DOCKETED	
Docket Number:	16-OIR-06
Project Title:	Senate Bill 350 Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group
TN #:	247514
Document Title:	Item 4 - DACAG Meeting Minutes 10-21-22
Description:	N/A
Filer:	Dorothy Murimi
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	11/18/2022 9:42:08 AM
Docketed Date:	11/18/2022

### OCTOBER 21, 2022 - DACAG Meeting Minutes

#### **ITEM 1: WELCOME**

Member Attendance				
* Write arrival time next to member name if member is late.				
Member	Present	Absent		
Adrian (1:10pm)	$\boxtimes$			
Andres				
Fred		$\boxtimes$		
Jana				
Roger (1:35pm)				
Roman				
Stephanie				
Curtis				
Elena (1:10pm)				
Julia	$\boxtimes$			

Group can move forward with voting items. [Quorum of members is needed to move forward. 6 members.]

#### **ITEM 2: GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

- Sylvia Chi, Just Solutions Collective
  - Raise for attention: lack of transparency around implementation of the Federal Infrastructure Investment in Jobs Act (IIJA), which includes billions of dollars for utilities. The CPUC requested that the utilities submit info to the CPUC about which IIJA programs they'd be applying for, but the CPUC has not yet released any of that info publicly. The public should understand and have a say in changes in the energy system, particularly environmental justice and low income communities. Requesting that the DACAG facilitate more transparency around IIJA and Inflation Reduction Act (IRA) implementation, and to work with the CPUC to make submissions from the utilities available to the public.

# ITEM 3: OPENING COMMENTS BY THE CEC AND CPUC COMMISSIONERS OR THEIR ADVISORS

Commissioners in Attendance:

\*Write any opening remarks below or next to their names

- CEC Commissioners
  - □ Chair Hochschild
  - □Vice Chair Gunda
  - □ Commissioner Vaccaro
  - **⊠Commissioner Monahan** 
    - Hoping to get DACAG input on draft Clean Transportation Program Investment
       Plan. Given the enormity of the investments and the importance of the equity in

these investments, we hope to get formal input from the DACAG as a single voice, if possible, in addition to the individual input we may have received from organizations and are incorporating. Three years ago the budget was \$100M, then \$1B, now \$2B – in alignment with the Governor's goal to electrify everything in the next 15-25 years. CARB is also considering the advanced clean fleet rule to complement the rule for advanced clean trucks regulation. Infrastructure will be critical to the State meeting its goals, including refueling infrastructure in the ground, which is critical for public health. All of this has a strong impact on communities and the CEC wants to ensure we're doing all we can to help CA meet its goals and to do that in an equitable way.

<ul><li>None</li></ul>	makes  nds motion	Jar	na	Triceting Minutes September 10, 2022.
<ul> <li>None</li> <li>Motion to approximate Member who motion</li> <li>Member to second</li> </ul>	makes  nds motion	Jar	na ve.	Preeding Minutes September 10, 2022.
<ul><li>None</li><li>Motion to approv</li><li>Member who</li></ul>				riceting Minutes September 10, 2022.
<ul><li>None</li><li>Motion to approve</li></ul>				Meeting Minutes September 10, 2022.
		the Drovie	uc Month's	Meeting Minutes September 16, 2022.
<ul> <li>Public Comment</li> </ul>				
	•	MEETING	G MINUTES	FOR SEPTEMBER 16, 2022.
New staff announceme	nte: N/A			
□Commi Other:	ssioner Rey	ynolas		
	ssioner Shi			
	ssioner Red			
	ent Reynold ssioner Ho			
• CPUC				
Other:				
	ssioner Mc	Allister	godio di la c	o do that in an equitable way.
□Commi:	•	A meet its	s uuais aiiu i	U UU IIIAI III AII EUIIIIADE WAV.

<b>Member Votes</b>				
Member	Aye	Nay	Abstain	Not Present During Vote
Adrian	$\boxtimes$			
Andres	$\boxtimes$			
Fred				$\boxtimes$
Jana	$\boxtimes$			
Roger				
Roman			$\boxtimes$	
Stephanie	$\boxtimes$			

Curtis	$\boxtimes$		
Elena	$\boxtimes$		
Julia	$\boxtimes$		

Motion	Passes	Doesn't Pass	If not unanimous, include vote count
ITEM 4	$\boxtimes$		7 aye, 1 abstain, 2 not present

ITEM 5: CEC STAFF WILL UPDATE DACAG ON THE DRAFT STAFF CLEAN TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM INVESTMENT PLAN AND DACAG WILL CONSIDER ADOPTION OF WRITTEN COMMENTS DRAFTED BY SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS ON THE DACAG AND APPOINTMENT OF A DACAG DESIGNEE TO PRESENT THE DACAG COMMENTS AT A CEC BUSINESS MEETING.

Presentation Title: Update on the Draft Staff Clean Transportation Program Investment Plan, Charles Smith

#### Notes:

• Full presentation linked <u>here</u>.

#### **Public Comment**

None

#### Q&A

- What are the baseline requirements for equitable investments currently?
  - Present metric has been looking at how much of program dollars are being invested in projects in either low-income communities, disadvantaged communities, both, neither, or "statewide" projects.
  - o Extra credit on grants is also provided for things like jobs created, etc.
- It seems that the \$10M for workforce training and development is rather low. Please comment.
  - Historically aligned with investment the program has made in workforce, but that doesn't mean it couldn't be expanded.
- Is there data that shows the results of previous workforce investments, such as jobs created?
  - o Provided training for over 22,000 trainees, benefitting 277 businesses.

#### **DACAG Member Discussion:**

- There's a strong prioritization across communities across the state for getting heavy duty truck charging deployed as quickly as possible, as well as advocacy that CARB adopt a strong zero emission truck rule. This means getting dollars spent as quickly as possible to get charging in the ground, and with a focus on public charging not just publicly-available fleet charging.
- In the future, we might want to pick a few issues and get more deeply engaged in the implementation, in addition to providing this higher level of feedback on the full plan overall.
- Excited for this historic investment in transportation with zero emissions.

- many stations are going into disadvantaged and low-income communities, to help us see where the actual physical infrastructure is being installed.
- Statewide or non-applicable funding share historically accounts for about 1/3 of funding todate, and is broken into two categories: older, legacy projects that are no longer funded (such as natural gas vehicle deployment incentives, where CEC might identify the dealership, but not specifically where the benefit accrues); and funding put into block grants that haven't gone to a specific project site yet, but will eventually. The statewide number will contract over time, and we'll be able to see where the benefit accrues based on charging station location.
- Enormous, well-organized program.
- Recommend that some program dollars are set aside for adaptive management on the hydrogen piece, with close analysis to ensure that it's green and not blue hydrogen, to ensure that carbon life cycle analysis is done appropriately. We need a green molecule for transportation. Be very careful and maintain a close look at it going forward.
- Recommend a programmatic analysis by economists so that hydrogen so that hydrogen application investment is optimized. It's exciting and new, so want to ensure we're monitoring things like affordability and ensuring it's the best use of the application.
- Regarding pollution reduction, beyond where chargers are located: not all trucks are registered
  in or originating from CA. If there's a project directly with a fleet, we may be able to collect
  data on vehicle miles traveled and emission reductions associated with in-state or out-of-state
  trucks. This isn't really possible where we're funding more publicly-oriented ZEV refueling
  infrastructure, as we don't know in-state/out-of-state registration based on fueling station data
  we collect.
- CARB oversees vehicle regulations and tracks in/out-of-state traffic and its registration data.
   They track the ZEV vehicle registration data on their ZEV dashboard for medium heavy duty vehicles which is updated on an annual basis and released for the first time this year.
- CA coordinates closely with Pacific Coast States through the Pacific Coast Collaborative just signed an agreement for the electrification of the interstate I-5 corridor. Hope that additional federal support will provide for more coordination.
- Funding is not available in this plan for small owner-operators to electrify their trucks; CEC investments tend to focus on infrastructure, with CARB having more funding and authority on vehicles side.
- Equitable At-Home Charging addresses renters and multifamily: this will be open to multifamily residents and single-family homes in priority communities. Multifamily charging for residents has been challenging and CEC is eager to have resources to do more there.
- Feedback is welcome from this group and other CBOs as the CEC begins rolling out funding concepts aligned with the final plan, including how much funding is being offered, priority scoring, eligibility considerations, geographic diversity, authenticity and impact of projects. Funding concept workshops are particularly valuable when CEC is building out solicitations and would love to receive advisement from folks who live/work in DACs to weigh in. This is particularly important since the language of equity has been coopted. The DACAG's ideas would be welcomed for how to engage directly with DACs CEC is working to be creative about customizing engagement and input, and has limits as a state agency. This group has a better sense of what works; CEC is receptive to ideas and willing to act on them.

- Would love to see the DACAG involved in elements of the solicitation and implementation process around things like priority points, perhaps similar to the role the DACAG is playing with SGIP.
- Had previously requested was to prohibit any non-zero-carbon projects. If we can't do that, would like to see priority points assigned.
- We need to be clear about who we want to benefit, who we're targeting and prioritizing, and
  what we mean by equity. We should identify priorities within each category of funding within
  this plan and get specific to ensure direct, meaningful benefit.
- We need to operationalize equity. This could look like creating a set of guiding principles, developed through a public participatory process.
- Consider both procedural equity (such as the processes for community engagement coming
  to the DACAG is great, but there are so many others to engage, and we need a plan for that
  and a way to build capacity for folks to engage) and distributional equity (for instance,
  identifying the investment gaps, or switching from a first-come/first-served basis to a needsbased approach.) Imperial Valley just received its first charging station that's a good
  example of listening to community-driven demand, looking at gaps and needs first, and
  pivoting investments to respond to those needs.
- We can develop more metrics to assess impact, which also requires more specific definitions.
- CEC will be developing an outreach and communications strategy that they'll be seeking input on as well. Seeing on the ground what communities are facing and being their with them is incredibly important.
- CEC is going through the process of defining "equity", including hearing from community and putting a draft for public comment forward.
- The DACAG has an Equity Framework, but it doesn't include a definition of equity, which could be valuable as a North Star. The DACAG should revisit this as a group.
- Specific programs, like the Clean Transportation Program, could have their own definition it's
  OK to create a definition that's more focused on the specific opportunity and what the
  contextual priority is.
- The DACAG may also want to provide more focused priorities and definitions of equity within our own stated Priority Areas.
- Collaboration is critical CEC with CARB, CPUC, CTC, CalSSTA. This could include bundling funds to make it easier to apply, providing more lead time to allow for meaningful engagement, more public engagement vs. more advisory groups.
- Consider bringing other agencies that CEC and CPUC work with to the DACAG to report. The
  DACAG can only advise the CEC and CPUC, but could be informed about what's happening
  across agencies. For example, for the GoBiz ZEV Market Development Strategy, all agencies
  came together to talk how they were <u>coordinating on ZEVs</u> in a process that was transparent
  to the public next step is to close the loop on where that landed. GoBiz will have a new staff
  member focused on equity who could be a guest at this meeting.
- Consider developing a list of targeted beneficiaries within the DACAG Equity Framework, and revise and refer back to it as necessary.
- Equity is essential, but can we challenge ourselves to work towards justice? How can we make justice our guiding star? Discuss this at the December meeting.
- Review of Written Comments

- Comments weren't able to be posted 10 days in advance of this meeting, but are allowable as they were made public in this meeting to members of the DACAG and the public at the same time and docketed.
- Updates to the comments document were made in real time.
  - Clarify on zero-emission; would like biofuels excluded or to include priority points at a minimum.
  - Add a separate point on green vs. blue hydrogen; remove specific references to "shipping" and "rural transit buses"
  - "Prioritize" vs. "support"
  - Should we be more specific around the definition of equity?
  - Some language is identical to a prior letter: add "we continue to remain concerned"
  - Prioritize investment where there are investment gaps. Increase capacity for smaller municipalities. Address accessibility for equity. Resource community groups to support capacity-building.
  - Make it clear that things like offroad equipment still need to be addressed.
  - Speak to importance of coordination.
  - Define benefits more clearly and effectively (and discuss benefits as part of our larger DACAG Framework conversation in December).
  - Refer to DACAG Equity Framework.
  - DACAG should engage the with Commission as part of the implementation process.
  - Include workforce development in the benefits/equity/framework conversation at the December DACAG meeting.
  - Add a point on workforce development that mentions job quality and access to jobs, not just training.
  - Address grammatical errors before submission.

#### **Public Comment**

- None
- Motion to approve Item 5, To approve the Comment Letter on behalf of the DACAG to be submitted to the Energy Commission Clean Transportation Docket and to be presented at the December business meeting.

Member who makes	Andres
motion	

Member to seconds motion to approve.

Member who Seconds	Adrian
--------------------	--------

Member Votes				
Member	Aye	Nay	Abstain	Not Present During Vote
Adrian	$\boxtimes$			
Andres	$\boxtimes$			
Fred				$\boxtimes$

Jana	$\boxtimes$		
Roger	$\boxtimes$		
Roman	$\boxtimes$		
Stephanie	$\boxtimes$		
Curtis	$\boxtimes$		
Elena	$\boxtimes$		
Julia	$\boxtimes$		

Motion	Passes	Doesn't Pass	If not unanimous, include vote count
ITEM 4	$\boxtimes$		1 not present

 Adrian will submit these comments and will join the CEC December Business meeting to present.

# ITEM 6: CEC STAFF WILL UPDATE THE DACAG AND SEEK VERBAL COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS ABOUT THE PROPOSED PLANS FOR THE SB 100 PROCEEDING, INCLUDING OUTREACH AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT.

Presentation Title: Update on the Proposed Plans for the SB 100 Proceeding – Alicia Notes:

- Full presentation is available <u>here</u>.
- Review 2021 Report Findings and Recs
  - Set 2045 goal to power all retail electricity sold in CA with renewable and zero-carbon resources
  - Update Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) to ensure that by 2030, at least 60 percent of CA electricity is renewable
  - o CEC, CPUC, CARB provide a joint agency report every 4 years
  - Key takeaways it's technically achievable, and have to sustain work at record-setting rates. Diversity in energy resources and tech lowers overall costs. Retaining some natural gas power capacity may minimize costs but can reduce need for that with storage and other tech. Recommend further analysis.
- Initial Timing and Roadmap for 2025 Report
  - o 2022: scoping roundtables kick off on Monday; holding 6
  - o Check in with DACAG at critical juncture points
  - Final modeling at start of 2024, then report-writing
  - Publish Jan 1, 2025
- Questions for Discussion on Report Approach
  - What are critical scoping questions and issues to inform policymaking and planning to reach goals?
  - o Process engagement practices for consideration?

#### Q&A

N/A

#### **Public Comment**

None

#### **DACAG Member Discussion:**

- Include DER in the scope.
- Consider non-energy benefits (NEBs) in the SB 100 report. Ideally, work would have been done prior to preliminary modeling. This is an outstanding request from a prior joint agency report, and the DER proceeding may have some applicable NEBs.
- DACAG would like to see scenarios before they go to modeling for an opportunity to provide input.
- CEC will be seeking outside help on quantifying NEBs and societal costs; there will be a technical support RFP to help define and set thresholds and integrate into modeling.
- Need some spatial granularity in the output of the modeling, and possibly in the input of the modeling. Could fold equity outcomes into the scenarios. Looking forward to discussing further.
- Goals of SB 100 are amazing, but also raise unintended consequences, particularly for DACs.
   Consider the impacts on cost of housing, jobs and job creation, transportation, etc. These are integrated issues.
- Energy efficiency and conservation are a powerful component of reducing grid stress, as the text flex alert a couple months ago demonstrated. Let's continue that focus in the overall rubric and modeling, but also around the messaging for SB 100 design and implementation.
- We know we must increase clean generation to increase fossil and emission generation sources. With that, a deep consideration of distribution and transmission grid upgrades necessary. To what extent would those upgrades solve reliability issues and increase affordability, clean generation adoption and acceleration? Just as we have bold goals for new clean generation, having some bold goals around transmission and distribution electrical grid upgrades every year would be great to see. Funding and other resources to develop more DERs and storage are coming, but their impact is dependent on what we can interconnect them with in terms of our grid.
- Be proactive about when a good time to present to the DACAG is and when our written comments would be most helpful.
- A meeting with the SB 100 SMEs, or the full DACAG, might be good ahead of the framework and scenario creation.
- Incorporate resilience into the modeling, scenarios, etc., so it's at the forefront. There will be a
  lot more extreme climate conditions how are we planning for that and how are we
  identifying our most vulnerable communities and prioritizing them in this process so that
  they're prepared for the transition and for unintended or undue burdens that might arise from
  this transition. Discuss this in early 2023.

# ITEM 7: DACAG TO CONSIDER ADOPTION OF WRITTEN COMMENTS PROPOSED BY SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS ON THE DACAG REGARDING THE MICROGRID INCENTIVE PROGRAM. [D.21-01-018]

Presentation Title: Written Comments on Microgrid Incentive Program

Notes:

## Q&A

N/A

#### **Public Comment**

N/A

#### **DACAG Member Discussion:**

- DACAG reviewed the draft Comment Letter at the September meeting.
- Point of order: can members vote on this item if they may be involved with MIP-specific projects in the future?
  - CEC legal counsel: it's appropriate to vote today, as this focuses on process, but can meet/consult as we move forward to assess any real or perceived conflicts of interest.
  - CPUC legal counsel: always good to be clear on which hat you're wearing here, approving the letter, you're acting as a member of the DACAG. If a member does eventually participate in the proceeding with their daytime hat, then different rules and triggers apply. It's fine to move forward with voting on this letter. Parties also received notice, so have had the opportunity to raise concerns.
- Motion to approve Item 7, To adopt the comments drafted by Roger regarding the Microgrid Incentive Program.

Member who makes	Elena
motion	

Member to seconds motion to approve.

Member who Seconds	Andres			

Member Votes				
Member	Aye	Nay	Abstain	Not Present During Vote
Adrian	$\boxtimes$			
Andres	$\boxtimes$			
Fred				
Jana	$\boxtimes$			
Roger	$\boxtimes$			
Roman	$\boxtimes$			
Stephanie	$\boxtimes$			
Curtis	$\boxtimes$			
Elena	$\boxtimes$			
Julia	$\boxtimes$			

Motion	Passes	Doesn't	If not unanimous, include vote
		Pass	count

ITEM 7	$\boxtimes$	ı		1 not	present
• Roger v ITEM 8: DAC SUBJECT MA AUGUST 25,	vill send to AG TO CO TTER EXP 2022 REQ ATION INC	staff/Phi NSIDER ERTS OI UEST TO CENTIV	l to distrib ADOPT N THE DA O EXPAN	oute. ION OF WR ACAG REGA ID THE ADV	ITTEN COMMENTS PROPOSED BY IRDING THE ENERGY COALITION'S ANCED REBATE PROGRAM FOR THE ENTIAL EQUITY BUDGET. [R.12- 11
Notes:					
Q&A • N/A					
Public Comme  N/A	nt				
<ul><li>Motion</li></ul>		Item 8,	To adopt	comments d	rs in real time. rafted by Roger on the request for resid
• Meml motio	er who m	akes	Ju	lia	
Meml	r to seconds per who Se		to appro	ve. Elena	
Member '					
Member		Aye	Nay	Abstain	Not Present During Vote
Adrian					
Andres		$\boxtimes$			
Fred					⊠ —
Jana					
Roger		$\boxtimes$			
Roman		$\boxtimes$			

Stephanie

Curtis

Elena

 $\boxtimes$ 

 $\boxtimes$ 

 $\boxtimes$ 

Julia	$\boxtimes$		

Motion	Passes	Doesn't Pass	If not unanimous, include vote count
ITEM 8	$\boxtimes$		1 not present

• Letter to be shared with staff for distribution.

## ITEM 9: DACAG MEMBERS PROVIDE UPDATES AND ANNOUNCEMENTS, AND MAY REPORT ON AND DISCUSS 2022 PRIORITY AREAS:

- TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION
- BUILDING DECARBONIZATION & ELECTRIFICATION
- WORKFORCE TRAINING & DEVELOPMENT
- RELIABILITY
- GAS TRANSITION
- DISTRIBUTED ENERGY RESOURCES
- ELECTRIC PROGRAM INVESTMENT CHARGE (EPIC) PROGRAM
- INTEGRATED ENERGY POLICY REPORT (IEPR)
- AFFORDABILITY
- COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

#### Q&A:

N/A

#### **Public Comment:**

NB

#### Priority Area Developments:

- Across several priority areas: the US Bureau of Ocean Energy Management just published a
  final sale notice for the first offshore wind energy auctions for CA, for Humboldt Bay and Moro
  Bay. Auction will start December 6. Offshore wind is here. In 2023, let's make sure we're
  discussing how community benefits are being thought through and worked on in these
  regions. Going to be a very big industry substantially important to climate goals and gas
  transition. CEC and CPUC have done an extraordinary job.
- Transportation Electrification: met with Commission on Clean Transportation Plan, similar to
  what we heard today. Regarding the early public comment from Sylvia Chi re: transparency
  around IIJA and IRA, it would be good to have a presentation on how our the CPUC and CEC
  agencies are using and implementing those dollars, especially if there will be opportunities for
  communities to apply for those funds how can we prepare them to do so. CEC has a
  presentation coming up on Monday: Special Business Meeting, fully virtual, and IIJA will be
  one of the topics.

• There is no longer an SB 100 priority area. It fits within Community Engagement, Reliability, others. Identified Elena as the main point of contact and will inform Alicia to contact Elena.

DACAG Member Priority Area Selections:

• Julia is joining the Workforce Training & Development Priority Area as a SME.

# ITEM 10: DACAG MEMBER(S) PROVIDE UPDATE REGARDING ENGAGEMENT, IF ANY, WITH THE LOW-INCOME OVERSIGHT BOARD (LIOB).

Member Update: Did reach out but haven't heard back from them yet. Keep this item here as a reminder to continue to reach out. Next outreach may wait till after December – early 2023.

### Q&A:

N/A

#### **Public Comment:**

N/A

## **DACAG Member Discussion:**

N/A

#### ITEM 11: CEC AND CPUC STAFF PROVIDE AGENCY UPDATES AND ANNOUNCEMENTS.

- CEC Updates
  - Currently in the drafting of the report phase of IEPR. Intend to include draft equity and EJ framework in there to get comments and guidance. Aiming to publish late November/early December.
  - Governor issued an Executive Order directing all state agencies to create action plans to embed equity, which are due at end of October. <a href="https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/09/9.13.22-EO-N-16-22-Equity.pdf?emrc=c11513">https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/09/9.13.22-EO-N-16-22-Equity.pdf?emrc=c11513</a>
  - Annual Clean Energy Hall of Fame Awards six individuals doing great local work contributing to clean energy future. <a href="https://www.energy.ca.gov/about/california-energy-commissions-clean-energy-hall-fame-awards">https://www.energy.ca.gov/about/california-energy-commissions-clean-energy-hall-fame-awards</a>
- CPUC Updates
  - Issued 2020 Annual Affordability Report: <a href="https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/-/media/cpuc-website/divisions/energy-division/documents/affordability-proceeding/2020/2020-annual-affordability-report.pdf">https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/-/media/cpuc-website/divisions/energy-division/documents/affordability-proceeding/2020/2020-annual-affordability-report.pdf</a>
  - Closing the circle with DACAG on feedback provided on the gas OIR.
  - Discuss in December how to close the feedback loop inform the DACAG on what impact/action came from our feedback. Consider embedding into Annual Report.

#### ITEM 12: GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

Public Comment

None

# ITEM 13: DACAG MEMBERS DETERMINE FUTURE MEETING FORMAT, DATES, LOCATIONS, AND TOPICS.

- The next meeting is scheduled for **November 18 at 1:00 p.m.** and will be VIRTUAL.
- December
  - o Admin matters and 2023 planning
  - Scheduled for Friday, 12/2; Jana may not be available; can coordinate prior to get her feedback in advance. She'll try to join if she can.
  - Objections
    - None
  - o Possible Agenda Items
    - See previous lists

#### **ITEM 14: ADJOURN**

Time Adjourned: 4:13pm