BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION AND THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emission Standards into Procurement Policies.

Order Instituting Informational Proceeding – AB 32. Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

CEC Docket No. 07-OIIP-01

SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA PUBLIC POWER AUTHORITY SUPPLEMENTAL REPLY COMMENT ON ALLOWANCE ALLOCATION ISSUES

Norman A. Pedersen, Esq. HANNA AND MORTON LLP 444 South Flower Street, Suite 1500 Los Angeles, California 90071-2916 Telephone: (213) 430-2510 Facsimile: (213) 623-3379 E-mail: npedersen@hanmor.com

Attorney for the SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA PUBLIC POWER AUTHORITY

Dated: December 7, 2007

30226001nap12070701

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	PG&E MISCONTURES SCPPA'S POSITION
н.	PG&E'S SUGGESTION THAT GLOBAL WARMING PROBLEMS WERE WELL KNOWN IN THE 1970s IS WRONG
m.	PG&E'S ANALYSIS OF THE NUMBER OF ALLOWANCES THAT CALIFORNIA WOULD GET UNDER A NATIONAL PROGRAM IS MISPLACED AND SHOWS THE INEQUITY OF AN ALLOCATION OF ALLOWANCES THAT IS BASED ON RETAIL SALES INSTEAD OF EMISSIONS
IV.	THE SCAQMD COMMENT IS A HELPFUL ADDITION TO THE RECORD
v.	CONCLUSION

+

-

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION AND THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emission Standards into Procurement Policies.

Order Instituting Informational Proceeding – AB 32.

Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

CEC Docket No. 07-OIIP-01

SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA PUBLIC POWER AUTHORITY SUPPLEMENTAL REPLY COMMENT ON ALLOWANCE ALLOCATION ISSUES

In accordance with the Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") TerKeurst's e-mail ruling dated November 8, 2007, and the Administrative Law Judges' Ruling Extending Comment Dates and Addressing Procedural Matters ("Extension Ruling") dated November 30, 2007, the Southern California Public Power Authority ("SCPPA") respectfully submits this supplemental reply comment on allowance allocation issues. This supplemental reply comment responds to supplemental opening comments that were filed on November 14, 2007, pursuant to ALJ TerKeurst's November 8, 2007 e-mail ruling.

Besides SCPPA, the only party to submit supplemental opening comments that were designated as being "supplemental opening comments" was Pacific Gas and Electric Company ("PG&E"). Additionally, the South Coast Air Quality Management District ("SCAQMD") filed what it designated as being "comments" on November 16, 2007. Presumably, those were latefiled supplemental opening comments. SCPPA now responds to PG&E and SCAQMD.

I. PG&E MISCONTURES SCPPA'S POSITION.

PG&E suggests that SCPPA contends that "the customers of lower-emitting utilities, such as PG&E, are better able to 'afford' the costs of GHG reductions better than the customers of higher-emitting utilities, such as LADWP and SCPPA." PG&E Supp. Opening Comment at 21-23. PG&E misstates SCPPA's position. SCPPA has not contended that any given utility's customers can "better afford" GHG reduction than others.

Instead, SCPPA's position is that the California Public Utilities Commission ("CPUC") and the California Energy Commission ("CEC") (jointly, "Commissions") should recommend to the California Air Resources Board ("CARB") an allowance allocation methodology that will enable utilities to focus their resources on activities that will result in concrete greenhouse gas ("GHG") reductions, *not* a methodology which counterproductively redirects resources to buying allowances. Further, SCPPA has advocated that the Commissions should not recommend a methodology that would result in wealth transfers from some utilities to others, as would occur under PG&E's proposal to allocate allowances among retail providers on the basis of retail sales. *See* SCPPA Supp. Opening Comment at 1-7. Accordingly, SCPPA has consistently supported an allocation of allowances to regulated retail providers for the benefit of the retail providers' customers on the basis of recent pre-AB 32 emissions, with the amount of allowances that are allocated being reduced proportionately over time.

II. PG&E'S SUGGESTION THAT GLOBAL WARMING PROBLEMS WERE WELL KNOWN IN THE 1970s IS WRONG.

PG&E presents quoted material from a recent Supreme Court purporting to show that the "risk of greenhouse gas emissions...were identified and acknowledged by public policymakers

2

and others" as early as the late 1970s. PG&E Supp. Opening Comment at 21-23. The implication is that utilities should have known about global warming when they were contracting for coal plants in the 1970s. In fact, global warming was neither well-known nor widely acknowledged in the 1970s. By contrast to PG&E, the Natural Resources Defense Counsel and the Union of Concerned Scientists ("NRDC/UCS") contend more reasonably that the "threat of global warming has been known" for "over 15 years," pointing to an Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change report dated 1990. NRDC/UCS Reply Comment at 5 (Nov. 14, 2007). That was long after SCPPA members contracted for the Intermountain Power Project coal plant.

III. PG&E'S ANALYSIS OF THE NUMBER OF ALLOWANCES THAT CALIFORNIA WOULD GET UNDER A NATIONAL PROGRAM IS MISPLACED AND SHOWS THE INEQUITY OF AN ALLOCATION OF ALLOWANCES THAT IS BASED ON RETAIL SALES INSTEAD OF EMISSIONS.

PG&E presents an analysis purportedly showing that if there were a nation-wide GHG emission reduction program, California entities would get more allowances if allowances were administratively allocated on the basis of retail providers' "recorded sales" rather than generators' emissions. PG&E Supp. Opening Comment at 21-23. The apparent suggestion is that the Commissions should recommend to CARB an allocation methodology which would maximize California's receipt of administratively allocated allowances under a national program. SCPPA disagrees.

The lodestar of the Commissions' allowance allocation policy should not be maximizing California's receipt of allowances under a supposed national program. Instead, the Commissions' selection of an allowance allocation methodology should be guided by paramount principles, chief of which should be attaining AB 32 mandated GHG emission reduction goals, fairness, and cost-effectiveness. *See* SCPPA Opening Comment on Point of Reg. Issues at 9-14 (Dec. 3, 2007). The PG&E analysis is a further illustration of the inequity of allocating allowances on the basis of retail sales rather than emissions. California's greenhouse emissions per capita are one of the lowest in the United States. 2007 Integrated Energy Policy Report at 7 (Nov. 2007). In 2001, California ranked fourth lowest in CO2 emissions per capita and fifth lowest in CO2 emissions per unit of gross state product. *Ibid.* California would get fewer allowances under a national administrative allocation of allowances because California does not have as far to go as many other states. Those states will have to do much more to attain the same percentage reduction in emissions as would be achieved by California. Allocating allowances on the basis of emissions would allow those states to focus their resources on addressing their substantially greater burden of reducing GHG emissions.

IV. THE SCAQMD COMMENT IS A HELPFUL ADDITION TO THE RECORD.

Although, as discussed above, SCPPA is unsure about the procedural status of the SCAQMD Comment, it is a helpful addition to the record in this proceeding. Through its Comment, SCAQMD submits a "paper" entitled "Over a Dozen Years of RECLAIM Implementation: Key Lessons Learned in California's First Air Pollution Cap-and-Trade Program" ("SCAQMD Paper") and dated June 2007.

The SCAQMD Paper presents a helpful description of the SCAQMD's RECLAIM program under the Clean Air Act. The features of SCAQMD's regulation of NOx and SOx under the Clean Air Act and the features of the GHG emission reduction program envisioned by the CPUC under D.06-02-032 (Feb. 16, 2006) are similar. *See* SCPPA Opening Comment at 2-6 (Oct. 31, 2007), SCPPA Reply Comment at 8-9 (Nov. 14, 2007).

Each facility that is subject to SCAQMD's program is allocated "specific annual emissions caps" that decline over time. SCAQMD Paper at I-2-1. SCAQMD's "specific annual

4

emissions caps" are similar to the allowance levels that would be established and then decline over time under the CPUC's envisioned program.

Under SCAQMD regulation, the allocations that are the basis for each facility's caps are based on "recent past peak actual emissions". Similarly, the CPUC envisioned an allocation of allowances to retail providers on the basis of recent historical emissions.

The cap-and-trade feature of the RECLAIM program provides each regulated facility with some flexibility in meeting its annual cap in the interest of achieving the pollution reduction goals at a lower cost:

> [E]ach facility has the flexibility to design its best approach to meeting their declining emission cap, rather than reacting to specific command-and-control rules. The 'incentive' portion of the program involves trading RTCs. RTCs are valid for one year, and expire after a 60 day year-end reconciliation period. Any facility that emits or will emit less than its cap in a given year may sell the extra credits. A facility that needs to increase production, add equipment, or needs more time to add control equipment may buy credits on the market.

Ibid. Similarly, the CPUC envisioned trading under a cap-and-trade program as a "flexible compliance mechanism" that could reduce costs of GHG emission reduction by retail providers.

SCPPA supports development of a program that builds on SCAQMD's experience with

RECLAIM as envisioned by the CPUC. Accordingly, SCPPA supports receipt of the SCAQMD

Paper into the record as a helpful addition.

V. CONCLUSION.

SCPPA recommends that the Commissions build upon the foundation laid by the CPUC in D.06-02-032 and the SCAQMD's experience with RECLAIM. GHG emission allowances should be administratively allocated to regulated retail providers as the points of regulation in the electric sector for the benefit of the retail providers' customers. The allocation should be based upon recent pre-AB 32 actually experienced emissions, with the amount of allowances that are

allocated to each retail provider for each successive compliance period being reduced proportionally over time as necessary to achieve the AB 32 GHG reduction goals for the electric sector and for each retail provider by 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Norman A. Pedersen

Norman A. Pedersen, Esq. HANNA AND MORTON LLP 444 South Flower Street, Suite 1500 Los Angeles, California 90071-2916 Telephone: (213) 430-2510 Facsimile: (213) 623-3379 E-mail: npedersen@hanmor.com

Attorney for the SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA PUBLIC POWER AUTHORITY

Dated: December 7, 2007

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of the SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA

PUBLIC POWER AUTHORITY SUPPLEMENTAL REPLY COMMENT ON

ALLOWANCE ALLOCATION ISSUES on the service list for CPUC Docket No. R.06-04-

009 and CEC Docket No. 07-OIIP-01 by serving a copy to each party by electronic mail and/or

by mailing a properly addressed copy by first-class mail with postage prepaid.

Executed on December 7, 2007, at Los Angeles, California.

/s/ Veronica Hakopian

Veronica Hakopian

R.06-04-009 SERVICE LIST DOCKET 07-OIIP-01 SERVICE LIST

abb@eslawfirm.com abonds@thelen.com achang@nrdc.org adamb@greenlining.org aeg@cpuc.ca.gov agc@cpuc.ca.gov agrimaldi@mckennalong.com aimee.barnes@ecosecurities.com ajkatz@mwe.com akbar.jazayeri@sce.com akelly@climatetrust.org alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com alho@pge.com amber@ethree.com amsmith@sempra.com andrew.bradford@constellation.com andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com anita.hart@swgas.com annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk annette.gilliam@sce.com apak@sempraglobal.com arno@recurrentenergy.com atrial@sempra.com atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com Audra.Hartmann@Dynegy.com aweller@sel.com bbaker@summitblue.com bbeebe@smud.org bblevins@energy.state.ca.us bcragg@goodinmacbride.com bdicapo@caiso.com bernardo@braunlegal.com beth@beth411.com Betty.Seto@kema.com bill.chen@constellation.com bill.schrand@swgas.com bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us bjl@bry.com bjones@mjbradley.com bkc7@pge.com blm@cpuc.ca.gov bmcc@mccarthylaw.com bmcquown@reliant.com Bob.lucas@calobby.com

bpotts@foley.com bpurewal@water.ca.gov brabe@umich.edu brbarkovich@earthlink.net brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com burtraw@rff.org bushinskyj@pewclimate.org C Marnay@1b1.gov cadams@covantaenergy.com californiadockets@pacificorp.com carla.peterman@gmail.com carter@ieta.org case.admin@sce.com cathy.karlstad@sce.com cbaskette@enemoc.com cbreidenich@yahoo.com cchen@ucsusa.org cem@newsdata.com cf1@cpuc.ca.gov cft@cpuc.ca.gov charlie.blair@delta-ee.com chilen@sppc.com cjw5@pge.com ckmitcheil1@sbcglobal.net ckrupka@mwe.com clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov clark.bernier@rlw.com clyde.murley@comcast.net cmkehrein@ems-ca.com colin.petheram@att.com cpe@cpuc.ca.gov cpechman@powereconomics.com cswoollums@midamerican.com curt.barry@iwpnews.com curtis.kebler@gs.com Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation.com cynthia.schultz@pacificorp.com daking@sempra.com Dan.adler@calcef.org danskopec@gmail.com dansvec@hdo.net dave@ppallc.com david.zonana@doj.ca.gov david@branchcomb.com david@nemtzow.com davidreynolds@ncpa.com

dbrooks@nevp.com deb@a-klaw.com deborah.slon@doj.ca.gov dehling@king.com Denise_Hill@transalta.com derek@climateregistry.org dhecht@sempratrading.com dhuard@manatt.com diane_fellman@fpl.com dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net dil@cpuc.ca.gov dkk@eslawfirm.com dks@cpuc.ca.gov dmacmil@water.ca.gov dmetz@energy.state.ca.us dniehaus@semprautilities.com douglass@energyattorney.com dseperas@calpine.com dsh@cpuc.ca.gov dsoyars@sppc.com dtibbs@aes4u.com dwang@nrdc.org dwood8@cox.net dws@r-c-s-inc.com echiang@elementmarkets.com edm@cpuc.ca.gov egw@a-klaw.com ehadley@reupower.com ej_wright@oxy.com ek@a-klaw.com ekgrubaugh@iid.com ELL5@pge.com elvine@lbl.gov emahlon@ecoact.org emello@sppc.com epoole@adplaw.com epowers@arb.ca.gov e-recipient@caiso.com etiedemann@kmtg.com ewolfe@resero.com ez@pointcarbon.com farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net fiji.george@elpaso.com filings@a-klaw.com fjs@cpuc.ca.gov fluchetti@ndep.nv.gov fstem@summitblue.com fwmonier@tid.org gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com gblue@enxco.com

george.hopley@barcap.com ghinners@reliant.com GloriaB@anzaelectric.org glw@eslawfirm.com gmorris@emf.net gpickering@navigantconsulting.com gregory.koiser@constellation.com grosenblum@caiso.com gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com gxl2@pge.com harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com hayley@turn.org hcronin@water.ca.gov hgolub@nixonpeabody.com hoemer@redefiningprogress.org hs1@cpuc.ca.gov hurlock@water.ca.gov HYao@SempraUtilities.com hym@cpuc.ca.gov info@calseia.org jack.burke@energycenter.org james.keating@bp.com janill.richards@doj.ca.gov jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com jason.dubchak@niskags.com jbf@cpuc.ca.gov jbw@slwplc.com jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com jci@cpuc.ca.gov JDF1@PGE.COM jdh@eslawfirm.com jdoll@arb.ca.gov jeanne.sole@sfgov.org jeffgray@dwt.com jen@cnt.org jenine.schenk@apses.com jennifer.porter@energycenter.org JerryL@abag.ca.gov jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com jf2@cpuc.ca.gov jgill@caiso.com jgreco@caithnessenergy.com jhahn@covantaenergy.com jimross@r-c-s-inc.com jj.prucnal@swgas.com jjensen@kirkwood.com jk1@cpuc.ca.gov jkarp@winston.com jkloberdanz@semprautilities.com jlaun@apogee.net

jleslie@luce.com jluckhardt@downeybrand.com jm3@cpuc.ca.gov inm@cpuc.ca.gov jody london consulting@earthlink.net Joe.paul@dynegy.com john.hughes@sce.com johnrredding@earthlink.net jol@cpuc.ca.gov josephhenri@hotmail.com joyw@mid.org jsanders@caiso.com jscancarelli@flk.com isqueri@gmssr.com jst@cpuc.ca.gov jtp@cpuc.ca.gov julie.martin@bp.com jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com jxa2@pge.com karen.mcdonald@powerex.com karen@klindh.com karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com kbowen@winston.com kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com kdusel@navigantconsulting.com kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com keith.rnccrea@sablaw.com kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov kelly.barr@srpnet.com ken.alex@doj.ca.gov ken.alex@doj.ca.gov kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com kerry.hattevik@mirant.com kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com kfox@wsgr.com kgough@calpine.com kgrenfell@nrdc.org kgriffin@energy.state.ca.us kjinnovation@earthlink.net kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com kkhoja@thelenreid.com klatt@energyattorney.com kmills@cfbf.com kmkiener@fox.net kowalewskia@calpine.com krd@cpuc.ca.gov kyle.l.davis@pacificorp.com kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com

kyle boudreaux@fpl.com lars@resource-solutions.org Laura.Genao@sce.com lcottle@winston.com Idecarlo@energy.state.ca.us leilani.johnson@ladwp.com liddell@energyattorney.com lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us lisa.decker@constellation.com lisa weinzimer@platts.com llorenz@semprautilities.com llund@commerceenergy.com Imh@eslawfirm.com Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com lpark@navigantconsulting.com Irdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com Irm@cpuc.ca.gov Ischavrien@semprautilities.com Itenhope@energy.state.ca.us Itt@cpuc.ca.gov marcel@turn.org marcie.milner@shell.com mary.lynch@constellation.com mclaughlin@braunlegal.com mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com mflorio@turn.org mgarcia@arb.ca.gov mhyams@sfwater.org Mike@alpinenaturalgas.com mjd@cpuc.ca.gov mmattes@nossaman.com mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com monica.schwebs@bingham.com mpa@a-klaw.com mpryor@energy.state.ca.us mrw@mrwassoc.com mscheibl@arb.ca.gov mwaugh@arb.ca.gov nenbar@energy-insights.com ner@cpuc.ca.gov nes@a-klaw.com nlenssen@energy-insights.com norman.furuta@navy.mil notice@psrec.coop npedersen@hanmor.com nsuetake@turn.org nwhang@manatt.com obartho@smud.org obvstrom@cera.com ofoote@hkcf-law.com

pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us pburmich@arb.ca.gov pduvair@energy.state.ca.us pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com phanschen@mofo.com Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us philm@scdenergy.com pjazayeri@stroock.com ppettingill@caiso.com pseby@mckennalong.com psp@cpuc.ca.gov pssed@adelphia.net pstoner@lgc.org pthompson@summitblue.com pvallen@thelen.com pw1@cpuc.ca.gov pzs@cpuc.ca.gov rachel@ceert.org ralph.dennis@constellation.com ram@cpuc.ca.gov randy.howard@ladwp.com randy.sable@swgas.com rapcowart@aol.com rhelgeson@scppa.org RHHJ@pge.com rhwiser@lbl.gov richards@mid.org rick_noger@praxair.com nta@ritanortonconsulting.com rkeen@manatt.com rkmoore@gswater.com rmccann@umich.edu rmiller@energy.state.ca.us rmm@cpuc.ca.gov rmonillo@ci.burbank.ca.us robert.pettinato@ladwp.com Robert.Rozanski@ladwp.com roger.montgomery@swgas.com roger.pelote@williams.com rogerv@mid.org ron.deaton@ladwp.com rprince@semprautilities.com rreinhard@mofo.com rrtaylor@srpnet.com rsa@a-klaw.com rschmidt@bartlewells.com rsmutny-jones@caiso.com rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com ryan.flynn@pacificorp.com S1L7@pge.com

saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us sandra.carolina@swgas.com Sandra.ely@state.nm.us sas@a-klaw.com sasteriadis@apx.com sbeatty@cwclaw.com sberlin@mccarthylaw.com sbeserra@sbcglobal.net scarter@nrdc.org scohn@smud.org scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com scottanders@sandiego.edu scr@cpuc.ca.gov sdhilton@stoel.com sellis@fypower.org sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us sephra.ninow@energycenter.org sgm@cpuc.ca.gov slins@ci.glendale.ca.us sls@a-klaw.com smichel@westernresources.org smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com smk@cpuc.ca.gov snewsom@semprautilities.com spauker@wsgr.com sscb@pge.com ssmyers@att.net steve.koerner@elpaso.com steve@schiller.com stevek@kromer.com steven.huhman@morganstanley.com steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com steven@iepa.com steven@lipmanconsulting.com steven@moss.net svn@cpuc.ca.gov svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com svs6@pge.com tam@cpuc.ca.gov tburke@sfwater.org tcarlson@reliant.com tcx@cpuc.ca.gov tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com tdillard@sierrapacific.com THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET thunt@cecmail.org tiffany.rau@bp.com tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com todil@mckennalong.com

tomb@crossborderenergy.com tomk@mid.org trdill@westernhubs.com troberts@sempra.com UHelman@caiso.com vb@pointcarbon.com vitaly.lee@aes.com vjw3@pge.com vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com vwelch@environmentaldefense.org wbooth@booth-law.com westgas@aol.com william.tomlinson@elpaso.com wsm@cpuc.ca.gov wtasat@arb.ca.gov www@eslawfirm.com wynne@braunlegal.com ygross@sempraglobal.com zaiontj@bp.com