

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

<b>DOCKET</b>	
07-011P-1	
<b>DATE</b>	OCT 8 1 2007
<b>RECD.</b>	OCT 8 1 2007

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the  
Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to  
Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions  
Standards into Procurement Policies.

Rulemaking 06-04-009  
(Filed April 13, 2006)

**COMMENTS OF SUSTAINABLE CONSERVATION ON  
ALLOCATION OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION ALLOWANCES**

Jody London  
P.O. Box 3629  
Oakland, California 94609  
510/459-0667  
jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net

FOR Sustainable Conservation

October 31, 2007

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the California Public Utilities Commission ("CPUC"), Sustainable Conservation submits these comments on emission allowance allocation issues, as requested in the Administrative Law Judge's October 15, 2007 ruling. Sustainable Conservation applauds the Commission for examining the many complex issues related to emission allowances. The interplay of the issues outlined in the Ruling and other issues before the Commission in R.06-02-012 related to tradable renewable energy credits are emerging and deserve particular attention.

Sustainable Conservation has a particular focus on issues related to biogas digesters, a form of baseload renewable power that provides significant greenhouse gas emission reduction benefits, in addition to other environmental advantages. For purposes of the current ruling, if the Commission recommends a first seller approach to allowance allocation, small renewable distributed generation should not be subject to the regulations.

Sustainable Conservation in these comments also asks the Commission to grant it party status, in accordance with Rule 1.4(a)(2)(ii) of the Rules of Practice and Procedure.

## **II. SMALL RENEWABLE DISTRIBUTED GENERATION SHOULD NOT BE SUBJECT TO ALLOWANCE ALLOCATION REGULATIONS**

In Decision 07-01-039, the Commission determined that several renewable resources and technologies are compliant with an emissions performance standard. D.07-01-039 singles out biomass and biogas technologies:

"In particular, the record shows that electric generation using biomass (e.g., agricultural and wood waste, landfill gas) that would otherwise be disposed of under a variety of conventional methods (such as open burning, forest accumulation, landfills, composting) results in a substantial *net reduction* in GHG emissions. This is because the usual disposal options for biomass wastes emit large quantities of methane gas, whereas the energy alternatives either burn the wastes that would become methane or burn the methane itself, generating CO<sub>2</sub>.

Since methane gas is on the order of twenty to twenty-five times more potent as a GHG than CO<sub>2</sub>, and since methane has an atmospheric residence time of twelve years, after which it is converted to atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, trading off methane for CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from energy recovery operations leads to a net reduction of the greenhouse effect.”<sup>1</sup>

It is important to recognize that biomass and biogas do not emit “fossil” carbon. The CO<sub>2</sub> emitted from burning biomass and biogas is biogenic carbon; in the case of biogas digesters, this CO<sub>2</sub> is annually cycled whether it is burned to generate electricity or is released during the decomposition of organic matter (manure, crop waste, etc). As should be self evident, these technologies should not need to purchase allowances, and under the Commission’s procurement policies they count as zero net emissions for the emissions performance standard. Because these technologies destroy greenhouse gases, it does not make sense to include them in any regulatory system for carbon allowance allocation.

Note also that small renewable generators are likely to be important in a carbon offset program. In such a position new facilities will be funded by substantial private sector investment, now starting to happen in anticipation of an emerging market. And they will become significant sources for new carbon neutral or carbon negative electricity generation. Putting them in an allowance program would seem to defeat that purpose without providing any tangible benefits. In fact, doing so would likely create administrative headaches for both the generators and the State agencies administering the program due to the large number of facilities to include, most of which will not have countable GHG emissions.

Other regulatory bodies have recognized that there are no net carbon emissions associated with biomass and biogas technology. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

---

<sup>1</sup> D.07-01-039, pp. 18-19.

recognizes that “Biomass is a special case.”<sup>2</sup> Carbon-equivalent emissions from biomass and biogas are biogenic emissions and will be inventoried and reported in a different category from fossil fuels and will not require allowances.

The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (“UNFCCC”) has developed a clean development mechanism for issuing offset credits in accordance with the Kyoto Protocols, with a focus on developing countries. In 2004, UNFCCC published a methodology for calculating greenhouse gas reductions from manure management systems. The accounting tool UNFCCC uses has separate quantification methodologies for projects that have methane destruction by anaerobic manure digesters. When measuring greenhouse gas emission reductions from manure management, the UNFCCC methodology separates CO<sub>2</sub> emissions as a result of electricity generation from the methane that is destroyed in the process.

The California Climate Action Registry (“CCAR”) in June 2007 adopted its first industry-specific project reporting protocol, the Livestock Reporting Protocol for Capturing and Combusting Methane from Manure Management Systems. The CCAR Protocol specifically delineates greenhouse gas reductions from farm operations (capturing methane that would otherwise be emitted) from those associated with operation of a biogas digester: “Furthermore, producing power for the electricity grid (and thus displacing fossil-fueled power plant GHG emissions) is a complementary and separate GHG project activity to destroying methane gas from waste treatment/storage, and not included within this protocol’s accounting framework.”<sup>3</sup>

California’s treatment of GHG emissions/benefits from renewable technologies, particularly biomass and biogas, should be consistent with the regulatory policies adopted by

---

<sup>2</sup> IPCC, “2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories,” Volume 2: Energy, p. 2.33. This document can be found online at: [http://www.ipcc-nggip.iges.or.jp/public/2006gl/pdf/2\\_Volume2/V2\\_2\\_Ch2\\_Stationary\\_Combustion.pdf](http://www.ipcc-nggip.iges.or.jp/public/2006gl/pdf/2_Volume2/V2_2_Ch2_Stationary_Combustion.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> California Climate Action Registry, “Livestock Project Reporting Protocol: Capturing and Combusting Methane from Manure Management Systems,” June, 2007, p. 3.

other state and international entities. Including them in an allowance system would seem to run counter to these established policies, would not achieve any additional greenhouse gas reduction outcomes and may create barriers to new renewable generation.

### **III. THE COMMISSION SHOULD GRANT SUSTAINABLE CONSERVATION PARTY STATUS**

Rule 1.4(a)(2)(ii) allows any person that wishes to become a party to a Commission proceeding to do so by filing comments in a rulemaking. By this filing, Sustainable Conservation seeks party status. Sustainable Conservation is a non-profit public benefit corporation with a long-standing interest in advancing the stewardship of natural resources using innovative, pragmatic strategies that actively engage businesses and private landowners in conservation. This includes participation and advocacy before regulatory entities including the California Air Resources Board, the California Energy Commission, and the California Public Utilities Commission, as well as other State agencies, boards, and the Legislature. Sustainable Conservation is a formally organized group authorized pursuant to its bylaws to, among other things, “develop, support, and demonstrate ecologically and environmentally sensitive business strategies and land use” and “represent interests related to the Corporation’s conservation activities in regulatory, judicial and legislative proceedings.”<sup>4</sup>

Sustainable Conservation is an active participant in ongoing Commission proceedings related to renewable resources and the renewable portfolio standard (R.06-20-012, R.06-05-027). Sustainable Conservation’s focus in those proceedings, as in this one, is on issues related to biogas digesters. Sustainable Conservation is not seeking to expand the scope of the proceeding, and offers herein comments that are responsive to the Administrative Law Judge’s October 15

---

<sup>4</sup> “Bylaws of Sustainable Conservation, a California Public Benefit Corporation,” Article 3.

ruling, particularly the questions around emission allowances with a deliverer/first seller point of regulation.

The Commission should grant Sustainable Conservation party status in this proceeding.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

If the Commission recommends a first seller approach to greenhouse gas allowance allocation, it should refrain from including small renewable generation, particularly biomass and biogas, from that requirement. The Commission also should grant party status to Sustainable Conservation.

Dated: October 31, 2007

Respectfully submitted,

By:



Jody S. London

Jody London Consulting  
P.O. Box 3629  
Oakland, California 94609  
Telephone: (510) 459-0667  
E-mail: jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net

For SUSTAINABLE CONSERVATION

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

---

I, Jody London, certify that I have, on this date, caused the foregoing COMMENTS OF SUSTAINABLE CONSERVATION ON ALLOCATION OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION ALLOWANCES to be served by electronic mail, or for any party for which an electronic mail address has not been provided, by U.S. Mail on the parties listed on the Service List for the proceeding in California Public Utilities Commission Docket No. R.06-04-009 and the California Energy Commission's docket 07-OIIP-01.

I declare under penalty of perjury, pursuant to the laws of the State of California, that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on October 31, 2007, in Oakland, California.



---

Jody London

## **CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION**

### **Service Lists**

**Proceeding: R0604009 - CPUC - PG&E, SDG&E,**  
**Filer: CPUC - PG&E, SDG&E, SOCALGAS, EDISON**  
**List Name: LIST**  
**Last changed: October 29, 2007**

cadams@covantaenergy.com	dwood8@cox.net	vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com
steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com	ramsmith@sempra.com	jkarp@winston.com
steven.huhman@morganstanley.com	atrial@sempra.com	jeffgray@dwt.com
rick_noger@praxair.com	apak@sempraglobal.com	cjw5@pge.com
keith.mccrea@sablauw.com	dhecht@sempratrading.com	ssmyers@att.net
ajkatz@mwe.com	daking@sempra.com	lars@resource-solutions.org
ckrupka@mwe.com	svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com	alho@pge.com
lisa.decker@constellation.com	troberts@sempra.com	aweller@sel.com
cswoollums@midamerican.com	liddell@energyattomey.com	jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com
kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com	marcie.milner@shell.com	beth@beth411.com
trdill@westernhubs.com	rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com	kerry.hattevik@mirant.com
ej_wright@oxy.com	tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com	kowalewskia@calpine.com
pseby@mckennalong.com	lschavrien@semprautilities.com	wbooth@booth-law.com
todil@mckennalong.com	GloriaB@anzaelectric.org	hoemer@redefiningprogress.org
steve.koerner@elpaso.com	llund@commerceenergy.com	janill.richards@doj.ca.gov
jenine.schenk@apses.com	thunt@cecmail.org	cchen@ucsusa.org
jbw@slwplc.com	jeanne.sole@sfgov.org	gmorris@emf.net
kelly.barr@srpnet.com	john.hughes@sce.com	tomb@crossborderenergy.com
rtaylor@srpnet.com	llorenz@semprautilities.com	bmcc@mccarthyaw.com
smichel@westernresources.org	marcel@tum.org	sberlin@mccarthyaw.com
roger.montgomery@swgas.com	nsuetake@tum.org	anginc@goldrush.com
ron.deaton@ladwp.com	dil@cpuc.ca.gov	joyw@mid.org
snewsom@semprautilities.com	fjs@cpuc.ca.gov	
dhuard@manatt.com	achang@nrdc.org	jjensen@kirkwood.com
curtis.kebler@gs.com	rsa@a-klaw.com	mary.lynch@constellation.com
dehling@kling.com	ek@a-klaw.com	lrdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com
gregory.koiser@constellation.com	kgrenfell@nrdc.org	abb@eslawfirm.com
npedersen@hanmor.com	mpa@a-klaw.com	mclaughlin@braunlegal.com
mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com	sls@a-klaw.com	glw@eslawfirm.com
tiffany.rau@bp.com	bill.chen@constellation.com	jluckhardt@downeybrand.com
klatt@energyattomey.com	bkc7@pge.com	jd@eslawfirm.com
rhelgeson@scppa.org	epoole@adplaw.com	vwelch@environmentaldefense.org
douglass@energyattomey.com	agrimaldi@mckennalong.com	www@eslawfirm.com
pssed@adelphia.net	bcragg@goodinmacbride.com	
akbar.jazayeri@sce.com	jsqueri@gmssr.com	westgas@aol.com
annette.gilliam@sce.com	jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com	schohn@smud.org
cathy.karlstad@sce.com	kbowen@winston.com	atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com
Laura.Genao@sce.com	lcottle@winston.com	dansvec@hdo.net
rkmoores@gswater.com	sbeatty@cwclaw.com	notice@psrec.coop



deb@a-klaw.com  
cynthia.schultz@pacificorp.com  
kyle.l.davis@pacificorp.com  
ryan.flynn@pacificorp.com  
carter@ieta.org  
jason.dubchak@niskags.com  
bjones@mjbbradley.com

kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com  
rapcowart@aol.com  
Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com  
sasteriadis@apx.com  
george.hopley@barcap.com  
ez@pointcarbon.com  
burtraw@rff.org  
vb@pointcarbon.com  
kyle\_boudreaux@fpl.com  
andrew.bradford@constellation.com  
gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com  
ralph.dennis@constellation.com  
smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com  
brabe@umich.edu  
bpotts@foley.com  
james.keating@bp.com  
jimross@r-c-s-inc.com  
tcarlson@reliant.com  
ghinners@reliant.com  
zaiontj@bp.com  
julie.martin@bp.com  
fiji.george@elpaso.com  
echiang@elementmarkets.com  
nenbar@energy-insights.com  
nlenssen@energy-insights.com  
bbaker@summitblue.com  
william.tomlinson@elpaso.com  
kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com  
Sandra.ely@state.nm.us  
bmcquown@reliant.com  
dbrooks@nevp.com  
anita.hart@swgas.com  
randy.sable@swgas.com  
bill.schrand@swgas.com  
jj.prucnal@swgas.com  
sandra.carolina@swgas.com  
ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net  
chilen@sppc.com  
emello@sppc.com  
tdillard@sierrapacific.com  
dsoyars@sppc.com  
fluchetti@ndep.nv.gov

leilani.johnson@ladwp.com  
Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com  
randy.howard@ladwp.com  
robert.pettinato@ladwp.com  
HYao@SempraUtilities.com  
rprince@semprautilities.com  
rkeen@manatt.com  
nwahang@manatt.com  
pjazayeri@stroock.com  
derek@climaterestry.org  
david@nemtzow.com  
harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com  
vitaly.lee@aes.com  
sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us  
slins@ci.glendale.ca.us  
THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET  
bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us  
rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us  
roger.pelote@williams.com  
aimee.barnes@ecosecurities.com  
case.admin@sce.com  
tim.hernig@nrgenergy.com  
bjl@bry.com  
aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com  
ygross@sempraglobal.com  
jlaun@apogee.net  
kmkiener@fox.net  
scottanders@sandiego.edu  
jkloberdanz@semprautilities.com  
andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org  
jack.burke@energycenter.org  
jennifer.porter@energycenter.org  
sephra.ninow@energycenter.org  
jleslie@luce.com  
ofoote@hkcf-law.com  
ekgrubaug@iid.com

pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com  
gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com  
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com  
diane\_fellman@fpl.com  
hayley@turn.org  
mflorio@turn.org  
Dan.adler@calcef.org  
mhyams@sfwater.org  
tburke@sfwater.org  
norman.furuta@navy.mil  
amber@ethree.com  
annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk  
dwang@nrdc.org

filings@a-klaw.com  
nes@a-klaw.com  
obystrom@cera.com  
sdhilton@stoel.com  
scarter@nrdc.org  
abonds@thelen.com  
cbasket@enemoc.com  
colin.petheram@att.com  
jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com  
kfox@wsgr.com  
kkhoja@thelenreid.com  
pvallen@thelen.com  
spauker@wsgr.com  
rreinhard@mofo.com  
cem@newsdata.com  
hgolub@nixonpeabody.com  
jscancarelli@flk.com  
jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com  
mmattes@nossaman.com  
jen@cnt.org  
lisa\_weinzimer@platts.com  
steven@moss.net  
sellis@fypower.org  
arno@recurrentenergy.com  
ELL5@pge.com  
gx12@pge.com  
jxa2@pge.com  
JDF1@PGE.COM  
RHHJ@pge.com  
sscb@pge.com  
svs6@pge.com  
S1L7@pge.com  
vjw3@pge.com  
karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org  
farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net  
dtibbs@aes4u.com  
jhahn@covantaenergy.com  
andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com  
Joe.paul@dynegy.com  
info@calseia.org  
gblue@enxco.com  
sbeserra@sbcglobal.net  
monica.schwebs@bingham.com  
phanschen@mofo.com  
josephhenri@hotmail.com  
pthompson@summitblue.com  
dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net  
Betty.Seto@kema.com  
JerryL@abag.ca.gov  
jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net

steve@schiller.com  
 mrw@mrwassoc.com  
 rschmidt@bartlell.com  
 adamb@greenlining.org  
 clyde.murley@comcast.net  
 brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com  
 carla.peterman@gmail.com  
 elvine@lbl.gov  
 rhwiser@lbl.gov  
 C\_Marnay@1b1.gov  
 philm@scdenergy.com  
 rita@ritanortonconsulting.com  
 cpechman@powereconomics.com  
 emahlon@ecoact.org  
 richards@mid.org

rogerv@mid.org  
 fwmonier@tid.org  
 brbarkovich@earthlink.net  
 johnredding@earthlink.net  
 clark.bernier@rlw.com  
 rmccann@umich.edu  
 cmkehrein@ems-ca.com  
 e-recipient@caiso.com  
 grosenblum@caiso.com

rsmutny-jones@caiso.com  
 saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov  
 david@branchcomb.com  
 kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com  
 kdusel@navigantconsulting.com  
 gpickering@navigantconsulting.com  
 lpark@navigantconsulting.com  
 davidreynolds@ncpa.com  
 scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com  
 ewolfe@resero.com  
 Audra.Hartmann@Dynegy.com  
 Bob.lucas@calobby.com  
 curt.barry@iwpnews.com  
 danskopec@gmail.com  
 dseperas@calpine.com  
 dave@ppallc.com  
 dkk@eslawfirm.com  
 wyne@braunlegal.com  
 kgough@calpine.com  
 kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov  
 kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com  
 mwaugh@arb.ca.gov  
 pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us  
 pstoner@lgc.org

rachel@ceert.org  
 wtasat@arb.ca.gov  
 steven@iepa.com  
 etiedemann@kmtg.com  
 ltenhope@energy.state.ca.us  
 bushinskyj@pewclimate.org  
 lmh@eslawfirm.com  
 obartha@smud.org  
 bbeebe@smud.org  
 bpurewal@water.ca.gov  
 dmacmill@water.ca.gov  
 kmills@cbbf.com  
 karen@klindh.com  
 ehadley@reupower.com  
 Denise\_Hill@transalta.com  
 sas@a-klaw.com  
 egw@a-klaw.com  
 akelly@climatetrust.org  
 alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com  
 kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com  
 californiadockets@pacificcorp.com  
 Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us  
 samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us  
 lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us  
 cbreidenich@yahoo.com  
 dws@r-c-s-inc.com  
 jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com  
 charlie.blair@delta-ee.com  
 karen.mcdonald@powerex.com  
 larence.binninger@doj.ca.gov  
 david.zonana@doj.ca.gov  
 agc@cpuc.ca.gov  
 aeg@cpuc.ca.gov  
 blm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 cf1@cpuc.ca.gov  
 cft@cpuc.ca.gov  
 tam@cpuc.ca.gov  
 dsh@cpuc.ca.gov  
 edm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 cpe@cpuc.ca.gov  
 hym@cpuc.ca.gov  
 hs1@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jm3@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jnm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jbf@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jk1@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jst@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jtp@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jol@cpuc.ca.gov  
 jci@cpuc.ca.gov

jf2@cpuc.ca.gov  
 krd@cpuc.ca.gov  
 lrm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 ltt@cpuc.ca.gov  
 mjd@cpuc.ca.gov  
 ner@cpuc.ca.gov  
 pw1@cpuc.ca.gov  
 psp@cpuc.ca.gov  
 pzs@cpuc.ca.gov  
 rmm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 ram@cpuc.ca.gov  
 smk@cpuc.ca.gov  
 sgm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 svn@cpuc.ca.gov  
 scr@cpuc.ca.gov  
 tcx@cpuc.ca.gov  
 ken.alex@doj.ca.gov  
 ken.alex@doj.ca.gov  
 bdicapo@caiso.com  
 jsanders@caiso.com  
 jgill@caiso.com  
 ppettingill@caiso.com  
 mscheibl@arb.ca.gov  
 epowers@arb.ca.gov  
 jdoll@arb.ca.gov  
 pburmich@arb.ca.gov  
 bblevins@energy.state.ca.us  
 dmetz@energy.state.ca.us  
 deborah.slom@doj.ca.gov  
 dks@cpuc.ca.gov  
 kgriffin@energy.state.ca.us  
 ldecarlo@energy.state.ca.us  
 mpryor@energy.state.ca.us  
 mgarcia@arb.ca.gov  
 pduvair@energy.state.ca.us  
 wsm@cpuc.ca.gov  
 hurlock@water.ca.gov  
 hcronin@water.ca.gov