

DOCKETED

Docket Number:	21-BUSMTG-01
Project Title:	Business Meeting Agendas, Transcripts, Minutes, and Public Comments
TN #:	236634
Document Title:	Transcript of January 25, 2021 Business Meeting
Description:	N/A
Filer:	Cody Goldthrite
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	2/4/2021 1:10:09 PM
Docketed Date:	2/4/2021

APPEARANCES

Commissioners

David Hochschild, Chair
Janea Scott, Vice Chair
Karen Douglas
Andrew McAllister
Patricia Monahan

Staff Present: (* Via WebEx)

Drew Bohan, Executive Director
Darcy Houck, Chief Counsel
Noemi Gallardo, Public Advisor
Cody Goldthrite, Secretariat

Agenda Item

Laurie ten Hope	2
Siva Gunda	2
Rhetta deMesa	2
Mona Badie	2
Linda Barrera	2
Matt Coldwell	2
Patrick McCann-Kingston	2
Courtney Smith	2
Jim Bartridge	2
Nick Fugate	3
Kadir Bedir	4
Alex Horangic	5
Armand Angulo	6
Danuta Drozdowicz	7
Susan Cochran	8
Lisa DeCarlo	8

Also Present:

VIPs

Wade Crowfoot, Calif. Natural Resources Agency	2
Alice Reynolds, Governor's Office	2
Matt Baker, CNRA	2
Martha Guzman Aceves, Calif. Public Utilities Commission	2
Mary Nichols, Former CARB Chair	2
Carla Peterman, Southern Calif. Edison	2

APPEARANCES (Cont.)

VIPs (continued)

Stan Greschner, GRID Alternatives and DACAG 2
Sara Gersen, Earthjustice 2

Interested Parties

Sean Armstrong, Redwood Energy 4
Scott Galati, DayZen, LLC on behalf of
C1-Santa Clara, LLC 8

Public Comment

Steve Black 2
Grace Anderson, WIRAB 2
Holly Taylor, WIEB 2

I N D E X

	Page
Proceedings	5
Items	
1. Consent Calendar	7
2. Vice Chair Janea Scott	8
3. California Energy Commission Forecast Update	69
4. Redwood Energy	85
5. Climate Scenarios and Analytics to Support Electricity Vulnerability Assessment and Resiliency Planning	93
6. Energy Conservation Assistance Act, Education Subaccount, ECCA-Ed	96
7. Local Ordinance Applications	105
8. Report from Committee and Possible Additional Direction to Committee Regarding Progress on Small Power Plant Exemption Application for the Sequoia Backup Generator Facility	113
9. Approval of 12-22-20 Business Meeting Minutes	130
10. Lead Commissioner Presiding Member Reports	131
11. Executive Director Report	144
12. Public Advisor Report	145
13. Public Comment	146
14. Chief Counsel's Report	147

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

P R O C E E D I N G S

January 25, 2021 10:01 a.m.

CHAIR HOCHSCHILD: Well, good morning and welcome, everybody. I'm David Hochschild and welcome to our first commission business meeting of 2021, and give yourself a pat on the back for making it through 2020. May this year be a year of new beginnings and new possibilities for us all.

Let's begin by having our Vice Chair, Janea Scott, lead us in the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon the Pledge of Allegiance is recited)

CHAIR HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Madam Vice Chair. Again, we are still in the middle of the COVID pandemic, and I want to ask everyone to remain vigilant in many ways. The news of the vaccine, while it's terrific, it can mask the danger that's still there, so, please do remain vigilant, wear a mask, wash your hands and keep your social distance. Go to covid19.ca.gov.

Before we go any further I would like to begin the meeting with a moment of silence in recognition of the more than 400,000 who have perished from COVID-19, as well as the six people who perished in the Capitol insurrection this week. Thank you.

Today's business meeting is being held remotely

1 without a physical occasion for any participant consistent
2 with Executive Orders N2520 and N2920 and the
3 recommendations of the California Department of Public
4 Health to encourage social distancing in order to slow the
5 spread of COVID-19. The public may participate and/or
6 observe the meeting consistent with the direction of these
7 Executive Orders.

8 Instructions for remote participation can be
9 found in the notice for the meeting and is set forth on the
10 agenda posted on the Commission's website.

11 We are using a combination of Zoom and Verizon
12 for remote access. If Zoom shuts down today, call Verizon
13 at 1-888-8235065. The passcode is "business meeting."

14 Pursuant to California Code of Regulations Title
15 20-1104(e), any person may make oral argument on any agenda
16 item. To ensure the orderly conduct of business, such
17 comments will be limited to three minutes or less per
18 person as to each item listed on the agenda that is voted
19 on today. Any person wishing to comment on information
20 items or reports that are not voting items shall reserve
21 their comment for the general public portion of the meeting
22 agenda and shall have three minutes or less in total to
23 state all their remaining comments.

24 Today we will be giving away in grants and
25 investments over 23 million dollars. This is going to help

1 with California's economic recovery and continue the
2 momentum we've been building.

3 With that, let's go the consent calendar. Madam
4 Public Advisor, we do have any public comments on the
5 consent calendar, Item 1?

6 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, the public
7 advisor. We do not have public comment.

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Let's entertain a
9 motion. Vice Chair Scott, are you willing to move the
10 consent calendar?

11 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Yes. I move approval of Item
12 1.

13 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Commissioner
14 Douglas, would you be willing to second?

15 MS. DOUGLAS: Yes, second.

16 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. All in favor say
17 aye. Vice Chair Scott.

18 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Aye.

19 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Douglas.

20 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

21 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner McAllister.

22 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

23 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Monahan.

24 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And I vote aye as well.

1 That item passes unanimously.

2 Let's move now to Item 2. This is a resolution
3 recognizing, commending Vice Chair Scott for her remarkable
4 leadership. This is the most important item we're going to
5 be discussing at our meeting today. I want everyone to
6 settle in, get comfortable, get some tea, and I would just
7 like to ask you, Janea, on here because this is going to be
8 personal today. I would really like to ask you to open
9 your heart today and just to receive all of this love, and
10 celebration, and gratitude from all of us.

11 We have been together as a group, with the
12 exception of Commissioner Monahan replacing Chair
13 Weisenmiller a year or two ago, we've been together as a
14 group for eight years. And because 2020 was so intense, it
15 sort of feels like we've been with Commissioner Monahan for
16 eight years as well.

17 So, this is a big day. It's a bittersweet
18 day for us because it's really hard to lose you. So, I'm
19 getting a little emotional. It's really hard to lose you.
20 You have been just at the core of the commission, and all
21 that we've done together is incredible. It's billions of
22 dollars we moved to amazing projects. Everything you've
23 touched you've made better, and I will give greater
24 comments at the end, but I just want to say on behalf of
25 all of us how incredibly honored we are to have had the

1 chance to work with you and grateful.

2 And I know that your mother, Evelyn Scott, is on
3 today with us. Ms. Scott, I remember we had a dinner maybe
4 a year or two ago, and you should be incredibly, incredibly
5 proud of your daughter, so thank you for joining us. And
6 with that, I'd like to begin with Secretary Wade Crowfoot.

7 MR. CROWFOOT: Thanks so much. And I'm thrilled
8 to be here in the queue to praise Commissioner Scott who
9 I'll also call Janea, because this is really about the
10 relationship we've all developed over the last several
11 years.

12 As I reflect on Janea's work at the Energy
13 Commission, I can honestly say that very few people in
14 California have been as consequential to the State's energy
15 vision over the last decade.

16 Consider her leadership during the Obama
17 administration under Interior Secretary Salazar with
18 getting large investment of renewables into California
19 during the ARRA effort, post-recession effort. And she and
20 her colleagues were really consequential actually getting
21 those projects on the ground with California.

22 Her leadership was noticed, obviously, and she
23 was recruited by Governor Brown and his team to come to
24 California and be more directly involved with State
25 government, and it obviously led to Governor Brown's

1 appoint of Janea onto the Energy Commission.

2 And, Janea, you've been incredible on the Energy
3 Commission over the last several years, whether it was, you
4 know, long, complicated siting hearings with Karen or
5 others, all of your many site visits actually to understand
6 what was happening on the ground, your stewardship of the
7 transportation investments for the state, literally
8 hundreds of millions of dollars advancing our
9 transportation vision that continues to march on. And most
10 recently, the work ensuring that all of the research
11 development employment investments in the state actually
12 move us aggressively towards all of our climate zone,
13 including carbon neutrality.

14 So, you know, your vision, your intelligence,
15 your organizational acumen, your example of leadership that
16 you've been able to provide have just been a huge, positive
17 consistently, you know, ambitious on behalf of the State.
18 And I've heard from so many people at the Energy Commission
19 and beyond, you are just a leader that I think a lot of us
20 would like to model ourselves on.

21 So, huge thanks for everything that you have
22 gotten done on behalf of California, and for all of the
23 time, and energy, and passion and commitment that you
24 brought.

25 I'll lastly say that we're excited hopefully that

1 your work enhancing our shared vision doesn't end, and in
2 your new job as Counselor to the Secretary, as appropriate,
3 you can help meet shared goals.

4 You know, the Interior Secretary nominee has an
5 ambitious vision that I think aligns closely with Governor
6 Newsom, so looking forward to continuing to move forward on
7 all things together, and just on behalf of, you know, our
8 agency and all of its employees and teams, thank you,
9 Janea.

10 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Well said, Mr. Secretary.
11 So, when we do this, Madam Vice Chair, if you want to just
12 make a few welcome remarks and then your mother and others
13 who are here, if you want to go to, and then we'll go to --
14 we have a number of comments from VIPs, then we'll go to
15 commissioners, then staff, and then the public. So, go
16 ahead if you'd like to comment.

17 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Great. Well, thank you so
18 much, Wade, for the really kind words. It's been a true
19 pleasure to get to work with you over the years on all
20 kinds of topics, and I know that we will continue to work
21 together, so I'm looking forward to that very much.

22 And I want to welcome, I think that my mom is on
23 the Zoom, my mom, Evelyn Scott. I may have my Aunt Donna
24 and Uncle Michael Threadgill listening on the Zoom as well.
25 And then both my sister Marina and my little niece Abby are

1 at school, so they may have to watch on the recording, but,
2 you know, I have to mention them as well. So, I'm just
3 delighted to have some family and friends on the line.

4 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay, wonderful. Okay.
5 With that, why don't we go -- Noemi, would you mind just
6 calling on the folks on the list in order, and you can take
7 it from there?

8 MS. GALLARDO: Will do, Chair. This is Noemi
9 Gallardo, public advisor. Do you want to read the
10 resolution first or do you want us to go with the comments
11 first?

12 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Let's do the resolution.
13 Actually, could you read the resolution if you have it? I
14 don't have it open.

15 MS. GALLARDO: Yes, I can.

16 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: I have it right here. I
17 have it right here.

18 MS. GALLARDO: Okay, wonderful.

19 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Great, okay. And this is a
20 substantial resolution which is deserved, so bear with me
21 here. Lot to celebrate about you.

22 Whereas Janea Scott has enthusiastically served
23 on the California Energy Commission for the past eight
24 years after first being appointed by Governor Edmund G.
25 Brown, Junior in February of 2013, and reappointed in

1 January of 2016, and whereas Janea was designated Vice
2 Chair of the Energy Commissioner by Governor Gavin Newsom
3 in 2019, and whereas Janea has devoted her efforts to
4 helping lead California to a 100 percent clean energy
5 future for all, and whereas Janea started as the Lead
6 Commissioner of the Fuels and Transportation Division,
7 where she shaped the Clean Transportation Program, formerly
8 known as Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Technology
9 Program.

10 During her leadership of the Clean Transportation
11 Program she helped implement more than 750 million dollars
12 in clean transportation projects throughout the state which
13 supported California's efforts to reduce greenhouse gas
14 emissions, increase the adoption of zero emission vehicles,
15 improved air quality, promoted economic development and
16 reduced the state's dependence on petroleum, and whereas
17 she then served as the Lead Commission for the Energy
18 Research and Development Division. In that role she
19 oversaw the implementation of the Electric Program
20 Investment Charge, EPIC, program, the Natural Gas Research
21 and Development Program, both world-class research programs
22 that advanced energy research technology and innovative by
23 investing in diverse clean energy projects supporting
24 California's clean energy entrepreneurs.

25 And whereas under her leadership the Energy

1 Commission's administration of the EPIC program was renewed
2 through 2030, representing one-and-a-half billion dollars
3 in investment in clean energy research for California.

4 And whereas Janea has served as the Energy
5 Commission's public member during her tenure, diligently
6 working to strengthen opportunities for all Californians to
7 participate in and benefit from Energy Commission policies
8 and programs, including the State's most underserved
9 communities.

10 And whereas Janea was an ambassador for equity
11 and inclusion in California's energy transition, leading a
12 multi-agency coordination effort to develop Senate Bill 350
13 Barrier Study and helping to establish the Disadvantaged
14 Communities Advisory Group.

15 And whereas Janea led the framing and development
16 of the 2014 and 2019 Integrated Energy Policy Reports,
17 which is California's primary energy policy document that
18 provides thoughtful, comprehensive solutions to the State's
19 pressing energy needs.

20 And whereas Janea served as the Chair and Vice
21 Chair of the Western Interconnection Regional Advisory Body
22 and is the California representative for the Western
23 Interstate Energy Board, helping promote, coordinate energy
24 policies their connection and reliability across the west.

25 And whereas Janea spearheaded the California

1 Energy Ports Collaborative, engaging the leaders of six
2 major California seaports to collaborate on important
3 energy issues, common challenges and opportunities for
4 transitioning for to alternative and renewable energy
5 technology that aligned with the ports' operational needs
6 while advancing California's climate and clean energy
7 goals.

8 And whereas between 2013 and 2019 she supported
9 the State's transition to zero emission vehicles by serving
10 as chair of the Plug-In Vehicle Collaborative, and helped
11 shepherd its transition into Veloz, a nonprofit advancing
12 the electric car in California where she sat on the Public
13 Policy Board.

14 And whereas Janea has always embraced mentorship
15 in her personal and professional life by mentoring her
16 team, welcoming students and interns into her office, and
17 dedicating hundreds of weekend and evening hours to local
18 youth mentorship programs.

19 And whereas Janea is known for her enthusiasm,
20 dedicated leadership, focused attention to supporting
21 Energy Commission staff by promoting their excellent work
22 at events and through social media.

23 And whereas Janea has spent considerable time and
24 effort developing and maintaining an enormous network of
25 supported stakeholders for the Energy Commission through

1 her collaborations has created a deep well of external good
2 will and respect in the organization's work.

3 And whereas Janea's leadership, collegiality,
4 innovative thinking, and pragmatic approaches -- I would
5 add sense of humor. That should be in here, too. She's
6 got a great sense of humor. -- have benefited California
7 over the years. She sent me a picture of Bernie, the one
8 with the mittens, in front of the Energy Commission dais
9 last night, so that's -- She will be taking that energetic
10 dedication and commitment that she's well known for to
11 Washington, D.C. to serve as Counselor to the Secretary of
12 the U.S. Department of Interior.

13 Now, therefore, being resolved that the Energy
14 Commission hereby recognizes and commends Janea A. Scott
15 for her many contributions to the Energy Commission and the
16 people of California, the Energy Commission wishes her the
17 best of luck in all her future endeavors.

18 So, with that, let's turn to Madam Public
19 Advisor, if you want to just run through the list that we
20 have.

21 MS. GALLARDO: Yes. So, first up we will have
22 Alice Reynolds. Alice, if you could unmute and begin your
23 remarks. Go ahead.

24 MS. REYNOLDS: Thank you, everyone. Thank you,
25 Chair Hochschild. I'm really pleased to have this

1 opportunity to say a few words.

2 And I wanted to recognize Janea for all of her
3 contributions to the State. I'll say, first, unfortunately
4 today is leaf blower day in my neighborhood, so hopefully
5 you're not interrupted by the background sound.

6 So, I've had the pleasure of working with Janea
7 through two administrations, and there's so many amazing
8 things that I want to say, so, I'll try to be brief.

9 But when I think back to things like putting
10 together our plan to ramp up electric vehicle
11 infrastructure, to implementing the SB350 low-income
12 barrier study report, and then more recently, with all
13 Commissioner Scott's work on EPIC and all of the progress
14 that we've made in that program.

15 I remember throughout Janea's enthusiasm, her
16 perseverance, her thoughtfulness, and also the positive
17 atmosphere that she brings to any group. It really helped
18 to sustain everything that we did.

19 And, you know, also I think that it is really
20 worth mentioning that throughout the efforts that we have
21 undertaken together she's always had a strong sense of
22 equity and justice and making sure that we remembered all
23 Californians as we carried forward our work. So, really
24 Janea was thinking about California for all, before it
25 became something that, you know, we put on the emblem in

1 this administration.

2 So, all of that makes me feel incredibly excited.
3 I think I would be very, very sad if I weren't looking
4 forward to the opportunity to continue to work with Janea,
5 but thankfully, today we have an emotional day, one of many
6 that we've had recently, but emotional because we have so
7 much to look forward to in the partnership with
8 Commissioner Scott that she'll bring forward to her new
9 role.

10 I think about the importance of Federal lands and
11 our partnership with the Federal Government in climate
12 change and conservation efforts and all of the work that we
13 have going forward, and I'm really thrilled and looking
14 forward to working with Janea as part of our extended
15 family.

16 The thought of all of the change that we can
17 achieve and the difference that we can make, it's just
18 really humbling and, you know, amazing.

19 So, this is not goodbye, and it makes me hopeful
20 for the state, it makes me hopeful for the nation, and
21 really even for the world.

22 So, good luck, Janea, and I want to send all my
23 best from the team at the Governor's office. You have
24 many, many supporters and fans, and I just wanted to
25 communicate that on behalf of all of us.

1 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

2 MS. GALLARDO: Next we have Matt Baker. Matt,
3 you're welcome to turn on your video box.

4 MR. BAKER: Hello, Commissioner. I want to --
5 I'll be relatively brief, but I also want to thank you for
6 your service and for the example that you've provided. I'm
7 looking forward to your new position as an advocate for
8 climate, for conservation, for justice inequity. I am
9 very, very excited to work with you in your new position,
10 very excited to, you know, see progress on issues that are
11 important to California and really important to the world
12 like offshore wind, you know, expanding the model that was
13 created, the desert renewable energy conservation plan,
14 and, you know, all of the important work that the Interior
15 Department will be doing.

16 So, I would just like to congratulate you both on
17 fantastic service that you have provided for the State of
18 California, and, you know, I'm very much looking forward to
19 the work that you'll be able to do, not just on behalf of
20 California, but on behalf of, you know, the whole country
21 and the world in these very important issues.

22 Thank you for your service. I really appreciate
23 it.

24 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

25 MS. GALLARDO: Now we'll have Commissioner

1 Guzman-Aceves.

2 COMMISSIONER GUZMAN-ACEVES: Good morning,
3 everyone, and thank you, Commissioner Scott, for your
4 service to this great State of California. I, too, like
5 Alice, had the pleasure of working with you over two
6 administrations. But I think really over the last two
7 years I've really appreciated just the amount of detail and
8 implementation skills that you have to get us from point A
9 to point B, and to just not forget one piece of
10 consideration along the way.

11 It's been an advantage to have you as a partner
12 on some of these recent areas that we focused on, most
13 notably the Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group that you
14 not only got off, you know, from scratch, and not much
15 direction is often given to legislation, and this is no --
16 this is a great example of that.

17 But, really, your thoughtfulness and thoroughness
18 on just everything from really tough siting decisions to
19 something as new and innovative as the Disadvantaged
20 Community Advisory Group. And I certainly want to
21 recognize your leadership in the EPIC research and
22 development program, and that collaboration, not just in
23 really focusing the priorities of both agencies, but I
24 think in creating a collaboration within our agencies as
25 true sister agencies that really I think was enhanced by

20

1 your leadership, and the ability to really just foster that
2 collaboration with professionalism and tenacity with all of
3 our staff.

4 And, finally, I just wanted to quote. I had the
5 advantage of participating in a little bit of farewell
6 remarks from the Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group,
7 and one of the members, Andres Puente from Pacoima
8 Beautiful, said some really eloquent remarks, and I just
9 want to quote him because he really sums it up really well.

10 He said, "Commissioner Scott, you're a reflection
11 of a new administration and much needed to this country,
12 that someone so capable, someone so committed to equity is
13 going to Washington. This is what the country needs, and
14 our loss is a gain for the country."

15 So, thank you so much for your partnership, and I
16 look forward to working with you as well in your new
17 capacity.

18 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

19 MS. GALLARDO: And now we have a message from
20 Commissioner Rex Shawson who was unable to be with us in
21 person, but has sent over a special video. If we could
22 play that now.

23 COMMISSIONER SHAWSON: . . . a Commissioner on
24 the California Public Utilities Commission.

25 It's been my great pleasure to work with

1 Commissioner Scott over the past eight years since she came
2 to California. I've learned a lot from her very strong
3 leadership and deep expertise on transportation
4 electrification issues, on western grid issues for the many
5 years that Commissioner Scott was chair of the Western
6 Interconnection Regional Advisory Board. WIRAB, and also in
7 issues relating to the Disadvantaged Committee's Advisory
8 Group, among others.

9 I can't tell you how many times I and others have
10 benefitted from her being so super organized, calling
11 meetings, sending out reminders, preparing agendas for
12 everyone. She's just always on top of things. She's also
13 super considerate and thoughtful and unfailing positive and
14 upbeat, no matter what, no matter what, which makes it such
15 a pleasure to work with her. You could not ask for a
16 better collaborator.

17 And on top of that I think everyone will agree
18 that she is one of the nicest people to work with. In
19 fact, she is just one of the nicest people anywhere,
20 period.

21 We PUC Commissioners like to have some friendly
22 rivalries with our Energy Commission counterparts, but with
23 Commissioner Scott it's just not possible. There's nothing
24 to tease her about.

25 Commissioner Scott, good luck in your new role.

1 We will really miss you, but we are very happy that you
2 will be in a position to do so much good for California and
3 the rest of the country in these critical times.

4 MS. GALLARDO: All right. Next up we will have
5 Mary Nichols. Mary, if you could turn on your video, you
6 may begin.

7 MS. NICHOLS: Thank you. I wasn't sure where I
8 was in the queue.

9 I find that as usual in these things, if a person
10 has a strong personality and has made a big impression, a
11 lot of people's reactions are going to be very similar, and
12 that is definitely true for Janea.

13 I can't add any more adjectives in terms of her
14 personality and the contribution that she makes to any
15 group that she's a part of, but I can maybe share a little
16 bit of insight to her, which is that she is a really good
17 person to go on a road trip with.

18 She and I had a really fun trip from northern --
19 from southern California, from LA to Sacramento, with a
20 stop to refuel a hydrogen fuel cell vehicle, broadcasting
21 along the way and leading a little caravan of other cars,
22 and ending up, as I recall, at a watering hole somewhere in
23 downtown Sacramento where there might have been some
24 margaritas involved. And I think that's an illustration
25 of not only her attitude, but her willingness to put

1 herself out there on the line for the right cause, and this
2 was definitely the righteous cause.

3 We've done so much working together with the
4 Energy Commission and the PUC and really making electric
5 vehicles not only the wonderful contributors that they are
6 to the environment, but also helping to enhance the
7 reputation of these vehicles as things that people would
8 want to have. And that was very much a part of Janea's
9 vision, and it fit with our overall philosophy.

10 She is one of the founding mothers of the Veloz
11 organization which has now gone on to be a successful
12 nonprofit that was spun off, but it has its connections
13 still to the state in terms of collaboration and sharing of
14 information at all times.

15 I first met Janea -- she may not remember this --
16 but before she came to work for the State she worked for
17 the Environmental Defense Fund once upon a time, a long,
18 long time ago. And that was where I first met her.

19 She wasn't a Californian then. She was
20 definitely from another state a little bit across the
21 mountains as I recall. But she has become a Californian
22 over this time, and so, if there's one message that I want
23 to send back to her, it is -- to her and with her, it is
24 that California is definitely part of the west. We are not
25 an island onto ourselves, and our relationship with the

24

1 Federal Government through all the many agencies that touch
2 on us is extremely important. So, I hope when you go back
3 there they think of you as that California lady.

4 Thank you so much. It's been great to work with
5 you. We'll miss you.

6 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

7 MS. GALLARDO: All right. Next we have Carla
8 Peterman. Carla, you may begin.

9 MS. PETERMAN: Hi, everyone. Hello, Commissioner
10 Scott, Janea. It is my absolute pleasure to add my
11 congratulations to you on a job well done, as well as offer
12 our support as you take on this new adventure. So happy
13 that you're going to be representing the energy in
14 California inD.C..

15 I've had the opportunity to work with you in
16 various capacities, and whether it's been as a
17 collaborator, a colleague, and now as a regulator, every
18 role, every opportunity you've approached with the same
19 pragmatism, the same integrity, the same curiosity, the
20 same professionalism, and I can tell you that you will
21 truly be missed by so many stakeholders.

22 Everyone has already said it, but the
23 contributions that you've made to energy planning, clean
24 energy transportation, equity will be long lasting.

25 And I have to say on a personal note, what I'll

25

1 miss the most is getting credit for all your good work. As
2 Janea knows, over the last eight years we have been
3 mistaken for each other many times, and we've not made it
4 any better by trading hairstyles during that period.

5 And I'll say the best time was I was attending a
6 meeting, and the day after the meeting someone said to me,
7 wow, you ran that meeting yesterday so well. It was so
8 much better than any other time I went to that meeting.
9 And I had to say, well, it was actually Commissioner Scott
10 who ran that meeting, but I ran it last year, and so I'm
11 really glad to hear that it's been improved, and I have to
12 say I can't disagree.

13 So, I'm so glad we get to still swim in the same
14 circles, and you have been a terrific person to work with
15 all these years. Congratulations.

16 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Carla.

17 MS. GALLARDO: All right. So, next we have
18 Caroline Choi on the list. I have not been able to find
19 her in my Zoom, so I just want to give her a chance.
20 Caroline, if you're there if you could either raise your
21 hand. If you're on the phone line, press star nine to
22 raise your hand. Give her a few seconds. All right. So,
23 we'll move forward. We have a long list.

24 So, next up will be Stan Greschner. Stan, you
25 may unmute and turn on your video. You're muted, Stan. If

1 you could unmute from your screen.

2 MR. GRESCHNER: I'm unmuting. Good morning,
3 Commissioners. I'm Stan Greschner. I'm the Chief Policy
4 Officer at GRID Alternatives and also the chair of the
5 CEC's and CPUC's Disadvantaged Community Advisory Group.

6 It was interesting to see the pictures that were
7 rolling at the beginning because I saw, Commissioner Scott,
8 you with a hard hat on at the Alternative's installation,
9 helping install solar for low-income families. So I think
10 it's emblematic of the work you've done over the past eight
11 years, and getting out in the community, and really
12 understanding what is needed and what the opportunities are
13 on the equity front.

14 So, first I want to congratulate you on your new
15 role at the Department of Interior. Thank you so much for
16 joining the DACAG meeting last Friday to allow all of our
17 members to share their personal gratitude of working with
18 you directly over the past few years, and thank you,
19 Commissioner Guzman Aceves for sharing one of our members,
20 one of their thoughts.

21 You've been an extremely staunch advocate for
22 equity during your time at the Commission which I'm sure
23 will carry into your role back at the Department of
24 Interior.

25 And for those of you who don't know, Commissioner

1 Scott was central to helping our Disadvantaged Community
2 Advisory Group get established two years ago. She attended
3 nearly every one of our meetings that first year. She
4 traveled to all of our remote meetings, and we're doing
5 that sort of thing around the state, again, as we welcome
6 feedback from community members from LA and Fresno where we
7 were hosting them.

8 She worked directly with us and helped our
9 organization that was nothing, that had no idea what to do,
10 they had no mandate, to form our identity as an advocacy
11 partner with the CEC. You made us a partner with the
12 commission and you helped us build the foundation of the
13 impactful group that it is today.

14 So, on behalf of the DACAG members I again want
15 to express our gratitude for your support and admiration
16 for how you have centered equity in your work with this
17 position. So, I wish you all the best. You'll be missed
18 in these conversations, but we will carry your equity
19 leadership forward, so thank you very much.

20 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

21 MS. GALLARDO: Next is Sara Gersen. Sara, you
22 may begin.

23 MS. GERSEN: Good morning. I'm Sara Gersen,
24 clean energy attorney at Earthjustice, and I'm here to
25 express Earthjustice's deep appreciation for Commissioner

1 Scott's service to advancing clean energy, clean air, and
2 equity at the commission.

3 As folks have already mentioned, Commissioner
4 Scott has devoted significant time to making sure equity
5 remains a part of the work of our energy agencies. I
6 appreciate everything she's done for the Disadvantaged
7 Communities Advisory Group and her regular participation in
8 that.

9 Commissioner Scott has also spent just a
10 tremendous amount of time working to understand the unique
11 challenges posed with cleaning up our seaports and other
12 freight facilities, which is critical work because of the
13 immense stress that these facilities pose for these
14 communities.

15 So, finally, these are difficult times for our
16 planet as we work to tackle climate pollution, and we need
17 desperately to send smart, devoted people to work in
18 Washington, D.C. Commissioner Scott, you fit this to a
19 "T," and we wish you all the best as you head to the
20 Department of the Interior.

21 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

22 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Noemi, did you want
23 me to go to the video now?

24 MS. GALLARDO: Yes.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. So, we'll go now to

1 Commissioner comments, and to kick it off, we have a little
2 video. Let's tee it up.

3 (Video played)

4 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: All right. Well, the Janea
5 Scott celebration and album is coming out later this year.

6 Commissioner Douglas, did you have any nonmusical
7 words you wanted to share?

8 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Yes, I did. So, we have
9 to work with Zoom in resolution, but, Janea, I'll send you
10 the better video because we have one. I think we might
11 overwhelm the system.

12 But the actual lyric, you know, the song is "Hey
13 there, Delilah," and the actual lyrics when I started
14 writing them started out "Mad at Janea," and then, you
15 know, I had to dig deep and turn it into something, you
16 know, a little more mature.

17 But, anyway, I'll send you the better recording,
18 and I just wanted to say, and I don't know how much of the
19 lyric you could hear, but what it does trace through is the
20 -- you know, the work that you did at the Department of
21 Interior before you came to the Commission and the great
22 progress that we were able to make working with you then.

23 And, of course, I want to acknowledge your
24 tremendous contribution here at the Energy Commission.
25 I've really enjoyed working with you on siting cases. We

30

1 had some hard ones together. I've enjoyed working with you
2 on just seeing, you know, the barriers report, DACAG,
3 diversity work, seeing your leadership on transportation,
4 on ethics, on IEPR, our partnership of the last month or so
5 on AB841, which has been tremendous.

6 And I don't know if we have a Commissioner who
7 reads quite as much of you. You read every word of
8 everything you get, which is, you know, more so it seems to
9 me anyway. The enthusiasm and attention to detail and
10 positive energy that others have mentioned, the way you
11 take the public member role very seriously, and foster
12 access and hear diverse voices that want to speak to the
13 Commission.

14 And, so, I just want to thank you for your hard
15 work and dedication and friendship over the years, and,
16 anyway, wish you luck and look forward to working with you.

17 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Commissioner
18 Douglas.

19 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Next. Sorry, Commissioner
21 McAllister, you have to follow that act.

22 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Yeah. I definitely
23 think we're going to need some liner notes to this meeting
24 because we definitely want to read through the lyrics as
25 well.

1 But, yeah, I mean so many great points. I had
2 all these points noted down and I've been picking them off
3 as they get mentioned already, so as not to repeat every
4 single one. But it will be hard not to repeat some.

5 I've really missed over the last year not having
6 you across the wall, on the other side of my wall at the
7 Energy Commission, and hearing the laughter and just the
8 parade, the procession of meetings that you have through
9 your office. And, you know, we all have a lot going on,
10 and it was really -- even if I couldn't quite understand
11 what was being said across the wall, I knew there was a lot
12 of heavy lifting going on and that you were really engaged
13 with staff, stakeholders, and it was just very clear, you
14 know, at all times. And I really appreciated that
15 openness, and just the respect for process and access,
16 others have said, culminating emblematic -- most
17 emblematic, I think, in the barriers report, but really
18 throughout your whole tenure, and that's been just super
19 helpful for the Commission and getting better products
20 across the board, not just in the areas that you happen to
21 be overseeing.

22 The barriers report really I think, again, is
23 just an example of the great work that you led that is
24 changing the narrative. That really is changing the
25 conversation. It has legs. It has long-term impact in

1 that people are continuing to take seriously and really
2 sets the tone.

3 TheD.C.AG, you know, extends that kind of
4 approach even further into the future and gives it
5 institutional structure. So, I just -- it's so critical
6 for California. We all know how important equity is, how
7 fundamental it is to achieving our goals, and that we
8 admittedly won't achieve them without bringing everyone
9 along, and the institutional structures just have to do
10 that, and you've been really the center of that
11 conversation during your tenure.

12 I guess just a couple of other things. I mean we
13 collaborated on a number of things. You know, when you
14 were over at transportation we didn't necessarily intersect
15 that much because I was buildings and, you know,
16 forecasting and some of the analytics that didn't really
17 overlap that much with transportation.

18 But when you moved over to EPIC, we've done a lot
19 more together and I've really just loved the convergence of
20 what we do out in the world with the research that we used
21 to develop the opportunities to do things out in the world.
22 And that EPIC, you know, efficiency buildings kind of nexus
23 is just, again, it's fundamental. And, so, having
24 partnered with you on that with this long-term vision on
25 behalf of the state has just been super gratifying.

1 And then, last, I'll just say on the 2019 IEPR we
2 collaborated and to your organization skills, I backed you
3 up on the technical stuff when that was necessary and the
4 forecast and some of the -- you know, some of the
5 nettlesome issues that we had to deal with during that
6 IEPR. But I could always breathe easy knowing that you had
7 the kind of organizational piece of it and were keeping
8 things on track and the trains running, and I could kind of
9 parachute in when needed, and that was just a real load off
10 of me as well, just knowing that you were competently
11 making sure that things were happening and being organized,
12 and so -- and throughout all of that I just really enjoyed
13 becoming friends and just working together with you and
14 interacting in all sorts of social and just informal ways
15 as well.

16 It's just been super gratifying, and I'm sure
17 we'll keep in touch. I know you'll be -- I was actually --
18 it's great to have you, you know, whispering in the
19 Interior Secretary's ear, you know what happened with the
20 BLM plan in California. So, that will be terrific. You
21 know, we have your phone number, so we'll be able to call
22 you.

23 And, anyway, Karen did not mention the DRECP, but
24 I'm sure that will come up.

25 But, anyway, really great luck. I wish we could

1 give you a real hug instead of a virtual hug, but, really,
2 if not -- it's not goodbye, right, it's just a little bit
3 of farewell for a while. So, best of luck and thanks for
4 everything, Janea.

5 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Well said, Commissioner.
6 Thank you.

7 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Let's go to Commissioner
9 Monahan.

10 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Thank you. Well, Vice
11 Chair Scott, I was actually contemplating when we first
12 met, and this was, of course, long before you were Vice
13 Chair Scott. We were both working for nonprofit
14 environmental organizations. You were at EPS; I was at the
15 Union of Concerned Scientists. I don't know if you recall,
16 but we were both intersecting on the Diesel Emission
17 Reduction Act with Senator Voinovich.

18 And I've got to say, maybe I'm disclosing
19 something inappropriate, but sometimes there's competition
20 between nonprofit organizations. You'd think, oh, they're
21 all happy, but, no, no, there's a lot of backstabbing
22 issues, elbowing and it can be a rough world.

23 And we were both intersecting in this and some of
24 your colleagues weren't so nice, but I've got to say what
25 stood out when I started working with you is that you were

35

1 both a consummate professional and you were so nice to work
2 with. And I would tell everybody, I was like, oh my gosh,
3 Janea is wonderful, other colleagues I had been butting
4 heads with. But you were just such a -- you were always
5 thinking about like what's the most important policy to get
6 through and how do we get it through. And you didn't come
7 in with a lot of ego, and mean spiritedness. You came in
8 with like an open heart and wanting to -- wanting to like
9 learn from what was happening in California through the
10 Carl Moyer Program, and so, it was just wonderful to work
11 with you then, and it remains so.

12 And I know it was about 18 years ago because my
13 younger daughter -- I had just given birth to my younger
14 daughter when I was working on all that. So, I like to say
15 I was pretty (audio skips) surprised through that period,
16 but I remember that very distinctly.

17 And it was wonderful to be able to come to the
18 Energy Commission and basically ride on your coattails. I
19 mean, you did such a good job setting up the Clean
20 Transportation Program and led so many seminal initiatives,
21 you know the school bus replacement program, really seeing
22 like this opportunity for B to G in the school bus arena
23 and capitalizing on that. And, you know, the ports
24 collaborative, and just so many ways that you were thinking
25 ahead of the curve about how can we really demonstrate that

1 this was the clean transportation system for all.

2 So, you know, I feel really mixed about you
3 leaving, as everybody does. I mean, I think that you've
4 accomplished great things here. You're going to accomplish
5 great things for the Biden administration as well. Now we
6 have a partner in the Biden administration in terms of
7 advancing clean energy for all, and you are going to be
8 such a key leader in that.

9 I mean every time I look at another appointment,
10 you know, I think, wow, what an amazing group of climate
11 leaders we have in the Federal government, and it's been a
12 long time. We're all chomping at the bit to have a
13 positive relationship with the Federal Government.

14 So, I'm just really happy to know that you'll be
15 there, and I'm assuming we're going to keep intersecting in
16 your new job and beyond, so this is not a farewell. This
17 is just an opportunity to really give you accolades for all
18 you've done for California. So, thank you.

19 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Well said, Commissioner
21 Monahan.

22 Well, I'd just like to add a few thoughts about
23 Janea the person and the friend. We were sworn in together
24 eight years ago on the same day, so we have joked it's
25 always like twins arriving, but I remember when we first

1 met I realized, okay, this woman is smarter, better
2 organized, more attractive, more popular than me. The
3 (indiscernible) all together. And, really, like it's just
4 such a delight to become friends over the years and share
5 Thanksgivings and dinners.

6 And I remember before COVID we would go out to a
7 movie, you know, especially in the early days before things
8 got really busy. But, you know, once a month or so, always
9 some action movie that I didn't think I'd enjoy that you
10 wanted me to go to, and then I ended up loving it. And
11 there were such great evenings to kind of relieve stress
12 and just brainstorm a bit, and it really mattered a lot,
13 Janea, you know, settling into the new job, having you
14 there to talk to and to commiserate with, and collaborate
15 with, brainstorm with.

16 And so much of what we talked about has come to
17 fruition. You know, it's just amazing. I had Drew add up
18 the amount of money we've given away at the Energy
19 Commission since you arrived and it's just under four
20 billion dollars. And, you know, you've presided. The work
21 you did on transportation really laid the groundwork for
22 the Governor's executive order, you know, in collaboration
23 with CARB and others. You know, the solar mandate on new
24 homes, the ban on incandescent light bulbs, you know, all
25 these votes we've taken, and now this new billion dollars

1 of infrastructure for clean transportation charging and
2 refueling, I mean that is a template for the country, and
3 so, I really hope you take pride in that and also just how
4 you have done it, because it's just with a lot of grace,
5 and decency, and competence, and you've just been a real
6 light.

7 So, I just wanted to leave you with these words.
8 Amanda Gorman, you know, really touched us all at the
9 inauguration last week, and her closing line has just
10 really been ringing very true for me. For there is always
11 light if we have the courage to see it, if we have the
12 courage to be it.

13 And, you know, today is a bittersweet day because
14 we're losing you, but the sweet part of it is you're doing
15 the right thing. I really feel you are stepping up. You
16 are stepping into that courage to be the next thing you
17 need to be. And I think you're going to move mountains in
18 that new role, and we're eager to partner with you and help
19 build this clean energy future together with you. I'm just
20 so proud and grateful to have worked with you.

21 So, with that we'll go to -- I think we have some
22 comments from staff.

23 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

24 MR. BOHAN: Janea, this is Drew. I get to go
25 first on behalf of staff. Others want to speak

1 individually and we they will. But on behalf of all 750 of
2 us, I just want to say two things, thank you and good luck.
3 You've been a constant bright light in the eight years
4 we've worked together, and in both transportation and R&D
5 you motivated staff. You motivated them to develop
6 creative ideas, and do their best, and take chances. Your
7 support really helped our staff flourish.

8 And you always knew that you were the public
9 member and what that meant in your representation of all
10 Californians, regardless of whether they pay attention to
11 what we do every day or don't frankly even know we exist
12 was really laudable.

13 As you've heard from so many outside the CEC,
14 you've been a tremendous ambassador for our organization
15 everywhere you go, and we hope that will continue when you
16 move on from us.

17 We're going to miss you. We're waiting for big
18 things in D.C., and we wish you the very best. You've been
19 a great boss and mentor, and again, thank you.

20 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

21 MS. GALLARDO: Next up is Laurie ten Hope.
22 Laurie, you may begin.

23 MS. TEN HOPE: Thank you so much for giving us an
24 opportunity to speak on behalf of staff. We've certainly
25 heard about your power as a leader in the energy space.

1 And I just want to speak a little bit to your leadership of
2 staff.

3 The same attributes that people speak to that
4 have made you so impactful, you know, in the energy policy
5 space have really helped to boost staff's confidence and to
6 reinforce the value of their work.

7 You value science. You value the power of
8 innovation, and obviously that supports our policy goals,
9 and also supports our staff who come to this job because
10 they care about the same thing. And sometimes the work is
11 hard, but to get a personal reinforcement that the work
12 matters, that it makes a difference, and that you see the
13 staff as individuals.

14 And I just want to thank you for taking the time
15 to personally acknowledge staff and really acknowledge them
16 personally. The Vice Chair takes time to thank staff after
17 business meetings, after personal briefings in her office,
18 and, you know, with enthusiasm, appreciation and, you know,
19 that really means -- it means a lot.

20 We had a chance in our lead commissioner briefing
21 to do a personal, you know, personal goodbye, and I just
22 want to share one staff person who kind of exemplifies
23 staff's experience with the Vice Chair.

24 He said when he was young in his career he heard
25 that he was going to travel with the Vice Chair on a three-

1 hour site visit, and he was super nervous. I'm going to be
2 with a Commissioner. You know, what are we going to talk
3 about? This is just, you know, this is like -- this is
4 frightening.

5 And he said what a fantastic experience it was,
6 you know, just to have, you know, real conversation with a
7 real person and felt like, you know, he built a friendship.
8 So, I thank you for that.

9 I just want to -- I want to close with just a
10 little symbol of our R and D Lead Commissioner briefings.
11 We work with the Vice Chair on our research programs and
12 the food processing programs, and, you know, most of the
13 meetings are really to seek her guidance on our next steps
14 on our programs.

15 We always close the program with an example of a
16 project success, and we call it our home run or base hit
17 portion of the program. And just to carry that baseball
18 analogy, I just want to say ERDD feels like we hit the
19 grand slam when we got the Vice Chair to oversee our
20 program and just want to thank her for her enthusiasm, her
21 kindness and her vision and leadership with the research
22 program. Thank you so much.

23 MS. SCOTT: Thank you.

24 MS. GALLARDO: All right. Next is Siva. Go
25 ahead, Siva.

1 MR. GUNDHA: Good morning, Commissioners and good
2 morning, Vice Chair.

3 I've been debating whether to make a comment or
4 not. Matt Caldwell is going to make a comment on behalf of
5 the EAD and he's going to do a much better job than I do.
6 So, I just didn't want to miss out on the opportunity to
7 publicly say thank you to you.

8 There is a number of our leaders that already
9 have talked about your accomplishments and your
10 contribution to the State of California, so I do not feel
11 in the same league to be able to say those kinds of things,
12 but I just wanted to share a couple of things that you have
13 helped foster. So, for EAD staff, I joined the Assessments
14 Division during a transitional period for ZEVs and the
15 forecasting.

16 I just wanted to thank you so much for your
17 thoughtfulness and your ability to dig into the details and
18 being able to advise on how to think about the forecasting
19 and the idea about developing that idea. So now to think
20 about our futures that we could get to and how we could get
21 to.

22 I just want to appreciate all the support that
23 you showed us in helping us go through that moment which
24 was very difficult for our staff to kind of think through.

25 I also want to just thank you for and I don't

1 know if you recall, you gave us a complete day sitting with
2 us on a strategic planning exercise, and that was just --
3 talks to your -- speaks to your kind of dedication to staff
4 and helping them succeed and shine, and I just -- Laurie
5 kind of mentioned this very beautifully, just your support
6 of the staff and helping them shine has been incredible for
7 us.

8 Personally, I also had a chance to travel with
9 you a couple of times, and my experience was very similar,
10 which was I was petrified to go out with you for the first
11 couple times. I didn't know what a Commissioner, and we
12 were kind of still figuring out the forecasting. I didn't
13 want to be in trouble. But you have shown your amazing
14 personal side and connection, and the things that I took
15 away from that is your kindness and your love for your
16 family. You spoke about your mother, you spoke about your
17 sisters, you spoke about your niece. It was just so
18 beautiful to connect with you on a personal level and
19 develop that kind of relationship with you, so thank you.
20 And I will forever brag about the walks I had with you once
21 you leave, so I will talk about the walks with Vice Chair
22 Scott talking about life, and justice, and everything
23 together.

24 And, finally, I spoke to Nora this morning and I
25 told her that today was your last day, and Nora just wanted

1 me to thank you again for the wonderful bread that you
2 baked, and she told me that's her favorite bread ever, so,
3 thank you for everything you have done for the division,
4 for the Commission and for me personally helping me grow.
5 Thank you so much and all the very best.

6 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you.

7 MS. GALLARDO: All right. So, Vice Chair Scott,
8 next up we're going to have some of your current and former
9 advisors starting with Rhetta. Go ahead, Rhetta.

10 MS. de MESA: Hi, Janea. I just wanted to take a
11 minute here today to personally say thank you so very much
12 for everything over the years.

13 We spent a good portion of my time at the
14 Commission and almost all of your time working together,
15 and it has really been such an honor and a pleasure.

16 I feel like you really took a chance on me when I
17 was one of the younger staff and didn't have a lot of
18 experience, and I just learned so much under your
19 leadership, not just about energy, and policy, and
20 technology. There's a lot of that, of course. But also
21 the intangibles like how to lead with vision and purpose,
22 how to cultivate and foster a collaborative team
23 environment, and how to inspire confidence in others.

24 Not only did you welcome me into your office, but
25 you've always been so encouraging and supportive, always

1 giving me the band width to explore areas that I was
2 interested in learning more about and creating
3 opportunities and space for me to work on the skills I
4 wanted to develop. I think anyone who spent any amount of
5 time in your office can attest to the fact that we
6 automatically have a built-in cheerleader in you which is
7 just amazing.

8 You're always quick to send an email with kind
9 words expressing your appreciation, always willing to carve
10 time out to check in regardless of how busy your day is,
11 and I know firsthand how busy your days are. And coming to
12 work every day knowing that you have that level of support
13 really does make a difference.

14 It's been such a privilege working with you over
15 the years, one that I certainly don't take for granted.
16 Although I'm so incredibly sad to see you go, I look
17 forward to seeing all the things that you accomplish in
18 your next role.

19 So, thank you for being such a great boss, thank
20 you for being such a great mentor, and on a personal note,
21 thank you for becoming a great friend.

22 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thanks, Rhetta.

23 MS. GALLARDO: Next is Mona. You may begin,
24 Mona.

25 MS. BADIE: I'm also an advisor with Vice Chair

1 Scott's office, and as another member of the Janea Scott
2 fan club I just want to thank you, Janea. I know you're
3 going to hear this several times in the coming days, but I
4 especially want to thank you for your tremendous enthusiasm
5 for all things energy, and your enthusiasm and support for
6 the people that you work with.

7 I got to see firsthand many of the benefits that
8 your brought to California and our diverse communities and
9 it's really inspiring. I have learned so much during my
10 short time with your office, so thank you, thank you, thank
11 you.

12 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Mona.

13 MS. GALLARDO: Next we have Linda. Linda, you
14 may begin.

15 MS. BARRERA: Good morning. I also wanted to
16 personally thank you and am so grateful for this
17 opportunity, Janea. It has been an inspiration to watch
18 you lead these past eight years and to see you passionately
19 and effectively help California move towards a clean energy
20 future.

21 I had the honor and privilege to serve as your
22 advisor during part of your time with the commission, and
23 am so grateful to have learned so much from you, and this
24 has been said before, but I want to just emphasize that you
25 have an incredible capacity to connect with anyone who

1 crosses your path and adapt to the most challenging
2 circumstances. And it was incredible to see you make time
3 to mentor and inspire others to follow their dreams. And I
4 will always remember how you had just incredible schedules,
5 super, super busy and you always found time to like write
6 thank you notes to people that participated, for example,
7 at the EPIC symposiums and other events, and that was just
8 very inspirational, and I hope to follow that quality you
9 have throughout my career.

10 And another quality that I just love is that
11 you're always so enthusiastic about your work and it's
12 really infectious.

13 And, last, I want to say that I'm just very
14 grateful for you as an inspiring woman and a terrific
15 friend, and thank you for showing me and all the other
16 advisors how to be a great leader.

17 I'm excited for what you're going to embark on in
18 your next adventure at the Federal level. I will miss you
19 a lot here in California, but I'm so happy for you.
20 Congratulations. And like everybody else, I wish you the
21 very best in your new role.

22 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Linda.

23 MS. GALLARDO: All right. Next we have Matt.

24 MR. COLDWELL: Janea, how are you? So, it's
25 funny, I was -- Siva mentioned I was going to make some

1 comments on behalf of the division, so there's no way that
2 I can top what he shared. I thought that was beautifully
3 put, so I'll just second what he said.

4 One thing I was going to note, ironically this
5 year is the year that we're going to finally tackle that
6 time to station issue that you've been talking to us about
7 on the transportation forecast, so I'll try my best to keep
8 you updated on that while you're in D.C.

9 More personally, I mean others, Linda, and Mona
10 and Rhetta, they all said all the wonderful things about
11 you that I could repeat, and so I'll just second that.
12 And, you know, you took a chance on me almost five years
13 ago now and I got to serve in your office for about three
14 years, and, you know it's three years that I'll never, ever
15 forget, and we did so many wonderful things, you know, all
16 the traveling that we did. I don't think I've been in so
17 many airports in such a, you know, short timespan in my
18 life, and, you know, just all the meetings, while it was
19 work it never really felt like work at all. It just felt
20 like, you know, we were out there doing good.

21 And we sort of, you know, followed your lead, and
22 your leadership was just amazing during the time that I
23 worked in your office, and then even since I've left, with
24 your leadership over the Energy Assessments Division.

25 So, one thing, one story I wanted to just to

1 tell. I still remember when you called, again, almost five
2 years ago to offer me the position as advisor in your
3 office, and I was obviously beyond excited, and I took the
4 call, and I was in the CEC building, and as soon as I hung
5 up with you I ran down the street to the other side of the
6 park and, you know, jumped up and down and celebrated, and
7 I'm pretty sure everybody over there thought I was losing
8 my mind, but that's how much it meant to me.

9 And, so, from the bottom of my heart I want to
10 thank you for taking that chance on me. Obviously we're
11 super sad that you're leaving, but also, you know, so
12 excited for you about where you're going. So, all the best
13 to you in the future going forward, so, thank you.

14 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Matt.

15 MS. GALLARDO: Next we'll have Patrick.

16 MR. McCANN-KINGSTON: Thank you, Noemi. I hear
17 all these things that people are saying, and they are all
18 true.

19 I've had the pleasure to work with Janaea for the
20 past year, and it's been one of the most rewarding work
21 experiences I've ever had. I'm another person that Janaea
22 took a chance on. Janaea and her two advisors at the time,
23 Rhetta deMesa and Linda Barrera, took a chance on me, and I
24 was able to become a student assistant in her office for
25 which I'm forever grateful.

1 You know, I once asked Chair Hochschild have you
2 had a career instead of just holding down a job, and he
3 told me that when you have a true passion for what you do
4 it no longer feels like work, and your career kind of lines
5 itself up and you've found it at that moment.

6 And I don't think there's anybody more exemplary
7 of that fact than Janea Scott. Janea lightens up every
8 meeting we've ever been in, whether it's in person or
9 virtual. She's always making people laugh. She gets
10 people excited about what they do. People just can't get
11 enough of Janea honestly. And she brings that true passion
12 to her work, and the passion that is often contagious and
13 inspiring.

14 You know, when you work alongside Janea, it
15 doesn't feel like you're working so much as you're trying
16 to solve like an interesting puzzle is what it feels like.
17 She's always asking you important questions. You know, she
18 catches things in meetings, things that I would never
19 catch. But it's great to see that because, you know, it
20 inspires me and educates me further about the things she
21 knows so much about. She has such an extensive breadth of
22 knowledge about the field she works in. And anybody who's
23 worked alongside Janea can attest to these things. She has
24 a -- when you hear her speak of the California Energy
25 Commission, of the work that it does, you can tell that

1 she's truly proud of what she does and what the
2 organization has accomplished as a whole.

3 I wish I had had more time in the office to work
4 with Janea, but I know that she's off to better things. I
5 congratulate you on your new position. I think you're
6 going to be amazing out there. And it's funny, you know,
7 when I first was told by Janea that she wasn't going to
8 seek reappointment I was in my living room. My roommate
9 was next to me, and I read the email out loud, and he was,
10 wow, like where do you think she'll end up. She's got a
11 lot of like skills and stuff, because he always heard about
12 Janea before. And I said she's either going to work for
13 Biden, or she's gearing up to take his job in 2024. So, I
14 guess I was half right, and maybe in four years I'll be a
15 hundred percent right. I wouldn't be surprised, honestly.
16 You know, with Janea it always feels like anything is
17 possible if you work alongside her.

18 Anyways, thank you, Janea, for being my boss and
19 mentor these past years. Despite everything that has
20 happened and all the circumstances that we've had to adapt
21 to, I'll be forever grateful for your tutelage and the
22 tutelage of the advisors I've been lucky enough to work
23 under.

24 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Patrick.

25 MS. GALLARDO: So now we'll have Courtney. You

1 may begin.

2 MS. SMITH: Hey, Janea. I mean, frankly, I
3 wouldn't be at the Energy Commission if it wasn't for you,
4 since you're the one who hired me many years ago.

5 You know, Mary referenced some of those trips we
6 took together pre-COVID, and I think you both really taught
7 me work hard, yes, but it's also good to have a little fun
8 while you're doing it.

9 So, thank you for that time together. Thank you
10 for always being an ally to me, which I know you will only
11 continue to be, not just for me, but really for all of
12 California and what we're working for here now that Ms.
13 Scott goes back to Washington. So, congratulations and
14 look forward to working with you in your new role. Cheers.

15 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Courtney.

16 MS. GALLARDO: All right. So, we have Jim
17 Bartridge who would like to make a comment. I just
18 converted him to panelist, so Jim, you may unmute and turn
19 on your video box and begin.

20 MR. BARTRIDGE: Good morning, Janea, or
21 Commissioner, excuse me, Vice Chair. I remember your first
22 day, and I learned a lot from you. It was a great
23 experience.

24 Everything that has been said today I can't say
25 better. Your kindness, your attention to detail, just

1 getting in, putting your head down and doing the work. I
2 remember working closely with you to reauthorize AB8 and
3 really set the future for transportation of where we are
4 today.

5 I also remember running down the hall between
6 yours and Commissioner, now Chair, Hochschild trying to be
7 an advisor to both offices, and it was crazy times, lot of
8 great fun, and I wish you the best going forward. So,
9 thank you so much.

10 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Jim.

11 MS. GALLARDO: All right. Chair, that was the
12 last comment that was coming through Zoom. We do have a
13 few people on the Verizon line.

14 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Oh, we do. Okay, let's go
15 to those.

16 MS. GALLARDO: All right. So, we're going to --
17 this is Noemi Gallardo, the Public Advisor. We're going to
18 our Verizon line. We're going to start off with Holly
19 Taylor, and, Holly, please if you could spell your name and
20 state your affiliation if you have one. You may begin,
21 Holly. All right. We're not hearing Holly. We want to
22 make sure that -- it looks like the line is open on the
23 Verizon side, but we are not hearing her. All right.
24 Holly, I'm going to give you one more chance. We do want
25 to hear from you. Your line is open. You may begin

1 speaking. Okay. We might be having a problem with our
2 Verizon line, so let me check on another person that's in
3 the queue on Verizon, Steve Black. Could we open up his
4 line?

5 MR. BLACK: Hi. I don't know -- can you hear me?

6 MS. GALLARDO: We hear you.

7 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: We can hear you, Steve.

8 MR. BLACK: All right, great. Well, thank you
9 Chair Hochschild and Commissioner Scott, soon to be
10 Counselor Scott. This has been so much fun. I just have
11 to tell you, I've been thrilled to listen to the comments,
12 the tributes to Janea. I hope you don't mind if I make
13 this a little personal. I am so proud of your leadership,
14 your wisdom and really couldn't agree more with all of the
15 comments that have been made.

16 I can hardly believe it was 12 years ago that I
17 interviewed you to hire you as my special assistant, and
18 then soon my deputy, and now you're taking my old job. I
19 couldn't be happier, couldn't be more proud of you. I am
20 excited that you will continue the strong partnership
21 between the Federal Government and the State of California.

22 As a fellow Coloradan, certainly appreciate your
23 roots and feel also privileged to be an adopted
24 Californian.

25 I want to channel our former boss, Secretary

1 Salazar, who used to refer to Janea as my Janea. And, you
2 know, I'd like to take -- I wish I could claim a little bit
3 of credit for teaching you everything you know, but
4 obviously we both know that's not true.

5 When we started together in the first part of
6 2009, we had an ambitious agenda, of course, to stand up a
7 renewable energy program at the department and to partner
8 with the State of California, and you made that happen.
9 You through all of the organizational skills that you have
10 and that have already been mentioned, but also, your deep
11 background at EDF and as a lawyer brought a skillset to the
12 table and a personality that enabled us to get things done.

13 So, I'm confident that you will continue in that
14 role and for Secretary Haaland really represent the entire
15 State of California and the west as she looks to stand --
16 to continue to stand up for not only energy on public
17 lands, but help us meet our climate goals.

18 So, as a friend and member of this family, just
19 wanted to say it's been a real privilege to listen in
20 today. Thank you for everything you've done.

21 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Steve.

22 MS. GALLARDO: All right. So, we have Grace
23 Anderson who would like to speak, and she is actually on
24 Zoom now. So, Grace, if you would unmute, you may begin.

25 MS. ANDERSON: Thank you very much. Hello. Good

1 morning. I work in EAD. I am the staff lead for Western
2 Collaboration Initiatives there.

3 Commissioner Scott has been a blessing to
4 California and the CEC. When she was first appointed,
5 young, intelligent, qualified, capable and calm, it
6 affirmed my faith that everything would be well, not just
7 okay.

8 I was personally highly fortunate and amazed when
9 in addition to all of the California responsibilities
10 you've heard about today, she found willingness to chair in
11 the central western state organization, as you know WIRAB.
12 This was huge for us because leadership in the west is
13 essential to achieving outcomes positive for California,
14 especially our low-carbon future and our reliable resilient
15 western electric grid.

16 In her WIRAB role Janea demonstrated the
17 qualities essential to good leadership. She innately
18 understood that California, the 600-pound gorilla, would
19 not be effective. She recognized her job was not to
20 advocate for California's parochial interest, but rather to
21 lead the western states, blue and red, fossil and
22 renewable, to consensus outcomes. She did this
23 successfully and is held in the highest regard and remains
24 the vice chair today.

25 Personally I've been blessed not only in the

1 western arena but in friendship. Janea truly cares for
2 other people in her work and her life. She always asked
3 for my advice. She watched over and mentored me. I'm ever
4 grateful.

5 I offer gratitude in a celebratory cheer as she
6 moves along to apply her multitude of abilities in the wide
7 stewardship of America's natural places and resources. I
8 truly hope she will recall John Muir as best she can. He
9 always encouraged politicians to keep it wild, and we need
10 to do that for all present and not yet born Americans.

11 Janea is California's own version of Amanda, the
12 inaugural poet. May she be safe and free in this next
13 episode of her professional journey.

14 And I don't know if you can see, I think you can.
15 I have a bouquet of roses here which I'm virtually
16 presenting to her, and also, it's adorned with pearls which
17 I know she'll remember to wear as she takes on the power
18 structure because she will need all the help she can get.

19 And I'll close by thanking her for the
20 willingness to take on this next huge challenge. Thank you
21 very much Janea.

22 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Grace.

23 MS. GALLARDO: All right. We have one more
24 person coming through. Holly, I have converted you to
25 panelist if you'd like to begin. There you go.

1 MS. TAYLOR: Wonderful. Thank you. Thank you
2 for making that work.

3 My name is Holly Taylor. I'm the Director of
4 State, Federal and International Affairs for the Western
5 Interstate Energy Board, also known as WIEB. And I'm
6 really delighted to join you all for this discussion and
7 this celebration of Janea.

8 Janea, it is my great honor to represent WIEB,
9 WIRAB, Mauri, Eric and all of the WIEB and WIRAB staff
10 today in extending a note of our sincerest thanks and
11 congratulations.

12 As noted in the resolution and by Grace, thank
13 you Grace, Janea has served as California's representative
14 to the Western Interstate Energy Board. We're also known
15 as WIEB. In that capacity she successfully engaged in many
16 collaborative and productive discussions with WIEB's
17 members, states and provinces on key energy policy. She
18 also served as both Vice Chair and Chair to the Western
19 Interconnection Regional Advisory Body, WIRAB, where she
20 focused specifically on matters of electric grid
21 reliability.

22 Janea, you have provided valuable leadership,
23 direction, representation to both of those organizations,
24 both at a regional and national level, and we just couldn't
25 have had the same presence without you. We so appreciate

1 you. You've been a thoughtful partner to your colleagues.
2 You've been a remarkable mentor and a role model to myself
3 and to others. Your bright smile and your brilliant energy
4 are just contagious, and I see that reflected in all the
5 people around you. You've been just an absolute joy to
6 work with, and we do wish you the very best in your new
7 role.

8 Thank you, and because she's on the line, to your
9 mother, thank you. Janea is a gift to everyone who knows
10 her. Thank you.

11 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Holly.

12 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi, the Public Advisor.
13 So, Chair, that was the final comment.

14 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Well, how
15 appropriate was that. Thank you, Holly, for those
16 beautiful words. Janea is a gift.

17 And what an hour-and-a-half it has been. Poetry,
18 roses, pearls and gratitude. So, let's turn it back to the
19 Vice Chair for a closing thought.

20 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: I do have some closing
21 thoughts, and I'm happy that I wrote them down yesterday
22 because I am just overwhelmed by everyone's really kind and
23 thoughtful words.

24 It has been such a wonderful ride for me. It was
25 a very, very tough decision to decide to not seek

1 reappointment because I love the commission. I love the
2 work that we're doing. I love the difference that we are
3 able to make every day, and it is -- I think my intern
4 Patrick mentioned it. If you are doing what you love,
5 you'll never work a day in your life, and I feel that very
6 strongly about the work at the Energy Commission.

7 I really want to say thank you to Governor Brown
8 for appointing me, and thank you to Governor Newsom for
9 designating me as the Vice Chair. I really appreciate them
10 giving this incredible opportunity to me. It's just been
11 such an honor and a privilege to get to work on behalf of
12 the people of California on these really important clean
13 energy, and climate, and equity, and that place in the
14 clean air and other things, all of that.

15 I was going to highlight a couple of the things
16 that I have been so proud to help work on. One is within
17 the Clean Transportation Program, which as you all know
18 invests up to a hundred million dollars every year in
19 transforming transportation.

20 And I remember when we started, the Energy
21 Commission was one of the only games in town in terms of
22 getting chargers out there for battery electric cars, and
23 we have built the largest hydrogen -- largest open retail
24 hydrogen network in the world with 62 hydrogen refueling
25 stations. And, so, we went from a place where I remember

1 celebrating a hundred thousand ZEVs on California's roads,
2 and now we're close to a million and having infrastructure
3 all over the place, and I'm really excited and proud of the
4 work that we did there.

5 I'm really proud of the partnership that we built
6 with the ports. It's the ports of San Diego, Long Beach,
7 Los Angeles, Hueneme, Stockton and Oakland. They have been
8 just amazing partners in really helping us demonstrate all
9 types of clean energy, whether it's micro-grids, whether
10 it's where to put the refueling in a really busy port,
11 whether it's what types of equipment work best in what
12 areas. They have just been a fantastic partner, and I was
13 thrilled to have the opportunity to collaborate with them.

14 The research portfolio, I'm so excited about our
15 research portfolio. You heard from Laurie ten Hope. It is
16 -- depending on the year, almost up to 200 million dollars
17 between the Food Production Investment Program, the EPIC
18 Program, the Natural Gas Program. And this program has
19 been around for decades. We were just able to renew it
20 last year in August for another decade for EPIC, and I just
21 -- the level of entrepreneurship, the creativity, the types
22 of technologies, I would guess that -- well, I shouldn't
23 guess, but I think many, many of the clean energy
24 technologies that people have in their homes that they use
25 that help with energy efficiency, that help buildings talk

1 to vehicles, vehicles talk to the grid, all of that the
2 EPIC team has had a hand in helping put together, and it's
3 just really exciting to see that program. And the program,
4 itself, has leveraged more than 2.2 billion dollars of
5 private investment as well. And that to me is a really
6 exciting phase. I think the State can kick start a bunch
7 of things, and then the private sector grabs them and pulls
8 them into the market, and that's how we transform how we
9 use energy across California.

10 I'm really proud of the partnership that we had
11 with the military -- that we have with the military. We
12 got to travel to some really interesting parts of
13 California where the military bases are. But again, in
14 that same way with ports, we're looking at microgrids, and
15 lighting, and energy efficiency, and how to get more zero
16 emission vehicles, and just how do we all use energy
17 together in a much smarter way and work towards
18 decarbonization. And, so, having these powerful partners
19 around the state helping to demonstrate this, it has just
20 been incredible.

21 And I also want to mention the ability to uplift
22 equity and diversity, and we've done that internally. One
23 of the first things I did with Chair Weisenmiller was we
24 put in place a resolution for equity and diversity for the
25 Energy Commission, itself. We want the staff at the Energy

1 Commission to reflect the diversity and breadth of our
2 state, and also in our contracting, and also in the grants
3 that we give out and how can we really make sure that
4 communities are deciding for themselves what they would
5 like to see and how can we support -- within the clean
6 energy space and how can we support that. And, so, the
7 work that I've gotten to do with our Disadvantaged
8 Community Advisory Group, with some of the tribes, with
9 some of the rural areas of the state has just -- it's
10 really been a privilege and a true opportunity to get to
11 carry out these initiatives.

12 And as people mentioned, we've had some fun along
13 the way. I just want to note, you know, I had a chance to
14 see some petroglyphs one time out at China Lake.
15 Especially Commissioner Douglas and myself, we have visited
16 Californians from all over the state when we've been
17 working on some of the siting cases, and it's just great to
18 get to see people, and meet them, and hear from them
19 directly in the places where they live.

20 Mary Nichols mentioned our fantastic and fun
21 drive in hydrogen cars from Los Angeles to Sacramento. You
22 would never think a road trip would be that much fun, but
23 it was just a really great time, and we demonstrated that,
24 and that was several years ago, that you can drive almost
25 from one end of California to the other in a zero-emission

1 vehicle, stop for refueling, it took 10 minutes, and then
2 keep on going. And it just was so much fun.

3 Commissioner Hochschild and I have had a chance
4 to be in a convoy simulator and in a helicopter simulator,
5 so driving all around and I guess flying all over San Diego
6 in that helicopter simulator that one time was super fun.

7 There's just been so many things that have been
8 just a true honor and a true privilege to get to do as part
9 of this job, and one of them is really getting to know all
10 of you. I feel like we really have made a family.

11 And I just want to say thank you so much to my
12 team over the years. You heard from a bunch of them, Jim
13 Bartridge, Leslie Kimura Szeto, Courtney Smith, Amy
14 Brousseau, O'Shea Bennett, Monica Shelley, Matt Coldwell,
15 Linda Barrera, lots of smart and enthusiastic interns. The
16 deputies of the programs were most especially, Laurie ten
17 Hope, who I've been working with most recently, and then,
18 of course, my current team which is Mina Holloway, Patrick
19 McCann-Kingston, Mona Badie and Rhetta deMesa. I just
20 wouldn't have been able to accomplish what I was able to
21 accomplish without all of them at my back, and so I really
22 appreciate all of the fantastic work that they have done.

23 And I just -- my fellow Commissioners, I wanted
24 to just reflect on each of you just a little bit. It's
25 been so much fun to get to work with all of you. I think

1 we are such a fantastic team together, and I will miss
2 every day getting to work with you. And I thought maybe I
3 would just tell a little personal story for each, which is
4 with, you know, Patty, one of the things that I'll always
5 remember you and I when we were in China and how you went
6 toe to toe with that rickshaw driver because we were not
7 paying him one extra cent more than what you thought was a
8 fair price for the ride that we had been on. I was quite
9 impressed with that.

10 Andrew, I remember that you came down to the Art
11 Rosenfeld room to meet me before I had even started. I'm
12 trying to remember what I was doing there, but it just was
13 so nice to meet you on that very first day. And I want to
14 note that one of the things I like most about you is when
15 you describe your travel you may be more likely to describe
16 the various appliances that you saw, the faucets, the
17 showerheads, the stoves, than you are to talk about maybe
18 the people that you met or the places that you saw.

19 Karen, you and I have traveled all over the
20 state, as I mentioned, for siting and we have been some
21 places. We've been from Cobb, to Oxnard, to Blythe, and
22 many places in between, and I appreciate that you're always
23 up for a good hiking adventure, or always up for a good
24 eating adventure. And I do recall one time, I think we
25 were on our way to Blythe, where we discovered the best

1 sandwich shop in the whole world, and it did have
2 delightful really yummy sandwiches, and who knew that it
3 was there right in the middle of the southern California
4 desert, the best sandwich shop in the world.

5 David, as you mentioned, we were announced on the
6 same day, and we started this job within weeks of one
7 another. And I just, you know, learning Sacramento, going
8 to the movies. Thank you for going to my lowbrow choices
9 of movies. That was always so much fun. And just learning
10 this business of commissionering together has been a true
11 joy.

12 I want to say, as I mentioned, the Commission has
13 felt like home. We do important and impactful work
14 together from our ITT Team to our Audit Team, from the
15 Contract Grants and Loans Team, to the Programs Team, every
16 individual at the Energy Commission makes a difference
17 every day.

18 And so I wanted to close my remarks to you all
19 just by reading a quote, that I used it when Chair
20 Weisenmiller left the Commission, but it's one of my
21 favorite quotes, and I think a lot about this when I think
22 about public service and working together with all of the
23 folks in the Energy Commission to make this state a better
24 place. And it's from a speech called "Citizenship in a
25 Republic," and it's a speech that Teddy Roosevelt gave in

1 Paris in April of 1910.

2 And what he said is, "It is not the critics who
3 count, not the man who points out how the strong man
4 stumbled, or where the doer of deeds could have done them
5 better. The credit belongs to the man who is actually in
6 the arena, whose face is marred by dust and sweat and
7 blood, who strives valiantly, who errs, who comes short
8 again and again because there is no effort without error
9 and shortcomings. But who does actually strive to do the
10 deed, who knows great enthusiasm, the great devotion, who
11 spins himself in a worthy cause, who at the best knows in
12 the end the triumph of high achievement, and who at the
13 worst, if he fails, at least fails while bearing greatly so
14 that his place shall never be with those cold and timid
15 souls who neither know victory nor defeat."

16 And I just wanted to say I can't think of any
17 better set of people to be in the arena with. It has been
18 a true honor and a privilege for me to be in the arena with
19 all of you, so thank you so very much.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: That was beautiful. Thank
21 you, Janea, for sharing that and for a really restorative
22 hour and a half. Just hearing all this, it's wonderful. I
23 think it's a great way to begin the new year.

24 And we talked about this before, you know, this
25 is not just a job; this is a mission, and we're all in it

1 together. And so everything that you brought to California
2 as Vice Chair of the Energy Commission, we want to support
3 and bring that to the whole country, and we've got your
4 back, and we will be partnering with you the whole way.

5 So, thank you to everybody. Thanks for all the
6 stakeholders and Commissioners who spoke.

7 All right. Let's turn now to Item 3, California
8 Energy Demand Forecast Update. Let's have Nick Fugate
9 present.

10 MR. FUGATE: Thank you, Chair. Congratulations,
11 Commissioner Scott, and good morning -- yes, good morning
12 Commissioners and everyone.

13 So, my name is Nick Fugate. I am with the Energy
14 Assessments Division, and I'm here today to provide a high-
15 level overview and proposed adoption of the California
16 Energy Demand 2020 to 2030 Forecast Update.

17 Next slide, please.

18 Forecasting is one of the Energy Commission's
19 core responsibilities. And if adopted today, the updated
20 forecast will be incorporated into the 2020 Innovated
21 Energy Policy Report.

22 The demand forecast is also a critical planning
23 tool and lays the foundation for a number of state-
24 sponsored planning efforts, including transmission and
25 distribution planning, integrated resource planning,

1 resource adequacy and other activities aimed at keeping
2 California's energy clean, affordable and reliable.

3 Next slide, please.

4 Like the IEPR, itself, our forecast is a biennial
5 one. Our goal in an IEPR update year is not to produce an
6 entirely new forecast, but rather to refresh important
7 elements of the most recently adopted forecast. So, for
8 the 2020 IEPR update we are refreshing the 2019 IEPR
9 forecast, adding more data bits to the historical record,
10 and updating forecasts of important behind-the-meter
11 resources such as solar PV, battery storage, and electric
12 vehicle adoption.

13 Notably, we are also refreshing our economic and
14 demographic inputs. This is particularly important as it is
15 the primary way in which impacts from the COVID-19 pandemic
16 are reflected in this update.

17 Next slide, please.

18 PV adoption is one of our more impactful
19 modifiers. Significant growth and adoption over recent
20 years has not only lowered electricity sales, but has
21 shifted the timing and magnitude of system ramps and peaks.
22 Because it's such an important factor in our forecast, we
23 take special care in updating our historical record and
24 ensuring that our forecast begins at a realistic level.
25 This including using for the first time data collected

1 under our recently amended Title 20 authority. We now have
2 more detailed information about individual systems which
3 allows us to better classify the systems into specific
4 sectors.

5 Our demand models are based on detailed end use
6 information, so it's extremely helpful to have this more
7 specific accounting of behind-the-meter generation.

8 For this update we also used the CPC's NEM
9 interconnection database which has information about
10 specific orientation and tilt. We used this to re-estimate
11 our PV capacity factors which slightly lowered our
12 estimates of generation.

13 Finally, we included new TOU tariffs for PG&E and
14 SMUD in our adoption modeling. And all of this results in
15 a mid-case forecast which grows from 15,800 gigawatt hours
16 of generation in 2019 to 41,000 gigawatt hours by 2030,
17 more than doubling over the forecast period.

18 Next slide, please.

19 Battery storage adoption is growing rapidly. We
20 see this just in examining new interconnection data. In
21 2019, California added 130 megawatts of behind-the-meter
22 storage, which is roughly 70 megawatts greater than what we
23 had previously forecast. Similarly, outstanding self-
24 generation and center program reservations stand at 470
25 megawatts as of fall, 2020. This is roughly 400 megawatts

1 more than what we observed at the same point in 2019.

2 So naturally we have increased our storage
3 adoption forecast, and by 2030, the mid case reaches 26,000
4 -- I'm sorry, 2,600 megawatts, nearly double what we were
5 projecting previously.

6 Next slide, please.

7 Electric vehicles are another key factor as they
8 contribute significantly to projected load growth. COVID-
9 19 has had a severe impact on this sector, disrupting sales
10 across all vehicle classes, EVs included. The forecast
11 assumes that by 2020 (sic.) we'll see a full-recovery from
12 this effect.

13 Regarding the Governor's recent executive order,
14 the one that by 2035 all new passenger vehicles sold in
15 California must be zero-emission, while the timing of this
16 order did not allow for its consideration in this forecast
17 update, it will be a key policy consideration during the
18 2021 cycle.

19 The updated light-duty vehicle forecast projects
20 3.3 million ZEVs by, zero emission vehicles, by 2030 in the
21 mid demand case, 4.2 million in the high, with battery
22 electric vehicles preferred to plug-in hybrids at a rate of
23 2-to-1.

24 On the medium and heavy-duty side, the forecast
25 includes the latest updates to and status of the Air

1 Resource Board's Hybrid and Zero-Emission Truck and Bus
2 Voucher Incentive Project. It also takes into account the
3 combined impacts of COVID-19 and the China Trade Agreement
4 on the economic growth of goods movement.

5 By 2030, the forecast update projects 81,500
6 zero-emission trucks and buses to be in service in the mid-
7 case, and 90,500 vehicles in the high.

8 Next slide, please.

9 We refreshed our economic and demographic inputs
10 using data from Moody's and the Department of Finance
11 respectively, specifically from their June, 2020
12 projections.

13 The Department of Finance also -- the Department
14 of Finance updated its demographic forecast lower
15 population growth projections from .8 percent to just .5,
16 the consequences of lowering migration, lower birth rates
17 and lower life expectancy. Naturally, this leads to slower
18 household formation, and these two factors considered
19 alongside Moody's projected decrease in personal income
20 have a negative impact on our projected residential demand.

21 Moody's analytics indicates that statewide
22 unemployment reached 12 percent in 2020, and according to
23 their baseline projection, is expected to return to
24 prepandemic levels by 2024. This is a critical driver for
25 our commercial and industrial demand models in particular,

1 and so naturally our forecast for these sectors is lower in
2 the near term relative to the adopted 2019 IEPR forecast.

3 After 2024, though, employment grows at a rate
4 similar to what we assumed in the 2019 IEPR.

5 Next slide, please.

6 This graph shows our statewide electricity sales
7 forecasts for all three baseline scenarios. Here, it's
8 easy to see the significant role that economic and
9 demographic drivers play in our update. The sudden
10 economic decline due to COVID-19 corresponds to a drop in
11 total sales from 2019 to 2020. We enter a period of rapid
12 recovery from 2022 to 2024, then a return to long-term
13 growth of just over half a percent annually, which is,
14 again, similar to the previously adopted forecast.

15 Electric vehicle charging is a significant
16 contribution to that growth, representing nearly 14,000
17 gigawatt hours of electricity demand by the end of the
18 forecast period. And in 2030, the mid-case is roughly 1.2
19 percent lower than the previously adopted forecast.

20 Next slide, please.

21 Here I am showing our statewide non-coincident
22 peak forecasts and this tells a slightly different story.
23 We don't see the same near-term volatility that we did in
24 the sales forecast. This is because we're taking into
25 account observed peaks from this last summer. And what we

1 saw when we compared these peaks to temperatures is that
2 there wasn't a noticeable change in how demand responded
3 during peak hours on hot days. Daily peak loads last
4 summer appeared to be relatively insensitive to the
5 economic downturn caused by the pandemic.

6 But, as I mentioned previously, our sales
7 forecast for 2020 did decline, especially for the
8 commercial and industrial sectors. So in that year, the
9 starting year of our peak forecast, we have an unusually
10 high peak to energy ratio. I discussed this at a workshop
11 last month, in December, noting that this high peak-to-
12 energy ratio may be an accurate reflection of near-term
13 conditions, but that it is likely more reasonable to assume
14 that the ratio will return to something more normal in the
15 long term. Specifically, this forecast assumes that the
16 high peak-to-energy ratio for 2020 diminishes gradually
17 over time, returning to 2019 levels by year 2023.

18 And what we end up with is a peak forecast that
19 remains relatively stable in the near term, and then in the
20 latter half of the forecast tracks closely with the long-
21 term growth rate from the previously adopted forecast,
22 roughly .7 percent annually.

23 Nest slide, please.

24 The peak load projections on my previous slide
25 represent one in two forecasts, that is, they project the

1 level of load that you would expect to be surpassed on
2 account of extreme temperatures only once in two years.

3 This update also includes one in five, one in 10
4 and one in 20 forecasts which have to find roles in
5 specific transmission planning and reliability studies.

6 This past summer, of course, was marked by
7 particularly extreme heat events and corresponding extreme
8 loads. In response to the August, 2020 shortfalls, CEC
9 staff are assessing the adequacy of California's
10 electricity system to meet electricity needs under a
11 variety of conditions. This is being done through
12 stochastic stimulations that account for the uncertainty in
13 wind and solar generation, forced outages and hourly
14 demands.

15 Our demand forecasting team is collaborating with
16 our electricity supply team to modify our models to produce
17 distributions of hourly demand profiles, each consistent
18 with the assumptions embedded in our adopted forecast, but
19 capturing a broad range of uncertainty in weather patterns.

20 I offer this just as an example of how a forecast
21 process is being adapted to meet the needs of new and
22 evolving resource assessments.

23 Next slide, please.

24 So, everything I've described so far has been at
25 a high level, but the detailed components of our forecast

1 have been presented and discussed with stakeholders
2 throughout its development. We do so in a public process,
3 which this year included two IEPR workshops, one focused on
4 scope and methods, and the other on reviewing draft
5 results. We also held a number of demand analysis working
6 group meetings to discuss specific technical elements of
7 the forecast and to review results in even greater detail.

8 We also routinely engage with the Joint Agency
9 Steering Committee. This is a group comprised of CEC, CPC,
10 ISO, and ARB principals, management and staff which aims to
11 promote coordination between the IEPR forecast process and
12 its most critical dependencies.

13 After presenting results at our December 3rd
14 workshop, we did receive a number of formal comments, many
15 of which were forward looking. We've had follow-up
16 discussions with staff from many of the commenting
17 organizations and we certainly look forward to continued
18 collaboration as we seek to continually improve our data
19 and methods.

20 I do want to note that we did make one explicit
21 adjustment to this forecast update in response to formal
22 comments, and that is that we added approximately 485
23 megawatts of peak load to our forecast for Silicon Valley
24 Power's territory. This is a sizeable increase to their
25 total load, one that is necessary to account for several

1 new and large data centers that are currently in
2 construction or have been approved by the City to begin
3 construction.

4 Next slide, please.

5 So, this is my final slide, but I would like to
6 take a moment just to acknowledge and thank all the staff
7 who helped pull this forecast together over this
8 particularly challenging yearlong process. There are
9 probably too many people to name. We're quite fortunate
10 to have contributions from a very talented staff across the
11 entire Assessments Division.

12 I do want to thank Heather Raitt and her IEPR
13 team specifically for their patience in particular and also
14 their support.

15 And also my thanks to our stakeholders who take a
16 lot of time and effort to attend our workshops, review all
17 of our materials, and provide valuable feedback as we
18 develop our forecast.

19 And, lastly, I want to acknowledge the
20 contributions of one of our -- one of the Energy
21 Commission's longest tenured forecasters, Tom Gorin. Much
22 of the work I described today was built on a foundation
23 that Tom helped lay decades ago. He has been an insightful
24 and pragmatic analyst, a dedicated civil servant and a dear
25 friend and mentor to so many of his colleagues.

1 I'm sad to say that Tom passed away yesterday.
2 He was surrounded by his loving family and surrounded in
3 spirit by his friends here at the Energy Commission. Those
4 who were fortunate enough to know and work with Tom will be
5 forever grateful for that experience, and we will miss him.

6 So, I want to reiterate my gratitude and conclude
7 by recommending that the Commission adopt the California
8 Energy Demand 2020 to 2030 Forecast Update.

9 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Well, thank you, Nick, to
10 you and your colleagues for all the work and all the
11 stakeholders who contributed to this.

12 And thank you for acknowledging Tom Gorin. We
13 will be adjourning our Commission business meeting today in
14 his memory. We send our thoughts and best wishes to his
15 family.

16 With that let me see, Madam Public Advisor, do we
17 have any public comment on this item?

18 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, the Public
19 Advisor. There are no public comments on item three.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay, thank you. Let's
21 move to Commissioner discussion. Commissioner McAllister.

22 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Thank you. Can you
23 hear me okay? I switched microphones.

24 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yeah, we hear you fine.

25 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Great, okay, perfect.

1 So, Nick, thank you so much and for acknowledging Tom's
2 contributions as well. Our hearts just go out to his
3 family. I appreciate your acknowledging him and the impact
4 he had on the Commission, and it's totally appropriate that
5 we dedicate this meeting to him.

6 So, thanks for that presentation. I guess this
7 has -- as you said, it's been a particularly challenging
8 update. You know, the COVID curveball really made it
9 challenging to figure out what information to use, sort of
10 to project forward, given the fact that the sort of --
11 implicitly our year-to-year variation in demand is bigger
12 in this analysis than it has been in the past with all the
13 COVID changes. So that will be something ongoing going
14 forward. You know, the full forecast we'll still be
15 wrestling with. I think we have a good handle on the
16 approach forward, but I think, you know, lots of
17 conversation about that internally and with all our
18 colleagues in the (indiscernible) and beyond. So, really
19 an extraordinary year for many reasons, but certainly in
20 this particular context.

21 I want to acknowledge -- well, first of all, our
22 own team, Nick, you, you know, leading a lot of this work
23 and Carey as well, sort of carrying on Chris Cavaleck's
24 work and really stepping in those shoes and doing a great
25 job with that. Lynn Marshall as well, and really the whole

1 team, great work on this with all the challenges in this
2 past year.

3 And then also, you know, I think we have to
4 acknowledge the summer outages and the role of stress to
5 grid that we had, and the root cause analysis that followed
6 really did put more intense focus on the forecast, and I
7 think it really held up well to that focus.

8 So, you know, I think it was -- our work was, I
9 think, reflected well the forecast really -- really
10 wouldn't have changed anything. It really was a solid
11 foundation for understanding what had happened, and also
12 the summer challenges I think also opened up really
13 valuable conversations around the liability going forward
14 and additional things we might want to do in the forecast
15 and will do, committed to around reliability, around the
16 summer assessment this coming summer, and around west wide
17 resource sufficiency, all of which really build on the
18 platform of the forecast. And, so, I think it's a
19 testament to the team and your competence. So, lots of
20 things to expand it to that I think will be really valuable
21 for the State as we shepherd the transition into 100
22 percent carbon-free resources.

23 And really I believe we're paying attention to
24 the right things, and a lot of that is, you know, based on
25 the really tremendous analytical work and collaboration

1 across the agency that you guys lead. So, I'm really --
2 I'm comfortable with this forecast, and I'm really excited
3 to lead the one in 2021 that will really be a full forecast
4 and start a little bit more from first principles once
5 again as we do every two years.

6 But with that, I think I'll wrap up my comments
7 and pass it to anyone else who wants to make a comment.

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Commissioner.
9 Any other Commissioners wishing to make a comment?
10 Commissioner Douglas.

11 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: So, yeah, just briefly. I
12 wanted to join in the thanks to Nick and the team who
13 worked on this, and also recognize Commissioners McAllister
14 and Monahan for their leadership and hard work here.

15 As Commissioner McAllister noted, if we plan for
16 summer, 2021 and beyond, the forecast update will be and
17 remains one of our critical tools for looking ahead and for
18 collaboration among the Energy Commission, CPUC and CAISO
19 and other balancing authorities.

20 And, so, you know, I'm just looking forward to
21 continuing to be part of the conversations within the
22 Energy Commission and among our partner agencies and
23 stakeholders since we work to continually move forward and
24 improve the forecast and utilize it. So, thank you.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you. Commissioner

1 Monahan.

2 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Yeah. I wanted to thank
3 Nick as well. He, Matt and others gave me a briefing the
4 other day, Friday, and it was enlightening on a few fronts.
5 I do think, as Commissioner McAllister and Commissioner
6 Douglas emphasized, I mean the demand forecast is so
7 critical for California having reliable electricity
8 planning for our partners going forward, and just got a
9 deeper appreciation of all the work that Nick and the team
10 is leading on this front.

11 Two things kind of popped out in terms of the
12 electric vehicle world and the SPPE world, our favorite
13 (indiscernible) exemption topic which is -- well, on the EV
14 front, as Nick said, this analysis was done before the ZEV
15 EO, and so, you know, there's going to be additional
16 regulations adopted by the Resources Board. There's going
17 to be additional incentives, hopefully on the ZEV
18 infrastructure fund. And one of the things we can't yet do
19 in our modeling is evaluate how ZEV infrastructure
20 influences that uptake. We know it's important, but we
21 don't know how to measure it.

22 And, so, over time I think, you know, the team is
23 open to this concept, and I'd really like to help us
24 continue to think through. So how do we continue to refine
25 our modeling to be able to take into account these very

1 critical infrastructure investments and to be able to over
2 time demonstrate how infrastructure will influence uptake.
3 And I think this is going to be a while in the making
4 because it's not an easy analysis to do, and yet, we know
5 that it's really important. Perhaps it's the number one
6 variant of adoption, just getting ZEV infrastructure out
7 there well placed.

8 On the issue of data centers, I wonder, Nick, can
9 you tell folks how much, what percentage of the new demand
10 from these data centers is stated to be compared to
11 baseline?

12 MR. FUGATE: For SVP's territories specifically
13 it is close to doubling their peak load by 2026.

14 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: That, to me, was a really
15 important data point, that at least in one utility district
16 it doubles demand, and that -- the peak demand, and that, I
17 mean, is really showing how these data centers are
18 proliferating, and the amount of energy they use, and what
19 it means when they're going on backup generation.

20 So, it's just really interesting how -- you know,
21 we all know that data centers are incredibly important for
22 being able to have this meeting. So, we need to make sure
23 that there is reliable energy even as we move forward with,
24 you know, a clean energy system for all. So, to me that
25 was a fascinating data point for us to cogitate on.

1 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes, excellent point. Any
2 further comments from the Commissioners? Okay. With that,
3 let's entertain a motion. Commissioner McAllister, would
4 you be willing to move the item?

5 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Yeah, I will move this
6 item forward.

7 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Commissioner
8 Monahan, would you be willing to second?

9 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: I second this.

10 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. All in favor say
11 aye. Commissioner McAllister.

12 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

13 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Monahan.

14 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

15 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Vice Chair Scott.

16 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Aye.

17 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Douglas.

18 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

19 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And I vote aye as well.
20 That item passes unanimously. Thank you, Nick and team.
21 Let's move on to item four, Redwood Energy.

22 MR. BEDIR: Greetings Chair, Vice Chair and
23 Commissioners,

24 My name is Kadir Bedir and I am with the Energy
25 Research and Development Division. Here, we are

1 recommending an agreement with Redwood Energy, an energy
2 consulting partnership specializing in zero-net energy
3 technologies for multifamily residential buildings.

4 Next slide please.

5 The project we are recommending for approval
6 today resulted from a solicitation intended to advance
7 next-generation space heating and cooling, and water
8 heating systems. This solicitation has funded applied
9 research and technology demonstration projects that develop
10 and demonstrate innovative, efficient, and environmentally-
11 friendly approaches to provide space conditioning and water
12 heating in buildings.

13 The initial awards were presented at the May
14 business meeting. The funding for this project is allocated
15 from Group 4 on this slide, which focuses on load
16 flexibility research for heat pump technologies.

17 Next slide please.

18 Under this agreement, the recipient will develop
19 advanced load controls for central water heating systems in
20 multifamily residential buildings. The proposed system,
21 thermal storage control, or TSC, uses thermal storage to
22 provide several grid services, such as peak load reductions
23 and renewable integration, without causing any service
24 disruptions over consumers.

25 As you can see on this chart, the TSC system

1 includes controls and communications, a plumbing manifold
2 hosting the valve system, and a thermal storage labeled as
3 controlled storage on the chart. The TSC components are
4 connected in parallel over the existing water heater that
5 runs on a heat pump.

6 Next slide please.

7 Compared to conventional electric systems, this
8 technology has the ability to reduce the annual cost of
9 water heating operation by up to 37 percent, by utilizing
10 load shifting with high-efficiency thermal storage.

11 On the grid-side, the system will provide several
12 grid services, such as peak load reductions and renewable
13 integration, again, without causing any service disruptions
14 over consumers use of water -- hot water.

15 Next slide please.

16 The proposed technology along with high-
17 efficiency thermal storage tanks will be demonstrated at
18 three separate affordable housing projects in climate zones
19 one, two and four along Northern California. These sites
20 are already recently built and occupied multifamily
21 buildings with high-efficiency heat pumps already installed
22 on site.

23 It is estimated that, at five percent adoption
24 rate of this technology among multifamily buildings, the
25 proposed system can provide annually a reduction of \$5.6

1 million on consumer's electricity bills, and a reduction of
2 6,300 metric tons of CO2 emissions.

3 Next slide please.

4 Staff recommends approval of this award as well
5 as staff's determination that this project is exempt from
6 CEQA. I am available to answer any questions you may have.

7 Thank you.

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you. Madam Public
9 Advisor, do we have public comment on this item?

10 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, the Public
11 Advisor. Yes, we do. On the Verizon line we have Sean
12 Armstrong, who if we could open up Sean's line. Sean, just
13 a reminder to please spell your name and indicate your
14 affiliation, if any. Sean, if you're able, please begin
15 your remarks.

16 MR. ARMSTRONG: Okay. Can you hear me?

17 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yeah, we can hear you.

18 MS. GALLARDO: Yes, we can.

19 MR. ARMSTRONG: Okay, thank you. Hi, this is
20 Sean Armstrong with Redwood Energy. Sean is spelled S-E-A-
21 N. Armstrong is A-R-M-S-T-R-O-N-G.

22 And we are the prime recipient of this and I want
23 to say thank you. I'm really looking forward to continuing
24 our existing EPIC funded thermal storage research which is
25 in domestic hot water systems in four different zero net

1 energy developments. We have made a lot of progress in
2 documenting how to use thermal storage and even just the
3 field performance of the stand in/SanCo2 for the CO2 heat
4 pump water heaters that are being used centrally. This is
5 sort of the first place that we documented fully their
6 operating efficiencies and the way they did use for thermal
7 storage. So that work you're helping continue.

8 So, we're going to be studying three different
9 manufacturers' products so that the same code two, the two
10 CO2 heat pump water heaters at 14 tiny houses that are set
11 up centrally. They're for homeless veterans. Individual
12 Rheem tanks are 80 gallons -- 65 gallons, pardon me,
13 initial 65 gallons next door.

14 These systems that are there now are serving four
15 studio apartments for homeless veterans and homeless
16 seniors in different developments. In the third one we're
17 working with homeless seniors and community members
18 generally, 71 apartments. These are the big central Colmac
19 systems.

20 So all three of these really different systems
21 are going to get the same application of additional water
22 storage and controls. And I'm just delighted as a
23 researcher to have such a varied set of side-by-side
24 comparisons using the same basic control strategy.

25 And further, this is a delight, this isn't

1 necessarily going to happen, but we did apply with Lawrence
2 Berkeley National Laboratory to the Department of Energy to
3 use these three same sites for a complete (indiscernible)
4 research to then replace the water tanks to phase change
5 tanks which take one-third to one-fourth of the space as
6 the water would, and would give us even more flexibility in
7 storing more, so they can get through peak periods without
8 taking in electric resistance or even operating the
9 compressors. Just turn the whole system off, rely upon
10 storage and then fill up during the sunny part of the day.

11 So, really exciting research hopefully benefits
12 the whole state because, you know, more than half of all
13 domestic hot water systems are going into apartment
14 complexes in California for the last decade, so this is,
15 hopefully, widely applicable.

16 So, I'm here to answer any questions, and I just
17 want to express my heartfelt appreciation for your
18 confidence in this research.

19 Thank you.

20 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi. That was the final
21 comment, Chair.

22 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay, thank you. Let's
23 move on to Commissioner discussion. By the way, how
24 appropriate on your last day, Commissioner, we have a
25 project this exciting. This is exactly where we need to

1 go. So, Vice Chair Scott, you're hitting home runs all the
2 way to the end here.

3 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Yeah, absolutely. This is a
4 very exciting project. I don't have much to say except
5 maybe underscore a couple of the things Kadir mentioned in
6 his presentation.

7 That 37 percent energy savings is pretty huge,
8 especially when you think about the communities where the
9 water heaters are going to be and, as you heard, ,low-
10 income communities with seniors, and veterans, and some
11 folks that are homeless as well. So, that energy savings
12 will hopefully translate also into monetary savings. And
13 that these water heaters are going to be able to provide
14 some good services, which I don't need to express to you
15 all is going to be incredibly important as we think about
16 how to integrate more renewables onto our grid and just
17 making sure that all of the things that we've plugged into
18 the grid are helping the grid, that they're smart
19 technologies.

20 So, if there aren't questions or comments I will
21 move approval of Item 4.

22 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Seeing no further --
23 oh, Commissioner McAllister, did you want to make a comment
24 or did you want second?

25 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Yeah, I wanted to make

1 a comment just quickly. So, I agree with everything Vice
2 Chair Scott said, and, in particular, would just point out
3 that the particular heat pump that Mr. Armstrong mentioned
4 actually uses CO2 as its working fluid and not HFC. I have
5 one in my house. It works great. And, so, that actually
6 is a big strategy for our decarbonization of our building
7 sectors as well as to migrate away from hydrofluorocarbons
8 to much lower GWP refrigerants. And, so, in addition to
9 the grid benefits and the electricity cleanliness benefits
10 over time, it decarbonizes and all the benefits that the
11 staff presentation elucidated. This also has the market
12 development for low income -- for low GWP refrigerant. So,
13 I want to just point that out as the technology of the
14 future. So, great that we're doing this market push and
15 investigation about how to make it more grid relevant.

16 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: That is a great point, and
17 is it so great that you're willing to second the motion?

18 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Yes, I will second this
19 motion.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Fantastic. The motion by
21 Vice Chair Scott and as seconded by Commissioner
22 McAllister, all in favor please say aye. Vice Chair
23 Scott.

24 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Aye.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner McAllister.

1 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

2 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Douglas.

3 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

4 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Monahan.

5 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

6 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And I vote aye as well.

7 Item 4 passes unanimously.

8 Colleagues, it's ten past twelve. I think we
9 should break for lunch. Would it be okay if we reconvened
10 at 1:00 o'clock? Is that acceptable? Yes, okay. Let's
11 take a break, and then we'll come back on at 1:00. Thanks,
12 everyone.

13 (Off the record 12:11 p.m.)

14 (On the record 1:01 p.m.)

15 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: It is a beautiful day
16 outside, blue skies. I hope everyone got a little fresh
17 air.

18 Let's return to the agenda. I think we're on
19 Item 5, Climate Scenarios and Analytics to Support
20 Electricity Sector Vulnerability Assessment and Resiliency
21 Planning.

22 MS. HORANGIC: Good afternoon, Commissioners. My
23 name is Alex Horangic I'm from the Energy Research and
24 Development Division. Today I am requesting your
25 approval of two agreements resulting from a solicitation

1 intended to support, first, the development of next-
2 generation climate projections to support electricity
3 sector resilience, and, second, provide data in a manner
4 that informs planning for a 100% clean energy system
5 through stakeholder-informed analytics and a platform to
6 provide data access.

7 Next slide, please.

8 The proposed research will help electricity
9 sector stakeholders anticipate and adapt to climate and
10 weather-related challenges as California transitions toward
11 a 100% clean energy system.

12 Results from the research are anticipated to
13 directly support implementation of the California Public
14 Utilities Commission's Adaptation Rulemaking. Results will
15 also provide a foundation for California's next Climate
16 Change Assessment.

17 Next slide, please.

18 The first proposed agreement with the University
19 of California San Diego will provide high resolution
20 climate projections across California. The team will also
21 provide point projections at meteorological weather
22 stations of interest to demand forecast and other
23 applications.

24 The project is tailored towards variables of
25 importance to planning and investing in a resilient,

1 reliable renewables grid such as wind and ground-level
2 solar radiation. New downscaling techniques will be
3 applied to the newest generation of global climate models
4 embraced by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.

5 Next slide, please.

6 The second agreement with Eagle Rock Analytics
7 will develop a stakeholder-informed, state-of-the-art
8 platform for access to climate data. Eagle Rock Analytics
9 will develop climate analytics through co-production,
10 working close with electricity stakeholders who need to
11 integrate climate data into planning. The project will
12 also develop tools to help users choose appropriate models
13 for their particular application and understand the range
14 of possible outcomes.

15 The data, analytics, and guidance on choosing
16 models and interpreting the results will be available
17 through a cloud-based data platform that will provide
18 unprecedented computational resources to users. The
19 platform will enable users to easily transform enormous
20 amounts of data into analyses designed specifically to
21 address stakeholder needs.

22 Next slide.

23 Staff recommends approval of these agreements.
24 We're happy to take any questions, and thank you for your
25 consideration.

1 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you. Madam Public
2 Advisor, do we have public comments on this item?

3 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, Public
4 Advisor. No public comment on Item 5.

5 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Let's go to
6 Commissioner discussion. Vice Chair Scott.

7 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Yes. And I don't have
8 anything to add to Alex's excellent presentation. I would
9 hardly recommend this one to you.

10 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Unless there's other
11 Commissioner discussion, let's go ahead and make a motion.
12 Vice Chair Scott, are you willing to move the item?

13 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Yes, I move approval of Item
14 5.

15 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Commissioner
16 Douglas, would you be willing to second that?

17 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Second this item.

18 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. All in favor say
19 aye. Vice Chair Scott.

20 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Aye.

21 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Douglas.

22 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

23 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner McAllister.

24 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Monahan.

1 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

2 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And I vote aye as well.

3 That item passes unanimously. Let's move on to Item 6,
4 Energy Conservation Assistance Act, Education Subaccount
5 ECCA-Ed.

6 MR. ANGULO: Thank you. Good afternoon, Chair
7 Hochschild and Commissioners. My name is Armand Angulo
8 with the Renewable Energy Division, appearing on behalf of
9 Camille Remy-Obad and to request your approval of 13 loan
10 agreements for the Energy Conservation Assistance Act-
11 Education Subaccount Financing Program, commonly known as
12 ECAA-Ed.

13 These are zero percent interest loan agreements
14 with school districts. The total dollar amount for the 13
15 loans is at \$17 million, financing 13 energy projects
16 involving renewable generation and energy efficiency
17 projects in schools located throughout all regions of
18 California. I will present these project proposals
19 categorized by California regions

20 Next slide, please.

21 The benefits to California of projects funded by
22 the ECAA-Ed program include the increased energy efficiency
23 and renewable energy generation lowering utility bills and
24 promoting a clean energy economy.

25 These loans are investments in clean and

1 sustainable energy projects located in schools where low-
2 income and disadvantaged communities reside, and they lower
3 energy costs, contribute to a healthier environment, but
4 also have a significant impact by inspiring these
5 communities to transition their clean and sustainable
6 energy. I will highlight this later in the presentation.

7 Next slide, please.

8 In the Northern California region we have four
9 school districts with loan proposals. These loan amounts
10 range from \$125,000 dollars to just under 2 million
11 dollars.

12 The projects involve installing --

13 MS. GALLARDO: Armand, we're hearing a lot of
14 noise.

15 MR. ANGULO: There you go. Thank you. These
16 projects involving installing a range of 10 kilowatts to
17 257 kilowatts of ground or rooftop mounted solar
18 photovoltaic, PV, systems and energy efficiency measures,
19 including exterior lighting upgrades to LEDs and a heat
20 pump replacement.

21 Over 50 percent of students enrolled at all four
22 schools are eligible for the Free or Reduced-Price Meal
23 Program, with Pierce Unified having the highest percentage
24 at 83 percent and Pacific Union School having the lowest
25 percentage with 58 percent. The percentage of students

1 enrolled at a school that are eligible for the Free or
2 Reduced-Price Meal Program is diametrically used to define
3 those schools located in the low income, disadvantaged
4 community with 75 percent eligible being the threshold
5 value defining such schools.

6 Next slide, please.

7 In the Central Valley region, we have seven
8 school districts with energy project loan proposals. These
9 loans range from \$230,000 to \$3 million dollars. The
10 energy projects include six schools installing solar PV
11 projects and one school installing energy efficiency
12 measures. The six solar PV systems range from 52 kilowatt
13 to 892 kilowatts of ground or rooftop mounted systems. The
14 one school installing energy efficiency measures include
15 lighting retrofit upgrades through LEDs, new plug loads and
16 building controls.

17 On average, over 82 percent of students enrolled
18 at all seven schools are eligible for the free or reduced
19 meal program, with four of the schools having an average of
20 90 percent of their enrolled schools in students eligible.
21 This is nine out of 10 students.

22 Think about how the school teacher looking out
23 into the classroom and seeing nine out of her 10 students
24 depending on the school food program. That is the
25 community these projects are being built in.

1 What an opportunity this is for us to overcome
2 the human barriers in our transition to clean energy,
3 sustainable energy with the impact being a long-term
4 significance.

5 This is how I imagine it. Walk with me for a
6 minute here. These kids are playing on the playground,
7 walking on the campuses together, their little backpacks
8 on, and they see these solar PV projects being built and
9 they're curious, right. Kids are curious. And they say,
10 hey, what are you guys doing, putting mirrors on the roof,
11 putting mirrors in the ground? And the people working are
12 like, well, they don't have that much time to talk to these
13 kids, so they keep it simple and say, hey, these things
14 turn the sunlight into electricity. Wait, what, they're
15 thinking. Little curious kids are thinking, wow, that's
16 amazing. And, so, they start talking, and this becomes
17 their norm in their conversation. PV is turning sunlight
18 into electricity.

19 And then they go in the classroom, and they raise
20 their hand. They raise their hand and say, Ms. Scott, Ms.
21 Scott, do you know they're putting mirrors on the roof to
22 collect sunlight to make electricity? And the teacher
23 thinks about this and says, hey, this is a great
24 opportunity to tell them this is why we do math. This is
25 why we're studying science. This is why we talk about the

1 environment, because we learn about these things and the
2 importance of these things. And a light comes on in their
3 little heads, and then they're more curious.

4 And then kids grow older, and that curiosity
5 turns into passion, and they believe they can be part of
6 something bigger, and they start thinking si se puede. Si
7 se puede is an inspirational, empowering phrase in Spanish
8 meaning yes, we can, or I can, you know, we can.

9 And then this passion goes to college in the
10 central valley. They go to the Bakersfield State, the
11 Fresno State, UC Merced, Stanislaus State, and they study.
12 They study about the energy, the engineering, the
13 environment. And they graduate, and then those graduates
14 turn into careers, careers at utilities, careers at the
15 Energy Commission, maybe even being a public advisor.

16 And then those careers turn into economy driving
17 adults. And it's their norm now because now they're buying
18 homes with solar panels, they're buying the electric cars,
19 they're plugging in electric cars in their home batteries.

20 And now, now we've made an impact with
21 significance. Now the ECCA-Ed Programs, the top 39 K
22 through 12 programs, the upcoming AB841, SB-70, SB-14,
23 (indiscernible) programs are growing into that. And to
24 think this transition all started with an ECCA-Ed funded
25 solar PV project being built in an elementary school. This

1 is impact, overcoming human barriers in our transition to
2 clean, sustainable energy.

3 Next slide, please.

4 In the Los Angeles and Southern California
5 region, we have two school districts with energy project
6 loan proposals. The School of Arts and Enterprise in Los
7 Angeles is installing a 161-kilowatt solar PV system with a
8 loan amount of \$611,000. Palo Verde Unified is installing
9 an 877-kilowatt solar PV system with a loan of \$3 million.

10 80 percent of students enrolled at both schools
11 participate in the Free or Reduced-Price Meal Program.

12 Next slide, please.

13 The total electric generation capacity of these
14 solar PV system projects is 3,591 kilowatts, resulting in
15 projected annual energy cost savings of 981 thousand
16 dollars.

17 All the projects installing energy efficiency
18 measures are estimated to conserve 730,00 kilowatt hours
19 annually resulting in projected annual energy cost savings
20 of \$143,000.

21 Next slide, please.

22 Legal staff found these projects exempt from the
23 California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), and staff
24 recommend approval of these 13 loan agreements located
25 throughout California with benefits of energy savings,

1 promoting a clean energy economy and helping us overcome
2 human barriers to transitioning all of our communities to
3 clean and sustainable energy.

4 That concludes my presentation, and thank you for
5 your time and consideration.

6 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Armand, and for
7 all your diligence and oversight. I love this program. I
8 know all of the Commissioners feel the same, and it's
9 especially nice to see the benefit to disadvantaged
10 students.

11 So, do we have any public comments on this item?

12 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, the Public
13 Advisor. There are no public comments for Item number 6.

14 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Let's go to
15 Commissioner McAllister to begin the discussion.

16 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Great. So, totally
17 agree with your comments, Chair. This program, you know,
18 has a great dedicated staff, a really amazing pipeline and
19 solid funding that comes back to the Energy Commission and
20 each dollar cycles through new projects as it gets paid
21 back, and it's just really terrific.

22 And I concur with the -- you know, it's just
23 beautiful to be able to support disadvantaged communities
24 and all these kids who come from challenged backgrounds and
25 the schools that support them in our state.

1 And I wanted to just point out, okay, three-and-
2 a-half gigawattD.C., okay. You know back in the early days
3 of the CSI, we had two billion dollars to do three
4 gigawatts over 10 years, okay. And one day -- that was two
5 billion dollars, right. One day, \$17 million we doing that
6 amount. We're incentivizing that amount that a decade plus
7 ago it took 10 years to plan and get.

8 And, I mean, that is just an incredible success
9 story of the maturation of the solar photovoltaic market,
10 and it's just a testament to have concerted, consistent,
11 long-term policy with a vision behind it can completely
12 change the world. So, really pretty amazing. I mean three
13 gigawatts, so maybe a little bit less than three gigawatts,
14 you know, three-and-a-half gigawattsD.C., a little bit less
15 than three gigawatts AC maybe. But that's, you know, the
16 equivalent of the whole CSI program. I mean incredible,
17 including both new and solar homes partnership. So it's
18 pretty amazing.

19 So, obviously, I support this flight of projects.
20 Most of them are PV. There are, as Armand said, you know,
21 also a number of energy efficiency upgrades, lighting,
22 HVAC, all that good stuff. So, you know, it all looks
23 great from a payback perspective. So, happy to move Item
24 6.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Great. Thank you.

1 Commissioner. Unless there's other commissioner
2 discussion, let's see, Vice Chair Scott, would you be
3 willing to second?

4 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Yes, I'll second Item 6.

5 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. All in favor say
6 aye. Commissioner McAllister.

7 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Vice Chair Scott.

9 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Aye.

10 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Douglas.

11 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

12 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Monahan.

13 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

14 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And I vote aye as well.

15 That item passes unanimously. Thank you. Let's go on to
16 Item 7, Local Ordinance Applications.

17 MS. DROZDOWICZ: Good afternoon Chair and
18 Commissioners, and thank you, Vice Chair Scott.

19 My name is Danuta Drozdowicz. I work in the
20 Efficiency Division's Buildings Standards Office and am
21 presenting local ordinances that exceed the energy code
22 from jurisdictions that have applied to the CEC for
23 approval. Joining me today via the phone line is Jacqueline
24 Moore from the Chief Counsel's Office.

25 Next slide, please.

1 Jurisdictions that adopt local ordinances are
2 living laboratories exploring and adopting technologies for
3 our clean energy future, and reducing state greenhouse gas
4 emissions as they lead from the grassroots.

5 I think you'll find it interesting that
6 approximately one in three Californians lives in a
7 community with an energy code that exceeds state energy
8 standards.

9 For a local standard to be enforceable, the
10 jurisdiction must file with the CEC its determination that
11 its standards are cost-effective, and the CEC must find
12 that the local standards reduce energy consumption compared
13 to the current statewide Energy Code.

14 Next slide, please.

15 To give you a better sense of what's happening
16 throughout the state, to date, under this code cycle, 37
17 ordinances, from 32 jurisdictions, have been approved by
18 the CEC. This does not include the applications on the
19 agenda today.

20 The majority require all electric or electric
21 preferred construction. Twenty-two ordinances also require
22 photovoltaics on buildings not subject to the current
23 provisions of the Energy Code. And 18 require additional
24 electric vehicle infrastructure for charging.

25 Next slide, please.

1 Five jurisdictions have applied for approval at
2 this Business Meeting. The City of Campbell requires new
3 residential buildings use electricity for water heating and
4 space conditioning with gas allowed for cooking and
5 fireplaces.

6 The City of Millbrae requires new buildings to be
7 all electric with natural gas allowed for cooking and
8 fireplaces and some exceptions for nonresidential
9 buildings. It also requires photovoltaic systems in all
10 new buildings and rewiring for electric appliances where
11 gas appliances are installed.

12 The City of Sunnyvale requires new buildings,
13 including substantial renovations and additions, to be all
14 electric with some exceptions. Rewiring for electric
15 appliances where gas appliances are installed and
16 photovoltaic systems in brand new buildings.

17 The city of Chula Vista requires homes and
18 condominiums built prior to 2006, implement either
19 prescriptive or performance-based energy efficiency
20 improvements when remodeling or adding to the building.
21 Exceptions are allowed based on technical performance or
22 economic criteria.

23 The City of Los Altos requires new low rise and
24 accessory dwelling unit residential buildings to be all
25 electric with natural gas allowed for cooking and

1 fireplaces. Nonresidential and multi-family buildings to
2 be all electric, with some exceptions, and rewiring for
3 electric appliances where gas appliances are installed.

4 Next slide, please.

5 Staff posted the complete applications, including
6 the local ordinances and adopted cost effectiveness
7 analysis, on the CEC's website under Docket number 19-BSTD-
8 06 for the required public comment period.

9 Staff determined that these local ordinance
10 standards will result in the reduction of the energy
11 consumption levels permitted by the 2019 Energy Code, per
12 the requirements in the Public Resources Code, and will not
13 lead to increases in energy consumption inconsistent with
14 state law.

15 Staff further confirms that the jurisdictions
16 publicly adopted a finding of cost effectiveness for the
17 standards.

18 Because the applications meet all the
19 requirements of the Public Resources Code, staff recommends
20 approving enforcement of these ordinances.

21 This concludes my presentation, and I am
22 available to answer any questions that you may have.

23 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you. Madam Public
24 Advisor, do we have public comment on this item?

25 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, the Public

1 Advisor. We have no comments on Item number 7.

2 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Let's go to
3 commissioner discussion. Commissioner McAllister.

4 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Hey, so thank you,
5 Danuta, for that, and, you know, it's always -- it's
6 amazing, actually, to see the activity at the local level,
7 and certainly the cluster, the five cities here, as you
8 heard, and four of them are a cluster of cities in the
9 southern peninsula that look reasonably similar, and then
10 Chula Vista which is doing amazing things down in the San
11 Diego region. So, really kudos to all of them.

12 I did want to just make sure everyone understands
13 sort of what we're -- what the Energy Commission's role
14 here is. You know, we see local jurisdictions coming with
15 different proposals sometimes, very different in other
16 instances. But we're actually not approving the reach
17 codes themselves. We're making two findings. One is that
18 it does -- the reach code, the local ordinance, will result
19 in reduction of energy consumption from, you know, below
20 the statewide energy code. So, 2019 code, this will be
21 more efficient than that code.

22 And so that's one, and the other is that there
23 was a local process that actually looked at cost
24 effectiveness and adopted something at the local level.
25 But we're not actually adopting or approving that cost

1 effectiveness.

2 So, those two findings. One, that it will reduce
3 energy consumption, and, two, there was a local process
4 that discussed publicly the cost effectiveness analysis
5 that was done by the local government.

6 So, you know, the local jurisdictions will do
7 everything they need to to enforce and apply within state
8 and federal law.

9 So, with that, I want to just congratulate all
10 the locals, the five local governments, Campbell, Millbrae,
11 Sunnyvale, Chula Vista and Los Altos, for all their hard
12 work in bringing this to us. Heat pumps are great
13 technology and that's what happens when you electrify
14 heating, so you get efficient heat pumps. So that's
15 terrific.

16 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Commissioner.
17 Let me just see if there's any other commissioners wishing
18 to make a comment on this item. Hearing none, entertain --

19 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Oh, I --

20 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Looks like Patty.

21 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes.

22 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Just a quick one. I think
23 that the idea of these local building codes is really
24 showing the state and the world what more can be done to
25 reduce carbon pollution and create efficiencies that save

1 consumers money. And I think it's interesting that about
2 half of all of the local ordinances contain some kind of
3 easy infrastructure charging as well. And I think this
4 idea that we are creating an ecosystem of clean energy that
5 is, you know, this connection between buildings and
6 transportation that I think will just get closer and closer
7 as time goes on as seen modeled through these local
8 ordinances.

9 So, just wanted to highlight that as well as
10 other aspects of the electric construction requirements
11 that Commissioner McAllister highlighted.

12 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: So, actually, I left
13 out something. Can I turn back in?

14 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes, by all means.

15 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Yeah, so just want to
16 remind folks that -- I was expecting some public comment
17 here because in the past we've gotten quite a bit on these
18 local ordinances. But for everyone listening, I want to
19 just remind you that tomorrow there's a workshop on Title
20 24 to focus on the low-rise residential proposal that we're
21 still preformal rulemaking, and it's really a great
22 opportunity to have public input and comment for staff to
23 explain where things are going and get people's public
24 comment, so we can really get the proposal for the 2022
25 update dialed in. So, looking forward to what people have

1 to say. It's a staff workshop, not a commissioner
2 workshop, but a great opportunity for public input on the
3 low-rise residential.

4 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yeah, great point
5 Commissioner McAllister.

6 One of the requests, maybe LaQuinn (phonetic) or
7 Noemi, Commissioner McAllister has led in more ways than
8 one on this issue and that includes what he has done with
9 his house. We did have an incredible tour of Commissioner
10 McAllister's house, all the features, heat pumps, et
11 cetera, that is, I believe, on our website. But maybe
12 somebody could just share the link to that. There's a lot
13 of path-breaking new technology that he's pioneered, and
14 it's a great inspiration to see that. So if someone has
15 the link to share that, that would be terrific because they
16 can see it on the website.

17 With that, I am going to entertain a motion on
18 this item from Commissioner McAllister.

19 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Yes. I will move Item
20 7.

21 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Commissioner
22 Monahan, are you willing to second that?

23 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: I second.

24 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: All right. All in favor
25 say aye. Commissioner McAllister.

1 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

2 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Commissioner Monahan.

3 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

4 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Vice Chair Scott. Vice
5 Chair, can you hear us?

6 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: I can, sorry. Can you hear me
7 now?

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes.

9 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Okay, yes. I said aye.

10 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And Commissioner Douglas.

11 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

12 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: And I vote aye as well.

13 That item passes unanimously. Congratulations to all the
14 cities for that and thanks to staff.

15 Let's move now to Item 8, Report from the
16 Committee and Possible Additional Direction to Committee
17 Regarding Progress on Small Power Plant Exemption
18 Application for the Sequoia Backup Generator Facility.
19 Susan Cochran.

20 MS. COCHRAN: Good afternoon. This is Susan
21 Cochran, and I am an attorney in the Chief Counsel's
22 Office. I'm a hearing officer assigned to assist the
23 committee with the conducting of the proceeding on the
24 application for a small power plant, the Sequoia backup
25 generating facility, which I will occasionally refer to as

113

1 the project throughout the rest of my presentation.

2 The CEC has appointed a committee consisting of
3 Commissioner Douglas as presiding member and Commissioner
4 Monahan as associate member to conduct proceedings on the
5 application.

6 By way of background, the assigned committee
7 conducted an evidentiary hearing on the application. The
8 committee then issued a proposed decision on August 21,
9 2020, that evaluated staff's initial study, propose that it
10 give a negative declaration and recommended granting the
11 requested small power plan exemption.

12 The project analyzed was the construction and
13 operation of 54 tier two compliant diesel fired backup
14 generators capable of generating up to 99 megawatts, the
15 maximum demand in the Sequoia data center.

16 The committee's proposed decision was presented
17 for consideration at the September 9, 2020 business
18 meeting.

19 During the September 9 business meeting the
20 commission received comments from the California Air
21 Resources Board, also known as CARB, and the Bay Area Air
22 Quality Management District, which I'll refer to as Bay
23 Area, expressing concerns about the air quality analysis
24 contained in the committee's proposed decision.

25 The commission voted at that time to remand the

1 proceeding to the committee to obtain additional
2 information from CARB and Bay Area about their concerns.

3 On October 15, 2020, CARB filed written comments
4 on the committee's proposed decision providing greater
5 specificity about the concerns of the adequacy of the air
6 quality analysis.

7 On November 16, 2020, the Commission affirmed its
8 action to remand the proceedings back to the committee and
9 issued an order providing further direction to the
10 committee, specifically the commission directed the
11 committee to conduct limited additional proceedings, to
12 consider those comments raised by CARB and Bay Area in the
13 proceeding that addressed, one, input assumptions regarding
14 --

15 (Whereupon, Commissioner McAllister made an off-
16 the-record audible comment.)

17 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: I'm sorry, Andrew, you --

18 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Sorry about that. I'm
19 okay, good. Sorry. Go ahead.

20 MS. COCHRAN: Input assumptions regarding energy
21 impacts from routine testing and maintenance, and two,
22 directed (indiscernible) of impacts of emergency operations
23 of the project backup generators.

24 The Commission order also directed the committee
25 to report on progress of this proceeding at the January,

1 2021 business meeting, this agenda item.

2 After the remand was sustained, the committee
3 scheduled the committee conference for December 16, 2020.
4 The notice for the committee conference directed the
5 parties to respond in writing to specific questions
6 regarding the air quality analysis and requested that CARB
7 and Bay Area provide additional information deemed relevant
8 to resolving the outstanding issues identified by the
9 Commission in the order sustaining the remand.

10 Staff and applicant filed written responses to
11 the committee questions, and CARB and Bay Area file a joint
12 recommendation that the applicant use tier four compliant
13 engines rather than the tier two engine proposed in the
14 project.

15 On December 22, 2020, Bay Area informed the
16 Commission that it had established a new best available
17 control technology backed, guideline for diesel backup
18 generators greater than or equal to 1,000 brake horsepower.
19 This new guideline requires such engines to meet the
20 USEPA's tier four emission standard. This new backed
21 guideline would apply to any new and open permit
22 applications that was deemed complete after January 1,
23 2020. The project here would be subject to the new backed
24 guidelines.

25 The committee issued an order after the committee

1 conference that required the parties to respond to various
2 questions, including the effect of the change to the Bay
3 Area's backed guideline.

4 We received responses from staff, application and
5 intervener Robert Sarvey. In his response the applicant
6 stated its intent to modify the project to use tier four
7 compliant engines instead of the tier two engines described
8 in the application for the SPPE.

9 I filed a hearing officer memo requesting that
10 applicant be prepared today to inform the committee when a
11 formal revised project description would be filed, as well
12 as outlining the information such as a revised project
13 description should contain.

14 This morning applicant filed a revised project
15 description.

16 As to the other questions and requests for
17 information contained in the order after committee
18 conference, I believe the parties are present today and can
19 summarize their positions on the questions presented.

20 If you have any questions, I'm available to
21 answer them.

22 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Susan. Let's
23 now hear from the parties in the proceeding. The parties
24 should provide a brief summary of the recent status reports
25 filed in the proceeding and any additional comments

1 regarding the status of the proceeding.

2 Mr. Galati, can you hear us?

3 MR. GALATI: Yes, I can. Thank you. Can you
4 hear me okay?

5 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes, we can.

6 MR. GALATI: Okay. Members of the Commission,
7 Madam Hearing Officer, yes, we filed a status report. We
8 are moving the project to tier four. We have done the work
9 that's necessary and submitted a revised project
10 description.

11 What we did is we took the small power plant
12 exemption application and we redlined the (audio skipped)
13 to show you how minor the changes are. They are only for
14 the tier four.

15 We also filed something during this meeting that
16 I was able to get my hands on which shows that the solution
17 that will be used, which we're commonly calling urea, only
18 has a portion urea in it, and it is not the hazardous
19 material. I docketed the data sheets for that solution, as
20 well as I have docketed a letter from the State Water
21 Resources Control Board identifying it not as a hazardous
22 material and can be stored in appropriate tanks, even
23 underground.

24 One of the issues that we were struggling with at
25 the beginning of this is, it is possible to use ammonia,

1 itself, as the solution that you inject into the selective
2 catalytic reduction system. We're not doing that; we're
3 using urea.

4 Out of an abundance of caution we have put the
5 tanks in the underground, I would say below grade concrete
6 pit that the diesel tanks were put in. That ensures that
7 we comply with the Airport Landings Commission policy.
8 That policy applies to hazardous materials. We're putting
9 the tank down there, anyway, so we comply with that policy
10 and it's pretty simple to verify.

11 We submitted that as well showing the tank and
12 where it was being put.

13 We also threw in -- did a comparison of the
14 emissions from the tier four engines to the tier four
15 engines -- excuse me, from the tier two to tier four
16 engines.

17 And, lastly, we revised all of the emissions
18 calculations in the tables for the small power plant
19 emissions, and we put those in redline strikeout as well.
20 And you can see that the NOx emissions go down by over 90
21 percent.

22 So, we believe that we allowed everything that
23 would be necessary. We believe that you had previously
24 determined correctly that the project was not going to have
25 significant impacts with tier two. We reduced those

1 emissions. We believe that it would not be helpful nor
2 necessary to go back through and redo modeling since we
3 know that this modeling will go significantly down.

4 We again urge the commission to rely on the way
5 that it treated emergency operations on all projects up to
6 this date.

7 We would also point to the commission that the
8 Bay Area and the California Air Resources Board filed a
9 joint statement in this proceeding that said if the
10 applicant went to tier four they would remove their
11 objections relating to the modeling, both emergency -- we
12 read that as both emergency cumulative and testing and
13 maintenance.

14 So, we remind the Commission that unlike an
15 application for certification process where you're a
16 certified regulatory process and subject to certain
17 statutes for your lawsuits and things of that nature, you
18 are acting in neutral as performing the lead agency. It is
19 not necessary for us to do an evidentiary hearing for you
20 take the documents that I provided and the staff provided
21 and keep them in the administrative record and relying on
22 them.

23 So, we ask the committee, we are caught in this
24 very difficult quagmire. Just to remind the commission,
25 our initial study in mitigating (indiscernible) was issued

1 a year and three days ago. We filed our applications with
2 the Air District in January, 2020. We got -- excuse me, in
3 December, 2019, those were for tier two, we got a
4 determination that our application was complete meaning
5 that the fact analysis we did showing tier two as
6 applicable at the time was correct. We then got draft
7 permits issued for tier two. We then (audio skips) to
8 evidentiary hearing where the Bay Area testified that tier
9 two was back under cross-examination from Mr. Sarvey. And
10 it wasn't until December of this year that the Bay Area
11 changed its fact determination. This process has been
12 delayed for a significantly long time. It is now (audio
13 skips) tried its best to change to tier four as quickly as
14 it could possibly do, which it would have done had that
15 been the rule at the time that filed, making it retroactive
16 to projects very, very difficult. It is affecting other
17 projects Commissioners approved.

18 So, we ask the Commission to please get us to the
19 next available business meeting for approval. We do not
20 believe we need lengthy evidentiary hearings nor briefs,
21 and we hope that we can get to building this important
22 project.

23 So, thank you very much, and we're here to answer
24 any questions.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Mr. Galati.

1 Let's turn now to Mr. Sarvey. Can you hear us, Mr. Sarvey?

2 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi, the public advisor.

3 We have not seen him come through the Verizon line, and we
4 have not seen him come through Zoom. Let me just do a
5 check, though, to see if he happens to be on by phone using
6 Zoom. Mr. Sarvey, if you can hear this and you are on by
7 phone through Zoom, please press star nine so that we can
8 see your hand raise and then we will unmute your line.

9 Chair, I do not see any raised hands. I do not
10 believe Mr. Sarvey is on.

11 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you. Let's turn now
12 to staff. Any comments from staff?

13 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi, the public advisor.
14 Let me check in with Susan real quick. Susan, was there
15 any other staff that should be on the line now? I don't
16 see anyone on Verizon.

17 MS. COCHRAN: I know that Mr. Pittard is on line.
18 He signed the status report. I don't know whether any of
19 the attorneys from -- looking at the list, I'm not seeing
20 any of the attorneys have signed as to whether anybody from
21 staff is online.

22 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: You said DeCarlo is going
23 to present.

24 MS. COCHRAN: Yes, I just --

25 MS. DeCARLO: Sorry about that.

1 MS. GALLARDO: It's okay. We see you, Lisa.

2 MS. DeCARLO: I was on the Verizon line. I
3 wasn't quite sure which -- which to do.

4 Thank you. Good afternoon. Lisa DeCarlo, Energy
5 Commission staff attorney. Also with me today are Leonidas
6 Payne, Energy Commission project manager for this
7 proceeding and Joseph Hughes, air resources supervisor in
8 the Engineering Office of the Citing, Transmission and
9 Environmental Protection Division. And Mr. Hughes can go
10 into more detail on any air quality emissions questions the
11 commissioners might have.

12 I'll briefly summarize our status report and
13 where things stand currently considering the applicant's
14 recent filing this morning of more specific project detail.

15 So, in January we filed our status report
16 responding to Commissioner questions in the proceeding. We
17 provided what we hope is a fairly detailed response to the
18 committee's question on the NO2 emissions issue regarding
19 modeling of maintenance and operations. We believe that
20 this should satisfy the concerns raised by CARB regarding
21 the background data used, and we understand, from a high
22 level at least from CARB, that their concerns are not
23 continuing.

24 However, we haven't had a chance to speak with
25 the staff specifically to talk about the details. So,

1 maybe they're here today and can provide some information
2 on their position given the recent turn of events. We hope
3 that has been resolved with our updated modeling as well as
4 with the applicant's proposal to switch to tier four.

5 The staff is currently in the process of
6 reviewing the detailed information provided this morning,
7 but it may take us a few days to figure out if additional
8 analysis is necessary. The structure of the engines has
9 been augmented a little bit because of the addition of the
10 SCR, so that might create a need to model the downwash
11 effects. It might be so significant of a change to require
12 another look at the modeling. We're not sure staff is
13 going to do some hand adjustments to the model at this
14 point, and they'll know in a couple of days, hopefully,
15 whether or not additional more sensitive modeling would be
16 triggered by that change.

17 We also need perhaps to talk to the applicant
18 about the ammonia emissions just to get a better
19 understanding of what the actual emissions are likely to be
20 and whether or not that triggers BAAQMD'S threshold for
21 redoing the -- I'm sorry, the HRA, the health risk
22 assessment, whether or not that needs to be redone.

23 One final piece we're waiting for, too, is
24 confirmation from the Airport Landings Commission that the
25 project change would not trigger a need for them to take

1 another look or issue a formal determination. We don't
2 believe it would. The urea proposed to be used doesn't
3 fall under any hazardous designation under the calARP
4 program, and so -- in addition the applicant's proposal to
5 contain the urea and then the subsequently created ammonia
6 below grade we believe would satisfy any concerns that the
7 Airport Landings Commission would have and wouldn't trigger
8 a need to rereview or alter the project any further.

9 And we're hoping to receive confirmation from the
10 ALC in the next few days. We reached out to them last
11 week, gave them a heads up that this was coming, and they
12 agreed to look at the preliminary project description, and
13 now that we have the final one this morning we're hoping
14 that they can turn around a response fairly quickly.

15 And that basically summarizes where we stand now.
16 As I said, Mr. Hughes is available to speak to any specific
17 air quality issues or questions the Commission might have,
18 and I'm available as well.

19 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you, Lisa.
20 Appreciate that. With that, let's move to commissioner
21 discussion or questions starting with Commissioner Douglas.

22 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Well, so I think the
23 presentations that we've heard from the parties have been
24 very helpful. I don't have any questions right now, and I
25 appreciate the quick and thorough submission by the

1 applicants, in particular, I think it was super helpful to
2 get the revised project description and I obviously haven't
3 seen what Lisa vetted today.

4 So, I do want to encourage, you know, Lisa, any
5 additional or more definitive thoughts from staff as you've
6 had more of a chance to read the materials and think about
7 them. If you could obviously submit that to the docket
8 that would be helpful.

9 MS. DeCARLO: Yes, and we are working on a few
10 responses to Mr. Sarvey's points, specifically on the PM
11 2.5 and ammonia slip issue, and so we'll be certainly
12 docketing something responding to those in the next week or
13 two.

14 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Okay.

15 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay.

16 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: And I guess maybe this
17 would be a good opportunity to see if Mr. Galati has
18 anything to add after hearing from Ms. DeCarlo just in
19 terms of any of the questions that she raised.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Actually, Commissioner, can
21 I just first see are there any other Commissioners wishing
22 to ask questions at all? Okay, yeah, sorry. Mr. Galati.

23 MR. GALATI: Thanks for that commissioners. We
24 did look at and calculated the ammonia emissions and we
25 augmented a table that we have there, and it shows that the

1 ammonia emissions do not trigger the need for a health risk
2 assessment according to the Bay Area guidelines, and that
3 is put in -- I can't remember which table, but it's
4 redlined. We added it to the potential hazardous
5 materials.

6 So, our perspective is any additional modeling
7 would be modeling that would be within a very large window
8 of no significant impact. If you noticed, the applicant
9 hasn't asked to do anything other than run one at a time
10 again.

11 So, the idea that there might be some downwash or
12 there might be (audio skipped), that is absolutely the case
13 anytime there is a change. To give you some perspective,
14 the enclosure got about three feet longer and about a foot
15 less wide. It did get a little taller because the
16 equipment sits on top.

17 But we just ask the Commission to use a
18 reasonable person judgment here. The idea that we would
19 have to go back and redo modeling, if that's what we're
20 going to have to do, that is a significant undertaking that
21 we think leads to not a whole lot of information for the
22 commission to determine. There is no significant impact
23 here. The NOx emissions have been reduced by 90 percent.
24 So, let's say they're reduced by 88 percent, 50 percent,
25 they're still well within the envelope, and we'd like the

1 project to be treated like a CEQUA not like an AFC, and so
2 we're really at this point begging you, can we get to
3 construction.

4 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay, thank you.

5 Commissioner Douglas, do you have any further questions or
6 comments?

7 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Not at this time.

8 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Okay. Thank you, Mr.
9 Galati. At this point we've heard from the parties and the
10 public. The commission will adjourn to closed session to
11 --

12 MS. GALLARDO: Your Honor -- sorry, Chair.

13 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes.

14 MS. GALLARDO: I wanted to interrupt because we
15 haven't put on the record --

16 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Did you just promote me to
17 a judge, Noemi?

18 MS. GALLARDO: I did, sorry. I was in trial mode
19 here.

20 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: In trial mode.

21 MS. GALLARDO: So, I just wanted to clarify in
22 terms of public comment we don't have anyone on the line.
23 I wanted to make sure we got that on the record before we
24 went into closed session.

25 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Thank you. Thank you for

1 clarifying that. Now that we've heard from the parties and
2 the public the Commission will adjourn to closed session on
3 this matter consistent with Government Code Section 11126-
4 3-(c)-(3), and we will return shortly. So, let's adjourn
5 and we'll come back when we're done.

6 (Off the record 1:51 p.m.)

7 (On the record 2:58 p.m.)

8 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: I am going to pick up. You
9 have Vice Chair Janea Scott, Commissioner Karen Douglas,
10 Commissioner Andrew McAllister and Commissioner Patty
11 Monahan here with you. And we're back on the record. Let
12 me turn to Commissioner Douglas for any remarks.

13 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Great. Well, I have a
14 quick summary of our remarks, and I don't think -- our
15 report, and I don't think a vote is necessary for this.

16 But the committee is continuing the work to move
17 the project forward, and will, you know, continue to do so.
18 And I think the report out is that if a revised decision
19 has not been issued by April, the committee will report
20 back to the commission at the April business meeting.

21 So, in other words, it's always dangerous to say
22 the same thing twice, but, you know, the committee will
23 continue to run its proceedings and report back at the
24 April business meeting unless the filing of a revised
25 committee proposed decision before that meeting and obvious

1 need for a report.

2 So, is that clear enough?

3 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Good.

5 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: All right. Thank you very
6 much, Commissioner Douglas. And with that we will now turn
7 to Item 9, which is Approval of the December 22, 2020
8 Business Meeting Minutes. Madam Public Advisor, do we have
9 any public comment on any Item 9?

10 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi Gallardo, the public
11 advisor. We have no comments on Item number 9.

12 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Okay. So, with that, let us
13 make a motion. Commissioner Douglas, would you be willing
14 to make a motion?

15 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Move approval of the
16 minutes.

17 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Great. And Commissioner
18 McAllister, would you be willing to second?

19 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: I second the minutes.

20 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: All those in favor, please say
21 aye. Commissioner Douglas.

22 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Aye.

23 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Commissioner McAllister.

24 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: Aye.

25 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Commissioner Monahan.

1 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Aye.

2 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: And I also vote aye, so that
3 motion carries four to zero.

4 With that let's move on to Item 10, which is the
5 Lead Commissioner Presiding Member Reports. And why don't
6 we start with Commissioner Monahan, please.

7 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Thanks. A lot of things
8 to unclick.

9 Well, I first want to let my team know that I'm
10 speaking because I wanted to acknowledge my advisor Jana
11 Stanlford Romero who is leaving to take a job at the
12 Department of Justice. She's going to be one of the
13 government affairs people.

14 So, I just wanted to say a few words of
15 acknowledgment to Jana. Friday is her last day, so she's
16 really on her last couple of days here at the Energy
17 Commission. I think you all know she worked for Chair
18 Weissenmiller. She also worked in OGA. She worked at TCO
19 and now she's back in my office, so she's really gotten a
20 bird's eye view of a number of different divisions and work
21 of the Energy Commission.

22 And she was really super helpful to me as a new
23 commissioner. I think you all know when we first start the
24 learning curve is really steep, and Jana helped me to
25 understand some of the parameters of the work and I think

131

1 really leveraging the work that she had done with Chair
2 Weissenmiller.

3 No matter what the project, whether it was an
4 SPTE, a craft agency collaboration on electric vehicles, or
5 helping me prepare for my confirmation hearing, Jana just
6 hit them all out of the ballpark. She would work on her
7 projects with dedication, attention to detail, integrity,
8 professionalism. I would say she is also a little bit of
9 my conscience, so she would let me know if there was
10 something that I did that she thought, well, you can do
11 that better, and she would do it in a really nice way. Of
12 course, she would do it gently and really professionally,
13 but also, you know, with courage. And I really love that
14 in a colleague. I always think that we are -- we need to
15 be, you know, evolving towards ourselves, and sometimes
16 we're not our best selves, so how do we continually, like,
17 be open to helpful comments to make us better, and Jana
18 would do that for me.

19 So, she's also been a great team player. She
20 works with everybody kindly, but also, you know, she tells
21 you what she thinks and she helps everybody, I think, be
22 better.

23 Our whole team is really going to miss her, and
24 we're really going to miss her adorable son and daughter.
25 I don't know if you guys have been on Zoom calls with her,

1 but, you know, she's at home with two -- a five-year-old
2 and a two-year-old now, and they're adorable. And it's one
3 of the wonderful things about working from home and Zoom to
4 see everybody's family. And Jana manages her kids, so nice
5 to her kids always. They're screaming and she's like, oh,
6 you know, I'm on the phone now. Play gently with your
7 blocks, and she never raises her voice. I don't know how
8 she does it. So, she's like a consummate professional but
9 also a really terrific mother. So, we're going to miss her
10 on the team, and I'll be looking for a new advisor going
11 forward. So, just a heads up on that.

12 So, I think you all know I was volunteering on
13 the Biden transition team. I'm happy to report that's
14 over. So, I have my nights and my weekends back which is
15 wonderful for my family, as well as for me, also my
16 vacation days because I was taking vacation days to work on
17 the Biden campaign. So that's all over, thank God.

18 I wish Janaea all the best. It's exciting but,
19 wow, it's a lot of work.

20 So, the big news, as I think you all know, in the
21 world of clean transportation, the governor's budget
22 includes reauthorization of the clean transportation
23 program, also other important investments like the Carl
24 Moyer Program and HFIP which replaces trucks with cleaner
25 alternatives. And it includes a billion dollars for ZEV

1 infrastructure which (indiscernible) in future funds from
2 the Clean Transportation Program. But now we're all hands
3 on deck. We support the Governor and his budget on getting
4 to the finish line. While the budget takes a majority
5 vote, this is going to take a two-thirds vote, so, you
6 know, we just have to do a great job really educating the
7 legislature on the benefits of the program and the
8 governor's proposal.

9 So, the team has worked really hard, and you guys
10 know about these reports. Like three reports came out
11 within a month to support the reauthorization. Two are
12 drafts, one is final, so the SB 1000 report which looked at
13 analyzing whether charging infrastructure is
14 disproportionately allocated.

15 I think when we do the 21-27 report we'll
16 probably have Tiffany Hoang who is the head of that project
17 come and present about the findings of that report. It's
18 just a little early. That, actually is a final report. We
19 have to do it every year both in tied to our investment
20 plan, but, you know, we're trying to do it on a sequel
21 basis close to annual as we can.

22 The report found that level two and D.C. fast
23 chargers are somewhat unevenly distributed across districts
24 and counties, but they seem to follow the uptakes of plug-
25 in vehicles.

1 Fewer chargers are deployed in the census track
2 that has high population density or low income, so we do
3 see some disproportionate impact in terms of accessibility
4 of charging infrastructure, and I think now the charge for
5 the team is really to figure out what tweaks we make to the
6 program to adjust the findings of the SB 1000 report.

7 There's a 21-27 draft report, so that's the
8 report that looks at charging these through 2030, and the
9 Governor's ZEV EO included an -- asked us to amend that
10 announcement to include that charging needs to meet the new
11 ZEV target. So, we had a 5 million ZEV target before.
12 According to the Air Resources Board we have about 8
13 million ZEVS now in 2030 with the Governor's ZEV EO, and
14 the report analyzed the charging needs for that 8 million
15 number.

16 But the big take home is the 1.5 million light
17 duty chargers and about 160,000 heavy duty chargers. So,
18 that's a big number. So, what we have today is about
19 67,000. With all the chargers that are supposed to be
20 coming over the next number years from utilities and
21 others, the team estimates that there's about \$190,000 --
22 190,000 chargers coming. So, that's a big gap between the
23 190,000 that we currently have with all the investments of
24 utilities and us and what we need to get to which is about
25 1.7-ish million chargers by 2030.

1 And we'll hopefully be finalizing that report in
2 the spring and coming to you to approve it at that time.

3 So, the last draft report is the IPER, and some
4 of you already said, I know. I just got (indiscernible).
5 And I really -- I think it's a really good report, and
6 Quentin Gee was one of the leads for that, Heather, of
7 course, and her team is the IPER and really are like rock
8 stars on getting that report out. We are publishing it
9 separate from the other parts of the IPER. You may have
10 noticed that the other parts of the IPER are moving on a
11 little bit of a slower track, but we wanted to fast track
12 this chapter because it's going to be useful for supporting
13 the Governor's budget request.

14 So, yeah, I think the team is hard at work now
15 trying to get to the finish line with final reports and
16 develop fact sheets and information for the legislature to
17 highlight the investments that we've made and the benefits
18 of the program.

19 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Great. Thank you very much,
20 Commissioner Monahan. I'm going to turn next to
21 Commissioner Douglas.

22 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: All right. Well, thank
23 you Vice Chair Scott. So, I have a very brief report in
24 that I'm afraid I'll have to drop off of this meeting.

25 But one thing I wanted to say is that

1 Commissioner McAllister and I had an opportunity to
2 participate in a virtual dialogue set up between the State
3 and the government of Norway to share knowledge and
4 information about carbon capture technologies, and
5 certainly the Norwegian government has moved forward with a
6 really ambitious set of projects in this area, and so it
7 was really helpful to learn about that.

8 We were joined by some real leaders throughout
9 different state agencies who are also very interested in
10 the topic, and it was a really productive exchange.

11 Second thing is I think probably a lot of time
12 over the past few weeks has been spent with Commissioner
13 Scott and I working on AB841. We just held on Friday the
14 workshop on AB841, and we're looking forward to that
15 program running out, you know, moving forward on time, and,
16 of course, with Commissioner Scott leaving the commission
17 we will -- we'll miss her hard work and efforts on that
18 which continued down to the wire. And I know that with
19 Commissioner McAllister we will continue to move that
20 program forward on time as always.

21 So, those are my reports. Thank you.

22 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Commissioner
23 Douglas. All right. We'll turn to Commissioner
24 McAllister.

25 COMMISSIONER McALLISTER: All right. Well,

1 great. So, yeah, just a few things. I'll be brief here.
2 It's been a long day already.

3 So, I wanted to just thank the forecasting team
4 for bringing us what we approved today, but also just in
5 general building our analytical chops is a multi-year big
6 team effort, and it's just paying so many dividends.

7 You know, we know from discussion today around
8 the transportation forecast and how, you know, that really
9 was made with Vice Chair Scott and now Commissioner
10 Monahan's leadership coming into it. It's producing a lot
11 of kind of groundbreaking analysis on that front that, you
12 know, has been years in the making, and you can draw
13 parallels with. You know, you point out parallels with the
14 natural gas work that Melissa, Ms. Melissa Jones is
15 spearheading, and the various teams on forecasting on the
16 electric sector and all the behind the meter stuff and
17 batteries. All of those things are just coming. The
18 quality of our analysis is just ever greater. And as we
19 get all this data in that enables us to do more assessment
20 of locational and the demand side stuff and load
21 flexibility, it really is -- it hails a really great day
22 for what we can do as a Commission and how we can inform
23 our sister agencies and legislature and develop policies
24 like the programs that we're actually implementing, 841
25 and, you know, all the various incentive programs.

1 So, we do give away a lot of money, and that's a
2 great thing, but I also wanted to just highlight the work
3 that is behind our brand that allows us to obtain the
4 confidence of the policymakers and the administration that
5 enables us to do the work. So, a lot of people in the
6 engine room and, you know, we get to take the credit for
7 it.

8 That was a really great engineered carbon session
9 that Commissioner Douglas referred to.

10 I'm looking forward to also working with her on
11 hydrogen issues as well which is belated, which is similar
12 and overlapping in some ways. There's a lot of overlap
13 between electric sector storage and transportation that
14 hydrogen I think has a lot of potential to help us bridge
15 to a decarbonized future. And, so, getting into that
16 discussion, there's a lot going on in the west in LA with
17 DWP, so looking forward to that. There's been some good
18 discussions lately on that as well.

19 I wanted to on the Federal front just highlight a
20 couple of things, you know, with the new Relief Bill that
21 was already approved by Congress. You know, before the
22 administration was sworn in there was a couple of things
23 that are notable there, tax credit extensions for energy
24 efficiency and, also, a real push enabling the US EPA
25 authority to reduce by 85 percent over the next 15 years

1 our HFCs. So the Federal Government actually is going to I
2 think push our evolution away from hydrofluorocarbons,
3 which is really great for our heat pump push. So, that's
4 terrific.

5 Let's see. Looking forward to getting back on
6 the 841, even though it's bittersweet with Commissioner
7 Scott leaving, but looking forward to partnering with
8 Commissioner Douglas to get back in the mix there.

9 And I think with the local Assistance and
10 Financing Office in Renewables Division now is really a
11 natural partnership between efficiency and renewables on
12 that and the other incentive programs.

13 Then finally I just want to just cop to a mistake
14 that I made earlier in the business meeting. You know,
15 I'll chalk it up to irrational exuberance and bad math
16 really quickly, but the ECAA-Ed grants were very
17 impressive, but 3.5 megawatts, not gigawatts. I misspoke
18 there, so not nearly as big as I thought, so off by a
19 couple magnitude there. But, still, that program has
20 literally hundreds, you know, many hundreds of megawatts
21 out there and PV that is really, you know, moving the
22 needle on the state. And anyway, apologies for that, but
23 chalk it up to a little single parenting in the moment and
24 a little too quick math, so sorry about that.

25 And, yeah, we're really going to miss you Janea.

1 It's hard to see you go, but I'm sure we'll see you again.
2 So, thanks a lot.

3 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you, Andrew. I'm going
4 to miss you all, too. I'm like, oh, we could stay on this
5 business meeting forever and ever. I just don't want it to
6 end. I won't do that to you. I won't do that to you.

7 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: That's our strategy. The
8 meeting that never ends. The ultimate filibuster, right.

9 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Right. So, I was just going
10 to make some quick remarks and then I'll turn it back over
11 to you, Chair Hochschild.

12 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Oh, yeah, by all means.

13 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Okay. And so I really just
14 quickly wanted to pick up on the AB841 that you've heard
15 both from Commissioner McAllister and from Commissioner
16 Douglas.

17 She and I had a really good time over the
18 holidays with our excellent team really pushing hard to get
19 that done. We have tight deadlines that the legislature
20 gave to us, but it's important to get those dollars back
21 out to the schools, so we're doing everything that we can
22 to meet those.

23 We had a workshop, as Commissioner Douglas
24 mentioned, on Friday for the HVAC part of the guidelines
25 and also for the plumbing part of the guidelines. Those

1 are still open and available for comment, so if you haven't
2 had a chance to look at them and are interested, please do
3 take a look. Get your thoughtful comments to us as quickly
4 as you can, and Commissioners McAllister and Douglas will
5 pick that up and run with it going forward.

6 I also wanted to mention that there is an Interim
7 EPIC Investment Plan underway that will cover this year.
8 At the same time, probably starting in the spring, March or
9 April, the team will be working on the EPIC4 Investment
10 Plan and that will cover where the interim plan we got
11 through the end of 2025, so if you're engaged with EPIC and
12 our research program, please do pay attention to that as
13 well.

14 And then, last, I just did want to thank
15 everybody again for the really kind words. I was really
16 overwhelmed and just deeply moved. This has been such a
17 wonderful experience, and I forget how the saying goes. Is
18 it like it's not farewell, it's just see you later? So I
19 hope that people will remain in touch with me.

20 This has just been the honor and the privilege of
21 a lifetime to get to work at this Commission, carry out the
22 meaningful work that we've done with the wonderful staff
23 that we have, and so, I just wanted to make sure to say
24 thank you again for the really kind words. This has been a
25 wonderful, wonderful -- go back to the Chair.

1 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yeah. Well, we have joked
2 if the Energy Commission is kind of like the Mafia. You
3 can never really leave. You're always a part of the
4 family.

5 And I just wanted to add that in addition to your
6 core responsibilities, you know, one thing you've done so
7 spectacularly is take on these other big events for us. I
8 just wanted to highlight a few of them: The 45th
9 Anniversary Symposium which was incredible, a reflection
10 of, you know, all the body of work since we started, and
11 the EPIC Symposium, and 841 getting that launch with
12 Commissioner McAllister, you know \$750 million for schools,
13 all that.

14 And one other thing that I wanted to highlight
15 which you were instrumental in starting and you broke me
16 into joining after you had got it going with Mary is Veloz,
17 and we will do a little preview video for this new campaign
18 to promote EV adoption, ZEV adoption across the state that
19 is being highlighted by Mark Ruffalo. The previous
20 campaign was done with former Governor Schwarzanegger, and
21 we have that teed up. This is going to launch, I believe,
22 on Wednesday. So, let's roll that video, if we could.

23 (Video played)

24 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: All right. So that's
25 launching this week, and another thing you should feel

1 incredibly proud of.

2 So, I just want to just really quickly to say on
3 my end just an incredibly inspiring week. I've just been
4 soaking in all of the change, you know, restoring sanity to
5 our democracy, and even as we're meeting today, the move to
6 put Harriet Tubman back on the \$20 bill just got back on
7 track. These things have just been incredible to see.
8 It's breathtaking, actually, on the 30 executive orders, so
9 really excited for what seems to be the future of our state
10 with all of the collaboration on clean energy policy.

11 The only other thing I would just highlight, I
12 really wanted to thank staff for all the work putting
13 together the workshop on alternatives to diesel backup
14 generation. We had a spectacular workshop that the Vice
15 Chair and I and others participated in last week on
16 alternatives to diesel. We've been getting a lot of these
17 applications, including technologies like gas reciprocating
18 engines powered by biofuels that can help meet in a carbon
19 neutral way some of these backup generation needs. Really
20 fruitful discussion and great for the state (indiscernible)
21 and I just wanted to thank everybody for that.

22 And that's it for me. I'll pass it to you, Vice
23 Chair, if you want to finish out the meeting.

24 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Okay, great. Well, actually
25 that wraps up Item 10. We're now onto Item 11 which is the

1 Executive Director report. Do we have a report from our
2 Executive Director today?

3 MR. BOHAN: Thank you, Commissioners. I'll just
4 use this opportunity to once again say thanks again,
5 Commissioner Scott. We'll miss you, but I have nothing
6 else to report. Take care.

7 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you. I'll miss you,
8 too.

9 We'll turn now to Item 12 which is the Public
10 Advisor Report. Madam Public Advisor, do you have a
11 report?

12 MS. GALLARDO: Yes. First, Commissioner Scott, I
13 don't have flowers for you today, but I am wearing pearls
14 in your honor, in your transition to Washington, D.C. I
15 don't know if you can see them, actually, but I am wearing
16 them.

17 Also, I'd like to make some quick comments on
18 behalf of the staff at the Public Advisor's Office and
19 myself. I want to highlight the compassion that you
20 consistently infused into the energy space throughout your
21 tenure as a commissioner. You never forget the human
22 element that comes with advancing technology, and we've
23 always appreciated that about you.

24 We also thank you for your leadership, your
25 mentorship and your partnership, particularly supporting

1 the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group.

2 I personally enjoyed working shoulder to shoulder
3 with you to determine how to improve the experience of our
4 stakeholders and the public generally, and along those
5 lines I want to reassure you that I will continue investing
6 and doing more and better for the public. For example, at
7 our next meeting we're going to incorporate some surveys
8 specifically to get feedback from our audience about their
9 business meeting experience and how to improve. And we'll
10 conduct those surveys in your honor and as a part of your
11 legacy. So, thank you so much, Vice Chair. We'll miss
12 you. And that concludes my report.

13 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you so much, Madam
14 Public Advisor. I'll miss you as well and your whole team.

15 Next is Item 13 which is public comment. Do we
16 have any public comment?

17 MS. GALLARDO: This is Noemi, the public advisor
18 again. So, I'll read some instructions first. This is the
19 period for any person wishing to comment on information
20 items or reports of the meeting agenda, or any other item.
21 Each person has three minutes total to comment, and
22 comments may be limited to one representative per
23 organization. As a reminder, we are not accepting public
24 comment through the Zoom system. Please call our Verizon
25 line at 888-323-5065. You still have time to hop on if you

146

1 act quickly. The passcode is "business meeting." And
2 after your line is open, please spell your first and last
3 names, state your affiliation if you're representing an
4 organization. Do not use the speaker phone when talking
5 because we won't hear you clearly. If you're also on Zoom
6 either mute or leave Zoom to avoid feedback.

7 And let's see here. If you are on the phone
8 please remember to press star nine to raise your hand and
9 then star six to unmute.

10 And, Vice Chair, I am not seeing any public
11 comments at this time and no raised hands.

12 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Okay. So, thank you for that.
13 So, with that we will now go onto Item 14, which is the
14 Chief Counsel's report. Darcy, do you have a Chief Counsel
15 report for us today?

16 MS. HOUCK: I do not have a report today. I do
17 want to say, though, that I did not get to work with you as
18 much as many of the other people here, but was very honored
19 to be able to work with you in your capacity here and look
20 forward to working with you in your new capacity, and we're
21 all going to miss you tremendously. So, otherwise, no
22 report.

23 VICE CHAIR SCOTT: Thank you for that. I'm going
24 to miss working with you and your team as well.

25 Well, with that, thank you so much, everyone.

1 That concludes the first meeting of the year and my last
2 meeting. Let me turn it back to Chair Hochschild.

3 CHAIRMAN HOCHSCHILD: Yes, thank you, Vice Chair.
4 Congratulations. We celebrate you.

5 Again, we're just going to adjourn the meeting in
6 memory of Tom Gorin who passed away yesterday, and we want
7 to send our best wishes to his daughter, Stacy, and his
8 whole family and to all the team that worked with him in a
9 long and fruitful career with the Energy Commission, and as
10 a devoted staff member for many years. So, thank you, Tom.

11 All right. We're adjourned, everybody. Thank
12 you.

13 (The Business Meeting adjourned at 3:16 p.m.)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were reported by me, a certified electronic court reporter and a disinterested person, and was under my supervision thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 4th day of February, 2021.



PETER PETTY
CER**D-493
Notary Public

TRANSCRIBER'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were transcribed by me, a certified transcriber.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 4th day of February, 2021.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Barbara Little", is written over a horizontal line.

Barbara Little
Certified Transcriber
AAERT No. CET**D-520