

### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement Policies.

Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

And

CEC Docket No. 07-OIIP-01

#### REPLY COMMENTS OF AES SOUTHLAND L.L.C.

AES SOUTHLAND L.L.C. Vitaly Lee, Vice President 690 North Studebaker Road Long Beach, CA 90803

Telephone: (562) 493-7307

Facsimile:

(562) 493-7737

Email:

vitaly.lee@aes.com

Date: November 14, 2007

# OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement Policies. Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

And

CEC Docket No. 07-OIIP-01

#### REPLY COMMENTS OF AES SOUTHLAND L.L.C.

Pursuant to the direction provided in the October 15th, 2007 Administrative Law Judge's Ruling under Rulemaking 06-04-009, AES Southland L.L.C.<sup>1</sup> ("AES SL") respectfully submits the following reply comments regarding distribution of allowances under a greenhouse gas (GHG) emission trading program for the electricity sector.

AES SL notes that many parties support an auction method for allocating allowances. These parties argue that an auction will prevent windfall profits and is the fairest way to account for differing GHG emission levels and investments made in clean technology in the past. These parties also state that an auction will provide a strong incentive to make new investments in clean technology in the period prior to 2012. Other parties advocate giving allowances to LSEs. One justification for this approach is to mitigate retail cost increases that ratepayers will face.

AES SL also notes that there is little economic data provided to support the notion that a partial allocation of allowances to power generators will produce windfall profits. Furthermore, there is little economic data provided to shed light on the economic costs to generators of a 100% auction. Finally, there is no analysis on how a 100% auction would affect investment decisions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> AES Southland L.L.C. is a wholly owned subsidiary of AES Corporation (NYSE:AES), which owns and operates 125 power plants with a total installed capacity of 44,000 MW in 28 countries on 5 continents. In California, AES owns and operates 4,300 MWs which represent approximately 9% of the in-state electrical generation for California and 20% of installed capacity base in Southern California.

to expand generating capacity in California or lead to the early shutdown of existing generation. Given the State's perilous reliability issues, the effect of GHG emission allowance allocation proposals on generators' investment or retirement decisions is a crucial piece of information that the Commission should carefully consider as it makes its decision.

Pacific Gas and Electric Company (PG&E) proposes to allocate GHG emission allowances to LSEs on an output basis and to establish the "first seller" as the point of regulation. LSEs would then auction off the allowances (presumably to other first sellers) and use the resulting revenues to mitigate the effects on customers. As AES SL understands PG&E's proposal, the LSE would receive free allowances for its own resources but require other first sellers to purchase allowances through an auction. AES SL opposes PG&E's proposal as it unnecessarily shifts the burden from one class of entities (LSEs) to another (first sellers, including many independent power producers (IPPs)). Allocating free allowances to LSEs and placing the LSE in the role of auctioneer of the emission allowances raises competitive concerns, because many LSEs, like PG&E, also own or control generating resources and are also first sellers. As for PG&E's proposal to use auction proceeds to mitigate the effect on customers, using all or part of auction revenues to mitigate GHG compliance impacts on customers does not require LSEs to receive the initial allocations.

AES SL supports in concept the "economic harm" proposal submitted by Southern California Edison (SCE), under which allowances would be allocated for free in proportion to the economic harm experienced by regulated entities. In essence, the State's program to regulate and reduce GHG emissions seeks to internalize what had previously been externalized costs. These newly internalized costs will fall unevenly on specific sectors or firms, and SCE's proposal attempts to recognize the uneven impact of GHG emissions regulation. There are, however, important details that AES SL wishes to highlight regarding SCE's proposal:

- AES SL has not had an opportunity to fully evaluate SCE's calculation of
  economic harm and the formulae for allowance distribution. Any formula for
  determining economic harm for all regulated entities in the electricity sector
  should be subjected to public discussion and careful scrutiny.
- 2. The marginal cost analysis presented by SCE does not adequately cover all applicable costs that regulated entities would incur under GHG regulation.

Some of those additional costs will not be passed through to end-use customers and as such will be absorbed by generation sources<sup>2</sup>. To this end, AES SL calls on the CPUC to assign greater weight to the allocation of allowances to generators who cannot recover all of these increased costs and will not have recovered their investments as of the date of implementation of GHG regulations. This preference in allocation of allowances to IPPs is further dictated by the immediate impact of GHG regulation on existing gas-fired generators and the inevitable resulting impact on grid reliability. Generators should have a decidedly higher allocation than other classes of regulated entities so that grid reliability is not disrupted. AES SL supports an allocation of allowances to those entities that will experience economic harm for a period of at least 15 years, following which the state should begin a transition to a full auction.

3. To mitigate cost increases to retail customers, LSEs need not be granted allowances. In California's hybrid market design, the allocation of allowances to LSEs presents the opportunity for creating competitive advantages favoring LSE generation resources over merchant generators. Retail rate impacts can be mitigated by auction revenues, rather than the allocation of allowances. This method avoids the possibility of providing a competitive advantage to one segment of the industry. It also allows the CPUC to more appropriately target retail price mitigation to specific classes of ratepayers. However, as noted by the Market Advisory Committee, electricity price increases at the retail level resulting from GHG regulations will encourage more energy efficiency and conservation, thereby further reducing overall GHG emissions. Therefore, the CPUC should be cautious in the use of price mitigation, so as to not undermine the GHG reduction benefits of its energy efficiency and demand response programs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Please refer to AES Comments under Rulemaking 06-04-009 filed on October 31, 2007 for a description of such costs.

As previously stated, AES SL recommends that administrative allocation should be the principal means of distributing emission allowances in the early years of the GHG trading system. AES SL is supportive of a transition to allowance auctioning over time, but believes this should be gradual so as not to overburden the most economically harmed entities.

#### Conclusion

AES SL appreciates this opportunity to comment and the Commission's consideration of its comments herein.

Respectfully submitted this 14th day of November, 2007 at San Francisco, California.

Vitaly Lee Vice President AES SOUTHLAND L.L.C.

Ву	/s/ Vitaly Lee	
	Vitaly Lee	

3317/001/X94321.v1

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Melinda LaJaunie, certify that I have on this 14<sup>th</sup> day of November 2007 caused a copy of the foregoing

#### REPLY COMMENTS OF AES SOUTHLAND, L.L.C.

to be served on all known parties to R.06-04-009 listed on the most recently updated service list available on the California Public Utilities Commission website, via email to those listed with email and via U.S. mail to those without email service. I also caused courtesy copies to be hand-delivered as follows:

Commissioner President Michael R. Peevey California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5218 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

ALJ Jonathan Lakritz
California Public Utilities Commission
State Building, Room 5020
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

ALJ Charlotte TerKeurst California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5117 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

ALJ Meg Gottstein
California Public Utilities Commission
State Building, Room 2106
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 14<sup>th</sup> day of November 2007 at San Francisco, California.

/s/ Melinda LaJaunie
Melinda LaJaunie

3317/001/X94361.v1

## Service List R.06-04-009 Last Updated 11/13/07

CINDY ADAMS cadams@covantaenergy.com	SID NEWSOM snewsom@semprautilities.com	DANIEL A. KING daking@sempra.com	MICHAEL P. ALCANTAR mpa@a-klaw.com
STEVEN S. SCHLEIMER steven.schleimer@barclayscapit al.com	DAVID L. HUARD dhuard@manatt.com	SYMONE VONGDEUANE svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com	SEEMA SRINIVASAN sls@a-klaw.com
STEVEN HUHMAN steven.huhman@morganstanley.	CURTIS L. KEBLER curtis.kebler@gs.com	THEODORE ROBERTS troberts@sempra.com	WILLIAM H. CHEN bill.chen@constellation.com
com RICK C. NOGER	DENNIS M.P. EHLING dehling@klng.com	DONALD C. LIDDELL, P.C. liddell@energyattorney.com	BRIAN K. CHERRY bkc7@pge.com
rick_noger@praxair.com	GREGORY KOISER gregory.koiser@constellation.co	MARCIE MILNER	EDWARD G POOLE epoole@adplaw.com
KEITH R. MCCREA keith.mccrea@sablaw.com	m NORMAN A. PEDERSEN	marcie.milner@shell.com  REID A. WINTHROP	ANN G. GRIMALDI agrimaldi@mckennalong.com
ADAM J. KATZ ajkatz@mwe.com	npedersen@hanmor.com MICHAEL MAZUR	rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.co m	BRIAN T. CRAGG bcragg@goodinmacbride.com
CATHERINE M. KRUPKA ckrupka@mwe.com	mmazur@3phasesRenewables.c	THOMAS DARTON tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com	JAMES D. SQUERI
LISA M. DECKER	VITALY LEE	STEVE RAHON	jsqueri@gmssr.com
lisa.decker@constellation.com  CATHY S. WOOLLUMS	vitaly.lee@aes.com TIFFANY RAU	lschavrien@semprautilities.com GLORIA BRITTON	JEANNE B. ARMSTRONG jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.co m
cswoollums@midamerican.com	tiffany.rau@bp.com	GloriaB@anzaelectric.org	KAREN BOWEN
KEVIN BOUDREAUX kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com	GREGORY KLATT klatt@energyattorney.com	LYNELLE LUND llund@commerceenergy.com	kbowen@winston.com  LISA A. COTTLE
THOMAS DILL trdill@westernhubs.com	RICHARD HELGESON rhelgeson@scppa.org	TAMLYN M. HUNT thunt@cecmail.org	lcottle@winston.com
E.J. WRIGHT ej_wright@oxy.com	DANIEL W. DOUGLASS douglass@energyattorney.com	DIANE I. FELLMAN diane_fellman@fpl.com	SEAN P. BEATTY sbeatty@cwclaw.com
PAUL M. SEBY pseby@mckennalong.com	PAUL DELANEY pssed@adelphia.net	JEANNE M. SOLE jeanne.sole@sfgov.org	VIDHYA PRABHAKARAN vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride
TIMOTHY R. ODIL	AKBAR JAZAYEIRI	JOHN P. HUGHES	JOSEPH M. KARP
todil@mckennalong.com	akbar.jazayeri@sce.com	john.hughes@sce.com	jkarp@winston.com
STEPHEN G. KOERNER, ESQ. steve.koerner@elpaso.com	ANNETTE GILLIAM annette.gilliam@sce.com	LAD LORENZ llorenz@semprautilities.com	JEFFREY P. GRAY jeffgray@dwt.com
JENINE SCHENK jenine.schenk@apses.com	CATHY A. KARLSTAD cathy.karlstad@sce.com	MARCEL HAWIGER marcel@turn.org	CHRISTOPHER J. WARNER cjw5@pge.com
JOHN B. WELDON, JR. jbw@slwplc.com	LAURA I. GENAO Laura.Genao@sce.com	NINA SUETAKE nsuetake@turn.org	SARA STECK MYERS ssmyers@att.net
KELLY BARR kelly.barr@srpnet.com	RONALD MOORE rkmoore@gswater.com	Diana L. Lee dil@cpuc.ca.gov	LARS KVALE lars@resource-solutions.org
ROBERT R. TAYLOR rrtaylor@srpnet.com	DON WOOD dwood8@cox.net	F. Jackson Stoddard fjs@cpuc.ca.gov	ANDREW L. HARRIS alho@pge.com
STEVEN S. MICHEL smichel@westernresources.org	AIMEE M. SMITH amsmith@sempra.com	AUDREY CHANG achang@nrdc.org	ANDREA WELLER aweller@sel.com
ROGER C. MONTGOMERY roger.montgomery@swgas.com	ALLEN K. TRIAL atrial@sempra.com	DONALD BROOKHYSER rsa@a-klaw.com	JENNIFER CHAMBERLIN jchamberlin@strategicenergy.co m
LORRAINE PASKETT Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com	ALVIN PAK apak@sempraglobal.com	EVELYN KAHL ek@a-klaw.com	BETH VAUGHAN
RONALD F. DEATON ron.deaton@ladwp.com	DAN HECHT dhecht@sempratrading.com	KRISTIN GRENFELL kgrenfell@nrdc.org	beth@beth411.com

KERRY HATTEVIK kerry.hattevik@mirant.com

AVIS KOWALEWSKI kowalewskia@calpine.com

WILLIAM H. BOOTH wbooth@booth-law.com

J. ANDREW HOERNER hoerner@redefiningprogress.org

JANILL RICHARDS janill.richards@doj.ca.gov

CLIFF CHEN cchen@ucsusa.org

GREGG MORRIS gmorris@emf.net

R. THOMAS BEACH tomb@crossborderenergy.com

KENNETH C. JOHNSON kjinnovation@earthlink.net

BARRY F. MCCARTHY bmcc@mccarthylaw.com

C. SUSIE BERLIN sberlin@mccarthylaw.com

MIKE LAMOND Mike@alpinenaturalgas.com

JOY A. WARREN joyw@mid.org

UDI HELMAN UHelman@caiso.com

JOHN JENSEN jjensen@kirkwood.com

MARY LYNCH mary.lynch@constellation.com

LEONARD DEVANNA irdevannarf@cleanenergysystems.com

ANDREW BROWN abb@eslawfirm.com

BRUCE MCLAUGHLIN mclaughlin@braunlegal.com

GREGGORY L. WHEATLAND glw@eslawfirm.com

JANE E. LUCKHARDT jluckhardt@downeybrand.com

JEFFERY D. HARRIS jdh@eslawfirm.com

VIRGIL WELCH vwelch@environmentaldefense. org

WILLIAM W. WESTERFIELD,

www@eslawfirm.com

DOWNEY BRAND DOWNEY BRAND Sacramento Municipal 555 CAPITOL MALL, 10TH FLOOR SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-4686

RAYMOND J. CZAHAR, C.P.A. westgas@aol.com

STEVEN M. COHN

scohn@smud.org

ANN L. TROWBRIDGE atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com

DAN SILVERIA dansvec@hdo.net

JESSICA NELSON notice@psrec.coop

DONALD BROOKHYSER deb@a-klaw.com

CYNTHIA SCHULTZ cynthia.schultz@pacificorp.com

KYLE L. DAVIS kyle.l.davis@pacificorp.com

RYAN FLYNN ryan.flynn@pacificorp.com

IAN CARTER carter@ieta.org

JASON DUBCHAK jason.dubchak@niskags.com

BRIAN M. JONES bjones@mjbradley.com

MATTHEW MOST EDISON MISSION MARKETING & TRADING, INC. 160 FEDERAL STREET BOSTON, MA 02110-1776

KENNETH A. COLBURN kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.c

RICHARD COWART rapcowart@aol.com

KATHRYN WIG Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com SAKIS ASTERIADIS sasteriadis@apx.com

GEORGE HOPLEY george.hopley@barcap.com

ELIZABETH ZELLJADT ez@pointcarbon.com

DALLAS BURTRAW burtraw@rff.org

VERONIQUE BUGNION vb@pointcarbon.com

KYLE D. BOUDREAUX kyle boudreaux@fpl.com

ANDREW BRADFORD andrew.bradford@constellation.com

GARY BARCH gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.co

RALPH E. DENNIS ralph.dennis@constellation.com

SAMARA MINDEL smindel@knowledgeinenergy.co

BARRY RABE brabe@umich.edu

BRIAN POTTS bpotts@foley.com

JAMES W. KEATING james.keating@bp.com

CYNTHIA A. FONNER Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation

JAMES ROSS jimross@r-c-s-inc.com

TRENT A. CARLSON tcarlson@reliant.com

GARY HINNERS ghinners@reliant.com

JEANNE ZAIONTZ zaiontj@bp.com

JULIE L. MARTIN julie.martin@bp.com

FUI GEORGE fiji.george@elpaso.com

ED CHIANG echiang@elementmarkets.com

FRANK STERN fstern@summitblue.com

NADAV ENBAR nenbar@energy-insights.com

NICHOLAS LENSSEN nlenssen@energy-insights.com

ELIZABETH BAKER bbaker@summitblue.com

WAYNE TOMLINSON william.tomlinson@elpaso.com

KEVIN J. SIMONSEN kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com

SANDRA ELY Sandra.ely@state.nm.us

BRIAN MCQUOWN bmcquown@reliant.com

DOUGLAS BROOKS dbrooks@nevp.com

ANITA HART anita.hart@swgas.com

RANDY SABLE randy.sable@swgas.com

BILL SCHRAND bill.schrand@swgas.com

JJ PRUCNAL jj.prucnal@swgas.com

SANDRA CAROLINA sandra.carolina@swgas.com

CYNTHIA MITCHELL ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net

CHRISTOPHER A. HILEN chilen@sppc.com

ELENA MELLO emello@sppc.com

TREVOR DILLARD tdillard@sierrapacific.com

DARRELL SOYARS dsoyars@sppc.com

JOSEPH GRECO jgreco@caithnessenergy.com

FRANK LUCHETTI fluchetti@ndep.nv.gov

LEILANI JOHNSON KOWAL leilani.johnson@ladwp.com

RANDY S. HOWARD randy.howard@ladwp.com

ROBERT K. ROZANSKI Robert.Rozanski@ladwp.com ROBERT L. PETTINATO KIM KIENER AMBER MAHONE JEN MCGRAW kmkiener@fox.net robert.pettinato@ladwp.com amber@ethree.com jen@cnt.org ANNABELLE MALINS LISA WEINZIMER HUGH YAO SCOTT J. ANDERS HYao@SempraUtilities.com scottanders@sandiego.edu annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk lisa weinzimer@platts.com RASHA PRINCE JOSEPH R. KLOBERDANZ DEVRA WANG STEVEN MOSS rprince@semprautilities.com jkloberdanz@semprautilities.co dwang@nrdc.org steven@moss.net RANDALL W. KEEN KAREN TERRANOVA SHAUN ELLIS rkeen@manatt.com ANDREW MCALLISTER filings@a-klaw.com sellis@fypower.org andrew.mcallister@energycenter S. NANCY WHANG NORA SHERIFF ARNO HARRIS .org nwhang@manatt.com. nes@a-klaw.com arno@recurrentenergy.com JACK BURKE PETER JAZAYERI jack.burke@energycenter.org OLOF BYSTROM ED LUCHA pjazayeri@stroock.com obystrom@cera.com ELL5@pge.com JENNIFER PORTER DEREK MARKOLF jennifer.porter@energycenter.or SETH HILTON GRACE LIVINGSTONderek@climateregistry.org sdhilton@stoel.com NUNLEY gxl2@pge.com DAVID NEMTZOW SEPHRA A. NINOW SHERYL CARTER david@nemtzow.com JASMIN ANSAR sephra.ninow@energycenter.org scarter@nrdc.org jxa2@pge.com HARVEY EDER DESPINA NIEHAUS ASHLEE M, BONDS harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.co JONATHAN FORRESTER dniehaus@semprautilities.com abonds@thelen.com JDF1@PGE.COM JOHN W. LESLIE CARMEN E. BASKETTE STEVE ENDO jlesIie@luce.com cbaskette@enemoc.com RAYMOND HUNG sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us RHHJ@pge.com ORLANDO B. FOOTE, III COLIN PETHERAM STEVEN G. LINS SEBASTIEN CSAPO ofoote@hkcf-law.com colin.petheram@att.com slins@ci.glendale.ca.us sscb@pge.com ELSTON K. GRUBAUGH JAMES W. TARNAGHAN TOM HAMILTON ekgrubaugh@iid.com jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.c SOUMYA SASTRY THAMILTON5@CHARTER:N svs6@pge.com ET THOMAS MCCABE EDISON MISSION ENERGY KEVIN FOX STEPHANIE LA SHAWN 18101 VON KARMAN AVE., BRUNO JEIDER kfox@wsgr.com S1L7@pge.com bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us **SUITE 1700 IRVINE, CA 92612** KHURSHID KHOJA VALERIE J. WINN RICHARD J. MORILLO kkhoja@thelenreid.com vjw3@pge.com JAN PEPPER rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us pepper@cleanpowermarkets.co PETER V. ALLEN KARLA DAILEY ROGER PELOTE pvallen@thelen.com karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org roger.pelote@williams.com GLORIA D. SMITH SHERIDAN J. PAUKER FARROKH ALBUYEH AIMEE BARNES gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net spauker@wsgr.com aimee.barnes@ecosecurities.co MARC D. JOSEPH ROBERT J. REINHARD DEAN R. TIBBS mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.co rreinhard@mofo.com dtibbs@aes4u.com CASE ADMINISTRATION case.admin@sce.com JEFFREY L. HAHN HAYLEY GOODSON CALIFORNIA ENERGY ihahn@covantaenergy.com TIM HEMIG hayley@turn.org MARKETS tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com cem@newsdata.com ANDREW J. VAN HORN MICHEL FLORIO andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com BARRY LOVELL mflorio@turn.org HOWARD V. GOLUB bjl@bry.com hgolub@nixonpeabody.com JOSEPH M. PAUL DAN ADLER Joe.paul@dynegy.com ALDYN HOEKSTRA Dan.adler@calcef.org JANINE L. SCANCARELLI aldyn,hoekstra@paceglobal.com SUE KATELEY jscancarelli@flk.com MICHAEL A. HYAMS info@calseia.org YVONNE GROSS mhyams@sfwater.org JOSEPH F. WIEDMAN

THERESA BURKE

tburke@sfwater.org

NORMAN J. FURUTA

norman.furuta@navy.mil

jwiedman@goodinmacbride.co

MARTIN A. MATTES

mmattes@nossaman.com

**GREG BLUE** 

gblue@enxco.com

SARAH BESERRA

sbeserra@sbcglobal.net

ygross@sempraglobal.com

JOHN LAUN

jlaun@apogee.net

MONICA A. SCHWEBS, ESQ. monica.schwebs@bingham.com

PETER W. HANSCHEN phanschen@mofo.com

JOSEPH HENRI josephhenri@hotmail.com

PATRICIA THOMPSON pthompson@summitblue.com

WILLIAM F. DIETRICH dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net

BETTY SETO Betty.Seto@kema.com

GERALD L. LAHR JerryL@abag.ca.gov

JODY S. LONDON jody\_london\_consulting@earthli nk.net

STEVEN SCHILLER steve@schiller.com

MRW & ASSOCIATES, INC. mrw@mrwassoc.com

REED V. SCHMIDT rschmidt@bartlewells.com

ADAM BRIONES adamb@greenlining.org

STEVE KROMER stevek@kromer.com

CLYDE MURLEY clyde.murley@comcast.net

BRENDA LEMAY brenda.lemay@horizonwind.co m

CARLA PETERMAN carla.peterman@gmail.com

EDWARD VINE elvine@lbl.gov

RYAN WISER rhwiser@lbl.gov

CHRIS MARNAY C\_Marnay@1b1.gov

PHILLIP J. MULLER philm@scdenergy.com

RITA NORTON rita@ritanortonconsulting.com

CARL PECHMAN cpechman@powereconomics.co m

MAHLON ALDRIDGE emahlon@ecoact.org

RICHARD SMITH richards@mid.org

ROGER VAN HOY rogerv@mid.org

THOMAS S. KIMBALL tomk@mid.org

WES MONIER fwmonier@tid.org

BARBARA R. BARKOVICH brbarkovich@earthlink.net

JOHN R. REDDING johnrredding@earthlink.net

CLARK BERNIER clark.bernier@rlw.com

RICHARD MCCANN, PH.D mccann@umich.edu

CAROLYN M. KEHREIN cmkehrein@ems-ca.com

CALIFORNIA ISO e-recipient@caiso.com

GRANT ROSENBLUM, ESQ. grosenblum@caiso.com

KAREN EDSON 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD FOLSOM, CA 95630

ROBIN SMUTNY-JONES rsmutny-jones@caiso.com

SAEED FARROKHPAY saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov

DAVID BRANCHCOMB david@branchcomb.com

KENNY SWAIN kenneth.swain@navigantconsult ing.com

KIRBY DUSEL kdusel@navigantconsulting.com

GORDON PICKERING gpickering@navigantconsulting.

LAURIE PARK lpark@navigantconsulting.com

DAVID REYNOLDS davidreynolds@ncpa.com

SCOTT TOMASHEFSKY scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com

ELLEN WOLFE ewolfe@resero.com

AUDRA HARTMANN Audra Hartmann@Dynegy.com

BOB LUCAS
Bob.lucas@calobby.com

CURT BARRY curt.barry@iwpnews.com

DAN SKOPEC danskopec@gmail.com

DANIELLE MATTHEWS SEPERAS dseperas@calpine.com

DAVID L. MODISETTE dave@ppallc.com

DOUGLAS K. KERNER dkk@eslawfirm.com

JUSTIN C. WYNNE wynne@braunlegal.com

KASSANDRA GOUGH kgough@calpine.com

KELLIE SMITH kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov

KEVIN WOODRUFF kdw@woodruff-expertservices.com

MICHAEL WAUGH mwaugh@arb.ca.gov

PANAMA BARTHOLOMY pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us

PATRICK STONER pstoner@lgc.org

RACHEL MCMAHON rachel@ceert.org

RYAN BERNARDO bernardo@braunlegal.com

STEVEN A. LIPMAN steven@lipmanconsulting.com

STEVEN KELLY steven@iepa.com

WEBSTER TASAT wtasat@arb.ca.gov

EDWARD J. TIEDEMANN etiedemann@kmtg.com

LAURIE TEN HOPE ltenhope@energy.state.ca.us

JOSHUA BUSHINSKY bushinskyj@pewclimate.org

LYNN HAUG lmh@eslawfirm.com

OBADIAH BARTHOLOMY obartho@smud.org

BUD BEEBE bbeebe@smud.org

BALWANT S. PUREWAL bpurewal@water.ca.gov

DOUGLAS MACMULLLEN dmacmil@water.ca.gov

KAREN NORENE MILLS kmills@cfbf.com

KAREN LINDH karen@klindh.com

ELIZABETH W. HADLEY ehadley@reupower.com

DENISE HILL3317/001/X94358.v1 Denise\_Hill@transalta.com

ANNIE STANGE sas@a-klaw.com

ELIZABETH WESTBY egw@a-klaw.com

ALEXIA C. KELLY akelly@climatetrust.org

ALAN COMNES alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com

KYLE SILON kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com

CATHIE ALLEN californiadockets@pacificorp.co m

PHIL CARVER
Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us

SAM SADLER samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us

LISA SCHWARTZ lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us

CLARE BREIDENICH cbreidenich@yahoo.com

DONALD SCHOENBECK dws@r-c-s-inc.com

JESUS ARREDONDO jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com

CHARLIE BLAIR charlie.blair@delta-ee.com

KAREN MCDONALD Kristin Ralff Douglas PHILIP D. PETTINGILL karen.mcdonald@powerex.com krd@cpuc.ca.gov ppettingill@caiso.com CLARENCE BINNINGER MICHAEL SCHEIBLE Lainie Motamedi clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov lrm@cpuc.ca.gov mscheibl@arb.ca.gov DAVID ZONANA **EVAN POWERS** Lana Tran david.zonana@doj.ca.gov epowers@arb.ca.gov ltt@cpuc.ca.gov Andrew Campbell Matthew Deal JEFFREY DOLL agc@cpuc.ca.gov mjd@cpuc.ca.gov jdoll@arb.ca.gov Anne Gillette Nancy Ryan PAM BURMICH aeg@cpuc.ca.gov ner@cpuc.ca.gov pburmich@arb.ca.gov Beth Moore Pamela Wellner B. B. BLEVINS blm@cpuc.ca.gov pw1@cpuc.ca.gov bblevins@energy.state.ca.us Cathleen A. Fogel Paul S. Phillips DARYL METZ psp@cpuc.ca.gov cfl@cpuc.ca.gov dmetz@energy.state.ca.us Charlotte TerKeurst Pearlie Sabino DEBORAH SLON pzs@cpuc.ca.gov cft@cpuc.ca.gov deborah.slon@doj.ca.gov Christine S. Tam Rahmon Momoh Don Schultz tam@cpuc.ca.gov rmm@cpuc.ca.gov dks@cpuc.ca.gov Donald R. Smith Richard A. Myers KAREN GRIFFIN dsh@cpuc.ca.gov ram@cpuc.ca.gov kgriffin@energy.state.ca.us LISA DECARLO Ed Moldavsky Sara M. Kamins edm@cpuc.ca.gov smk@cpuc.ca.gov ldecarlo@energy.state.ca.us Eugene Cadenasso Scott Murtishaw MARC PRYOR cpe@cpuc.ca.gov sgm@cpuc.ca.gov mpryor@energy.state.ca.us MICHELLE GARCIA Harvey Y. Morris Sean A. Simon mgarcia@arb.ca.gov hym@cpuc.ca.gov svn@cpuc.ca.gov PIERRE H. DUVAIR Henry Stern Steve Roscow pduvair@energy.state.ca.us hs1@cpuc.ca.gov scr@cpuc.ca.gov Wade McCartney Jaclyn Marks Theresa Cho wsm@cpuc.ca.gov jm3@cpuc.ca.gov tcx@cpuc.ca.gov CAROL J. HURLOCK Jacqueline Greig BILL LOCKYER hurlock@water.ca.gov jnm@cpuc.ca.gov ken.alex@doj.ca.gov HOLLY B. CRONIN Jamie Fordyce KEN ALEX hcronin@water.ca.gov jbf@cpuc.ca.gov ken.alex@doj.ca.gov ROSS A. MILLER Jason R. Salmi Klotz BALDASSARO DI CAPO rmiller@energy.state.ca.us bdicapo@caiso.com jkI@cpuc.ca.gov Jeorge S. Tagnipes JUDITH B. SANDERS jst@cpuc.ca.gov jsanders@caiso.com 3317/001/X94358.v1 Joel T. Perlstein JULIE GILL jgill@caiso.com jtp@cpuc.ca.gov Jonathan Lakritz MARY MCDONALD jol@cpuc.ca.gov DIRECTOR OF STATE AFFAIRS CALIFORNIA INDEPENDENT Judith lkle SYSTEM OPERATOR jci@cpuc.ca.gov CAISO Julie A. Fitch 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD

FOLSOM, CA 95630

jf2@cpuc.ca.gov