov	mwaugh@arb.ca.gov	rreinhard@mofo.com
ken.alex@doj.ca.gov	nenbar@energy-insights.com	rrtaylor@srpnet.com
kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com	ner@cpuc.ca.gov	rsa@a-klaw.com
kerry.hattevik@mirant.com	nes@a-klaw.com	rschmidt@bartlewells.com
kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com	nlenssen@energy-insights.com	rsmutny-jones@caiso.com
kfox@wsgr.com	norman.furuta@navy.mil	rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com
kgough@calpine.com	notice@psrec.coop	ryan.flynn@pacificorp.com
kgrenfell@nrdc.org	npedersen@hanmor.com	S1L7@pge.com
kggriffin@energy.state.ca.us	nsuetake@turn.org	saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov

CPUC R. 06-04-009 Service List

samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us
sandra.carolina@swgas.com
Sandra.ely@state.nm.us
sas@a-klaw.com
sasteriadis@apx.com
sbeatty@cwclaw.com
sberlin@mccarthyllaw.com
sbeserra@sbcglobal.net
scarter@nrdc.org
schohn@smud.org
scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com
scottanders@sandiego.edu
scr@cpuc.ca.gov
sdhilton@stoel.com
sellis@fypower.org
sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us
sephra.ninow@energycenter.org
sgm@cpuc.ca.gov
slins@ci.glendale.ca.us
sls@a-klaw.com
smichel@westernresources.org
smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com
smk@cpuc.ca.gov
snewsom@semprautilities.com
spauker@wsgr.com
sscb@pge.com
ssmyers@att.net
steve.koerner@elpaso.com
steve@schiller.com
stevek@kromer.com
steven.huhman@morganstanley.com
steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com
steven@iepa.com
steven@lipmanconsulting.com
steven@moss.net

svn@cpuc.ca.gov
svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com
svs6@pge.com
tam@cpuc.ca.gov
tburke@sfwater.org
tcarlson@reliant.com
tcx@cpuc.ca.gov
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com
tdillard@sierrapacific.com
THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET
thunt@cecmail.org
tiffany.rau@bp.com
tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com
todil@mckennalong.com
Tom.Elgie@powerex.com
tomb@crossborderenergy.com
tomk@mid.org
trdill@westernhubs.com
troberts@semptra.com
UHelman@caiso.com
vb@pointcarbon.com
vitaly.lee@aes.com
vjw3@pge.com
vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com
vwelch@environmentaldefense.org
wbooth@booth-law.com
westgas@aol.com
william.tomlinson@elpaso.com
wsm@cpuc.ca.gov
wtasat@arb.ca.gov
www@eslawfirm.com
wynne@braunlegal.com
ygross@sempraglobal.com
zaiontj@bp.com

Sent via U.S. Mail to:

DOWNEY BRAND
DOWNEY BRAND
Sacramento Municipal
555 CAPITOL MALL, 10TH FLOOR
SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-4686

MATTHEW MOST
EDISON MISSION MARKETING &
TRADING, INC.
160 FEDERAL STREET
BOSTON, MA 02110-1776

THOMAS MCCABE
EDISON MISSION ENERGY
18101 VON KARMAN AVE., SUITE 1700
IRVINE, CA 92612

MARY MCDONALD
DIRECTOR OF STATE AFFAIRS
CALIFORNIA INDEPENDENT SYSTEM
OPERATOR
151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD
FOLSOM, CA 95630