

DOCKETED	
Docket Number:	22-IEPR-04
Project Title:	Equity
TN #:	246201
Document Title:	Transcript - 06292022 IEPR COMMISSIONER WORKSHOP ON CENTERING EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE THROUGHOUT CEC EFFORTS
Description:	IEPR COMMISSIONER WORKSHOP ON CENTERING EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE THROUGHOUT CEC EFFORTS
Filer:	Raquel Kravitz
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	9/23/2022 5:44:50 PM
Docketed Date:	9/26/2022

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

In the matter of,) Docket No. 22-IEPR-04
)
 2022 Integrated Energy Policy)
 Report Update (2022 IEPR Update))
)
) RE: Centering Equity
) and Environmental
) Justice Throughout CEC
) Efforts

IEPR COMMISSIONER WORKSHOP ON
 CENTERING EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
 THROUGHOUT CEC EFFORTS

Primary Physical Location
 Imperial Valley College
 Building 2700, Floor 1, Room 2734
 380 E. Aten Road,
 Imperial, California 92251

Additional Publicly Accessible Location
 Warren-Alquist State Energy Building
 Rosenfeld Hearing Room, First Floor
 1516 Ninth Street
 Sacramento, California 95814

Remote Option Via Zoom

Wednesday, June 29, 2022

10:30 A.M.

Reported By:
Martha Nelson

APPEARANCES

Commissioners

Siva Gunda, Vice Chair

Andrew McAllister, Commissioner (at Warren-Alquist State Energy Building)

CEC Staff

Heather Raitt, Director of the IEPR

Katrina Leni-Konig, Energy Research and Development Division

Dorothy Murimi, Public Advisor's Office

Presenters

Dave Drury, Imperial College Representative

Moisés Moreno-Rivera, Assistant Secretary for Equity and Environmental Justice, California Natural Resources Agency

Dr. Manuel Pastor

Noemí Gallardo, Chair's Chief of Staff, Acting Public Advisor

Silvia Paz, Alianza Coachella Valley

Hilary Poore, Data Science Technical Research Project Lead, Energy Assessments Division, CEC

Dr. Chris Benner, Everett Program

Maria Lemus, Vision y Compromiso

Marisela Blancas, Vision y Compromiso

Patricia Cruz, Vision y Compromiso

Izel Landeros

Kaelynn Huelves

APPEARANCES (CONT.)

Spanish Translator

Jazmine Prezeau

Public Comment

Janira Figueroa, Comite Civico Del Valle

Adrianna Ivory, Center for Biological Diversity

Ryan Pickering, Self

Mariela Loera, Leadership Counsel for Justice and
Accountability

Ramon Elias

Roger Lin, Center for Biological Diversity

Fabi Lao, Center for Sustainable Energy

Diego Hernandez

INDEX

	Page
Introduction	
Heather Raitt, CEC, Director of the IEPR	7
Morning Session Opening Remarks	
Dave Drury, Imperial College Representative	9
Siva Gunda, CEC Vice Chair & Lead Commissioner for 2022 IEPR Update	10
J. Andrew McAllister, CEC Commissioner	13
Moisés Moreno-Rivera, Assistant Secretary for Equity And Environmental Justice, California Natural Resources Agency	14
1. Keynote Speaker	18
Dr. Manuel Pastor, Distinguished Professor of Sociology and American Studies & Ethnicity at the University of Southern California	
Discussion between Commissioners and Dr. Pastor Questions from attendees, Dorothy Murimi, CEC, to moderate online Attendees, Katrina Leni-Konig, CEC, to moderate in person attendees	
2. Introduction to the IEPR and CEC's focus on energy equity and environmental justice	31
Noemí Gallardo, CEC	
Questions from attendees to panelists, Dorothy Murimi to moderate online attendees	
3. Equity Indicators	45
Hilary Poore, CEC	

INDEX (CONT.)

	Page
4. Localized Indicators	51
A. Silvia Paz, Executive Director, Alianza Coachella Valley	
B. Dr. Chris Benner, Professor, Chair and Director of the Everett Program, and Institute for Social Discussion between Commissioners and speakers Questions from attendees to speakers, Dorothy Murimi, CEC, to moderate online attendees, Katrina Leni-Konig, CEC, to moderate in person attendees	
Public Comments	103
Closing Remarks	119
Break	120
Welcome Back Heather Raitt, CEC	120
Afternoon Session Opening Remarks Siva Gunda, Vice Chair and Lead Commissioner for 2022 IEPR Update	121
5. Regional Engagement Model	123
A. Maria Lemus, Executive Director, Vision y Compromiso	
B. Promotoras Comunitarias Discussion between Commissioners and speakers Questions from attendees to speakers, Dorothy Murimi to moderate online attendees, Katrina Leni-Konig to moderate in person attendees	
6. Building Community Connections	154
Attendees are encouraged to participate in facilitated small group discussions All attendees will reconvene in Room 2734 for small group representatives to share key takeaways of small group discussions	

INDEX (CONT.)

	Page
Public Comments	159
Closing Remarks and Adjourn	163
Adjournment	166
Reporter's Certificate	167
Transcriber's Certificate	168

1

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2 JUNE 29, 2022 10:30 A.M.

3 MS. RAITT: The schedule and presentations have
4 been docketed and posted on the CEC's IEPR page. And
5 for those of you who don't know where to find it, there
6 are signs around with QR codes that you can scan with
7 your phone to access those presentations.

8 Hardcopies of the meeting schedule are available
9 at the entrance. And for review, we have binders of all
10 materials available, if you would like to take a look at
11 those.

12 Please note that this workshop, like all IEPR
13 workshops, is being recorded and the recording will be
14 linked to the Energy Commission's webpage shortly after
15 the workshop, and a written transcript will be available
16 in about a month.

17 We invite for attendees wishing to participate
18 in the discussion today, there are a few ways to do so.
19 We have reserved a few minutes this morning to take
20 questions from attendees. I think we'll just do that
21 once this morning as we are shorter on time.

22 If you are in the room and you have questions,
23 please go ahead and write down your questions on a index
24 card, in the back or we can get that for you. You can
25 write down the question and you can give it to me or

1 Denise.

2 And for those on Zoom, you can use the Q&A
3 feature to ask your questions and we'll have a moderator
4 read out your questions at the appropriate time.

5 Another way to participate in the discussion is
6 during the public comment period at the end of the
7 morning. We'll also have another public comment period
8 at the end of the afternoon. The comments will be
9 limited to three minutes per person, and per one person
10 per organization.

11 If you'd like to make public comments please go
12 ahead and fill out a blue card and give it to me or
13 Denise, or another team member, and it will let us know
14 that you'd like to make a comment.

15 And if you're on Zoom, you can use the raised
16 hand function and that will let us know. And if you're
17 on the phone, press *9 to let us know you'd like to
18 comment.

19 And then, in the afternoon we'll have a break
20 out into facilitated small group discussions. We will
21 talk about that more in the afternoon. discussions, and
22 we'll go over that at that time.

23 And then, finally, we'll have written comments
24 and those are due July 20th. And the notice provides
25 instructions on how to turn in the comments.

1 And so, that was my logistical information. And
2 so, now, I'd like to turn to the Vice President of
3 Academic Services Dave Drury to make a few remarks.
4 Thank you.

5 MR. DRURY: Thank you. Good morning to
6 everybody. I am the Vice President, the Interim Vice
7 President of Academic Services here at Imperial Valley
8 College. Dr. Laura Johnson, our superintendent and
9 president could not make the meeting today, so she sent
10 me today to welcome all of you to our beautiful campus
11 in the lovely Imperial Valley. We're honored to have
12 you here.

13 There's a saying that we have here, you've
14 probably heard it before, it's "mi casa es su casa"
15 (phonetic), our home is your home and you are always
16 welcome.

17 Two of your principles that you're going to be
18 talking about today, the equity and justice, are
19 principles that we firmly believe in and we support here
20 on campus, so it's a natural thing.

21 And I noticed a lot of you are putting sweaters
22 back on because you're cold, which means our AC's
23 working really well. Don't worry about the energy
24 consumption, this is an energy award building. It's
25 very efficient. So, we're excited to have you, we're

1 grateful that you're here. And again, if there's
2 anything you need, please let us know.

3 I wanted to maybe mention here real quickly that
4 also one of our board trustees is here, Trustee Solis
5 from our northern area. So, she's here and joining us,
6 as well.

7 I won't take any more time because I know you've
8 quite a full agenda today. But thank you for being
9 here. Hopefully, you're enjoying our lovely weather at
10 our lovely facility. And we're so happy to see you and
11 have you. Thank you.

12 MS. RAITT: Thank you so much. And now, we'll
13 turn it over to Vice Chair Gunda, from the Energy
14 Commission.

15 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Thank you, Heather. And
16 thank you everybody for being here.

17 So, it's an absolute measure as part of the
18 state, and each of all of you to keep this workshop on
19 the equity, and collegial, and the community engagement,
20 too.

21 So, I'm Siva Gunda, the Vice Chair for
22 California Energy Commission. I grew up in India. I
23 moved to California about ten years ago and I'm so, so
24 grateful to call California my home and be a part of
25 this diverse and vibrant family.

1 And so, I'm also grateful to have the position
2 to serve on the Commission at this time where we're
3 going through an incredible transition in the energy,
4 but also in recognition, widely held, we have to undue
5 so many injustices, you know, over the last century.
6 So, we have a unique opportunity to kinda see clearly,
7 I'm grateful to be here.

8 And I have to turn on the video device. Thank
9 you. You can stop me once in while without me going.
10 It's just an incredible thing to be part of this
11 session. I'm proud of our team for, you know, trying to
12 make this workshop happen here.

13 As you've all seen over the last, you know, it
14 has been difficult to get everything lined up and more
15 official that we go on to. But this is the reason why
16 we go to each community and engage them because it's
17 sometimes hard for our team who want to engage and do
18 everything that they can to be here and truly serve the
19 State of California.

20 I want to thank Dave Drury for your opening
21 comments. Thank you for the "mi casa es su casa".
22 Thank you for that and for having this workshop here in
23 this beautiful space.

24 I also want to thank the IP students for giving
25 support to have this happen here. If you want to raise

1 your hands. Thank you. Thank you so much for having
2 us. To help us move forward together.

3 I also want to acknowledge everybody in the
4 audience here, both here as well as on Zoom. Thank you
5 for being here and helping us have this conversation.

6 The Chair of the Energy Commission, David
7 Hochschild, was not able to join today because of COVID.
8 He sends his warmest regards. And he really wanted to
9 be here to kick this up.

10 The team and staff, as I mentioned, the IEPR
11 team, so many team are not here and all the CEC staff,
12 and the IT staff, but also our interns who are here
13 today, who really believe in making justice happen,
14 achieving equity and justice. So, thank you to the
15 generation that's taking this on.

16 I'm also grateful for the region as a whole.
17 For instance, for all of you, we had a wonderful day
18 yesterday visiting the president, the community, and we
19 had a unique opportunity to look at the beauty of this
20 landscape. You know, so it was just a beautiful
21 opportunity for us being here. So, we're incredibly
22 happy to be here and thank you to all the residents of
23 the Coachella Valley, and Coachella here as a whole.

24 So, with that I want to move on, again. So, you
25 want to just open it up to the dais.

1 MS. RAITT: Commissioner McAllister, did you
2 want to make a comment?

3 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Hey everyone, we're
4 hear on this end here, everyone here in Sacramento, at
5 the Energy Commission's Hearing Room A, and this is
6 Commissioner McAllister, the audio on Zoom is very
7 difficult to make out. But I got the gist of what both
8 Heather and Vice Chair Gunda said.

9 But is there a moment for very brief opening
10 comments?

11 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Commissioner, are you making
12 a comment?

13 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Yeah, I'd like to.
14 It's hard to kind of gauge. So, if this is the moment,
15 let me know.

16 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yes, it is.

17 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Yeah, so I just want
18 to say thank you. And very briefly, and I'm going to
19 make my comments in Spanish, just acknowledging the
20 dual, the multiple languages that we have, you know,
21 across the state. So, very multiple. And also, just
22 the location, and the topic, and the fact that we have
23 interpretation.

24 (Comments in Spanish)

25 THE INTERPRETER: I'm going to give just a brief

1 resume of what the Commissioner so beautifully said.

2 I'd like to say thanks to everyone that's
3 working on this effort. This conversation about
4 environmentalism and around inclusion in the environment
5 is such a necessary one. Inclusion is a necessary
6 conversation if we're going to be successful.

7 We can't succeed as a state without including
8 all of the marginalized communities. We are the most
9 diverse state in this country and we can shift the
10 conversation. And what we do as Californians matters.
11 Everyone is watching. It is our responsibility to shift
12 the conversation to include marginalized communities in
13 this whole environmental conversation.

14 So, I'd like to say thank you to everyone that's
15 working on this initiative and to say that this is a
16 very important time.

17 THE INTERPRETER: And by the way, that was not
18 word for word, but it captures the essence.

19 MS. RAITT: Great, thanks. I'm hoping that you
20 can hear me better now. So, I have moved.

21 Next, we have Moisés Moreno-Rivera, the
22 Assistant Secretary for Equity and Environmental Justice
23 from the California Natural Resources Agency, if you'd
24 like to say a few words.

25 ASSISTANT SECRETARY MORENO-RIVERA: Gracias.

1

2 (Speaking Spanish)

3 ASSISTANT SECRETARY MORENO-RIVERA: Good morning
4 everyone. My name is Moisés Moreno-Rivera and I'm very
5 humbled to be serving the State of California as
6 Assistant Secretary for Equity and Environmental Justice
7 at the Natural Resources Agency.

8 I'm just very excited for this conversation.
9 I'm excited at the level of leadership from the Energy
10 Commission that's there with you and virtually.

11 I try not to miss any opportunity to visit the
12 Salton Sea Region, as that his home to me. I grew up in
13 Mecca, and I grew up in the northern part of the Sea.
14 So, I'm missing out on seeing my parents. But I'm
15 delighted that you are all there and that you are having
16 this conversation.

17 You know, Commissioner McAllister, I had all
18 these great talking points how we're going to hit the
19 mark on all the things that you brought up. So, instead
20 of repeating, I just want to reaffirm that the comments
21 shared by the Commissioner are very much in line with
22 the goals and objectives of our agency as a whole.

23 And in the past months we have actually been
24 seeking alignment on efforts surrounding equity and
25 environmental justice. And the Energy Commission staff

1 have been really instrumental in providing guidance, and
2 providing support and how we envision this both in our
3 internal capacity and external capacity.

4 So, with that I just want to say thank you for
5 leading these workshops. Thank you for being
6 intentional and providing the hybrid space, providing
7 the opportunity for advancing language access, and
8 making your meetings that much more accessible to the
9 communities in the Salton Sea Region.

10 You know, the last thing I will say is when
11 we're looking at our data and web-based tools, when
12 we're looking at this information it is best -- it
13 serves the public best -- when it's informed by the
14 communities that it's impacted.

15 So, I am looking forward to the constructive
16 conversations we're going to hear today. And I thank
17 the academics that have been working with communities
18 that are here and to expand all of these collective
19 efforts.

20 So, again, muchas gracias (speaking Spanish).
21 Thank you so much and thanks for this opportunity to
22 engage with you.

23 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Thank you, Commissioner
24 McAllister and Assistant Secretary. I just wanted to --
25 you know, before I pass it on to Heather here, who will

1 be our MC for most of the day, I just want to thank
2 Noemí Gallardo, our Public Advisor, who has brought in
3 this new spirit of engaging with the communities and how
4 to do this. You know, not just advancing equity, but
5 really achieving it. So, thank you, Noemí for your
6 leadership at the Energy Commission.

7 I'm also incredibly grateful that I had this
8 opportunity to see an old mentor and colleague on the
9 dais here, Dr. Benner, who I have known through UC Davis
10 for a very long time. Thank you.

11 And Silvia, it's just an amazing opportunity to
12 be here.

13 As both the Secretary and Commissioner
14 McAllister said, this is -- this is something we're all
15 doing together. And, you know, for us to feel that we
16 are a part of this and we need to do this together is
17 the most important thing we want to walk away from.

18 I know being in Sacramento, it's very easy to be
19 disconnected. We have a very large state. It's easy to
20 be disconnected because of lack of technology access.
21 And this is our best try to begin the conversation of
22 better engagement.

23 So, I welcome your thoughts, ideas on how to
24 make this process better, but also really looking
25 forward to learning from you today.

1 So, with that I'm going to hand it to Heather to
2 keep us on track and catch up on time again.

3 MS. RAITT: Thank you. (Inaudible) --
4 environmental and social conditions facing low income in
5 urban communities. And he's a prolific author. And
6 we're very grateful for him being here today. So, go
7 ahead Dr. Pastor.

8 DR. PASTOR: Okay, well I'm glad to be with you
9 today. So, I was asked to give a keynote speech, but
10 given the amount of time we now have left, I will
11 officially call it a keynotito (phonetic), a short
12 keynote.

13 (Laughter)

14 DR. PASTOR: And like any, I'm actually really
15 glad I decided not to have a PowerPoint because now I
16 can just pretty much freewheel it here with the time
17 we've got, because I'm going to try to get us back on
18 time.

19 I have a hard stop it seems at 11:00, could
20 maybe go a little bit longer. So, what I want to do is
21 just talk about three crises that are affecting us at
22 the same time. Three messages from a new book that I
23 just did with Chris Benner, who's on your panel. And
24 maybe three lessons for the work ahead.

25 Why three threes? I guess it's because I'm a

1 lapsed Catholic, I believe everything comes in a
2 trinity. So, thank you, Jesus.

3 So, let me start with the three crises. We
4 actually have, of course, faced the overarching crisis
5 of the last couple of years of COVID. In a way, it was
6 the disease that revealed our illnesses as a society.
7 The racial wealth cap, the digital divide, the lack of
8 access to healthcare, the lack of status for some
9 people.

10 But really, beneath that crisis were three
11 longer-term crises that have been simmering. One is the
12 climate crisis. It is the existential threat that we
13 face and it's certainly the work of the California
14 Energy Commission, and of CalEPA, and so many others to
15 try to address something that really threatens our
16 existence as a species and as a people.

17 So, it is a crisis that is there and we need to
18 address it. And it actually showed up in COVID because
19 we realized that where people faced more difficult
20 environmental conditions in terms of their quality, they
21 often also faced more susceptibility to the illness that
22 was COVID.

23 The second crisis we face in our society is the
24 crisis of inequality. We, in the United States, have
25 seen inequality sharply increase over the last 40 years.

1 And that increase has been on steroids in California.
2 And it's an inequality that has to do with the one
3 percent running away from the rest of us, the super
4 wealthy getting super wealthy. And, of course, that's
5 been super extreme here in California.

6 But it's also been a crisis of simply a wage
7 inequality that is below the one percent. There's been
8 sharply different returns for those with more education
9 and those with less education. That's been sharp in the
10 United States. It's been exacerbated here in the State
11 of California.

12 And it's also an income inequality crisis having
13 to do with persistent racial inequalities. And these
14 persistent racial inequalities are not only things that
15 have to do with differing education levels amongst
16 different racial and ethnic groups. Even when you
17 control for education there's been very different
18 returns for black Californians than white Californians,
19 Latino Californians, Asian Californians, et cetera. So,
20 it's a question of racial inequality as well.

21 So, climate crisis, inequality crisis, and then
22 what we've been seeing even this week, the crisis of
23 multiracial democracy. That is, as the country has
24 gotten more and more diverse, there is an older America
25 afraid that it's America's disappearing on them, trying

1 to cling on to power in any way possible.

2 And, of course, we saw that first in California
3 because the demographic change in California between
4 1980 and 2000 is the demographic change the United
5 States is going through between 2000 and 2050.
6 California was America fast forward. And our period of
7 demographic change was marked by the Proposition 187,
8 the attacks on affirmative action, bilingual education,
9 et cetera. So, this third crisis of multiracial
10 democracy is a crisis that we also need to address.

11 And the interesting theme beneath all of those
12 crises is a failure to recognize the commons. That is
13 to recognize the common threat of the climate because
14 it's so unequally distributed in terms of its impact.
15 The threat that inequality poses to our ability to
16 prosper because, as I'll mention in a minute, inequality
17 actually threatens our ability to prosper. But it's not
18 seen because with the social distance that comes from
19 the relatively well off, living in very different
20 circumstances than low income folks, they don't see
21 their interest in this.

22 And then, of course, the crisis of multiracial
23 democracy is the failure to recognize the commons that
24 democracy brings and that our new commons is
25 multiracial.

1 So, how do we address these crises? Well,
2 fortunately for you, Chris Benner and I have finished a
3 new book, *Solidarity Economics*, which provides the
4 recipe for what we need.

5 Now, for any of you who have written a book, the
6 thrilling thing about the book being finished and it
7 arriving at your household, and you being able to pick
8 it up and look at it, and say gosh, that's a pretty
9 cover, that's the great thing.

10 The frustrating thing is realizing that you
11 could have done the whole book with just three
12 sentences. So, let me save all of you a little bit of
13 time. Here are the three sentences of the book.

14 The three sentences of the book, and they apply
15 to your work, is that we need to stop talking about the
16 economy and start talking about our economy. When you
17 talk about the economy, it sounds like a set of rules
18 out there made by God or nature, made by the market,
19 that we have no control over.

20 But when you talk about our economy, you
21 recognize that it's something that affects all of us.
22 You recognize that it's a set of rules that we make
23 together, that are constituted as constellations of
24 power and property, when it could be constituted as
25 constellations of mutuality. That it's our economy.

1 And when you think about the rhetorical nature
2 of this, you've heard often people say, by the way
3 without evidence, because we know now, after 25 years of
4 research, for which David Card just got a Nobel prize,
5 that when you raise the minimum wage it actually doesn't
6 cost jobs.

7 But you hear the rhetoric that raising the
8 minimum wage is bad for the economy. But it's really
9 hard to argue that it's bad for our economy, because our
10 economy includes people in it who make the minimum wage.
11 And when that goes up they benefit, their families
12 benefit, their communities benefit. So, we need to be
13 talking about our economy and not the economy.

14 And we need to be talking about our environment,
15 and not just the environment. Because when we say our
16 environment, we recognize all the environmental issues
17 that were raised by Moisés Moreno-Rivera and
18 Commissioner McAllister.

19 The second big message from the book is that we
20 need to recognize that mutuality actually is key to
21 prosperity. It is very easy for people to suggest that
22 the issues of equity or inclusion are things that are
23 counter-posed to growing our economy.

24 But in research that Chris and I have done,
25 looking at every metropolitan, major metropolitan region

1 in the United States, what we have found is that those
2 regions that are more equal, less residentially
3 segregated, and less politically fragmented can actually
4 sustain job growth better over time.

5 And if you are looking at me and Chris and
6 thinking I'm not sure I trust those lefty professors,
7 these are studies that our study, for example, has
8 mimicked, copied after one done by the International
9 Monetary Fund, and it echoed the results of a study done
10 by the Cleveland Federal Reserve. Neither of which are
11 entities that are well-associated with the words equity.

12 And by the way, this plays for the issue of the
13 environment as well. One of the things that some of our
14 colleagues at UMass Amherst did was produced a study,
15 which is a really good study, but it's actually got the
16 single best title of any study I've ever seen. And the
17 title of the study was *Is Environmental Justice Good for*
18 *White Folks?*

19 And what they found out that in places where
20 there are more environmental disparities, there was just
21 more of a higher environmental load and it wound up
22 affecting white people even more. That is, when you
23 think that the environmental problems are going to be
24 situated in someone else's community, you just get more
25 environmental problems.

1 There's some game theory stuff that shows this
2 as well around climate change. But when you think about
3 it, even with one really clear climate disaster,
4 Hurricane Katrina, you know, part of the reason why the
5 entire City of New Orleans was wiped out was because the
6 lower 9th Ward, a low-income, largely black area was
7 left unprotected. If they had been protected with
8 sufficient levees, it would have protected the entire
9 City of New Orleans.

10 So, our message here, and I think this is really
11 what the Commissioner was saying, is not to think about
12 equity and inclusion as just questions of fairness or
13 being nice, they are really key to achieving our
14 economic objectives and achieving our environmental
15 objections.

16 Third big lesson from the book is that because
17 the message from the book is that even though we know
18 that it's our economy and interjecting equity would
19 bring overall prosperity, and be better for most of us,
20 it doesn't happen because some people benefit from the
21 current state of affairs.

22 And because that is true, we need movements that
23 can actually challenge the current constellation of
24 power and help to build the habits through organizing of
25 mutuality and solidarity that are key.

1 And that is why the book is called *Solidarity*
2 *Economics*, why mutuality and movements matter.

3 By the way, there's a website for the book
4 called Solidarity Economics. If you go to it, you can
5 get instructions on how to buy the book. But even
6 better, out of solidarity with our readers, you can get
7 instructions about how to download a free e-version for
8 your reading. And you can actually also download a
9 comic book version of the book that you can use for
10 popular education with, for example, the promatora model
11 that I know that you'll be hearing a little bit more
12 about going forward.

13 So, what are the three takeaways from what I
14 presented so far, that I would hope that the California
15 Energy Commission and, really, all of our environmental
16 agencies pay attention to?

17 Three quick takeaways. The first is that for
18 all the reasons I've mentioned, the interlocking crises,
19 the central messages of the book, we need to ensure that
20 equity is baked in, not sprinkled on.

21 We need to make sure that equity is a guiding
22 principle right from the beginning and not an
23 afterthought, afterwards.

24 And that means that you need to think about it
25 when you've got a policy like Cap and Trade, which

1 creates geographic inequalities. You know you need to
2 deal with that. That when ARB is talking about carbon
3 capture, something that won't get rid of the localized
4 pollution that affects communities of color, et cetera,
5 we need to make sure that equity's baked in, not
6 sprinkled on, not cleaned up later.

7 The second is that you should expect conflict.
8 Equity does not arrive at the table neatly packaged and
9 always being polite. Often, the ways that issues of
10 environmental justice get to the decision-making tables
11 is through protest, is through organizing, is through
12 communities ensuring that their voices are heard, when
13 they haven't been invited in early on.

14 And then, the third big takeaway, and I know
15 this is something that Dr. Benner will talk about, is
16 that we need to measure what matters. If we think that
17 equity is important and community participation are
18 important, then we need to come up with this aggregated
19 measures that hold us accountable to whether or not
20 we're moving the needle on equity, environmental equity,
21 racial equity, economic equity.

22 We also need to create interim measures that
23 deal with community participation and ask the question
24 who is participating, how are they participating, what
25 is the quality of participation?

1 So, bake equity in, expect that there will be
2 conflict along the way. You know that you're doing your
3 work if you're made to feel uncomfortable. And then,
4 keep work on designing the equity metrics that are going
5 to hold agencies accountable to the goals that you're
6 all talking about.

7 And I really do need to jump, but I can stick
8 around for maybe one question from the Commission
9 members.

10 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Thank you, Dr. Pastor, really
11 excellent, excellent comments. Thank you for
12 summarizing that. And I really appreciated you just
13 saying that we should expect conflict given, you know,
14 how long we have not had voices at the table.

15 You specifically mentioned the quality of
16 participation in your comments. I would love to hear
17 from you, as we continue to embark on thinking through
18 how to improve equity in our work, any highlights on how
19 do you think we should improve the quality of
20 participation?

21 DR. PASTOR: So, I'm sure you're going to hear
22 lots about this today. I think from my perspective,
23 it's about making sure that community-based
24 organizations are resourced to be able to participate.
25 I think it's about making sure that you go to the ground

1 as much as possible.

2 I'm so delighted that you're hosting this
3 meeting. Sorry I couldn't be with you today. I'm
4 flying internationally tomorrow and I was worried that
5 getting back from the beautiful Salton Sea might create
6 problems with catching a flight.

7 But to hold these meetings, I know that you're
8 doing, I think another one in the Central Valley as
9 well, maybe Imperial, in what's the so-called Inland --
10 Empire Inland, California, as well, and the valley as
11 well. And I think that those kind of going to places
12 that don't always get their voices heard.

13 Also, making sure that you're reaching out to
14 communities in very different ways. I'll just do one
15 anecdote. I once helped the City of Faustina (phonetic)
16 redo its general plan. And when they asked for
17 community participation, one of the things that we did
18 was to create what we called planning in a box, little
19 kits that community-based organizations could take with
20 them to work in communities independently, and then
21 report back to the city.

22 And then for outreach, one of the things that we
23 reached out to initially was to ESL classes to collect
24 their visions of what the city should look like. People
25 said, why go to ESL classes? And I said, well, number

1 one it's a very effective way to reach immigrants who
2 are trying to learn English and participate civically,
3 et cetera. Plus, planning is a second language, anyway,
4 nobody understands that either. So, why don't we go
5 ahead and bring it to the people.

6 So, I think thinking through what might be
7 unexpected vehicles. What are going to childcare
8 facilities, you'll get a lot of parents with kids. What
9 about creating programs, and I'm sure that you have some
10 of these, to create awarenesses, awareness in elementary
11 schools and high schools, and create programs for young
12 people to be involved. That will bring their parents in
13 as well, and you'll reach into communities that haven't
14 been affected.

15 But I know that you're in the Imperial Valley.
16 My good colleague, Silvia Paz, has all sorts of great
17 ideas. Comite Civico has done fantastic work over the
18 years of reaching into communities and raising difficult
19 issues. I just think you've got a wealth of resources.
20 And it's up to us to provide the resources to those
21 groups to further develop their muscles.

22 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Okay, thank you, Dr. Pastor.

23 Heather, are we -- do you want to --

24 MS. RAITT: Dr. Pastor, thank you.

25 DR. PASTOR: Heather, you dropped off, but I

1 think you're giving me a pass to get to my other
2 meeting.

3 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yes, and that's what she was
4 doing also. And we understand you not being able to
5 travel here. Good luck on your --

6 DR. PASTOR: (Speaking Spanish)

7 MS. RAITT: Thank you. This is Heather Raitt.
8 I'm hoping you can hear me on Zoom. If someone can give
9 me an indication if you can hear me or not? Dorothy,
10 perhaps, or someone can type in the Q&A if you can.

11 MS. MURIMI: So, we can hear, but hard to
12 understand.

13 MS. RAITT: All right. Well, thank you for your
14 patience, everybody, as we work out the bugs here.

15 So, we will move on to Noemí Gallardo, who is
16 the Chief of Staff for our Chair at the Energy
17 Commission, and she's Acting Public Advisor. So, thank
18 you, Noemí, go ahead.

19 MS. GALLARDO: All right, thank you, Heather.

20 (Audio Loss)

21 MS. GALLARDO: I'm not heard? Alright, so, again,
22 I'm Noemí Gallardo. I'm going to try to look up and
23 look down since we have two different audiences.

24 I'm honored to be here. One of our goals for
25 the IEPR this year was to make the process more

1 accessible because this report affects all California,
2 yet most people don't know what it is. Right. I didn't
3 before coming to the Energy Commission, so put that out
4 there.

5 And so, we thought one of the best ways to make
6 the report more accessible was to bring the IEPR to the
7 people, kind of like what Dr. Pastor was just telling
8 us, right. And so, here we are in Imperial, right,
9 making it happen and on zoom, of course.

10 I also wanted to apply Dr. Pastor's lesson about
11 calling it our report, right, because it really is that.
12 So, I'll try to do -- I'm going to try to put that into
13 practice.

14 Also in the spirit of making the IEPR more
15 accessible -- oops. Thank you. Sorry, something's
16 going on here.

17 All right. So, also in the spirit of making
18 IEPR -- okay, hold on a second, sorry.

19 MS. RAITT: You're okay. Just try to not touch
20 anything.

21 MS. GALLARDO: Okay, got it. All right.

22 Okay, so just talking about accessibility and
23 making the IEPR more accessible, I wanted to provide
24 some basics about the IEPR process before we, you know,
25 dive into additional content. So, I hope you find this

1 helpful.

2 On this first slide, well, we'll talk through
3 some basics. So, we call it the IEPR for short, but it
4 stands for Integrated Energy Policy Report, so I-E-P-R
5 is the acronym. And it is a report mandated by
6 legislation, so it's a legal obligation. Luckily, we do
7 have fun in the process. And as you've seen today, it
8 gets exciting sometimes with some technical issues.

9 But through the IEPR, the Energy Commission is
10 required to conduct assessments and forecasts of all
11 aspects of energy, which are then meant to be used to
12 develop energy policy that conserve resources, protect
13 the environment, ensure energy reliability, enhance the
14 state's economy, and protect public health and safety.

15 The report is biannual, which means we produce a
16 report every other year. And the years in between we
17 produce an update, rather than a full report. So, the
18 updates happen on even years, like 2022. So, this
19 year's is an update, so it's the 2022 IEPR update.

20 A key thing to know is that the report is taken
21 very seriously, whether it's the full reports or an
22 update. It is an extremely important report for two key
23 reasons, from my perspective.

24 First, the report is provided to the Governor
25 and Legislature. They review the report so they can

1 figure out, you know, what from our recommendations they
2 can take to modify policy, put new policy forward, and
3 whatnot. So, it's a way for them to get ideas. And
4 it's a way for us, if we want changes to be made to put
5 it in the IEPR, so that they can see that.

6 The second reason why I think the report is
7 important is because -- or our report, excuse me, is
8 because it is done through a public process, as you are
9 experiencing here. It lasts almost the entire year.
10 And the Commission gathers information from an array of
11 people and in an array of ways.

12 The report provides the Governor and the
13 Legislature information about what the Commission
14 learns. During the process we provide recommendations,
15 informed by you, and just by being here, really in our
16 workshops, is a great way to start influencing that
17 report.

18 So, go to the next slide, please. There are
19 three key phases to the report. The first is to develop
20 the scope. There are infinite topics to choose from, so
21 I want to pause here to share my gratitude for Vice
22 Chair Gunda selecting equity and environmental justice
23 to be included, and for championing our effort. So,
24 it's a team effort, it's not just me, but I am a loud
25 voice on this. So, thank you, Vice Chair.

1 The second phase is to collect information. So,
2 that's the phase we're in now. We collect information
3 through workshops. This is like our main way to get the
4 information. And I want you to also consider joining us
5 for the next two workshops that we're going to have for
6 equity and environmental justice. On July 20th we'll be
7 in Kern County. August 31st, we're going to be in
8 Oxnard, on the Central Coast. I know Dr. Pastor said
9 the Inland Empire, but it's actually the Central Coast.

10 And the final phase is to develop the report.
11 So, we'll share a draft for comment in October. The
12 final report is shared early next year in January. And
13 then, the Commission considers adopting it in February.
14 We hope you can take time to provide comments to us here
15 at the workshop, and then also through our other means
16 which I'll talk about.

17 Next slide.

18 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Just as a part of the
19 conversation, could you just expand on the commenting?
20 I think we have a lot of students. You know, we want to
21 hear your voice in the policy development, so if you
22 could just kind of talk about how easy it is to actually
23 provide a comment and be on the record.

24 MS. GALLARDO: So, we are in total sync, we did
25 not plan this, but that's what's up on the slide next.

1 (Laughter)

2 MS. GALLARDO: See I deliver. So, here on the
3 slide, for those of you who are able to view, we have
4 some instructions. So, if you want to receive alerts,
5 the latest information about what either people are
6 commenting, or what the Energy Commission is providing,
7 sharing, you should subscribe to the docket associated
8 with this IEPR. So, that's on this slide.

9 And then, I'll also share it with you through
10 the chat once I'm done talking, because I can't
11 multitask that much, that well.

12 And we also encourage you just to make comments.
13 So, there's different ways you can share the comments,
14 as Vice Chair Gunda was saying. So, one is by emailing
15 the Public Advisor, so that would be my office. It's
16 public.advisor@energy.ca.gov.

17 You can also go to the Energy Commission's
18 website and find the docket to get the alerts, and also
19 just to submit comments. There's an easy way to do it
20 electronically. So, the website is energy.ca.gov. And
21 you'd write -- the easy way for me is just write IEPR,
22 I-E-P-R, in the search box. Click on that first link
23 that comes up and then scroll down and click on 2022
24 Integrated Energy Policy Report Update. Then, click
25 where it says 22-IEPR-04-equity, as shown here on the

1 screen.

2 I know, it sounds like a lot. We're trying to
3 improve our processes, but for now this is the way to do
4 it.

5 And if you want any help signing up today, we
6 have a lot of Energy Commission staff here who would be
7 happy to help you. So, feel free to talk to folks
8 nearby and -- actually, Energy Commission team, are you
9 willing to raise your hands real quick, so folks can see
10 who's in the room? So, several people here. Us, too.
11 All right, thank you.

12 So, next slide. The Energy Commission's mission
13 is to achieve a 100 percent clean energy future by 2045.
14 That is an ambitious goal and we won't accomplish it if
15 we only have some of us contributing, and if only some
16 of us are benefitting. This is also something that Dr.
17 Pastor, and I believe Commissioner McAllister said.

18 So, together we realize we must prioritize
19 equity and environmental justice to provide tailored
20 resources that can bring in those people, just like Dr.
21 Pastor was saying. And especially resources those folks
22 who have been impacted by pollution and poverty the
23 most. And that, actually, policies of the past have
24 impacted and maybe even have harmed.

25 So, we don't want that to happen. We want to

1 get a 100 percent clean energy future for 100 percent of
2 Californians. That's why I like this visual here
3 because it's all of California, right. That's our
4 California. And so, this is why we must be doing equity
5 and environmental justice here.

6 And the IEPR process is basically a mechanism
7 that we can use for us to include more voices in our
8 report and to help shape those recommendations that will
9 be our recommendations, along with the deliverables that
10 the Energy Commission staff will be working on that I'll
11 talk about in a little bit.

12 All right, so next slide. Okay, so I just want
13 to be clear that although this is the first time that
14 equity and environmental justice are key topics for the
15 IEPR process, it is not the first time that the agency
16 is working on these efforts. We have been doing it for
17 many years.

18 In 2014 - in 2015, excuse me, is an example. We
19 established our diversity policy through a resolution,
20 so this is us putting it into writing, where we
21 committed to optimize the fair and equal opportunities
22 for small and diverse businesses, known as the supplier
23 diversity. As well as to disadvantaged and underserved
24 communities to participate in and benefit from the
25 Commission's programs.

1 The next slide. In 2019, we also started an
2 initiative to achieve inclusion, diversity, equity and
3 access. Also use an acronym, I-D-E-A, IDEA, to make it
4 comprehensive for both our internal workplace and our
5 external program.

6 So, we wanted to make sure the Energy Commission
7 reflected California's diversity and is a place of
8 belonging. So, what we're doing on the outside, also
9 we're doing it on the inside.

10 Next slide. Okay, so that leads us to the 2022
11 IEPR update, where we are focusing on equity and
12 environmental justice. And there are four key
13 deliverables we want to produce.

14 So, one is to test a regional engagement
15 approach, where we're going to the people.

16 Two, is developing an equity and environmental
17 justice framework that we can use agency wide.

18 Third, is an assessment tool that helps staff
19 determine if they are applying that framework, so that
20 they have that equity EJ lens in their work. And also,
21 an action plan to keep us on track to meet our goals,
22 and to keep us accountable. Again, like Dr. Pastor told
23 us, right. So, we want to make the commitment, but also
24 be held accountable.

25 Finally, we're revisiting the Energy

1 Commission's Equity Indicators Tool. And that was
2 originally produced as a recommendation from SB -- or
3 Senate Bill 350. And my partner over here will talk
4 about that one later.

5 All right, next slide. So, including tribal and
6 community engagement was a vital part of our plan for
7 this IEPR. And to make that happen, we knew we would
8 need to take the IEPR to the people, as we've said, and
9 meet people where they're at, rather than expecting
10 everyone to come to us, especially to Sacramento which
11 can be very far from, for example, Imperial Valley.

12 So, with that in mind we decided to try a
13 regional approach and use the map that you see here,
14 from the Fourth Climate Change Assessment, which has
15 nine regions. And because we planned to have three
16 workshops, we thought we'll select three regions, so we
17 can take those three workshops to those three regions.

18 So, if we get positive feedback about this
19 approach, I want to let folks know from the other
20 regions that did not get selected, that we will continue
21 this approach. And we're also very receptive to
22 feedback about whether this does not work. So, please
23 let us know that.

24 So, we selected the Salton Sea Region, the
25 Central Coast, and the San Joaquin Valley. These are

1 regions that have significant areas considered
2 disadvantaged by the CalEnviroScreen.

3 Someone's really excited about the regional
4 approach, so let's note that one.

5 And these are also areas where the Energy
6 Commission is currently focused in one way or another,
7 so we thought that that would help bring that EJ equity
8 lens to the existing work and also layer more support.

9 So, again July 20th in Kern County, August 31st
10 in Oxnard. We'd love for you to join us. And we'll
11 also have a Zoom capability. Hopefully, it will be a
12 little smoother next time.

13 So, next slide. In terms of a framework, we are
14 seeking to develop a baseline understanding for the
15 Energy Commission about equity and environmental
16 justice. And we think this will better enable us to all
17 move forward together to achieve our vision of all
18 Californians benefitting from a clean energy future
19 regardless of race, income, or location.

20 And the framework is also meant to be a
21 repository for definitions. For example, how is the
22 Energy Commission defining equity? Right. I think
23 right now we have different versions. And what terms
24 are we using for the people we serve? Should we use
25 tribes and frontline communities? What about equity

1 communities? Disadvantaged communities?

2 I've been hearing a lot lately that
3 disadvantaged is not preferred, I don't think by anyone.
4 But we want to put that out there to figure out what
5 terms we should be using.

6 We also want to include guiding principles and
7 best practices, and we are already inspired by some
8 existing resources, including the Jemez Principles from
9 the First National People of Color Environmental
10 Leadership Summit, back in 1991. The framework also
11 established by our advisory group, the Disadvantaged
12 Communities Advisory Group. And other resources listed
13 here.

14 We plan to learn from our peer agencies, who
15 have already produced some material. And also, the
16 federal government is doing a Justice40 Initiative and
17 other work that we can learn from. So, we're going to
18 be open to all of that.

19 Next slide. We are planning to develop an
20 assessment tool, like the matrix that you see here on
21 the slide, which was based on the framework of our
22 advisory body, known as the DACAG.

23 Actually, my partner over there, Katrina Leni-
24 Konig, is responsible for this awesome matrix. She took
25 the DACAG's equity framework and turned it into this

1 assessment tool that could then be used for a grant
2 program to determine is that grant program carrying an
3 EJ equity lens. So, thank you, Katrina, for showing us
4 it can be done.

5 Next slide. So, we'll also develop an action
6 plan that could look like this one. I looked at the
7 Strategic World Council. They actually are a leader
8 among state agencies in terms of equity environmental
9 justice. They had this action plan there so I thought
10 easy-peasy, I'll just start taking a little bit from
11 what they've got. And we'll fill it in later once we
12 have more comments.

13 Next slide. So, the deliverables that I talked
14 to you about mostly depend on that equity and
15 environmental justice framework. So, we want to get
16 that out sooner than later. So, we're planning to
17 submit a draft around July 29th, that will be in the
18 docket, that I mentioned to you earlier.

19 We will want, love, appreciate public comment,
20 so please feel free to dig into that one.

21 And some basic questions that I thought I'd put
22 out now for you to all consider is just, you know, are
23 we moving in the correct direction or should we be going
24 elsewhere?

25 What's missing? From what we'er doing or what

1 you're seeing other agencies that maybe we could fill
2 in, right.

3 What resources do you recommend? I listed a
4 few. But, you know, are there others that we're, you
5 know, not aware of? Please, don't hesitate to share
6 those with us.

7 And then, I'll conclude my presentation by
8 thanking all my colleagues who have been working
9 diligently on this portion of the IEPR, focused on
10 equity and environmental justice. They're the folks who
11 were raising their hands.

12 Also one of my staff members, team members,
13 Dorothy Murimi, is on Zoom and she's been a part of this
14 work as well. So, I want to thank you all for
15 everything that you're doing.

16 And hopefully, I would encourage the audience,
17 especially the audience here in person to reach out to
18 them and get to know them better. They're very cool
19 people.

20 One of our interns, Kaelynn, is here. She got
21 accepted to Berkeley, UCLA, so she's leaving us soon,
22 but for a good place. So, we're really proud of her.
23 And she's been working on this with us, so I wanted to
24 highlight her and, hopefully, she can make some contacts
25 here as well.

1 So, I'll stop there. I could keep talking
2 forever when it comes to equity and environmental stuff.
3 But turn it over to another team member of mine, Hilary
4 Poore, who's going to talk to you about the Equity
5 Indicators, which is that other -- the fourth big item.

6 MS. POORE: Okay. So, good morning everyone
7 online -- oh, nope -- online and in person. My name is
8 Hilary Poore and I am a Data Science Technical Research
9 Project Lead in the Energy Assessments Division at the
10 California Energy Commission.

11 Before I dive into my presentation, I want to
12 express how grateful I am for this opportunity to
13 present at this IEPR workshop. I'm excited to listen
14 and learn from our panelists, speakers, and
15 participants, and I know the feedback we get today will
16 be invaluable.

17 Oh, two slides, please. Thank you. And also,
18 before diving into SB 350 background and equity
19 indicators, I want to acknowledge John Reed and the
20 excellent work he did researching SB 350 and digging
21 into that first iteration of Energy Equity Indicators
22 that Noemí referenced. We so appreciate you.

23 So, Senate Bill 350 is the Clean Energy and
24 Pollution Reduction Act. It establishes clean energy,
25 clean air, and greenhouse gas reduction goals.

1 Specifically, SB 350 increases California's renewable
2 procurement goal, hard word, and requires the state to
3 double statewide energy efficiency savings in
4 electricity and natural gas end uses.

5 The bill also directs state agencies to undergo
6 studies to identify and assess barriers that low income
7 and disadvantaged communities face when considering
8 adopting clean energy measures.

9 The Energy Commission has utilized the Barrier
10 Study to shape programs and investments to help address
11 some of the barriers identified.

12 Next slide, please. The CEC worked in
13 conjunction with other state agencies, including the
14 Public Utilities Commission, Air Resources Board, and
15 the California Independent System Operator to implement
16 the bill.

17 As a result, SB 350 has been an incredible
18 catalyst for important equity and environmental justice
19 work across myriad state agencies. This slide outlines
20 just a few efforts resulting from SB 350.

21 Most notably, CARB's Access Clean California, an
22 incredible platform and tool that we consider an
23 excellent model as we revisit Equity Indicators.

24 And the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory
25 Group, an 11-member group representing disadvantaged

1 communities across the state that provides feedback and
2 insight on clean energy programs and policies to both
3 the CEC and CPUC. Another byproduct, which I'll dive
4 into now, is the Energy Equity Indicators.

5

6 Next slide, please. Energy Equity Indicators
7 was developed to identify opportunities and track
8 progress of recommendations from CEC's SB 350 Low Income
9 Barrier Study. The goals of Equity Indicators were to
10 help identify opportunities to improve access to clean
11 energy technologies for low-income customers and
12 disadvantaged communities, increase clean energy
13 investment in those communities, and improve community
14 resilience to grid outages and extreme events.

15 Next slide, please. A four-year lapse in
16 updating Equity Indicators has created this incredible
17 opportunity to revisit it. Since 2018, there have been
18 a multitude of changes and developments that we plan to
19 take into consideration as we begin to reshape Equity
20 Indicators.

21 These include the expansion of public safety
22 power shutoffs, improved data availability, and the
23 centering of CEC as the state's energy data repository,
24 expanded funding opportunities, and a heightened
25 importance of an equitable clean energy transition.

1 Next slide, please. As we reimagine and reshape
2 Equity Indicators, we envision it including dynamic data
3 and being presented as a suite of intractable maps or
4 dashboards. It will be developed so that it can best
5 serve disadvantaged communities. And we aim to have
6 Equity Indicators complement existing tools, like
7 CalEnviroScreen 4.0.

8 We believe that Equity Indicators has this huge
9 potential to be useful and we know we need to bring it
10 to communities, and revisit it together to ensure that
11 it is helpful and valuable. Today's workshop is the
12 first step and we are so grateful for any feedback we
13 get today.

14 Next slide, please. Thank you. Our vision for
15 the refreshed Equity Indicators will be a tool developed
16 and maintained by the CEC that increases data
17 availability and visibility, enables and empowers
18 individuals and communities to retrieve, understand, and
19 utilize their energy data. Provides support to
20 communities as they pursue strategies in investments to
21 aid in their clean energy transition. And finally,
22 addresses gaps and directs funding to communities that
23 need it the most.

24 We also do not want to stray far from an
25 objective of the original Equity Indicators, which was

1 to track progress and keep the CEC accountable. We want
2 to be able to utilize Equity Indicators to measure
3 movement across metrics and how much CEC programs
4 influence that progress.

5 Next slide, please. This slide highlights some
6 of the key differences between 2018 and 2022 Equity
7 Indicators. The 2018 version was static and centered
8 primarily on a PDF report. The 2022 version will be
9 dynamic and explorable, refreshed annually, and
10 initially focused on a key set of metrics with
11 opportunities to expand as we explore what is valuable
12 to our audience.

13 Next slide, please. Some of the very early
14 feedback that we heard from stakeholders and potentially
15 users is that they do not want Equity Indicators
16 perpetually stuck in a state of limbo.

17 This feedback inspired us to take a phased
18 approach, first focusing on the indicators and metrics
19 that we already have robust data for and are of great
20 interest. We hope that by focusing the scope in this
21 first phase it will allow us to launch the first
22 iteration of the new Equity Indicators by the end of
23 this year.

24 Phase one indicators of interest are featured on
25 this slide and are energy transition, investment,

1 reliability, and access. And we are exploring a few
2 metrics, either natural gas power plant retirement,
3 electrification, amount invested, energy burden, PSPS,
4 and participation in Energy Efficiency programs.

5 We have focused on these metrics because they
6 are meaningful, of interest, and we already have the
7 data needed for the analysis, or the needed data is
8 realistic to capture.

9 In phase two we plan on expanding to include
10 more nuanced and emerging indicators, which may require
11 research into and engagement on measurement methods, or
12 even collecting new data.

13 Ultimately, we envision Equity Indicators to be
14 an ongoing project, updating it annually, and always
15 looking for ways to expand, and add value and utility.

16 Next slide, please. We are posing these
17 questions to the audience, you as stakeholders, and
18 potential users, because we are striving to make Energy
19 Equity Indicators a valuable resource that complements
20 existing tools and is useful.

21 Through comments or in small group discussions
22 later this afternoon, I hope you'll think about these
23 questions. They're centered on two topics. Data, like
24 what information or data gaps exist and what indicators
25 are most important. And utility, how can we tailor this

1 tool so it is useful, or how would you use this tool.

2 These questions are just suggestions. We are,
3 of course, grateful for any and all feedback.

4 Next slide, please. Thank you again for this
5 opportunity. We look forward to hearing from you on
6 what value and utility Energy Equity can -- excuse me,
7 Energy Equity Indicators can provide to your work.

8 Up next are Dr. Chris Benner and Silvia Paz.
9 I'd like to express my personal gratitude to them for
10 sharing their experience with us. I'm grateful for the
11 opportunity to learn from them as we revisit our
12 indicators. Thank you for being here, we are very
13 excited to learn from you.

14 MS. RAITT: So, this is Heather, yeah. So, go
15 ahead, Silvia, if you'd like to go ahead.

16 MS. PAZ: Okay. Can I get a confirmation from
17 you? I'm going to wait for the presentation.

18 Can people in the back hear?

19 (Multiple comments)

20 MS. PAZ: So, can you hear me now in the back?
21 Perfect, thank you.

22 So, my name is Silvia Paz. I am the Founder and
23 Executive Director of a non-profit collective impact
24 organization. We are based in the Coachella Valley.
25 And the reason we are here is because in cooperation

1 with Dr. Chris Benner, Dr. Manuel Pastor, Dr. Christian
2 (phonetic), from UCR, and the Jobs Committee. We just
3 finalized a process that identifies key metrics for the
4 Salton Sea Region.

5 So, I will be talking about what got us here, so
6 process. What was going on through our minds, what
7 decisions we made early on. And then, Dr. Benner is
8 going to be speaking about the metrics themselves, the
9 findings, and then he will -- after he talks about the
10 findings, I will come back and speak to talk about the
11 applicability, right. So, after we have metrics, what
12 do we do with them.

13 So, next slide please. So, again, this is just
14 a brief -- I already mentioned our partnership. And
15 what this effort really was about and how it started was
16 an exploration on how we could realize equitable,
17 inclusive, and sustainable economic development and
18 mobility in the Salton Sea Region.

19 Next slide. We can skip this one. And this is
20 the overarching question: How do you foster equitable,
21 inclusive, and sustainable economic mobility in a rural
22 desert economy?

23 What led us to this question? As many of the
24 nonprofit organizations, working through the pandemic,
25 early on we realized that there -- that the pandemic

1 brought an additional challenge to already communities
2 that were already facing many barriers. And amongst
3 ourselves, we had spent the last seven years, before the
4 pandemic, working on addressing equity issues through a
5 public health lens. And we had been working on issues
6 to improve the infrastructure in our communities because
7 many of our community members do not have access to
8 drinking, clean drinking water.

9 We were working on issues of education equity so
10 that our -- it would become easier for our students to
11 stay in school, rather to drop out, right. And what
12 roll did the education system play in that.

13 So, these were issues that we were working on.
14 The pandemic hit. And the first week no one -- we
15 didn't know what to do. We all went home. And the
16 second week everyone's like what are we going to do?
17 The community needs us. We've been engaging them and we
18 can't just stay in our homes, right.

19 So, we started doing food distribution, right,
20 door-to-door. Why did we decide to do door-to-door
21 distribution? It was because many of the food banks in
22 our rural economy, right, in our rural desert landscape
23 required that someone had access to a car and drive to
24 pick up food.

25 We knew that our farmworkers were working and

1 they were taking the car that they had to work, and the
2 families were not able to go pick up the food. So,
3 that's what got us started.

4 Then we started doing cash assistance, which is
5 not something that we typically do. ALIANZA is not a
6 service organization. We're an advocacy, policy systems
7 change organization. But we needed to go in that
8 direction, so we did cash assistance.

9 And as we were going through all of that and
10 hearing the challenges that our communities were facing,
11 there was maybe a moment of panic and fear of what was
12 going to happen after the pandemic.

13 Our communities, like I mentioned, were already
14 facing barriers and the pandemic was going to put us
15 maybe 10, 20 years behind. We -- I realized that the
16 work that we were doing, while impactful and we had
17 already had huge achievements in addressing
18 infrastructure needs, was not enough. Because during
19 this pandemic my community was still at risk because
20 they didn't have a safe place where they could shelter.

21 And I knew that the cash assistance was going to
22 come to an end. So, I started putting my thoughts on
23 paper, calling people, and in my experience had taught
24 me that we needed maybe to take a step back and think
25 about a more proactive way of addressing the things that

1 we were doing. Because even at ALIANZA we were doing a
2 project campaign-by-campaign, which requires a lot of
3 time.

4 So, I thought to myself, okay, the difference
5 that having the social determinants of health and the
6 impact that those social determinants have done is the
7 way that we seek help, right. And that was my
8 experience. I knew that, well, being healthy did not
9 depend on just us going to the doctor, right. That
10 being healthy depended on the built environment, it
11 depended on civic engagement, it depended on jobs, the
12 quality of jobs.

13 And then I had the question, well, are there
14 social determinants of a healthy, thriving economy? And
15 I couldn't find anything. So, I called -- I know that
16 was one of the first questions I asked Dr. Benner was
17 like, look, I'm familiar with social determinants of
18 health, we need to think about our economy in a more
19 holistic way.

20 Because like Dr. Manuel Pastor mentioned, it's
21 not only going to be the jobs, it's not only going to be
22 the environment, it's really an intersection, right.
23 And how do we do that?

24 So, that started -- those are the background
25 conversations where we were maybe a year and a half ago.

1 And this was one of the questions -- and this was the
2 question. And why a rural desert economy? It's because
3 that we also knew, I grew up in Mecca, and I also knew
4 that whatever works in other places, in the Bay Area, in
5 San Diego, in Riverside is very different. We have
6 different conditions.

7 So, next slide, please. So, we -- early on,
8 when I was speaking with a group of researchers, and
9 people who are from Imperial probably feel very similar
10 to the way I feel about being from this region. We
11 don't want outsiders and we don't want them to come and
12 tell us what to do. And they don't understand, they
13 haven't lived here. And yet, they have some expertise,
14 right.

15 So, one of the first things is that we created
16 this set of guiding values even to identify who was it
17 that ALIANZA was going to partner with? And we had
18 these discussions with Dr. Benner. We had the
19 discussions with CARPA (phonetic). And we said, okay,
20 this needs to be a rural community-centered approach.
21 It needs to be intersectional. It needs to be inclusive
22 and participatory. And it needs to be action driven.

23 In our region we are studied a lot, and it
24 doesn't always result in an action. So, these were
25 going to be the values that were going to guide not just

1 our relationship, but also the work, and what we wanted
2 to see from the work.

3 Next slide, please. And then, the approach. We
4 wanted to make sure from the very beginning Let me know
5 if it's going to work we have a starting time, we know
6 that we want to publish this, and we needed to make sure
7 that the process was inclusive. Right, that was one of
8 our guiding principles.

9 So, at the very beginning it wasn't enough that
10 I had this great question and that I had, you know, I
11 know what I'm doing and how I'm going to solve this. We
12 opened it up at the very beginning to do a scoping and
13 research brainstorming meeting. And during that first
14 meeting we invited people from -- well, this is the
15 other thing and I'll step back.

16 When we were thinking about this, it was also
17 thinking about our region in a different way. And
18 typically, we're thinking about Riverside County,
19 Imperial County, Coachella Valley, Imperial Valley, but
20 we couldn't address our economy without thinking about
21 the Salton Sea. And the Salton Sea spans both Riverside
22 and Imperial Valley, Coachella Valley, Imperial Valley.

23 So, we wanted to make sure that this work was
24 going to be relevant for the entire region, and we
25 wanted to include voices from both regions. So, in our

1 scoping research and I -- full disclosure that I do not
2 have the deep connections and roots that some of our
3 other nonprofit colleagues who work in Imperial do.

4 But we -- I had been invited to the Census
5 Legacy Group that was meeting here in Imperial Valley,
6 and we invited them to be part of the scoping and the
7 research. We invited Imperial County, Riverside County,
8 and we invited our traditional economic development
9 developers. We invited community groups and residents.
10 So, it was really a diverse group just to think about
11 how do we address the situation where we are in, what is
12 our question. And that's what really defined not just
13 the question, but the way we were going to do this.

14 So, the first, when we think about research and
15 not -- this is not what Dr. Benner does. But when we
16 think about research you think these people are doing --
17 researchers somewhere, you know, in a tower and it's
18 very disconnected from our communities. So, that's not
19 what we want.

20 What we wanted was we wanted the legitimacy that
21 research brings. So, there was going to be a literature
22 review process. But we were not going to take the
23 literature as the final word. We were going to create a
24 draft and then ground truth it. And I don't know if
25 this is a word that may be made up, but what we mean by

1 that is that we were going to bring the set of
2 indicators, the frameworks that the researchers were
3 identifying and have focus groups, interviews, and
4 really check with as many people as we could given our
5 goals, whether it makes sense for us. Right. Just it's
6 resonates.

7 And I know Dr. Benner can speak more about this.
8 But again, the conversations that I joined, it was very
9 key that in those conversations the community here
10 identified two key things that were a priority, that
11 would probably not have been uplifted had we not done
12 this process.

13 And they talked about the resiliency of the
14 Salton Sea, right, the social, the ecological health of
15 the Salton Sea. So, thinking about the ecology and
16 thinking about the public health.

17 And they also talked about the importance of
18 infrastructure, like infrastructure being a main barrier
19 for many of the issues that we're talking about.
20 Whether we're talking about building up our economy,
21 whether we're talking about protection, or protecting
22 ourselves from a crisis such as COVID, infrastructure
23 played a key role.

24 So, those were the two things that came out in
25 the process because of the way that we did it.

1 Next slide, please. So, I will now pass the mic
2 over to Dr. Benner. And you can tell us about, you
3 know, the indicators.

4 DR. BENNER: Great. Well, thank you so much,
5 Silvia. And I just want to start by thanking you for
6 the invitation to work with you and your alliance. It's
7 really been an honor and a privilege to work with you,
8 and I've learned so much, and happy to be able to
9 contribute in the ways that I can.

10 And I also wanted to thank Vice Chair Gunda.
11 It's such a pleasure to see you again and be together in
12 this room, Commissioner McAllister, and the whole Energy
13 Commission to be here, it's a real treat to be able to
14 share this work.

15 Next slide, please. And in the spirit of
16 mutuality, I want to make sure to acknowledge that there
17 were a couple of graduate students who worked on this
18 research and report, Nate Edenhofer and Alejandro
19 Artiga-Purcell. And much of the work I'm presenting
20 today really depends on them.

21 I will mention that Alejandro just got a job as
22 a professor at San Jose State University in
23 environmental studies. So, the purgatory of PhD
24 programs doesn't last forever. There is hope at the end
25 of that.

1 Next slide, please. So, as Dr. Pastor, an old
2 colleague and friend, talked about the solidarity
3 economics framing that underpins the work that we're
4 doing here. And I want to lift up one particular aspect
5 of it that part of what we're trying to do in talking
6 about solidarity economics is put a different frame on
7 how we understand our economy.

8 Our dominant economic models emphasize
9 individuality and competition in markets, with price
10 signals. And it's not that those aren't important. But
11 when we only focus on that we have blinders on the
12 importance of mutuality that exists in our current
13 economy.

14 And so, we forget, for instance, that the
15 innovation that drove Silicon Valley depends on
16 collaboration, and knowledge sharing, and communication,
17 and research, and universities working with the private
18 sector, and public sector investments all coming
19 together.

20 We forget about the importance of the caring
21 economy, and healthcare, and childcare as building
22 health and wellbeing in our economy in central ways.
23 So, we hope that solidarity economics can help us see
24 that.

25 It also is important for seeing our environment,

1 which is so important in this Salton Sea region, and
2 recognizing the mutual collective inheritance of the
3 natural resources of this region, the lithium, and other
4 energy resources over with geothermal. But also
5 recognizes the importance of the common pollution, air
6 quality challenges that have gone on when we don't take
7 care of our environment appropriately.

8 And so, it's not just informative we should be
9 invested in mutuality, and there's plenty of evidence
10 about why, when we invest in mutuality, our economy does
11 better. But it's also a way of recognizing and seeing
12 our economy in different ways.

13 Next slide, please. And so part of that, as we
14 think about the importance of movements, as Dr. Pastor
15 talked about, you know, part of that is in a traditional
16 way of thinking about shifting power relationships, and
17 the advocacy, and trying to influence those with power,
18 but it also forces us to think about all the subtle ways
19 that power and values are invested in our economy in
20 ways that we need to challenge.

21 And again, one of the things I point to in this
22 is when we think about the caring economy, and by that I
23 mean both early childhood education and childcare, as
24 well as caring for the elderly. One, that's a much
25 larger portion of our economy in terms of employment,

1 the number of people depend on it, than high tech
2 services, the whole high tech economy. And we don't
3 value the skills in that kind of work in the way that's
4 appropriate.

5 Right, it's a real challenge to figure out how
6 do you promote motivation, and competence, and learning
7 into that. The one that's apparent, though, is that
8 truly a challenge. It's a challenge washing, helping
9 someone, an elderly person with dignity. That is not
10 seen as skilled work, but is incredibly skilled work.

11 And for this region, thinking about agriculture,
12 anyone who's worked in the fields knows not only is that
13 very difficult work, it's very skilled work.

14 So, we need to challenge our understandings of
15 what skilled means in our economy to be able to change
16 what we look at.

17 Next slide, please. And I should say also, by
18 the way, when we think about movements it helps us
19 broaden our sense of mutuality, broadens our sense of
20 belonging and connection to things that are so important
21 for addressing the crisis of the problems of our multi-
22 racial democracy that Dr. Pastor talked about.

23 So, when we look at the challenges and
24 opportunities in the Salton Sea, one thing that is
25 really clear, and that chart shows all the industries in

1 the region, the vertical access is high wage at the top,
2 low wage of the bottom. And the size of the bars is the
3 size of employment. And that sector, you can see really
4 clearly, so much employment in the region is in low wage
5 industries, agriculture, some of the care industries I
6 mentioned, retail accommodation.

7 And then, of course, there's the environmental
8 challenges of the region with the declining water levels
9 in the Salton Sea, and the associated dust with all that
10 toxic remnants of agriculture in the region.

11 But, of course, there's tremendous opportunities
12 in the region as well. And lithium is the one that's
13 getting a lot of publicity now. But, of course, energy,
14 solar, wind, geothermal has been an important resource
15 in this region for a long time, and a potential for
16 significant advancements in infrastructure.

17 And so, if we go to the next slide, part of what
18 we were thinking about in looking about developing
19 appropriate indicators for this region is recognizing
20 we're all definitely concerned about outcomes for people
21 in the region in terms of wellbeing. That will
22 partially be shaped by the background conditions, but
23 it's partially shaped by who's participating in the
24 decisions that shape our economy, including the
25 decisions that shape the rules that guide and shape

1 markets, and the values that are embedded in those. So,
2 the energy markets and our environment are particularly
3 important for that.

4 And figuring out appropriate metrics for
5 measuring participation is particularly challenging.
6 So, we spent a lot of time in this report looking at
7 that.

8 Next slide, please. So, people often talk about
9 this ladder of participation. From at the low end sort
10 of a, you know, manipulation or token level of
11 participation, where at the top level you're really
12 talking about full partnership, or delegation of
13 responsibility, or community empowerment. And that's an
14 important spectrum to think about is how real is
15 participation.

16 It's also important to think about how important
17 is the scope of the decision-making process. Because
18 you can have very meaningful community empowerment
19 around what goes on in a particular neighborhood, and
20 that's important, but it's very rare to have meaningful
21 community empowerment around determining, you know, the
22 future economy of the Salton Sea Region. And
23 ultimately, that's what we want to get to is an
24 increasing scope of the consequence of that
25 participation.

1 Next slide, please. And so, you know, part of
2 what we have in this report is some ways of thinking
3 about the different between sort of barriers to
4 meaningful participation and conditions for that
5 meaningful participation that include access to
6 economically significant decisions, really having
7 distributed authority in decision-making processes.
8 Really looking at building the relationships and
9 connections between community organizations, but
10 recognizing any single nonprofit or any single community
11 can only have limited inputs unless they're working with
12 a whole grouping of people.

13 And so, we're really trying to move towards that
14 conditions of both meaningful participation and
15 meaningful scope to really get community economic
16 empowerment.

17 Next slide, please. One of the things that
18 emerges when thinking about that meaningful
19 participation in consequential decision making is that
20 all too often those consequential decision making
21 processes happen behind closed doors.

22 Or, if there is a public participation process,
23 you get your two minutes to have your say and that's
24 about it.

25 And often the decisions get made in those

1 discussions afterwards, or in private meetings, or in
2 the relationships that get built over a long period of
3 time.

4 And so, part of the movement, the mention of
5 thinking about these indicators is how do you claim
6 space as someone who's marginalized for the process in a
7 way that, you know, addresses some of what Dr. Pastor
8 talked about, seeming uncomfortable, expecting conflict.
9 Trying to get into those spaces where historically
10 private decisions have been made of major consequence to
11 everyone and, yet, are made in a undemocratic,
12 nontransparent way.

13 And so, again, just a reminder that in this
14 process for community organizations getting into those
15 closed spaces and claiming access to them, we're going
16 to see conflict. And then, when we see that conflict,
17 one that's a good sign that things are changing, then
18 two we need to lean in and understand why, and have
19 those difficult conversations. I really look forward to
20 that.

21 Next slide, please. Okay, so getting into
22 particular indicators. Part of what we were thinking
23 about, of course this is some of what Silvia had
24 mentioned, is we're looking at indicators that are
25 getting at not just growth, but equity, and

1 sustainability, and broader senses of human wellbeing.
2 And those are important for tracking progress and
3 tracking those current conditions.

4 But also recognizing that data can help catalyze
5 conversations, that they can be a really important sort
6 of common point for bringing together people from
7 different experiences, and background, and perspective.

8 And I was really pleased to hear the discussion
9 about in the new round of Equity Indicators for the CEC
10 having an online source that's accessible, and can be
11 interactive so that people understand and look at that.

12 It's also important not to have 2,000
13 indicators, right. Because we all get lost, even those
14 of us who spend our lives in data. We need to be figure
15 out what the priority ones are that can be accessible
16 and really drive those conversations.

17 So, next slide, please. So, the process we did
18 actually start from a framework that Dr. Pastor and I
19 had developed, along with the Rockefeller Foundation, of
20 an inclusive economy framework that had five different
21 dimensions. It was an economy, an inclusive economy
22 should be equitable, should be participatory, it should
23 be growing in ways that have meaningful wellbeing.

24 It should be sustainable, both the ability to
25 sustain wellbeing over a long period of time, and

1 environmentally sustainable.

2 And it should be stable. One of the biggest
3 problems is, you know, boom and bust cycles or, you
4 know, people come across economically difficult
5 circumstances and have to go into debt and, you know,
6 aren't able to predict or plan for their future.

7 And so, we started with that and connected to a
8 variety of other frameworks, including the sustainable
9 development goals from the United Nations, and others.
10 And then, came to the series of conversations with
11 people in the community that Silvia talked about.

12 And what emerged is this framework that really
13 sort of brought together, I think, some of the best
14 thinking globally around indicators of an inclusive
15 economy, with what's an important set of priorities in
16 the region.

17 And Silvia used the term ground truthing. And I
18 think there's two ways of thinking about that. One is,
19 you know, it's often used in the scientific field to
20 look at satellite data that you're remote sensing of
21 actually having to go on the ground to refine it and get
22 more details.

23 And that's, I think, part of what happened here.
24 But I think it's also important to recognize that the
25 truth that exists on the ground, independently of any

1 outside monitoring or connection, is incredibly valuable
2 knowledge, and it needs to be respected, and understood,
3 and valued in the same way that that sort of remote
4 sensing is.

5 And that's what we've hope to have done in this
6 in really lifting up, sort of combining the stability
7 and growth together, so we're thinking about that in the
8 same language. Which is centrally important in this
9 region as we think about lithium. And tremendous
10 opportunities in the moment. But who knows what's going
11 to happen to battery technology two decades from now, or
12 a decade from now, and will lithium be an old technology
13 in that period of time. And are we thinking about
14 diversifying the economy of this region as we're also
15 thinking about the opportunities of lithium in the
16 region.

17 But as Silvia mentioned, socio-ecological
18 health, the community health, environmental health were
19 central and so we wanted to lift those up.

20 And then this issue about infrastructure,
21 particularly around transportation and access to
22 economic opportunity was central to that.

23 The next four slides you can skip over there.
24 They're in the public record. They are detailed metrics
25 for each one that I hope the Commission will look at.

1 They may have some relevance for the work that you're
2 doing.

3 But the final point, which is the next slide, is
4 -- you know, I think in any development opportunity I
5 would say this work, you know, the work in energy in
6 particular, there are both tremendous challenges and
7 opportunities. And I think this region reflects that in
8 fundamental ways. And it is such an important part of
9 the energy mix in California because of all the
10 tremendous resources in this area.

11 But we really have to not do business as usual.
12 Like in this moment, emerging out of the pandemic, if
13 we're not taking advantage of this moment to think about
14 doing things different, I don't think we're doing
15 justice to either ourselves or our future generations.
16 Like that's the call to us at this moment is to think
17 about how do we do things different in ways in which
18 equity and environmental justice are lifted up.

19 And that that progress, this is the last point
20 here, depends on collective dialogue, that none of us
21 are smart enough alone to figure out what needs to be,
22 we need each other to know how to move forward.

23 And with that, I'll turn it back to Silvia to
24 talk about how this work is now being implemented at
25 some of their projects in the region.

1 MS. PAZ: Thank you, Chris.

2 Next slide. So, if you, you know, recall the
3 guiding values that I talked about in the beginning, one
4 of them was that this needed to be action oriented. So,
5 as I was working with Chris Benner and our other
6 partners, I was also talking to an architect engineering
7 firm because of the nature of the Salton Sea, the needs
8 that our community faces when we're talking about
9 infrastructure.

10 And my goal in bringing in that expertise was to
11 say what do we do next? Right. We have indicators, but
12 we cannot wait. Indicators, it's not just about
13 tracking, it's not just about having a conversation,
14 it's like how do we implement it before. What does it
15 look like if we're truly going to be making a change.

16 So, for us, at the the Salton Sea, this work
17 really meant that there were serious implication for the
18 approach to the Salton Sea, right. That the current
19 approach had been -- has been a sole focus on the
20 ecology part, right, that we need to take care of the
21 fish and the birds. Which is really important, they're
22 good indicators about overall health.

23 But that that approach was creating a very
24 narrow view of what we need, not just to address the
25 Salton Sea, but to enhance the region.

1 So, we had developed these early proposals in
2 about 2017 to expand what the community wanted to see,
3 which was on the idea of resiliency. That we needed to
4 have an approach that would bring in the community, that
5 it would address the infrastructure needs and the
6 ecology as much as we could.

7 So, next slide. So, after this work and this is
8 the same, you know, chart of indicators, but we said
9 this shouldn't just be indicators, there should be a
10 criteria, right. For everything that we're planning to
11 do in this region we should have the criteria. Whether
12 we're talking about workforce development, whether we're
13 talking about, you know, a just transition and projects
14 that are going to advance that, whether we're talking
15 about, you know, new development in the region we need a
16 criteria.

17 And why that was important for our region is
18 because, as has been acknowledged, our region has been
19 left behind so many times. And it is very taxing on the
20 people who are leading this movement to be fighting
21 project after project, to be fighting to be included in
22 every single conversation where we've been left out of.

23 So, we said, if we can get this region to come
24 together and we said that something like this, having
25 the criteria would be the basic entry level for anything

1 that we're planning to do to advance this region, then
2 we've made a step forward, right.

3 So, what happens then, once we have this
4 criteria? And if it's accepted, how does it look like
5 or how could it look like. So, we thought about a
6 demonstration project.

7 Next slide. Okay, so we thought about creating
8 a demonstration project. That would start with the
9 inclusion piece, the number two that we saw on this
10 screen. Or, like I mentioned, for the last -- before
11 the pandemic, the last seven years we have been doing a
12 lot of community work, campaign work. And we've come to
13 understand and hear from the community what was
14 important for them.

15 And so, when we're talking about the community
16 aspect, the community is talking about access to play,
17 camping, art, entrepreneurship, good jobs. Right.

18 When we're talking about infrastructure, our
19 community -- and when I'm talking about our community,
20 I'm mostly talking about the North Shore, North Bend
21 community, so just to be clear.

22 So, about the infrastructure, they were talking
23 about multi-modal transportation, access to -- access to
24 the sea, having pavement, sidewalks, lights, water,
25 walking trails, electric charging stations. I mean I

1 received a call recently and they said, you know, with
2 the price of gas, the cost of gasoline right now, and
3 this move that California has for electrification of
4 cars, it's like I would like to get an electric car but
5 I live in a mobile home park. Where will I charge it?
6 So, having electric charging stations.

7 Broadband is another thing. During the
8 pandemic, we were all forced to work from home.
9 Students were forced to get an education online. And
10 there were so many, and continue to be so many
11 challenges with broadband, so adding that.

12 And then, making sure that our electric grid is
13 stable, that power can be delivered to our homes.
14 Because again, every time as we're talking about climate
15 change, this region is seeing more and more either
16 storms, and high winds, and those high winds end up --
17 we end up with power poles that are, you know, dropped,
18 or damaged, and our communities can go for weeks in the
19 desert heat without electricity in their homes.

20 And then, we also -- the ecology's also
21 important. So, dust suppression, habitat shade,
22 vegetation for some of the days.

23 And these are the things, then, that we
24 presented to the architect and they developed some
25 models that we could use as a demonstration project.

1 And again, why a demonstration project? It's because we
2 have heard many, and I believe many from the federal
3 administration, the state administration, that they want
4 to do this. Like we're hearing it. And for us in the
5 community, well, why haven't you? It's a very, maybe,
6 healthy skepticism on our end. It's like, well, maybe
7 we need to show them what this could look like in our
8 community.

9 So, next slide, please. So, this is what we're
10 talking about when we're talking about projects that
11 advance equity, growth, stability, socio-ecological
12 health, transportation and access, right.

13 So, imagine the community of North Shore
14 currently only has one community center that serves
15 them. They are about 9 miles away from Mecca and maybe
16 12 miles from the closest grocery store, so they already
17 have a lot of challenges.

18 When the power lines go down or there's an
19 emergency, most services get delivered at the Salton Sea
20 Yacht Club, which is on the other side of a railroad
21 track and Highway 111. So, unless you have a car, it's
22 not safe for them to get to it.

23 So, what if we had a green bridge that would not
24 only create that pedestrian access, reduce emissions
25 because now people do not have to depend on cars, add

1 green elements so that we're protecting our communities
2 from the growing heat, cooling down, and there's also,
3 you know, habitat for the birds, right. So, that's an
4 idea.

5 Next slide, please. And when -- what if we
6 continue with this mentality as we're thinking about the
7 Salton Sea, itself, and the need to reduce the dust
8 emissions, right, and think about a trail that would
9 connect the yacht club to the state park.

10 And what would be on that trail? Well, the
11 trail can be programmed with art, vegetation, solar
12 panels that also serve to provide shade under the day
13 and maybe lighting at night for safety. And electric
14 vehicle charging stations in that location.

15 Next slide. And this is an aerial view, again
16 just the piece of the trail that would be between the
17 yacht club and the state park. And again, it's linking
18 the community with a resource that is underutilized by
19 our local communities. When we're talking about access
20 to the state park, it's only about 2.5 miles away, but
21 our community doesn't really get there because of the
22 access issues that we have.

23 And then, the other piece was having a
24 marketplace there that would be an opportunity for
25 entrepreneurship. In the community of North Shore there

1 is a -- we have many people who are from Mexico,
2 (speaking Spanish) who do embroidery, they sell their
3 art from their homes.

4 In the development of a park there was also --
5 we did a similar process of doing participatory designs.
6 And biking, right, became -- it's important. There's a
7 bike club and they do bike repair. So, what if we had a
8 biking rental place in this marketplace, and other ideas
9 for entrepreneurship.

10 So, then we're talking not just about addressing
11 the environmental needs that the Salton Sea is facing,
12 but addressing them in a way that really meets our
13 community where they are and creating -- it's going to
14 create good jobs in the process of it. It's helping
15 with the energy goals with the, you know, the electric
16 charging station, solar. But then, there would be some
17 opportunities for people who typically get left out, and
18 who we do not think about entrepreneurs, right, like the
19 women who sells food from their home, they're an
20 entrepreneur. We just don't have access for them to
21 enter the market.

22 So, next slide, please. So, my key points.
23 Going back to the indicators and the process that you
24 are engaging in. The process has the ability to
25 determine the levels of inclusivity and meaningful

1 engagement.

2 So, you already know what you're trying to do.
3 Think about where does it make sense to engage
4 community? And in order for it to be meaningful
5 engagement, it needs to be at key points where the
6 discussion is going to make the difference between you
7 making a left turn, a right turn, or keep going
8 straight, right.

9 Indicators for the sake of indicators will not
10 yield the results that we're seeking. A couple of
11 questions to consider is who can or will adopt, right,
12 and how can they be operationalized? Right, they
13 shouldn't just live -- so, we're going to at this, we
14 met them, we didn't met them, there needs to be a degree
15 of intentionality. And that's why in our work I opted
16 for thinking of them as criteria, rather than just an
17 indicator.

18 And finally, we need to stop doing projects to
19 meet a mandate or a liability. The mandates that we
20 have for equity, the frameworks that have been put in
21 place, they were music to my ears. I loved it. But
22 that's not really the reason why we're doing this,
23 right. We need to think of every project as an
24 opportunity to improve someone's quality of life. And
25 only then will we realize the intersectionality of the

1 issues and begin integrating ourselves as a piece of
2 this larger puzzle that requires better integration
3 between and among agencies and communities in order for
4 us to complete that process.

5 So, with that I will end and really thank Vice
6 Chair Gunda, and Noemí, and the Energy Commission for
7 this opportunity. Thank you.

8 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Silvia. Thank you,
9 Chris.

10 So, this is Heather Raitt. And Commissioner, if
11 you have some questions?

12 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, I mean I -- it's hard
13 to both project and speak from the heart at the same
14 time. You know, it's like a --

15 MS. RAITT: It looks like your screen is --

16 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, I know. You know, I
17 just want to start by just thanking both of you. You
18 know, just such a chilling way of having a discussion.
19 I mean, you know, Silvia to you, this is real for you.
20 This means life. You know, this means people, and
21 community and heart.

22 A lot of times it's easy for us to draw broad
23 strokes on this is where we're going, and without really
24 taking into account the spirit of actual, you know,
25 boots on the ground. So, thank you for inspiring them.

1 And I'm so -- I feel now more honored that you
2 even took the chance to come and sit with us and
3 discuss, just giving us that welcome and trust to be a
4 part of the conversation. So, thank you.

5 And, you know, Dr. Benner, I've known you. And
6 I've said you were a mentor. You just reminded me why
7 you were a mentor. Thank you. Thank you for being
8 truthful to your heart and trying to bridge the gap.

9 So, I mean I took a lot of notes on how we can
10 move this forward. I love the discussion around, you
11 know, indicators being meaningful when they become
12 criteria. And I think that's extremely helpful part of
13 the discussion.

14 I also, kind of listening in through the idea
15 of, you know, how do you have both broad level, you
16 know, criteria, but really localized criteria and how do
17 you bring them into the discussion? And the timeliness
18 and when do you do it, you know, it's just incredible.

19 So, as we move forward, I mean I have a million
20 questions. I feel like even before I ask a question I
21 should sit for another ten hours learning first. So, I
22 think my question is just in the spirit of, you know, we
23 have another three or four months to, you know, land
24 this IEPR. We want this to be a living document as we
25 move forward.

1 Can you just comment on what we should not try
2 to do this in four months? You know, how do we think
3 about keeping this open in a way that it continues to
4 grow?

5 So, one of the reasons I'm asking this is a lot
6 of times when we talk about equity, people are worried
7 about, oh, it takes a lot of resources, a lot of time,
8 you know, and hence we can't do this, right, so keep it
9 at the broad level.

10 So, what I want to do is be able to have
11 meaningful conversation in the next four to six months,
12 but really keeping it alive in the way that it continues
13 to flourish and really be an impact.

14 So, if you can provide any guidance on what we
15 shouldn't attempt to do in these next four months or six
16 months, and what we should focus on.

17 DR. BENNER: I'll start and I'll give you a
18 chance to think a little bit, because you're asking a
19 very big question there.

20 The thing that came to my mind when you were
21 talking, and as I looked at sort of the draft indicators
22 of categories, et cetera, that you were talking about,
23 you know, there's a lot of great things in that, and
24 some really important indicators. And I really love the
25 way you're thinking about equity indicators, you know, a

1 lot and all.

2 And there's a danger of siloing this work. And
3 energy is so important, to life, you know, in our modern
4 society that figuring out what are the meaningful
5 indicators that really make that clear. And the one
6 that first came to my mind, you know, that electricity
7 infrastructure is actually a tremendously important
8 conduit for broadband. If we talk about rural, desert
9 economies struggling to get access to basic, basic
10 internet access in many parts, are there ways that we
11 can look at the energy infrastructure as a way to
12 facilitate broadband access.

13 You know, as we think about infrastructure
14 development and expanding renewable energies, what are
15 the job impacts of that? How are we prioritizing
16 getting employment to marginalized communities, using
17 that as a way of helping to support diversification of
18 our rural economies.

19 I'll mention there was a question online about
20 cooperatives. And it's sort of an invisible part of our
21 economy that in fact cooperatives provide roughly 12
22 percent of all electricity in America, and own something
23 like 42 percent of our electricity lines because they're
24 mostly in rural areas. They mostly date from the 1930s.

25 But what are the opportunities to promote more

1 cooperative ownership of energy production and
2 distribution in California, in this moment in our modern
3 economy. I think there's a lot of potential there.

4 So, I would just encourage you to think a little
5 more broadly than I can see, and I'm sure you are
6 already. But really thinking about what are the
7 indicators that can help us all see the interconnections
8 between energy and our own economy.

9 MS. PAZ: And I -- you said it in more detail
10 and I was thinking more generalities. But when you
11 asked the question several things came to mind.

12 One is that we can get stuck on, well, it takes
13 so long to include everyone and we're never going to
14 include everyone that we want to include or that should
15 be included. But that is why I think as in the process
16 you already know what timelines you have, what decisions
17 need to be made and when. So, using those as key
18 guidance for you.

19 And you're bright enough thinking this not as a
20 done process. I don't think we're ever going to be done
21 with equity as a people. In that sense, I'll give them
22 credit. Yeah, it's going to take a long time because we
23 might never be done.

24 But the importance, we could save time. And
25 part of why it takes so much time is we haven't been

1 thoughtful about including them in the beginning, right,
2 and that's what takes the most time.

3 The second though that came to mind, and I think
4 this is where Chris elaborated, is that where we are now
5 requires that intersectionality. And while you are
6 working on the energy segment, thinking about what are
7 the things that you can do in your jurisdiction that it
8 opens up venues for the next partner in line that is
9 going to require for us to get to, you know, the society
10 that we want to live in.

11 And I'll give you a clear example, one specific
12 example of what I mean about that. And I mentioned
13 about the needs for infrastructure in our communities.
14 And with part of our work we were successful in getting
15 a task force from the Coachella Valley Water District to
16 focus on communities facing disadvantages. Because our
17 communities do not have -- you know, the
18 infrastructure's not there.

19 And as a result of the conversations we had in
20 that task force, the staff from the water agency were in
21 the process of developing, and they have the funding
22 right, they were going to put in a line of water fixing.
23 And they in the past, and they acknowledged this, they
24 had never thought about what is the potential in the
25 future for those communities near that waterline to

1 connect?

2 Traditionally, the way they would have
3 approached that job was we're putting in the power -- in
4 the waterline, it's this size, and we know where it's
5 starting and we know why we're doing it. And they would
6 forget there were many communities, mobile home parks in
7 this case, that didn't have access to that
8 infrastructure and at some point could connect.

9 So, as a result of this task force and the
10 conversations it said, you know, we can make some
11 changes. It's not so much more costly to put a bigger
12 pipe and to leave the options for those connections for
13 those communities. It's something that they wouldn't
14 have done. And by the time those communities were ready
15 to connect, the cost would have been multiplied.

16 So, that's just an example of what I mean. What
17 can you do with the work that you're doing that starts
18 opening those opportunities that maybe we don't see
19 because we're used to doing our work in silos, and we
20 meet our objectives, but we need to think more about
21 what the intersections are.

22 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, I can ask a lot of
23 questions. But I do want to make sure, Commissioner
24 McAllister, would you want to ask, please?

25 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Thank you very much,

1 Vice Chair Gunda. I first of all just want to reiterate
2 or expand your thanks to Dr. Benner and Dr. Paz. I
3 really appreciate your -- your commitment and sort of
4 the depth of knowledge that comes from a long-term
5 commitment and really understanding the nuances of how
6 things have to work on the ground. And just thanks for
7 being here with us.

8 And, you know, Chris, it's been a long time
9 since we saw each other in person but we, you know, go
10 way back. And I just have enjoyed watching your career,
11 your fruitful career just sort of unfold. Including, we
12 overlapped a little bit I think at Berkeley, when we
13 were both getting our graduate degrees.

14 So, let's see, and I really appreciate your,
15 Chris, for bringing up the cooperative movement, because
16 I look at the national -- you know, the electric co-ops
17 for a long time, a good decade ago, and this country,
18 and internationally. And I agree that's just a really
19 powerful model for many things, and not just power.

20 So, I wanted to just note that Dr. Pastor had
21 talked about, you know, making sure, I think in response
22 to Vice Chair Gunda's question, or a comment, that we
23 have to make sure that our -- that these communities are
24 resourced. You know, and that's just pragmatically they
25 can't participate. I think all of you have said that,

1 they can't participate unless they have the resources to
2 actually create the flexibility in their lives for
3 community leaders, and community members, and thought
4 leaders, and local advocates to, you know, meaningfully
5 participate.

6 And then, I think the dialogue just now also
7 kind of highlighted the fact that these communities need
8 multiple problems addressed. I like this framework of
9 multiple benefits and trying to get twofers and
10 threefers from our particular investments.

11 I guess, you know, I struggle with this. Always
12 we talk about how to provide meaningful pathways for
13 participation and for getting results, you know, for
14 investment and results. Because at the end of the day
15 we're not going to solve the climate problem or the
16 energy transition problem unless we solve all of these
17 other socially sort of intransigent, historically
18 intransigent inequities.

19 And so, so we have to kind of do -- you know, we
20 have to do kind of a broad-based effort. We being, you
21 know, all of us. Not just the state, but at all levels
22 of government and community.

23 But anyway, this is a long way of getting to a
24 question. So, Silvia, you mentioned the water district
25 as providing some resources for local organization. You

1 know, in order for us, you know, say, in the energy
2 sphere in order for us to kind of create that space for
3 meaningful participation we need functional, practical
4 ways to reach down into communities and actually have
5 that dialogue and facilitate that dialogue.

6 So, are there templates that you're aware of, so
7 that would be one, sort of from, you know, state,
8 regional, local, you know, hyper local, ways to -- that
9 have worked, that have really shown results. You know,
10 we can't go funding things that don't have some metrics
11 attached to them so, you know, we need these metrics.
12 And to some extent these are just broad resource needs.

13 But is there -- do you have any suggestions
14 about how we can fund, you know, with dollars and
15 resources sort of the -- in ways that are efficient and
16 effective at the same time?

17 You know, we have to be accountable with state
18 resources. If we get other funds, you know, we have to
19 say what they're being used for. And we, ourselves,
20 have to be accountable. But we also need to channel
21 those resources to the local level and the community
22 level and find ways to do that, that are efficient.

23 So, are there any particular programs, or
24 models, or templates that you would point to that we
25 could use for inspiration or for, you know, as a model?

1 MS. PAZ: Maybe I can start just with some
2 thoughts that come to mind as I'm hearing that question.
3 And to honor the work that the community has invested in
4 getting some of the changes, like the one that I
5 mentioned at the water district. It really resulted,
6 one, from the movement, right. Like our communities had
7 been organizing for some time because we didn't have
8 representation on that water board. And as a result,
9 our communities had looked and faced the challenges that
10 they now do.

11 So, what I think about when I hear your question
12 and I understand the responsibility that we must have
13 with our dollars, the public dollars, but it's really an
14 investment on the capacity development of our
15 organizations, of the people that we engage through our
16 organizations. Because that's really what made the
17 difference.

18 And so far, the movement in the Coachella Valley
19 has been funded through foundations, particularly the
20 California Endowment that invested ten years in the
21 Coachella Valley, right. And that's the investment that
22 allowed us, as a community, to bring in attorneys that
23 could help us challenge the water board. Because at the
24 time the water board was elected at large, so it
25 disenfranchised our communities. We didn't have a

1 voice.

2 So, again, understanding the question that
3 you're asking and maybe giving you a totally complete
4 different answer, but it's really that investment in the
5 capacity of the community so that we can continue to
6 make the changes that are there.

7 And oftentimes that capacity is not invested in
8 at the government level, right. Like capacity is
9 invested at the foundations. And we've seen more and
10 more with this administration that partnership with
11 local -- private philanthropy and government dollars.
12 But really there's, you know, reconsidering what roles
13 does the state agencies have in investing in that
14 capacity.

15 And we are in a critical time. And I know this
16 conversation's not about lithium -- but even in those
17 conversations, when there's been conversations about
18 developing community benefits agreements, the community
19 needs to have the same resources that the people on the
20 other side, the developers are going to have when
21 they're negotiating those agreements, right.

22 So, there's really a need again, and I want to
23 emphasize, for that investment in the capacity.

24 And then, the most, and I'll use just local,
25 where we are and the model that we were able to get with

1 the Coachella Valley Water District in setting up a
2 infrastructure committee, I think it's the best model I
3 can point to in both ways. One because it came from,
4 you know, a lot of movement and organizing, but also
5 because we were able to then find an agency that was
6 willing to create this task force and really start
7 addressing the needs that our community has.

8 DR. BENNER: And I'll just say, Commissioner
9 McAllister, one it's a real pleasure to be interacting
10 with you again. Thank you. It's been a long time.

11 But when you were asking about models, the thing
12 that came to mind and I'll describe what came to mind,
13 and then what I think what might be a possibility in
14 California. That when you're talking about resources
15 what came to mind was the Alaska Permanent Fund. I
16 think many people know about that at the moment.

17 But you know, from oil revenues in the north
18 shore in Alaska, in the 1970s, they took a portion of
19 the revenue to create a permanent fund for the benefit
20 of residents of Alaska. And then, of course that got
21 returned to people in the form of a dividend and has
22 been since, and has become tremendously popular.

23 And I think it really taps into this notion of
24 our environment. And whether we're talking about, you
25 know, taking lithium from geothermal brine and

1 generating energy, or whether we're talking about solar
2 energy, or even wind, you know, those are resources that
3 are in our environment that is a collective inheritance
4 of all of us. Yet, who benefits from that?

5 And, you know, I think the challenge of the
6 Alaska Permanent Fund model is that it's a very
7 individualized dividend system.

8 So, in talking about resourcing communities, and
9 here's the idea, why don't we think about creating a
10 California Energy Solidarity Dividend Fund that would be
11 devoted to supporting community organizations to be more
12 equitable players in energy decision making in the
13 state. And it would be funded from, you know, a tax, a
14 portion of revenue generated from all forms of energy in
15 the state.

16 You could structure it in such a way so it's a
17 disproportionately higher tax on nonrenewable resources
18 and it might actually accelerate our transition. Just
19 brainstorming ideas. Energy Solidarity Dividend Fund.

20 COMMISSIONER MCALLISTER: Thank you very much.
21 That's exactly the kind of out-of-the-box, well,
22 thinking that we need. And I think, you know, there's
23 an increasing multi-agency discussion. You know, the
24 Energy Commission and our energy agency, you know,
25 counterparts aren't the only ones with this kind of

1 thinking about this. And, you know, we have housing, we
2 have transportation, we have all sorts of, you know,
3 infrastructure related problems in California that we
4 need to solve, and we'll only benefit from better
5 community organization, and participation, and
6 inclusion.

7 So, I really like that idea and I think that's
8 worthy of, you know, carrying forward some version of
9 that conversation and figuring out how we can have it,
10 you know, across agencies, beyond the IEPR even. So,
11 thanks for that, I really appreciate it. And thanks
12 again for being here.

13 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, thank you, Commissioner
14 McAllister.

15 So, given the time, I know we are running way
16 late, but I would love to have questions from the
17 attendees today.

18 You know, for those of you in the room, if you
19 filled one of these -- but, you know, just for access,
20 if you want to just come up here and provide your
21 question, that could be a way to do it.

22 MS. FIGUEROA: Is this your public comment?

23 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: It's actually Q&A.

24 MS. RAITT: Yeah, so this is Heather. This is
25 if you have any questions, and then after that we'll go

1 to public comment. So, you're welcome to come up here
2 and ask a question, if you like.

3 MS. GALLARDO: And to clarify, with my Public
4 Advisor hat on right now, so Q&A is more interactive, so
5 you can ask a question to the panelists and they can
6 respond to you, whereas public comment is more about
7 making a statement. There's no interaction. It's just
8 you make a statement on the record. So, either way,
9 there's nothing wrong with either. Just want to make
10 sure folks are aware so they can choose what they prefer
11 to do.

12 MS. FIGUEROA: From here or where would you
13 like?

14 MS. RAITT: You can come --

15 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, if you have a comment,
16 I think it's just -- we have just this mic.

17 MS. FIGUEROA: Okay, just --

18 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, you can probably do it
19 from there and then it would be okay.

20 MS. FIGUEROA: Yeah. So I guess a question.
21 Hi, my name is Janira Figueroa. I'm from the Comité
22 Civico Del Valle, a community-based organization here
23 from Imperial Valley.

24 One question that I had is for the topic of
25 inclusion of more CBOs in local schools. What do you

1 see as future workshops or a future report of having
2 more an extensive reach? Because although the
3 workshops, we appreciate them greatly, that there's more
4 inclusion of these areas, coming all the way down here
5 to Imperial Valley. You know, what are the ties that
6 you're making or the connections? Is it just CBOs, is
7 it local governments? What is this like so it can be a
8 more informed conversation with the community.

9 MS. GALLARDO: So, let me turn on my video.
10 This is Noemí Gallardo, functioning as Public Advisor in
11 the interim, also Chief of Staff to Chair Hochschild.

12 So, we do want to connect with everyone
13 possible. So, like Silvia mentioned, it's probably
14 impossible to do that. So, we're leaning heavily on
15 those types of entities and organizations that do have
16 those connections so that we can reach as many people as
17 possible.

18 And we know that we're not going to be experts
19 in all regions. I'm from the Central Coast, so I do
20 have some connections there, right, when we go to that
21 workshop. However, like I don't have as many
22 connections here. I've been making more friends, you
23 know, and learning more about the dynamics here and
24 who's involved.

25 But again, we need to lean on those folks who

1 are local, who do understand and can help us reach out.

2 So, we have been talking to multiple community-
3 based organizations. You know, there are some larger
4 than others. So, Alianza, Comite Civico, and Leadership
5 Council. We've been leaning on them a lot. And then,
6 we've also talked to other smaller organizations. So,
7 we're receptive to everyone. We would love to, you
8 know, learn who else is interested, who else would be
9 willing to, you know, talk with us, share information,
10 provide us expertise, whatever it is we'd be receptive.

11 We are talking to the local governments, to
12 Imperial Irrigation District for example, and we'll be
13 doing this elsewhere as well. You know, whatever
14 entities are in the other regions.

15 And I think, you know, we should also be talking
16 to businesses, where we're going to try to get a meeting
17 with the Chambers of Commerce here. We weren't able to
18 make that happen during the period we're here but, you
19 know, that would be something we'd look forward to
20 doing.

21 We've been talking also to the legislative
22 offices, Senator Hueso and Assemblymember Garcia.
23 They've been very gracious in trying to help us make
24 more connections.

25 And, you know, we'd appreciate any input you

1 have now, or later through public comment if there's,
2 you know, something else or different that we should be
3 doing.

4 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, and I just want to add
5 to that. You know, at the top we kind of -- this is
6 something we're trying to -- we have some idea on how to
7 do it, but really like trying to learn. So, I think
8 it's an engagement. You know, we would love to hear
9 your thoughts.

10 The idea for us was to begin the process, but
11 really keep it a living and dynamic way of both doing
12 work at our agency, but also address the broader state.

13 So, would love to hear your comments and then
14 that would kind of help us to move forward better.

15 MS. GALLARDO: One other group that we really
16 would like to engage with, that I think this is where we
17 need more of your help, is residents, right. Maybe not
18 associated with an organization or, you know, any type
19 of entity. Entrepreneurs who are working from home,
20 like Silvia mentioned earlier. It would be great to,
21 you know, talk more about how can we support what
22 they're doing, help them, you know, achieve prosperity.

23 So, you know, we're extremely receptive. We did
24 meet that residents this week and that was really
25 wonderful to hear about their personal experience. And

1 that helps inform, you know, what we're thinking about
2 when we're developing policies.

3 Several of the things that Silvia mentioned,
4 actually we heard it from local residents. So, it's
5 like, you know, that double validation, highlighting,
6 exclamation point.

7 MS. FIGUEROA: I guess another question that I
8 had already, in the report, in the drafts that you have
9 so far are there any direct measures or recommendations
10 that you're making specifically on the -- in equity of
11 clean energy, especially in communities that have
12 disadvantage? Are there any of the like guidelines or
13 recommendations that you're making specifically on the
14 topic of energy and clean energy?

15 MS. GALLARDO: So, if I may?

16 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yes.

17 MS. GALLARDO: So, those are the types of things
18 that we will want to talk about in the report. So,
19 we're not making any decisions right now. This is what
20 we're doing, we're listening, we're learning, we're
21 trying to figure out what's resonating with, you know,
22 with people we're talking to. What are they
23 highlighting as things that are important.

24 So, no decisions right now. We're not saying
25 no/yes, we're putting it all on the table to consider.

1 And then, once we are able to, you know, once we finish
2 the three workshops, have more information, go through
3 all of the public comment, written and verbal, then
4 we'll be able to have a better sense of what it is.

5 And we're hoping, too, that we can provide a
6 draft report, so that the public also has a chance to
7 comment on that before it goes to the next phase. We're
8 a little tight on our timeline, which we indicated
9 earlier is a bit of a challenge. And at the same time,
10 we're going to do our best to try to get it out there
11 and, again, just receive more input.

12 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, I think just adding to
13 that, so we've historically struggled with the IEPR
14 process, it's only a year. So, by the time you scope in
15 February, you know, you have to have that report out by
16 the end of the year.

17 So, as we begin to look at these big themes that
18 we need to work on, we're starting to launch independent
19 proceedings that can be multiyear, and then we can
20 continue the conversations. So, you know, we might
21 consider doing something like that for environmental
22 justice and equity at the agency, just kind of having a
23 continuing, you know, work on this.

24 So, as Noemí mentioned, you know, we really like
25 hearing right now. I mean I feel, just going to take

1 off my roll and Commissioner hat aside for a minute, you
2 know, just speaking from heart. Right, I'm a person of
3 color, came here as an immigrant. My experiences are
4 really limited to a subset. And, you know, just
5 recognizing the enormity of diversity of opinion and how
6 do we bring all of our stories together and address,
7 it's going to take time.

8 And so, we're trying to figure out a framework
9 for a framework on how to move this forward. So, that's
10 kind of where we are. So, we would love for you to
11 engage and, you know, help us to figure this out as well
12 as you can.

13 MS. FIGUEROA: Thank you. Yeah, I think that's
14 a great point of having those recommendations available
15 and then having that portion for comment, that way
16 there's more of that back and forth. That way, it's
17 like we see if the workshop information was -- did make
18 an impact. I'm finished with my points for this section.

19 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Thank you so much, yeah.

20 Anybody else in the room want to have a
21 question?

22 MS. RAITT: Should we go to Zoom? So, this is
23 Heather Raitt. So, Dorothy, Noemí, would you mind
24 reading the questions?

25 MS. MURIMI: Hi Heather.

1 MS. RAITT: Go ahead.

2 MS. MURIMI: Thank you. So, we do have a couple
3 of questions from the Zoom.

4 One from Roger Lin: Will the CEC use the
5 indicators or other methodology to inform the
6 consideration of nonenergy benefits, none? That is what
7 was mentioned in prior workshops. And Commissioner
8 McAllister had inquired from the CEC DER workshops, how
9 we would quantify that. And will the CEC then include
10 those nonenergy benefits in cost-effective analyses that
11 drive energy and climate decisions? That would get to
12 Ms. Paz's great recommendation to actually implement
13 this work -- sorry, that just disappeared.

14 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, I think that question
15 was also being answered, typed. So, Roger, I just want
16 to first of all appreciate your continued engagement on
17 this issue. And yes, I think, you know, our current
18 consideration is across the different proceedings how do
19 we make NEPS meaningful in the analysis, and really bake
20 them in, and make them available to our sister agencies
21 on the different analytical work we've done for planning
22 considerations, absolutely. We'd love to follow up on
23 the conversation further.

24 Do you have anything?

25 MS. GALLARDO: No, I agree, uh-hum.

1 MS. MURIMI: Oh, pardon me. The last question.
2 the last question seems like something we can definitely
3 answer offline. But it's a question on whether we have
4 -- the CEC as an agency has any resistance to posting
5 their workshops and public meeting information on other
6 platforms? And that, we can work internally and give an
7 answer to that.

8 So, back to you, Heather.

9 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Dorothy. So, if there's
10 -- it looks like there's no more question online. So, I
11 think it's time to go to public comment.

12 And so, again, the public comment period is
13 really we welcome your input and it will be -- we won't
14 be responding to questions at that point. So, if
15 there's anyone in the room -- thank you -- if there's
16 anyone in the room who would like to make a comment.
17 And the comments will be limited to three minutes per
18 person. Yes, it's a one minute -- one person per
19 organization.

20 If you could please introduce yourself and spell
21 your names?

22 My name is Janira Igueroa, J-A-N-I-R-A and F-I-
23 G-U-E-R-O-A. I'm from the Comite Civico Del Valle.

24 So, some points that I wanted to make relative
25 to some of the presentations would be that, you know

1 again, inclusion of our organizations, getting at as
2 much as possible getting the process more open to
3 community members. I would greatly stress local,
4 especially in this area, local governments. Right,
5 local government's the big connection that people may
6 have, a reliable source that they trust. Since there
7 can be a disconnect from a resident all the way to CEC
8 and, you know we recognize that. Especially in areas
9 like this with great big barriers.

10 We have Imperial Valley has the second highest
11 unemployment rate in the country, right. That can be
12 challenging for the input to be made on such a short
13 notice.

14 Another one I would like to bring up, something
15 that was brought up in some of the presentations, a lack
16 of clean energy infrastructure. It's a big thing that
17 we struggle with here.

18 And when we're talking about the topic of
19 equity, you know, we see the inequity here, especially
20 in Southern California. You know, here in the Imperial
21 Valley, Coachella Valley, all these Salton Sea areas,
22 specifically Imperial Valley, we see a lack of clean
23 energy, a lack of renewable energy being available to
24 residents.

25 You know, Californian city there are plenty of

1 clean energy programs, but the information isn't relayed
2 down here or it's taken to organizations on such short
3 notice that then CPOs can take on the role of having to
4 distribute this information. So, making this
5 information more reliable, making more connections.

6 And I would also say like the mention of PSAs,
7 the mention of, you know, social media. Again, back to
8 the point, social media is great, but if we don't have
9 broadband, if we don't have access to internet, if our
10 desert communities don't have access to basic internet,
11 then that can be an issue of the information is getting
12 distributed, but they can't receive it. Right.

13 So again, putting more boots on the ground, as
14 they like to say, getting more local engagement.

15 And the specific ones that we see, again energy
16 efficiency that should be widely accessible, yes? But
17 is the information being given directly to residents and
18 community members? How can they participate in
19 California's goal of 100 percent clean energy, right.

20 And in Imperial Valley, alone, our electric
21 vehicle chargers, our electric vehicle infrastructure is
22 not the best. Comite Civico put one of the first
23 publicly state-funded EV chargers, and we hope to have
24 more, but that can only be done without the efforts of
25 California, and the California Energy Commission

1 recognizing that there is inequity and we have been
2 ignored for time. Thank you.

3 MS. RAITT: Thank you. This is Heather.

4 Is there anybody else in the audience who would
5 like to make some comments? Seeing none, we'll move on
6 to the audience online and Zoom.

7 So again, if you wanted to make comments, just
8 use the raise hand function to let us know. And if
9 you're on the phone, press *9 to let us know.

10 So, I'll start with Adrianna Ivory. And
11 Adrianna, please spell your name for the record and let
12 us know who you're representing, if any organizations.

13 MS. IVORY: Thank you. My name is Adrianna
14 Ivory. That's A-D-R-I-A-N-N-A I-V-O-R-Y. I'm with the
15 Center for Biological Diversity's Energy Justice
16 Program.

17 I just want to relay the importance of
18 distributed energy resources in the IEPR's focus on
19 energy equity and environmental justice, including both
20 nonenergy benefits and Equity Indicators should inform
21 that discussion.

22 It's imperative that the state focus on DERs as
23 an efficient path to a clean energy future and it's not
24 possible to do that without considering Equity
25 Indicators in the multitude of NEBs involved.

1 These include like job creation, public health
2 improvements and an avoidance of harsh impacts on
3 biodiversity, air and water quality, and land use.

4 It's difficult to quantify these benefits, but
5 it's something that we have to do. Essentially,
6 considering nonenergy benefits in meeting the needs of
7 our communities, especially as you've heard those
8 disadvantaged communities that are being hit the hardest
9 by current access, resiliency and affordability issues.

10 Equity Indicators highlight these areas for
11 improvements and identifying these needs is a critical
12 step in effectively deploying distributed energy
13 resources. In turn distributed energy resources will
14 provide a way for community members to play an active
15 role in helping the state achieve its climate goals.

16 The IEPR has to properly integrate and recognize
17 the importance of DERs as a climate solution. In doing
18 so, Equity Indicators and NEBs should be used to inform
19 the cost effectiveness evaluation of DERs. The IEPR
20 can't fulfill its promises on energy equity and
21 environmental justice, and the state can't meet
22 decarbonization goals without these DERs.

23 Further, the Commission can't properly evaluate
24 DERs without thorough consideration of nonenergy
25 benefits and the Equity Indicators that we've been

1 discussing today to highlight community need.

2 Later this afternoon, we're going to hear a
3 discussion of community engagement, which is also an
4 integral piece in determining how to best deploy DERs
5 and consider the nonenergy benefits from like a ground
6 up model that puts community needs at the forefront of
7 the discussion.

8 So, it's critical for the IEPR, again, to
9 adequately recognize and integrate DERs, and in doing so
10 to fully consider Equity Indicators in the cost
11 effectiveness evaluation. Thank you.

12 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Adrianna.

13 This is Heather Raitt. Next we will move to
14 Ryan Pickering. And Ryan, go ahead and unmute your
15 line, and please spell your name for the record and your
16 affiliation, if any.

17 MR. PICKERING. Hello. My name is Ryan
18 Pickering and I am representing myself on the call,
19 though I do volunteer with a few different organizations
20 in California.

21 I am 34 years old. I have been a solar panel
22 installer for the last 12 years. And my experience in
23 my field has informed my opinion. And my opinion is
24 that we are not talking about the elephant in the room,
25 which is nuclear energy.

1 Nuclear energy is clean energy. We invented
2 nuclear energy in the United States in 1942 and we have
3 had the safest and most powerful experience with this
4 technology of any country in the world.

5 I understand that nuclear energy has become a
6 sensitive matter for folks in terms of fear, and I'm
7 here to assure you that nuclear energy is one of the
8 safest forms of energy as well.

9 Today, California has one nuclear power plant,
10 though there were plans for many more in the past. That
11 nuclear power plant is unfortunately called Diablo
12 Canyon Power Plant, a remnant of the emission system
13 that oppressed indigenous people in California.

14 The Petco Coast that the power plant is located
15 on is indigenous land. And the area today, in San Luis
16 Obispo, is a marine sanctuary, and it also houses rare
17 birds.

18 The State of California is planning to close
19 Diablo Canyon Power Plant in 2024 and 2025. Diablo
20 Canyon makes 15 percent of our clean energy in the
21 state, 24 hours a day. Diablo Canyon makes 10 percent
22 of California's total energy and is the largest power
23 plant in California.

24 As many of you know, Diablo Canyon has been in
25 the news recently as the Governor of California, and

1 some other prominent folks are considering changing,
2 pressuring, you know, various groups to change their
3 opinion.

4 The CEC is part of this decision and equity is
5 central to this decision because keeping power
6 affordable, and reliable, and clean is the center of our
7 equity mandate.

8 Therefore, as a solar installer, I am
9 encouraging all of you to research the matter in Diablo
10 Canyon Power Plant with humility, and courage, and
11 integrity, and honesty because what you will find is a
12 long and complex history of hard work, indigenous --
13 violations of indigenous people that can be righted, and
14 an opportunity for less power outages in California
15 which kills Californians and hurts our prosperity.

16 I want to thank you all for your civil service.
17 My name is Ryan Pickering and I appreciate everyone.
18 Thank you.

19 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Ryan.

20 This is Heather Raitt. Next, we'll go to
21 Mariela Loera. Please go ahead and unmute your line,
22 and spell your name and any affiliation for the record,
23 please.

24 MS. LOERA: Thank you. So, this is Mariela
25 Loera with Leadership Counsel for Justice and

1 Accountability. That is M-A-R-I-E-L-A and the last name
2 is L-O-E-R-A.

3 I do want to start by saying thank you for
4 creating this initial space, and especially thank you to
5 the CEC for its collaboration with us, not just
6 yesterday where they dedicated time to speak with us and
7 directly with community residents, but other
8 collaboration that we've done. And I look forward to
9 more collaboration.

10 So, I think that we need to start questioning
11 how we're going to ensure that we have direct feedback
12 from community residents on the ground, on this topic
13 that we're talking about now. Because it is important
14 to ensure that those on the ground can be involved in
15 the collaboration on what, like I would call this, a
16 brainstorming session for participation and planning for
17 participation. So, then communities to be engaged
18 starting now.

19 So, I think that there was a lost opportunity in
20 making this space a little bit more accessible to
21 community by doing things like providing the slides in
22 Spanish, providing translation not only in Spanish, but
23 also in Purépecha for this Zoom event. And also making
24 this event during a time that's more accessible for
25 community and not during working hours. And not so

1 long, because it's even a lot for us. I mean it's a lot
2 for me.

3 So, in terms of the Equity Indicators, just some
4 comments on that. I think that, like it was mentioned
5 in other comments, access to technology, and clean
6 technology, and energy reliability that was included in
7 the 2018 version is still a very big priority for
8 community in the Salton Sea Region and throughout the
9 state.

10 So, it's important to have conversations with
11 community. And I hope that from the conversations you
12 all had yesterday it was clear that it's important to
13 know what and how to make this accessible to them, and
14 know what is their lived experience. And not just the
15 technology that they're using now, and the need for
16 technology that they're using now, but also when you're
17 going to bring in new technology what does that really
18 look like, and how can you actually make that accessible
19 to folks.

20 I'm talking from our experience in our building
21 decarbonization work that we've also been engaged with,
22 and how difficult it's also been for us to have those
23 conversations with community because you're asking them
24 to change a part of their life that they're already used
25 to, and already have needs in.

1 So, with this, another question that I had, a
2 rhetorical question that I had, what does it mean when
3 you describe the 2020 (indiscernible) -- and how are you
4 going to make them dynamic and explorable, while at the
5 same time accessible to community? Because I think
6 merging those two can be difficult, and I guess bringing
7 in community to that conversation itself is important.

8 And I would invite all of you to also have these
9 conversations, as you already have, with community-based
10 organizations for those specific regions. Because,
11 again, this is a statewide plan, right, so it has to be
12 personalized for each region.

13 And then lastly, on my ten seconds, I just want
14 to highlight really quickly, I really like Dr. Benner's
15 spectrum on engagement and highlighting what he
16 described as not engagement, I think it was talking to
17 some, and meaningful engagement and that was really
18 great to see. Thank you.

19 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Mariela.

20 Next is Ramon Elias. And Ramon, if you could
21 please spell your name and state any affiliation for the
22 record.

23 MR. ELIAS: My name is Ramon Elias. I am a -- I
24 live in Santa Maria, California. I'm speaking on behalf
25 of myself, although I am an active participant in the

1 Regional Climate Collaborative Equity Advisory
2 Committee, although I don't represent them in this
3 comment that I wish to provide.

4 And my comment is this, the costs associated
5 with climate change, including such things like
6 modifications to existing housing, electricity supplies,
7 which obviously is of concern to this committee.
8 Transportation and travel, food production, clothing
9 manufacturing, healthcare, water, garbage, sewer
10 services, communications, the internet, entertainment.
11 All of those -- all of those segments are being affected
12 by the cost of energy, which is also being affected by
13 the cost of climate change.

14 Don't get me wrong, I am not -- I do believe
15 that we need to do something about this. However, these
16 costs are disproportionately impacting the disabled, the
17 unemployed, low- and fixed-income members of our
18 communities.

19 And, unfortunately, I do not see, in looking at
20 the Commission's website for these workshops, where
21 these impacts are being addressed or discussed by the
22 Commission. State law does require the fair treatment
23 of all races, cultures, incomes with respect to
24 everything we're discussing here.

25 And I would like to see the Commission do a more

1 comprehensive job of assessing these associated costs
2 and identifying ways of assigning fair treatment to all.

3 Once again, I thank all of you for the work
4 you're doing, and I think we need to do more. Thank you
5 very much.

6 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Ramon.

7 This is Heather Raitt. Next is Roger Lin, so
8 open your line. And Roger, please spell your name and
9 affiliation for the record, please.

10 MR. LIN: Good afternoon everyone, Roger Lin, R-
11 O-G-E-R L-I-N, and I'm an attorney with the Center for
12 Biological Diversity.

13 I just want to thank you for raising my question
14 in the Q&A, but also want to clarify and, again, agree
15 with Ms. Paz's, from Alianza, great recommendation on
16 having -- how do we implement these indicators or these
17 similar indicators to drive change.

18 This is consistent with Dr. Pastor's comments
19 focused on our economy. We have to focus on our
20 economy, so we have to consider the local economic
21 benefits that are out there for disadvantaged
22 communities. Those are not considered right now.

23 We have to consider that equity, to Dr. Pastor's
24 second comment, equity benefits the economy. Okay, but
25 we're only going to realize that if the social costs are

1 actually considered in our cost effective valuations.

2 And overall, to Dr. Pastor's final comment, we
3 have to bake in equity. So, it's great to do this
4 community engagement and to consider all of these
5 factors, but until we get off of the kids' table and
6 actually put those factors into the cost effectiveness
7 tests that drive our energy decision, I'm worried that
8 it won't be meaningful.

9 At the same time, as we're having this, the IEPR
10 has been developed in large part on the Scoping Plan,
11 the Air Resources Board's analysis that omits all of
12 these costs, and actually authorizes a lot of carbon
13 capture. That is exactly the resource that Dr. Pastor
14 warned against.

15 So, I see two different fronts operating here,
16 and at the same time the Scoping Plan analysis does not
17 consider distributed energy resources. So, how do we
18 make these tracks, you know, this great track focused on
19 equity talk to the rest of the IEPR process?

20 I want to thank the Energy Commission for their
21 efforts to do this community engagement, though. It's
22 refreshing to see, for sure. But then the next trick is
23 then how do we make that meaningful. And I look forward
24 to hearing more about that this afternoon. And thank
25 you for the time.

1 MS. RAITT: Thank you.

2 This is Heather Raitt. So, the next public
3 comment from Fabi Lao. Please spell your name and state
4 any affiliation for the record.

5 MS. LAO: Yeah, can you hear me okay?

6 MS. RAITT: Yes.

7 MS. LAO: Okay great, excellent. Thank you. My
8 name is Fabi Lao, that's F-A-B-I L-A-O. I'm the Senior
9 Equity Policy Manager in Center for Sustainable Energy.
10 Thank you for allowing me to speak today.

11 CSE strongly supports the proposed establishment
12 of an equity and environmental justice framework as part
13 of the 2022 IEPR update, and specifically its inclusion
14 of equity designations and nonenergy considerations.

15 As the Energy Commission undertakes this
16 important effort, we encourage robust coordination with
17 other efforts to both leverage existing resources and
18 ensure consistency. Which I'm glad that, you know, Ms.
19 Gallardo brought up during her presentation earlier
20 today.

21 We actually, CSE also strongly urges the Energy
22 Commission to prioritize using a foundational -- as a
23 foundational resource the California Public Utilities
24 Commission Comprehensive Guide on Key Equity and
25 Environmental Justice Definitions and Concepts, which is

1 outlined in the CPUC's Environmental and Social Justice
2 Action Plan, version 2.0.

3 You know, significant staff time and stakeholder
4 engagement has been devoted to the development of those
5 definitions in that plan, including incorporating
6 feedback from equity and environmental justice advocates
7 and communities, as well from the CPUC's and Energy
8 Commission's Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group.

9 For example, the ESJ action plan's definitions
10 for environmental and social justice communities aligns
11 with the DACAG's disadvantaged communities definition
12 outlining this equity framework.

13 Alignment of equity and EJ definitions used by
14 the CPUC and other agencies is key because it will
15 ensure continuity will exist in definitions and create a
16 more efficient process. Currently, these definitions
17 are being included in policies, in proceedings, and also
18 criteria for programs across different agencies. The
19 more alignment there can be, the less duplicative
20 efforts, the less redundancy, the less confusing it's
21 going to be for community members as they navigate
22 policy processes and programs that they're interested in
23 applying or participating in.

24 So, thank you for your time.

25 MS. RAITT: Thank you.

1 This is Heather Raitt. So, I want to ask
2 anybody on the phone who would like to make comments,
3 please press *9 and that will let us know that you'd
4 like to make comments.

5 And one last call for anybody on Zoom, if you'd
6 like to make a comment you can press the raised hand,
7 which looks like a high 5.

8 Okay, we have one more -- oh, no, I'm sorry.
9 Actually, Ryan Pickering we already heard previous, so I
10 don't know if that was an accident.

11 One more. All right, I'm not seeing any new
12 hands raised, so I think --

13 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Ryan, you already made a
14 comment. Would you be kind enough to make a comment
15 again at the end of the workshop, if you would like to
16 add additional comments. Thank you.

17 MS. RAITT: Great. Thank you, Chair. So, I
18 think we're done with public comments.

19 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: All right, thank you. Thank
20 you all again for, you know, taking the time to be a
21 part of this discussion. It's really nice to see the
22 students kind of staying through all the rest of the
23 morning, as well as everybody who spoke.

24 You know, a special thanks to Dr. Benner, and
25 Silvia, it's an absolute pleasure being able to spend

1 some time with you and learning from you. And Dr.
2 Pastor, as well. And everybody who made comments.

3 I know we want to start at 1:30 again. I would
4 like to ask everybody if you want to delay that a little
5 bit? I want to go through the entire program -- so I
6 need recommendations. Should we start at 1:45, 2:00?

7 MS. RAITT: Is anyone here, are folks planning
8 to stay for the afternoon, can you raise your hand?
9 This is folks in the room. Okay, great.

10 And then, can you also let me know, does 1:45
11 sound good to you? Raise your hand if it sounds good.
12 It's a good plan.

13 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Two more hands.

14 MS. RAITT: I think that's less. All right,
15 what about 1:30? That's going to give us a 15-minute
16 break. Okay, maybe 1:45, then.

17 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: All right. So, we'll
18 reconvene at 1:45. Apologies again for delaying the
19 start of the meeting this morning. We will learn how to
20 do this better. So, 1:45 we will reconvene. Thank you.

21 MS. RAITT: Thank you.

22 (Off the record at 1:13 p.m.)

23 (On the record at 2:03 p.m.)

24 MS. RAITT: All right, welcome back everybody.
25 I'm Heather Raitt. Thank you so much for your patience

1 as we're navigating all this, and learning, and just
2 getting better. So, just appreciate your patience as
3 we're moving along.

4 So, just before we get back in, I just want to
5 remind everybody that we are recording and we have a
6 written transcript that will be available in about a
7 month. And we'll have an audio recording posted on our
8 website very shortly.

9 And then, at the end of the afternoon we'll have
10 another opportunity for written comments -- I mean, for
11 oral comments. So, we'll have discussion time, I'll
12 talk about that later. And we'll have a lot of Q&A
13 options. And then, we will have that public comment
14 period where it's really just a one way, where we're
15 listening to you, but we're not responding.

16 And so, with that, I think unless the
17 Commissioner has any remarks.

18 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, thank you all and
19 welcome back. If anybody can confirm in the chat that
20 it's coming through, the voice, you can all hear us on
21 Zoom?

22 MS. RAITT: You're audible on Zoom.

23 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Thank you. Thank you so
24 much. And also, I quickly wanted to respond to a Q&A
25 question about closing Zoom and then closing the chat in

1 Q&A. I believe our team has access to that, and then
2 we'll make sure that's available either through a direct
3 interaction or -- well, Heather will figure it out. So,
4 thank you and we'll try to be more sensitive to that
5 moving forward.

6 I just want to again acknowledge the speakers
7 from this morning, as well as commentators. Excellent
8 comments this morning. And I think there's a few
9 things, for those of you who are just joining the
10 afternoon session, that we heard this morning loud and
11 clear. Ensuring that equity is baked in, not as an
12 afterthought, but it's really baked into the process.

13 Given that historically we've not had the voices
14 at the table, that we will be ready for some conflicts
15 and it's okay to have conflicts, but really take it as
16 an opportunity to lean in, as Dr. Benner said, and then
17 just keep the conversation going.

18 And also being able to measure when do we engage
19 the communities, how we engage the communities, and also
20 the quality engagement, and the importance of using some
21 of the indicators that we're think about as a way to
22 really develop criteria for community engagement and
23 thinking through equity.

24 So, I just wanted to at the top level say thank
25 you all for being a part of the conversation this

1 morning, but also coming back. So again, as Heather
2 mentioned, we are trying to learn how to do this better
3 and we'll get better at it as we go.

4 So, with that I will hand it to Heather to go
5 through the afternoon session, which is really around
6 thinking through regional engagement models, as well as
7 really improving our community connections.

8 So, Heather, to you.

9 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Vice Chair.

10 So, I'd just like to go ahead and introduce our
11 first speaker for this afternoon is Maria Lemus, and
12 she's the Executive Director with Vision y Compromiso.
13 And she is joined with some colleagues today from
14 Promotoras Comunitarias.

15 And I am so sorry, I don't know how to pronounce
16 very well, but I will learn to do better.

17 And they're representing the promoter model that
18 enables promoters and community health work as liaisons
19 between the communities, and health and social service
20 providers. And after their presentation, the Promotoras
21 will participate in discussion with the audience, and so
22 we will break out into a smaller group at that point.

23 But, so right now, I'd just like Maria to go
24 ahead, thank you.

25 MS. LEMUS: Thank you very much. Thank you for

1 the invitation to join you on this day. And thank you,
2 everybody in the audience for being here. Although it
3 is a nice respite from being out in your 120 degree
4 heat, at least that's what it feels like to those of us
5 who are not from this area.

6 I'm going to share a little bit about Vision y
7 Compromiso and the network of promotoras and community
8 health workers. (Speaking Spanish)

9 So, if you can just -- I'll just talk a little
10 bit in intro as she puts up the slide, the first one.

11 Vision y Compromiso was founded over 20 years
12 ago, about 23 years ago, by a group of leaders at that
13 time who were known as promotoras, only. And we came
14 together to start talking about all the resources that
15 we needed. Not that were out there, but the resources
16 that we needed as leaders in the community.

17 And we decided that we wanted to just get to
18 know each other. And when we discovered 10 of us, we
19 discovered 20 of us, we discovered 30, and before you
20 knew it there were a lot of promotoras in California.

21 And so, we said, well why don't we meet, and
22 talk and share. So, we kept meeting, we kept talking,
23 we kept sharing. And in 2002 we formed -- we came
24 together, a mini convening, and it was there were about
25 150 of us from all over California.

1 At that time promotoras were mostly volunteers.
2 They were affiliated with churches, with organizations,
3 or they were mothers who were donating their time and
4 volunteering. Most promotoras are women. And so, the
5 name of our organization is La Rega Promotoras y
6 Trabajadores Comunitarias (phonetic Spanish), community
7 leaders, community workers.

8 And we started to build this relationship where
9 -- with community, where we wanted to learn as much as
10 we could to take out to the community, to our families.

11 Now, the core of who we are is what we call
12 espiritu servicio. It's what we call the heart. So,
13 those of you in the audience and that are listening, if
14 you'll think of somebody in your family, typically it's
15 your mother or your grandmother, but it could be your
16 uncle or your aunt who's always helping. Who's taking
17 food. Who's caring for the sick. Who's giving rides.
18 That's what we call espiritu servicio. Nobody pays you
19 to do it. We just naturally are that helper and we've
20 been called the natural helpers.

21 And so, they're the ones that came together
22 because they were always out in the community. And so,
23 what they wanted was more information so that when I go
24 talk to Juana, and I'm talking about a local resource, a
25 clinic nearby, she really maybe wants to know something

1 about schools and education for her children. I want to
2 know about that so I can at least refer her to somebody.

3 So, what we found was not only does Juana know
4 information, but I know Alicia, who knows something
5 about schools because that's where she volunteers. So,
6 I connected the two and then they connect somebody else.

7 And this system started to build. Then they
8 wanted to know more information, they wanted trainings
9 on different subjects.

10 So, here we are fast forward 23 years later,
11 we're training, we have a training department, a
12 promotoras for training on every subject matter that you
13 can think of, 15, 18 curricula.

14 We have a network of promotoras across
15 California and other states, and our training department
16 is now training in English and in Spanish for diverse
17 communities. We're training across the United States
18 and in other countries, really lifting up who that
19 person is, who that promotor is.

20 The network is centered on leadership advocacy
21 and training. Really, to build up the personal and the
22 professional development of that individual.

23 Now, the way it started for me was my mother was
24 a promotora. This little, 4 foot 11 lady, looks like
25 me, if you can think of it as a shorter version, and

1 didn't speak English until the day she died. But that
2 was who -- that's who people want, they want my mother,
3 who everyday would go out to -- a month before she died,
4 she was out volunteering. That's who people want in
5 their mind, right.

6 But if you then overlay a high school degree or
7 English speaking, the unintended consequence is that
8 you're not going to get my mother. You're going to get
9 somebody else. It's important to understand that as you
10 look at the continuum of service of promotoras and
11 community health workers. They're all wonderful. All
12 are wonderful positions.

13 But people, when you think -- when people think
14 about a promotora or community health worker, they think
15 about my mom. So, as we have this discussion think
16 about your mothers, think about your aunts, think about
17 your uncles. Because in your mind that's the success of
18 this model. It is that individual that goes out and
19 does that.

20 So, we talk about integrating the promotor model
21 for community transformation. And why do we talk about
22 that? So, let me go through a little history.

23 The next slide, please. The promotor model is
24 not a Latino model. It is an international model.
25 There's some examples here. On the left you have the

1 Felders in Russia, you have the barefoot doctors that
2 many of you in public health have heard about.

3 You have, of course, Popular education that's
4 founded -- that was in Latin America, with Paulo Freire.

5 And so, the model, the promotor model has
6 international origins. It is not just a Latino thing.
7 It is, again, the heart. And we say that the heart has
8 no color. That the heart is beating everyday. It's not
9 Latino, it's not Asian, it's not -- it's individual, and
10 the heart really relates to that.

11 So, the next slide, please. The heart's also
12 with the -- the promotor has also been recognized by the
13 World Health Organization and by the Ottawa Charter.
14 It's important that it's been recognized
15 internationally. And yet, it didn't come to the United
16 States until the 60's, when we started looking at
17 community health outreach workers, and war on poverty.
18 And then, in the 80's when you look at CHOWs, of
19 community health outreach workers.

20 And so, it's been slowly integrated into the
21 vernacular of the United States. Public health in
22 particular, when APHA, American Public Health
23 Association adopted community health worker and defined
24 it. But before that, it's been very natural in every
25 community. It's a very natural activity.

1 The next slide, please. So, who are promotores?
2 As you can tell in these pictures we're young, we're a
3 little older, we're men, we're women, we're Afro-
4 Latinos, we're mothers, we're grandmothers, and we're
5 daughters, and we're fathers and we're sons. A promotor
6 is a very diverse community, we don't have one look
7 about us. We don't have one requirement. We can come
8 from the fields working in the harvest up in the Central
9 Valley, or we can be cleaning houses, in both, and still
10 find time to do your volunteer work.

11 So, we're a very diverse community. We're well
12 educated, we're under educated. We speak English, we
13 speak Spanish only. It's a very diverse community and
14 this is just a sampling of who we are. But it gives you
15 an idea that we're, you know, we're not one picture, we
16 don't -- we're not like me. I'm an older adult, we're
17 not like me.

18 But most are mothers, most have children, and
19 most come here from another country, the promotor model,
20 with the idea that they want a better life for their
21 family. It's the American dream. My parents came from
22 Mexico in the 20s, they wanted a better life for me. My
23 mother would always tell me, I don't want you to work as
24 hard as I did. She worked in the fields in Fresno. She
25 cleaned houses, she cooked. That's the one thing she

1 told me, I do not want you to work as hard as I had to
2 work.

3 And in God's blessing I graduated from college
4 but, you know, not everybody does. And that's, I think
5 the mother's dream.

6 And that's probably what we all have in common
7 as promotoras, as particular promotoras is that we do
8 this work and we volunteer because we want the best we
9 can for our community, for our families. We want our
10 children to do better. That's the American dream.

11 The next slide, please. So, what has evolved
12 over years is that promotoras and the promotor model has
13 become an effective catalyst for change. The way that
14 we did that is we started really -- as I mentioned, we
15 did a lot of training, a lot of advocacy. And
16 promotoras now are all over California and the United
17 States, really looking at the importance of their role
18 in the community. With all of the trainings that
19 they've received, they're highly skilled. Promotoras
20 get trained in evaluation, in project management.

21 I'll give an example of the (speaking Spanish).
22 We're a very large organization. We employ, at our
23 peak, hundreds of promotoras. We hire, they usually
24 will come in as a volunteer through our network, and
25 then we hire a promotor. They promote to a lead

1 promotor, they promote to a coordinator, they promote to
2 a manager, and they promote to a director.

3 And you think about the potential of the -- the
4 potential of that movement of that individual, they
5 don't necessarily have a BA, most don't. They don't
6 necessarily have even a high school degree in the United
7 States. Maybe they do in their home country.

8 But that's not what's important. What's
9 important is their ability to reach community. They're
10 ability to go out and talk to others like that, and to
11 provide education information, and really transform
12 them.

13 So, our theory of change is that when we provide
14 all this for a promotor they grow personally and
15 professionally. Their outlook about the world that they
16 live in -- imagine, you come here from another country
17 and you don't know the system, you don't know the
18 language. It's a remarkable thing when you think about
19 that.

20 I was in Paris 20 years ago and I thought -- I
21 don't speak French. It was my birthday present. I fell
22 and I broke my ankle. I couldn't get healthcare. I'm a
23 person of color in France. I couldn't get healthcare.
24 I couldn't get anybody to help me. And I felt -- I felt
25 a little bit of what somebody must feel like to come

1 here in the United States and not be -- not be assisted
2 with anything, and not understand the language, or the
3 culture.

4 And by accident, I went into a little pastry
5 shop and they started speaking to me in Spanish. Oh, my
6 gosh I was thrilled. I felt I was -- they helped me.
7 They told me where to go, what to do. They were not
8 Mexican, but they were from Spain. And they looked at
9 me, like I don't look like I'm a Latina. And they
10 started talking to me and I felt such a relief.

11 For those of you who wonder about immigration,
12 think about something like that. You're in another
13 country, you don't know the language, you don't have --
14 what helped me was I had an American Express card. But
15 how many immigrants come here with an American Express
16 card? You have to suffer the consequences of this
17 environment that you're in.

18 And so, promotoras are really happy -- already?
19 Oh, I'm only through two slides. Okay. So, promotoras
20 are really happy to learn as much as they can, because
21 they want to share it with others, they want to share it
22 with their family.

23 Let's go through another slide and I'll -- okay.
24 So, the promotor model is the center of -- because we do
25 a lot of training, and advocacy, and leadership we

1 believe that the promotor is really the center of all
2 this. They're a liaison, they help to assist with
3 information, education. They're the center of community
4 health systems and the families. A promotor is not
5 limited to health. We look at a socio-ecological model,
6 or anything that impacts a family is what we want to
7 provide information and education.

8 The fact that we're talking about climate and
9 the environment is really critical. Lack of water, lack
10 of environment. If you saw some of the housing that
11 some of our farmworkers live in, you'd cry, you would
12 just cry.

13 And I think it's important for us to see the
14 promotor as a resource for us to provide education,
15 information, but also advocacy. So that they can sit at
16 the table and say this isn't appropriate. This is what
17 we want today and this is what we need in the future.

18 The promotor model is a great way to get
19 information out, health information, but also for social
20 change. They're at the center of what we call the
21 community transformation model. If you want to change
22 your community, center on that individual, provide
23 leadership, information and education.

24 Build their personal and professional capacity.
25 That means -- and what that means is I understand the

1 system and I now want to change the system.

2 And this goes for native born persons, also.

3 Many of our native born Latinos, and others, don't
4 understand the systems. You know, over generations
5 maybe we're not as well educated.

6 So, the model really works to be able to
7 understand who you are in that environment. I think
8 that our speakers before really talked about that
9 education process and understanding, and then moving it
10 forward. Saying, this doesn't work for us. We want it
11 to look different.

12 The promotor model, we started with 20, we
13 started with 200, we're now thousands across California
14 and the United States. It is an effective model. There
15 are agencies who have been training and working with
16 promotoras for over 25, 30 years.

17 I encourage you to look at the model as a way to
18 integrate resources, but also the CBOs. The community-
19 based organizations who have been working with
20 promotoras for years, decades, are well versed in this.

21 And we talked about resourcing agencies. I
22 think it's a really important thing to look at those
23 agencies, to resource them. Also, on the back end to
24 support them with the infrastructure. Many are small-
25 and medium-sized organizations that need that support to

1 build. Most CBOs who hire or who work with promotoras
2 are on soft money, on grant money. We need to stabilize
3 this. Long-term stabilization of funding for CBOs over
4 four and five years helps to build the capacity for them
5 to really visualize change.

6 And it's also an equity issue because you hire
7 these women. Most are women, remember. You hire them,
8 you give them a job with a fair wage, with benefits.
9 Imagine what that does to a family, especially out here
10 with farmworkers. When a person, a member of their
11 family comes in with a paycheck and benefits. There's
12 more to a promotora than giving information to somebody
13 and helping lift them up. It's also an equity issue for
14 them and their families, and for the work, the great
15 work that they do, the historical work that they do.

16 And they're a part of California culture, the
17 United States culture. And as we say in Vision y
18 Compromiso we're lifting them up. They should be
19 integrated across sectors. A promotor has a role or a
20 preconception to that.

21 That's our mantra. We're in everything,
22 behavioral health, physical health, environment, every
23 aspect of our life is a role for a promotor.

24 Is that it? Okay, I think my time is up. I
25 didn't get through the slides because I was too chatty.

1 But I will offer them, and you can look through them,
2 and please feel free to contact me. Maria, Vision y
3 Compromiso. This is one of our celebrations.

4 And we have our annual conference coming up in
5 October, where we host a thousand promotoras.
6 Registration will be open soon. We have 40 workshops.
7 It's in Spanish, but we have English translation.

8 And if you want to know more about the world of
9 promotoras, join us at any of our activities and events,
10 look us up on our website.

11 MS. RAITT: Thank you so much.

12 MS. LEMUS: Oh, so let me introduce. So, I'd
13 like to introduce two colegas, Patty and Marisela, who
14 will chat a little bit about the work that they do, and
15 some of the activities that they do. Kind of a one-on-
16 one what does a promotor do.

17 Marisela and Patty have been with us. They work
18 in Riverside County and from Coachella to Riverside
19 City. And so, I'll pass it on to you, Marisela.
20 Gracias.

21 And they'll be presenting in Spanish, with a
22 translator.

23 MS. BLANCAS: (Through English Interpreter) Of
24 course, of course. My name is Marisela and I've been
25 doing this work for 18 years, going on 18 years. And it

1 seems like it was just yesterday that I began.

2 And during the time that I've worked in these
3 communities, it offered so many things. It offered
4 education, guided people, offered like a shoulder to cry
5 on. And it's not limited to the Latino community. We
6 offer these services to people, whether in English or
7 Spanish. Sometimes those are not even their languages,
8 but we're a resource for people of all ethnicities.

9 And I remember there as a fire recently in this
10 town called Oasis, not far from here. There was like a
11 fire in a mobile home center or community.

12 And there was in this community of mobile homes,
13 there was actually one of the promotoras, one of the
14 promoters. And she said, we've got to do something to
15 help my community. People were like evacuated. They
16 were in a local school with their children, and all of
17 their belongings. She said, we've got to work together
18 to help these people.

19 And like together, we promotoras banded
20 together. We found food, we found donations. We found
21 all of the essentials that people needed. But we didn't
22 stop there. We said, what more can we do for these
23 people who basically had to abandon their homes.

24 And we found that these people, like they didn't
25 have any permanent places to live. And they started to

1 like move into these places with like no electricity,
2 like it was (indiscernible) -- like they were so -- they
3 were basically so scared that they just started moving
4 into places without any electricity.

5 No, no, no. And so, we found coolers, we got
6 people ice, they put their vegetables and all their
7 perishables in there. And we found that one thing that
8 we had to actually like talk to people about was
9 actually the importance of these basic utilities. It's
10 like, you know, electricity. You have your
11 refrigerator, you have your lights, it's like these are
12 essential things. But it was also like for us a
13 learning, like it was something that we had to kind of
14 talk about.

15 So, it was like an education process. We,
16 promotoras, we talked about -- like they talked about
17 all of the things that they were grateful for that they
18 had, that they had lost. But even like talking about
19 the value of like these basic resources, like having
20 electricity like in their homes. So, it was like a
21 community education effort and it was a beautiful thing
22 to participate in.

23 So, it is kind of a beautiful thing to see that
24 the role for a promotora is kind of it's a road, and
25 it's a learning experience. Like you never would have

1 thought that as a promotora part of your role would be
2 to talk to people about the importance of basic
3 utilities, like electricity. It was a learning for us,
4 but it showed that this promotora role there is no real
5 beginning or end. It's a growing role. It changes all
6 the time. And we got to talk to people at all levels
7 about the importance of something like utilities. Like
8 you never thought that this would be something that
9 would be an opportunity to discuss with the community.

10 And that's why it's a pleasure for me to come
11 here today and to say to you, like we're here. This is
12 our role. We're here like on every level and every way
13 to educate, to help, to provide support. And that's
14 like that was here that we're a resource. And I just, I
15 want to share that with you. Thank you.

16 MS. CRUZ: (Through English Interpreter) Hi, my
17 name's Patty and I'm a community promotora and it's been
18 a while, several years.

19 One of the favors that we do as promotoras is to
20 actually go and knock on doors in our community. We
21 talk to people. We accommodate their schedules, like
22 their busy work schedules, their lives, because we know
23 they have a lot on their plate and we have to be
24 available for them when they're able to speak to us.

25 Often we have to go to people's homes late at

1 night when they're done with like their workday. And
2 so, basic things like utilities, like street lights, you
3 know, have well-lit areas that's an important thing when
4 we go visit people at night.

5 Often, well one of the things that we do is we
6 go to people and we talk to them about their everyday
7 problems. And the fact that we're part of their
8 community, they're able to open up and talk to us. In
9 fact, we talk to people about issues around their mental
10 health. Which because of like people's home culture or,
11 you know, because it's a lot of our cultures this is not
12 something that we easily share. It's a beautiful thing
13 when someone opens themselves up and shares some things
14 about how they're feeling.

15 We engage with people, we go to their homes. We
16 not only talk to them, but we engage in like a lot of
17 like activities with them, manual activities. So, we're
18 in people's homes and we do a lot of things with them.
19 We're engaging with them very closely.

20 The other day I was with a family that was
21 having a lot of trouble paying their bills, paying their
22 utilities. And we have access to a lot of community
23 resources, so we were able to connect them with a
24 resource that would help them to pay those bills. Yeah,
25 and this family was extremely grateful. I mean they

1 were -- their stress levels were just so high. And just
2 the fact that they were able to get this sort of help,
3 their stress level just went down.

4 A lot of the people that we deal with that are
5 in our community, like we're part of their community,
6 they deal with a lot of very stressful things. But we
7 go in and we are able to empathize with them and help
8 them to deal with all of these loads that we carry. And
9 so, in that we were able to diminish, you know, people's
10 stress levels to help them.

11 Thank you for listening. And also thank you for
12 like hearing and knowing that like we have like a strong
13 bond and affinity like with our community, that we're
14 really connected to them.

15 MS. LEMUS: There is a question in the chat that
16 I think is really interesting: Have we considered, have
17 promotoras considered trying to create a resilience up?

18 It was really interesting because I was just at
19 a meeting in Sacramento where they were actually looking
20 at one resource center that we were training promotoras
21 there. And so, I was at the meeting and there were a
22 lot of other agencies that were there to support the --
23 actually, the energy department was there, too, as was
24 DS, and a lot of other groups.

25 Looking at that center as a resilience. That's

1 how I got to know it. And I think that's a really great
2 idea if that -- and that resource center had been in
3 that community, oh gosh, probably 30 years. So, they
4 were advocating for that to consolidate funds from
5 different agencies in these resilience centers if those
6 resilience centers -- they did have a caveat, if those
7 resilience centers were in communities run by community-
8 based organizations, who had long-standing relationship
9 with a community. What that meant was don't bring
10 somebody else into a community. As Marisela was talking
11 about, you know, where communities are very protective
12 of their own historical presence.

13 And they were talking about energy and other
14 things. And I think that's a really idea to center it
15 if it's in the community and if there's enough support,
16 they were thinking about building out some parts of it.

17 And I think the discussion was, well, will these
18 agencies give us, then, the resource center enough funds
19 to really build this out appropriately? If they're
20 resourced well enough to build it out and there's
21 expectation that it's going to be a hub for a lot of
22 other agencies, I think that's a wonderful
23 thing.

24 This resource center was amazing. They had
25 things for children, they had -- for all ages. They had

1 after school. It was right there in the barrio, in
2 Sacramento. It was a great example of the future for
3 our children. It was a safe environment. I've seen
4 these resiliency hubs, if they really honor -- if they
5 honor who the community is and they're resourced well
6 enough, the person who wrote this, I think that's a
7 great idea. I think it's employment for a lot of the
8 local residents. I think that's a really critical
9 piece. And the children get to come to a happy place.
10 I was really -- I was really impressed with that, I must
11 say.

12 Do we have anymore questions?

13 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I have a question.

14 MS. LEMUS: Yes.

15 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So, I'm actually Haitian-
16 American and I work a lot with like the Haitian
17 community that's been establishing itself here and, you
18 know, crossing the border into San Diego. And I see
19 this model that's being like -- it would be an amazing
20 model for a community that's like struggling to
21 establish itself, and maybe doesn't have that kind of --
22 like it's a great model.

23 Like we try to like use this model in like non-
24 Latino communities.

25 MS. LEMUS: Oh, definitely, yeah. We are

1 training in other languages. We do train in -- the
2 model is very prevalent in the indigenous communities,
3 for instance, in our Latin American indigenous
4 countries. We have -- there's a lot of groups in
5 California and across the U.S.

6 And we actually started to work with a group in
7 Florida, a Haitian group. And we know that there's a
8 lot of Haitians in Mexico right now. So, we're finding
9 a lot of Haitian-Mexican babies all over, yeah.

10 So, the model works. Really, the model, if it's
11 centered on the person, on the individual and on that
12 heart, I mean the heart has no color so it works in
13 every community.

14 It needs adaptation, slight cultural adaptation.
15 But we've been training white individuals in Kentucky.
16 Imagine. So, it doesn't have limitations. It's just
17 what's known to be in the Latino community, but we don't
18 own it. We've perfected it for Latinos. But we think
19 it's a model that works.

20 And we're training now with mixed communities
21 because we want to show that there's a commonality, so
22 what works only Latina, what works -- what works, you
23 know, for the same mother that you have that did this
24 was my mother. And how can we have the common
25 understanding of those values and then you and I will be

1 working together. That's a goal, you know, that we
2 start really looking at the commonalities and we start
3 working to advance life that's better in our
4 communities. Especially in communities that
5 traditionally have not worked together, I think that's a
6 really important piece that we're working towards.

7 We're especially looking at the Latino immigrant
8 and the Latino native born, which are very different
9 communities. You know, we're not monolithic. The third
10 generation Latino here is very different from the recent
11 immigrant, as we are different in Texas or in New York.
12 And I think that's one thing that we have to identify
13 about our communities is there's no one answer to us.
14 As there wouldn't be in Asian communities, or anywhere
15 else. We're all very different. And the promotor model
16 allows you to adapt it for that community.

17 So, thank you, that's a very good question.

18 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, I just wanted to --
19 first of all thank you, thank you for your comments as
20 well.

21 But given that we're trying to think through a
22 broader community engagement, how does the promotor,
23 promotoras work with other CBOs, for example? If we
24 were to work in energy and then are CBOs going to be
25 working in energy, how do you see the model expanding to

1 many of some of the existing resources?

2 MS. LEMUS: You know, the gift of the model is
3 that it's versatile. And so, the individual is what
4 we're looking at. And what we've learned over 20 some
5 years is a promotor can learn almost anything. What's
6 hard is to teach them to have a heart. It's hard to
7 teach -- you can't really teach somebody to be nice.
8 You can't teach somebody to unabashedly go out and meet
9 people, and be kind and thoughtful. It's that intrinsic
10 piece of the thing that you can't do.

11 But you can teach about energy. You can teach
12 about behavior health. You can teach evaluation like we
13 do. You can teach logic modeling, you can teach all
14 those things. It's -- but you need that core, you need
15 that individual. And so, energy would just be another
16 topic that we train on.

17 We must have -- we're an example, and we're not
18 the only group, there are many agencies across
19 California who do this work for many years. But we
20 probably train and have projects on probably 50 topics,
21 gambling, families, youth, what else? I don't know.
22 But everything you can think of because that promotor
23 can learn it. They can figure out what's essential of
24 that idea and they can take it out to the community.

25 So, energy would just be another topic. And I

1 think it would be really interested because it's another
2 part of their daily life that affects their family. And
3 I think that's what would generate interest to be
4 involved in this.

5 MS. BLANCAS: Can I add something? (Through
6 English Interpreter) So, to add to what Maria said, I'd
7 just like to say that like when you take a topic, for
8 example like energy, it is like I'm talking to a mother
9 and it's not just let's talk about energy as a theme, as
10 a general theme. But you're a mom. You have children.
11 You use energy in the home. How does this impact your
12 home life?

13 That's the beauty of it because you can take
14 anything, energy, and I have that connection and I know
15 the importance of energy to her family.

16 The way I see it, it's like I have the ability
17 to go in and that pillar of the family, the mom,
18 whatever the subject is, change the utensils in your
19 kitchen so that it's more energy efficient. Change your
20 energy consumption. Change how you do this or that. If
21 I can talk to that mom -- okay, dad, they're there,
22 they're important, too. But that mom, she's the pillar.
23 If I can talk to her, flyers, conversation, I know that
24 once I influence that woman that is the mother, that
25 whole family -- I can inform -- and it can be on

1 anything. It can be on energy. It can be on
2 agriculture. I'm going to change that family's habits,
3 behaviors, based on whatever it is they're trying to
4 educate them on.

5 MS. LEMUS: And they just keep adding
6 information to it, layers and layers of more
7 information.

8 MS. BLANCAS: (Through English Interpreter) So,
9 I'll give you an example. My neighbor, Nita, we used to
10 get these flyers, she would get these flyers, you know,
11 by mail, everybody needs them. Switch out your
12 refrigerator for the green refrigerator. Garbage,
13 garbage, garbage, she doesn't need it.

14 So, I said, okay, let's sit down and let's
15 investigate, let's call around. Let's see what's this
16 whole energy efficiency thing, switch out your
17 appliances. No, no, no, no. She's like close to 80,
18 she doesn't trust anybody. It's too -- it's not real.
19 It sounds too good to be true. They're going to somehow
20 charge me some outrageous amount.

21 So now, after convincing here, talking to her,
22 we investigated, she switched out her refrigerator.
23 She's got a better refrigerator than me. She's got one
24 with an icemaker, energy efficient. She is so happy,
25 saves so much money, she's delighted.

1 But it didn't stop with her. Now, she's boom,
2 boom, boom, knocking on every neighbor's door and
3 telling them you should switch out your refrigerator.

4 So, I'm not -- it doesn't stop with here, now
5 the whole community's impacted because everybody's
6 switching to these energy efficient appliances. Thank
7 you.

8 MS. RAITT: That's wonderful, thank you so much.
9 Commissioner, do you have a comment or question?

10 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: No, I just wanted to say
11 thank you again. I think, you know, for me this is a
12 very long conversation. Thank you for the connection
13 today. I think we already talked about having a follow-
14 up conversation.

15 MS. LEMUS: Yes.

16 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: We'd like to get your --

17 MS. LEMUS: Happy to do that. Thank you.

18 MS. RAITT: Thank you, thanks. Oh, this is
19 Heather again. Thank you, that was just wonderful.

20 I think we're now ready to move on for our next
21 portion. And so, I'd like to ask Katrina Leni-Konig,
22 from the Energy Commissioner, who's a Deputy Public
23 Advisor, to kind of walk us through. She's going to
24 talk about how we're going to move to the small group
25 discussions.

1 And I'll just -- I'll repeat afterwards. But
2 after this, then we're just going to briefly be stopping
3 recording and not have a transcript. But then we'll
4 reconvene and we'll have a detailed recording out on our
5 conversations. So, anyway, sorry to -- go ahead.

6 MS. LENI-KONIG: First, let me thank all the
7 presenters. Thank you for coming and joining us. We
8 really appreciate hearing the stories into going into
9 homes and we know that it can be a real catalyst for
10 change when we start talk to all the communities. And
11 this model is really trying to make connection as with
12 the Energy Commission as we think about how we
13 transition to a clean energy future and how do we get
14 everybody involved. So, thank you.

15 We are going to continue this discussion into
16 small groups. There were different topics covered
17 today. Noemí talked about establishing the equity
18 framework that also sets up the terminology, and so
19 forth. It's how we describe equity. How do we talk
20 about communities? How do we do that clearly.

21 So, we'll have some discussion on that. We have
22 some questions already posed but, of course, the group
23 can continue and bring what they'd like to bring to the
24 discussion.

25 We also heard about equity indicators of how do

1 we measure and track our progress? How do we know that
2 what we're doing is working? And where are there gaps
3 and where do we need to put more time and effort to
4 shift the need for advancing of energy, advancing energy
5 equity and bringing communities forward into this work?

6 We're also going to talk about regional
7 engagement. And so, that was something that we've
8 really dived into here. What is meaningful engagement?
9 So, it was set up earlier today that meaningful
10 engagement is one of the necessities in how we shape and
11 drive our policies going forward. And today, just now,
12 we heard on some strategies on how meaningful engagement
13 really happens on the ground, on the field, and how
14 things change from there in that certain catalyst for
15 change. So, we'll dive into that as well.

16 We have a group online. And so, Dorothy, I have
17 my colleague, Dorothy, who's online, she'll be
18 moderating the group online.

19 And then we'll split into two groups here to
20 cover the topics. So, again, I listed those three
21 topics, equity framework, equity indicators, and
22 regional engagement. We have this microphone, also.

23 Each of the groups is going to begin with a
24 different topic area. And then, once that topic area
25 moves forward, then they can move into the other topics.

1 That way, we make sure we cover all three topics and
2 we're all carrying forward.

3 So, I'm going to ask Maria and her team to join
4 together and support one of the small group discussions.
5 I'll also be working and splitting up with a group as
6 well.

7 I also want to recognize we have students from
8 Imperial Valley College here that are going to be
9 helping us, also in taking notes, also sharing their own
10 experiences from the region as well. They're active.
11 We have students that are studying to become
12 electricians in this space. Imperial Valley College is
13 doing incredible work developing training programs to
14 support our clean energy transition. So, they're here.
15 And then, we also have students who are studying public
16 policy and interested in that space.

17 So, super excited to have the students here
18 supporting us. They'll be here in the conversations.

19 So, from there we're going to go ahead and split
20 up. Dorothy, online, you guys are going to begin with
21 the equity framework discussion. We'll have
22 introductions and so forth, and then dive into the
23 equity framework, and then move on from there.

24 Hillary, if we can have Hillary. Hillary is
25 going to work also with the promotoras and Maria on

1 equity indicators.

2 And then, we'll have the promotoras on regional
3 engagement, as well, and I'll carry that forward and
4 then, we'll have everyone set up.

5 And we have two rooms. So, sorry about that.
6 Two rooms. Two, just outside the door, 2735 and 2732,
7 which is out over here. So, we'll plan to --

8 MS. RAITT: Can you tell, how do they know where
9 to go?

10 MS. LENI-KONIG: So, as far as splitting up into
11 groups, I think you should just start with the group
12 that you'd like. We're going to try to divide up
13 evenly, and so I'll go ahead and do that off the mic, if
14 that's okay.

15 MS. RAITT: You need, yeah.

16 MS. LENI-KONIG: Oh, for dividing up into the
17 group? So, choose a room. So, go ahead and if you see
18 that one room is rather full, then go to the other room.
19 Okay. Equity indicators will be over here and then
20 we'll have social engagement in the back room, over
21 there.

22 MS. RAITT: And this is Heather. Just one quick
23 announcement. So, we will continue -- for the folks who
24 are on Zoom, we will continue to record that. And we're
25 just going to leave that part of it in.

1 But the folks who are in the breakout rooms will
2 not be recorded, and so that we will pause, keep the
3 recording out of their conversations.

4 So, give us a moment here as we're getting
5 organized.

6 (Breakout Sessions from 2:57 p.m. until
7 3:54 p.m.)

8 MS. RAITT: So, we're back on the record, which
9 just means that we're going to have a transcript of this
10 conversation.

11 And so, Katrina, if you would be so kind as to
12 get us started with the reporting out on the
13 conversations?

14 MS. LENI-KONIG: Sure. So, what I'm actually
15 going to do is I'm going to introduce the folks that
16 will be bringing back and carrying forward the messages
17 that they learned from the small group discussions.

18 We had an online group that Dorothy facilitated,
19 so I'll have her share some of the key takeaways to
20 begin. And then, we will -- I will then introduce the
21 next speakers.

22 Dorothy, if you want to briefly give us some of
23 the key takeaways from the online group.

24 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Katrina.

25 So, I'm sharing my screen here so, hopefully,

1 folks in the room can see that as well. We got a lot of
2 comments. I think everyone who was online joining us,
3 who participated.

4 Some of the key takeaways, so we worked on
5 equity framework, so in terms of definition, you know,
6 how would you define energy equity. Got a quite a few
7 responses.

8 Something that stood out was, you know, this
9 statement in particular, energy democracy, which kind of
10 gets into what everyone said here. But I liked that
11 when people can have access to clean and affordable
12 energy.

13 The next question we tackled: What terminology
14 should be used, if any, to represent communities that
15 should be prioritized for clean energy investments and
16 why?

17 So, this particular comment right here:
18 Whatever terminology or definitions are chosen, they
19 should be co-developed with community members to reflect
20 their self-identified needs and solutions.

21 Another one was: There will need to be
22 acknowledge of the definitions that already exist, that
23 are defined by legislative statutes, which many agencies
24 are required to use in their policies and programs, and
25 how to balance these with definitions that community

1 members prefer. For example, the definition of
2 disadvantaged communities comes from a legislative
3 mandate. Thank you for that comment.

4 The next question we tackled: How would you
5 rank the following as most appropriate for CEC to use?
6 So, our options were priority communities, priority
7 populations, frontline communities, fence-line
8 communities, environmental justice communities, equity
9 communities, under-resourced communities, under-invested
10 communities, disadvantaged communities, and underserved
11 communities.

12 And we had -- as you can see, we had a lot of
13 comments. So one here: Without seeing the definitions
14 in detail it is difficult to prioritize. For example,
15 what is a priority community? Who's priorities? Who
16 will receive the benefits? That was a great comment.

17 Also another one here: Environmental justice
18 communities is a term that I have -- and I'm quoting
19 here -- that I have most heard from people talking about
20 communities, versus community members in describing
21 themselves.

22 And that is -- those are the questions our group
23 worked on virtually. But as you can see, they did
24 contribute a lot to the other sections as well. So, I
25 will pass those on to the IEPR team. So, thank you

1 everyone who participated virtually.

2 Katrina, I'll hand the mic back to you.

3 MS. LENI-KONIG: Thank you very much, Dorothy.

4 With that, I'm going to introduce Izel Landeros
5 to present on the equity indicators group discussion.

6 MS. LANDEROS: Good afternoon, everyone. Can
7 you all hear me?

8 Good afternoon, everyone. Is that better?

9 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yes.

10 MS. LANDEROS: Yes. Okay. Well, good
11 afternoon. My name is Izel Landeros and I will be
12 sharing our takeaways.

13 Our takeaways are based on the idea of looking
14 at things in how these things matter of embracing
15 conflict and doing something about it. Is it only about
16 indicators of collecting data? But what does it mean?
17 It's about making energy relevant to the community by
18 having the community being taken into account early on.

19 It's about making the data connect to people's
20 narrative and take action to address realness. We
21 concluded that community engagement is a big part of it,
22 because through our understanding our community we'll be
23 able to educate each other to bring change.

24 And also, bring change to policy that resonates
25 the inner self. Thank you.

1 MS. LENI-KONIG: And next, I'll have Kaelynn
2 Huelves come and present on the regional engagement
3 group's key takeaways.

4 MS. HUELVES: Hello everyone. Thank you so much
5 for coming and sticking around.

6 All right, so I'll be reporting back from what
7 our regional engagement group went over, and I'll just
8 be reading briefly off from the main takeaways we went
9 over.

10 So, the first one, one of our group -- our
11 discussed like one of the best ways to create change in
12 a community is from working within. We felt that it's a
13 lot more meaningful when change comes from someone who's
14 a part of the community that knows their background and
15 their experiences. And it's a little difficult when you
16 have outsiders who don't know what you're community's
17 been through trying to impose change. And it's really
18 important when that change comes from within.

19 Another one of the things that we discussed is
20 that one of the best ways to create change is to use
21 media outlets and resources that resonate with the
22 youth, and people who are going to be taking on this
23 work of clean energy and renewable energy in the future.
24 Not only should the work and the information that the
25 CEC puts out be accessible, but it should also be

1 digestible to people who want to learn more about clean
2 energy and want to spread the work that we're doing with
3 our agency.

4 And one of our final and main takeaways is that
5 our group recommends having a presence in communities
6 outside of Sacramento, where the CEC is based. By
7 maintaining public engagement and outreach, we can help
8 build trust and understanding in communities across the
9 state, and not just the region that we're based in.

10 So, thank you so much.

11 MS. RAITT: So, thank you. Thank you, Katrina,
12 and thank you to the people who were brave enough to
13 report out, and to everybody who contributed to that
14 conversation. That is just so productive, and helpful,
15 and wonderful, and appreciated.

16 So, with that, let's see, yeah I think unless --
17 we'll just go ahead and move on to public comment.

18 So, if anyone in the room wanted to make a
19 public comment, this is the time where we won't
20 necessarily respond to, respond to questions, but we
21 welcome your input to us. So, if you wanted to make a
22 comment to us, please, you may come up here and we'll do
23 that. So, we allow three minutes per person and one
24 person per organization.

25 So, any folks, please raise your hands if you'd

1 like to. Seeing no hands up, anybody online who would
2 like to make a comment, please use the chat function --
3 sorry, the raised hand function to let us know that
4 you'd like to comment. So, you just click that raised
5 hand and that will let us know.

6 So, we have a couple people. So, Ryan
7 Pickering, we'll go ahead and open your line. You can
8 unmute. And if you could just spell your name and your
9 affiliation, if any. Go ahead.

10 MR. PICKERING: Thank you. My name is Ryan
11 Pickering, R-Y-A-N P-I-C-K-E-R-I-N-G. And I'm
12 representing unseated Petco Coast, Yok Tichu Tichu
13 (phonetic) land. And I want to thank the facilitators
14 for their work today. I am so grateful for civil
15 servants that keep our communities going. And I respect
16 the CEC for being -- for creating this body. And I feel
17 that this is a fair place for me to represent my
18 opinion.

19 And I want to thank everyone for perhaps reading
20 some of my comments or listening to my last comment.
21 And there is a opportunity for the CEC for
22 intersectional justice, and environmental justice, and
23 by partnering to keep Diablo Canyon Power Plant online.

24 Diablo Canyon Power Plant is located on the
25 Petco Coast. And the Yok Tichu Tichu people helped

1 build the nuclear power plant 40 years ago, and the
2 power plant works great. It has an incredible record.
3 And the Yok Tichu Tichu, who are called YTT. YTT has
4 voted and they want to keep the land open, the power
5 plant open in order to serve California's need for
6 reliable, clean electricity. And we, the YTT was not
7 consulted in 2018 when the plant was closed. YTT has
8 over 50 members. We have a unique history that is
9 documented by PG&E.

10 And we want to thank California for its
11 commitment to clean energy. And we hope to show other
12 indigenous communities, as well as all of Californians
13 that nuclear energy is clean energy. And in order to
14 achieve our goals we need to save this nuclear power
15 plant and we need to work with renewables to create more
16 abundant clean energy.

17 Thank you for your time today and your civil
18 service.

19 MS. RAITT: Thank you, Ryan.

20 I believe, before we move on to the next Zoom
21 participant, there was somebody in the room who wanted
22 to make a comment. Great. Yeah, you can just come down
23 here and so we can all hear. Thank you.

24 So, please say and spell your name for the
25 record and any affiliation. Where you were is fine.

1 MR. HERNANDEZ: Well, mine's short. My name's
2 Diego Hernandez, I'm a represented at the Office of
3 Assemblymember Garcia. And I just wanted to thank the
4 California Energy Commission and the guest speakers for
5 coming to Imperial County. And we're truly grateful to
6 have you guys here.

7 Other than that, I've been taking many notes and
8 I'll be reporting this back to the Assemblymember.
9 Thank you once again. Thank you.

10 MS. RAITT: Thank you. Well, thank you.

11 All right, going back to Zoom attendees, Mariela
12 Loera, please go ahead and state your name, and spell
13 it, and any affiliation for the record, please.

14 MS. LOERA: Mariela Loera, M-A-R-I-L-A, last
15 name L-O-E-R-A. And I'm with Leadership Council for
16 Justice and Accountability.

17 Similar to the other comments, I just want to
18 say thank you and acknowledge how great the second part
19 was. I mean the first part was also good, but this one
20 was great. It was really cool to see the promotoras be
21 part of it and engaged. The translator that spoke with
22 the promotoras was great, probably the best translator
23 I've ever seen. So, thank you to her, too.

24 The jamboard activity was also very good. And
25 I'm just hoping that we can see something very similar

1 on the ground with residents. So, just thank you for
2 the workshops/

3 MS. RAITT: Wonderful, thank you.

4 So, again, if anybody on Zoom on Comment, this
5 again is Heather Raitt, just press the raised hand
6 button. And then if you're on the phone, and you'd like
7 to comment, just press *9. I'll give it another moment
8 here.

9 All right. Well, I'm not seeing any raised
10 hands, so that concludes our public comment for the day.
11 Thanks everybody.

12 Go ahead, if you have any remarks, Vice Chair
13 Gunda.

14 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Yeah, you know, just I wanted
15 to say thank you again one more time to the Imperial
16 Valley College for hosting us, and it's a beautiful
17 space, opening this space for us to be a part of it.

18 The Assemblymember Garcia's Office taking the
19 time today and being here all day to be a part of this
20 discussion.

21 Everybody who was in attendance, the speakers.
22 You know, I have to agree with Mariela that was really
23 the best translation. You know, there was time when
24 there was very long sentences and you just did all of
25 it.

1 THE INTERPRETER: I want to say thank you. That
2 really makes me feel good, honestly. Really, I'm so
3 glad. I got up at 5:00 in the morning today and I
4 thought I'm going to be like try. So, I'm just -- thank
5 you so much, guys. It was also because you guys were so
6 beautiful. Both ladies were right here, and they're so
7 eloquent so, thank you. Thank you.

8 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Thank you, again. Yeah, so
9 much.

10 And then, I think Dr. Benner just walked out.
11 You know, for him staying out all day and being part of
12 this conversation. As Noemí mentioned, this is the
13 start of a conversation on how to do regional engagement
14 and really achieving equity and not just advancing, you
15 know, in every part of the work that we do in CEC, but
16 also engaging in the broader conversation in California,
17 and kind of creating a model to help move California as
18 a whole. So, really appreciate everybody's work.

19 A special thanks to IEPR team, Heather, Denise
20 and Raquel, wherever they are, thank you so much for
21 making this happen and all day.

22 (Applause)

23 MS. RAITT: Thank you, appreciate it.

24 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: No, you did very well today
25 and more. And we have our IT team. Thank you to the IT

1 team, thank you so much for your work.

2 (Applause)

3 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: And, you know, just want to
4 provide this additional context, equity has been a part
5 of CEC's work for nearly a decade and that we've been
6 doing this. But the importance of moving from advancing
7 to achieve really took root with Noemí. So, I really
8 want to give Noemí a big, you know, thanks for really
9 moving this conversation forward.

10 (Applause)

11 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: And, you know, Katrina I
12 just, you know, met in the last few months, but really
13 kind of looking at your leadership, thank you for the
14 work that you do.

15 And, you know, the interns, Hillary, wonderful
16 work. I'm just grateful for the team that we have and I
17 feel much more confident that we're going to deliver.
18 So, thank you.

19 MS. GALLARDO: I'll just say real quick -- I'm
20 losing my voice, so I'm talking less. No, but thank you
21 so much. It's so good to see friends in the audience.
22 Like the more we come out here, the closer we get so,
23 you know. Thank you just for being here, for
24 participating and opening your hearts, your minds, and
25 to also to those of you live here, your home. We really

1 appreciate being here and hope to come back soon, if
2 you'll have us.

3 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: If you'll have us.

4 (Laughter)

5 MS. RAITT: That concludes our meeting. Thanks
6 everybody.

7 MS. GALLARDO: And big cheers to Dorothy, also.

8 VICE CHAIR GUNDA: Dorothy, thank you.

9 (Thereupon, the workshop was adjourned at
10 4:12 p.m.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were reported by me, a certified electronic court reporter and a disinterested person, and was under my supervision thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 3rd day of September, 2022.



MARTHA L. NELSON,

CERT**367

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were reported by me, a certified electronic court reporter and a disinterested person, and was under my supervision thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 23rd day of September, 2022.



MARTHA L. NELSON,

CERT**367