

DOCKETED	
Docket Number:	20-IEPR-02
Project Title:	Transportation
TN #:	233612
Document Title:	Transcript of May 21, 2020 IEPR Update Commissioner Workshop on Heavy-Duty Zero-Emission Vehicle Market Trends
Description:	Session 3
Filer:	Cody Goldthrite
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	6/23/2020 11:39:58 AM
Docketed Date:	6/23/2020

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

COMMISSIONER WORKSHOP

In the Matter of:)	Docket No. 20-IEPR-02
)	
)	
2020 Integrated Energy)	REMOTE ACCESS WORKSHOP RE:
Policy Report Update)	Heavy-Duty Zero-Emission
(2020 IEPR Update))	Vehicle Market Trends
)	
<hr/>)	

HEAVY-DUTY ZEVS: MOVING PEOPLE

REMOTE

THURSDAY, MAY 21, 2020

1:30 P.M.

Reported by: Martha Nelson

APPEARANCES

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Commissioner Patricia Monahan, 2020 IEPR Update Lead
Commissioner
Commissioner Karen Douglas
Commissioner Fran Inman, California Transportation Commission

CEC STAFF PRESENT:

Heather Raitt, Assistant Executive Director, Policy
Development
Dorothy Murimi
Michelle Vater, Field and Transportation Division

PRESENTERS:

Nate Baguio, Lion Electric
Brandon Bluh, A-Z Bus Sales
Macy Neshati, Antelope Valley Transit Authoirty
Cris Liban, LA Metro
Brittany Caplin, Proterra

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jaimie Levin, Center for Transportation and the Environment
Chris Peeples, Alameda-Contra Costa Transit System
Diane Moss, California Hydrogen Business Council
Tim Sasseen, Ballard Power Systems
Nico Bouwkamp, California Fuel Cell Partnership
Heidi Sickler, Silicon Valley Leadership Group
Al Cioffi Plug Power, Inc.
Rajiv Singhal, Mobility House
Ray Pringle, Sierra Club California
Kristian Corby, CalETC
David Warren, New Flyer of America
Lauren Skiver, SunLine Transit Agency

	INDEX	
		Page
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6	1. Introduction	4
7		
8	2. Opening Remarks	5
9		
10	3. Panel on Heavy-Duty ZEVs (Moving People)	6
11		
12	4. Public Comments	54
13		
14	5. Closing Remarks	78
15		
16	6. Adjournment	79
17		
18	Reporter's Certificate	
19		
20	Transcriber's Certificate	

P R O C E E D I N G S

1
2 MAY 21, 2020

1:30 P.M.

3 MS. RAITT: Good morning -- good afternoon,
4 everybody.

5 Welcome to our Session 3 of the 2020 IEPR Update
6 Commissioner Workshop on Heavy-Duty Zero-Emission Vehicle
7 Market Trends.

8 I'm Heather Raitt, I'm the program manager for the
9 IEPR. And I'll just quickly go over our housekeeping items.

10 Today's workshop is being held remotely consistent
11 with Executive Order N-25-20 and N-29-20. Our
12 recommendations for the California Department of Public
13 Health encourage physical distancing to slow the spread of
14 COVID-19. Instructions for attending or participating in the
15 workshop were provided in the notice to include both Internet
16 and call-in options. The notice is available on the Energy
17 Commission's webpage.

18 So this is our third and final session of this
19 workshop series which we've broken up into three parts. And
20 this one is focusing on heavy-duty ZEVs with respect to
21 moving people.

22 The meeting is being recorded and a written
23 transcript and the recording will be posted on the Energy
24 Commission's webpage.

25 At the end of this workshop segment, we will have an

1 opportunity for public comment. For folks on Zoom, you can
2 use the raise your hand, the raise hand feature to let us
3 know that you'd like to comment and we'll open your line at
4 the end of the workshop.

5 And for folks on telephone, you can just press Star 9
6 and that's going to raise your hand to let us know that you
7 wanted to comment. Alternatively, written comments after the
8 workshop are welcome and they are due on close of business on
9 July 11th (sic). And the notice gives you all the information
10 you need for how to do that.

11 And with that, I will just turn it over to
12 Commissioner Monahan for a few remarks.

13 Thank you.

14 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Good afternoon, everybody.
15 Welcome. Very excited to have our third session of heavy-
16 duty ZEVs. This one is, as Heather said, on moving people.
17 And, you know, we planned these workshops initially in a pre-
18 COVID world. Now we're facing a very, very different world.
19 And arguably no sector has been more impacted by COVID-19
20 than our public transit.

21 So that's part of the reason why I think this
22 conversation is going to be particular interesting is that
23 I'd love -- we would love to hear what is, you know, what
24 folks are facing, what they're seeing going forward, and how
25 we as a state can support the continued electrification of

1 the heavy-duty people moving sector. As we also wrestle with
2 the impact of COVID-19 and as we make sure that we're doing
3 all we can to get people back to work and back to work
4 safely.

5 So I am joined on our virtual dais with Commissioner
6 Fran Inman from California Transportation Commission, and
7 with my fellow CEC Commissioner Karen Douglas.

8 So have either of you -- do either of you want to
9 make any opening remarks before we start the panel?

10 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Commissioner Monahan, this
11 is -- this is Commissioner Douglas. I just wanted to say
12 that I'm looking forward to today's workshop. I enjoyed the
13 workshop yesterday morning. And this is a really important
14 topic, looking forward to the afternoon.

15 COMMISSIONER INMAN: Commissioner Monahan, I would
16 just jump in, this is Fran Inman.

17 I, too, enjoyed yesterday and excited for this
18 afternoon's session. And I think the combination of what we
19 learned collectively from all three of them will be a really
20 good discussion as well because I expect that we're going to
21 be able to identify lots of work we need to do together. So
22 thank you for including me.

23 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Great. I'll turn it over,
24 then, to Michelle from our -- Michelle Vater from our Field
25 and Transportation Division who's going to be facilitating

1 the panel on heavy-duty ZEV.

2 And, Michelle, I think you need to unmute.

3 MS. VATER: Thank you, Patty. Yes. Thank you,
4 Patty.

5 Welcome everyone to Session 3 of our Heavy-Duty Zero-
6 Emission Vehicle Market Trends Workshop pertaining to moving
7 people.

8 My name is Michelle Vater and I'm the supervisor of
9 our freight and transit unit within the Energy Commission
10 Field and Transportation Division. It is an absolute
11 pleasure to be moderating this panel this afternoon.

12 The focus today again is on moving people and today's
13 panelists are all about that. I'll go ahead and introduce
14 the panelists. From there they will begin their presentation.
15 Once the presentations conclude, I'll reach back out to the
16 commissioners for questions before we begin our panel
17 discussion.

18 Joining me on the panel today, we have Nate Baguio,
19 he is the vice president of sales in the U.S. for Lion
20 Electric Company. Lion Electric is a manufacturer of zero-
21 emission vehicles primarily known for their electric school
22 buses. But, have also developed a minibus as well as electric
23 trucks.

24 Next up we have Brandon Bluhm, he is the director of
25 new school bus sales with A-Z Bus Sales. A-Z Bus Sales is a

1 transportation dealer distributor that is headquartered in
2 California and offers numerous transportation options and
3 various transportation sectors including education and
4 commercial transit.

5 Next we have Macy Neshati, executive director and CEO
6 with Antelope Valley Transit Authority in Southern
7 California. AVTA has committed to converting their entire
8 bus fleet to 100 percent all electric zero-emission buses.
9 Today over half of their fleet consists of electric buses
10 which have completed over 2 million miles of travel. They
11 plan to add more than 35 additional bus -- electric buses to
12 their fleet this year.

13 Next we have Cris Liban who is the chief
14 sustainability officer for the Los Angeles County
15 Metropolitan Transportation Authority or LA Metro. LA Metro
16 serves the country's largest most populous country and
17 operates a fleet of over 2300 buses. So with that said, LA
18 Metro has a goal to attain a fully electric bus fleet by
19 2030.

20 And last but not least, we have Brittany Caplin who
21 is the director of government relations and public affairs at
22 Proterra. And Proterra designs and manufacturers zero-
23 emission electric transit vehicles that serve various sectors
24 including public and commercial transit, airports, and
25 education.

1 So Nate, if you're ready, we'll begin our
2 presentation with Lion Electric.

3 MS. RAITT: Nate, this is Heather Raitt, I don't
4 think we're hearing you.

5 MR. BAGUIO: How's that?

6 MS. RAITT: There we go. Thank you.

7 MR. BAGUIO: Okay. My --

8 MS. RAITT: I think you're going to have to start
9 over. Thanks, though.

10 MR. BAGUIO: Yeah, sorry about that. My presentation
11 hopefully is more exciting with sound.

12 I just want to thank -- thank you, Michelle, and
13 thank you the commissioners for letting me participate in
14 today's panel. Really important topic and an exciting topic.
15 Things are moving forward so quickly with zero-emission and
16 clean air transportation and I'm really proud to be a part of
17 it. Especially with some of the initiatives that have been
18 championed by the California Energy Commission. So thank
19 you.

20 Just a little bit of background about myself just so
21 you understand my perspective. I started in the
22 transportation business over 30 years ago actually driving a
23 school bus in Sacramento, California. And have been involved
24 in managing operations of over 300 school buses in the
25 greater Los Angeles area. Also worked on the Los Angeles

1 subway system and light rail system. And have really
2 dedicated my career to mass transit and moving people. So
3 thank you for inviting me to this panel.

4 Next slide.

5 I talked a little bit about momentum and where things
6 are going. I work for Lion Electric Company and we are the
7 leader in zero-emission battery electric school buses. Not
8 only in California but across North America with over 300
9 buses on the road. We've been picking up school children and
10 taking them to school since 2016. So there's information
11 there and data on how this is working and how it's out doing
12 what it's supposed to be doing. It's not a pilot, zero-
13 emission school buses are a real thing along with a number of
14 other platforms.

15 I think one of the most exciting things to see is the
16 leadership in California and the initiatives not just from
17 the regulation side but from the incentive side with grants
18 are working. You know, just a little over two years ago when
19 I started the pricing in our vehicles was almost twice what
20 it is today. So you can see that these grants are doing what
21 they were intended to do was to get the price down. You
22 know, your range is more than double. You're on our school
23 bus, you're up to 155 miles range which covers just about
24 every route in the country. So it's exciting to see. These
25 electric vehicles are operating in snow, in the hills, in hot

1 weather. So they're really robust.

2 One of the other things you're seeing that's really
3 exciting is that there's more competition out there. More
4 people are -- and companies are competing for this business,
5 are engaging this business and embracing it. And I have a
6 national view in my process and you can see companies out
7 there like mine but also Proterra that is really, you know,
8 large transit buses are reality. School buses, when you look
9 at deployments across the country from New York to Minnesota
10 to California, they're a real thing taking kids to school
11 every day.

12 There's an increased number of platforms. You know,
13 once you have a platform that works like a school bus, you
14 can see on my slide there are a number of different
15 applications that you can use in duty cycles that are more
16 attainable from refuse trucks to delivery trucks to tractors
17 to bucket trucks. And it's exciting to see these things
18 moving forward in transportation in general, not just moving
19 people.

20 Manufacturing capacity is up. You know, just two
21 years ago when you were looking at pilots, people were
22 putting in one or two vehicles to really see what was being
23 revealed and a lot of these things are changing.

24 A great example is the California Energy Commission's
25 bulk purchase grant that was awarded. You can see this isn't

1 a one or two bus pilot industry anymore, it's 10, 20, 30
2 vehicles going in all at once. And the industry has
3 responded accordingly. You know, we can manufacture two and
4 a half, you know, 2500, 3000 vehicles in a year rather than
5 just one at a time.

6 You know, just from my viewpoint we opened a couple
7 of locations here in California, others in -- across the
8 country. But we're bringing research and development jobs to
9 California because of these grants. We're bringing
10 manufacturing jobs to California because of these grants.

11 And, you know, there's not only clean air goals that
12 are being met but there's economic goals. And at this point
13 in time, I think more important than ever.

14 Next slide.

15 During these difficult times, you know, in looking at
16 what is happening with the economy, people's health, it --
17 zero-emission vehicles, in my opinion, it's more important
18 than ever. When you look at, you know, school children, for
19 example, the worst air they'll breathe during the day is in
20 that diesel school bus that takes them to school and then
21 brings them back home. And by implementing zero-emission
22 school buses, that not only protects their health and safety,
23 but also the community around them. And with our current
24 health crisis, largely affecting respiratory systems, zero-
25 emission is more important than ever. And also jobs that

1 have that longevity to bring that economic boost to
2 California are really, it's more important now than ever.

3 Other opportunities. If you look at what is
4 happening out there in the market, infrastructure challenges.
5 When you bring a new vehicle, you have to fuel it and put
6 energy into those batteries. And expanding our
7 infrastructure network is going to be critical moving
8 forward. And again, the CEC grant for the bulk purchases of
9 school buses had a component in there to help move that
10 along.

11 Education. Getting the world and California to
12 really embrace that this is not a pilot or an experiment.
13 It's a real thing. It drives down your street very quietly
14 and it's not necessarily noticed. But it's out there working
15 and it's a new and improved version of the school bus, the
16 transit bus, and the truck that serves your communities.

17 Next slide.

18 You know, I'm talking about excitement and you can't
19 talk about excitement in zero-emission without looking
20 forward and what is to come. We're already in an exciting
21 spot with the adoption of zero-emission vehicles and so many
22 fleets embracing it. But I talked a little bit about
23 statewide job growth and what it's bringing not only for
24 companies that, you know, you have on the call today but the
25 supply chain that is going to feed the manufacturer of those

1 companies and California is really leading the way there. So
2 there's some really encouraging signs to helping this economy
3 recover.

4 Again, I talked about pilots really being a thing of
5 the past. I was on a webinar in another state and they were
6 talking about well, let's put out a couple of buses and see
7 how they perform. And I was able to point to, you know, many
8 districts across California that have already been doing this
9 since 2016. So that data needs to get out to people and
10 they're excited to see it. So once again, California's
11 leadership is really at the forefront of this entire movement
12 of improving the movement of people and goods.

13 Multiple battery life use. You know, when you look
14 at transportation in the rearview mirror, it's a vehicle, you
15 fuel it up, it performs its duty cycle. But what is opening
16 up in today's environment is, you know, transportation is
17 going in so many different directions. You can not only use
18 it to power your vehicle but you optimize the energy in the
19 vehicle with vehicle to grid components where you can power a
20 building or give energy back to the grid to offset peak use.
21 When the battery is no longer useful to move a vehicle, it's
22 still very useful for energy storage. And then also these
23 batteries are also recyclable. So you're seeing such a
24 dynamic use of these vehicles and the batteries that power
25 them, that it's really an exciting time for California and

1 this discovery of how these things can benefit the community
2 at large. And I'm excited to be a part of it.

3 A book life on a vehicle. You know, when you're done
4 using a diesel vehicle, it really doesn't have a lot of work
5 to it. And as I'm talking about these generations of
6 batteries, you know, there's a book life on these vehicles
7 just add to the economic argument of switching to zero-
8 emission.

9 Creative finance options. People are leasing just
10 the battery on the vehicle. So fleet operators can leverage
11 other mechanisms to, you know, defer costs of these vehicles.

12 So it's a really exciting time. I'm really proud to
13 be a part of this and really thank the California Energy
14 Commission for having the foresight and the leadership to
15 develop programs that are useful now, that are putting
16 vehicles on the road now, and putting children in a better
17 situation now.

18 So thank you and I look forward to your questions.

19 MS. VATER: Thank you, Nate.

20 Brandon, with A-Z, you're up.

21 MR. BLUHN: All right. Can you hear me?

22 MS. VATER: Yes, we can hear you.

23 MR. BLUHN: Great. I'm Brandon with A-Z Bus. I'm
24 the director of sales for our new school bus division. And
25 we represent transit, commercial, as well as school on the

1 electric front.

2 So excited to share with you a little bit today about
3 what we're seeing in the industry, and my conversation with
4 gear more toward the school side as far as what we're seeing.

5 Let's go ahead and move to the next slide.

6 So as Nate mentioned, you know, right now nationwide,
7 90 percent of school buses are diesel powered. This has been
8 over the ages and we're seeing the effects of that and are
9 very aware with the studies about the effects that has with
10 children, which really is our most sensitive receptors which
11 obviously is a huge part of why there's such a focus in this
12 market.

13 We can go ahead and go to the next slide.

14 This is kind of what we're seeing as far as the
15 trends that have been happening. It's important to note Blue
16 Bird was the first manufacturer who brought an electric
17 school bus to market in 1996. Technology has obviously
18 changed a lot since then and in 2014, we had the first
19 adoption of electric vehicles here in California with newer
20 technology.

21 At this time it was really about accessibility to the
22 technology itself. It was very much in development, limited
23 providers, and really had some early adopters that were
24 willing to kind of be those guinea pigs and go through that
25 learning process.

1 Fast forward a few years, 2017, it was more about the
2 viability of the product, helping people to understand what
3 the commercial aspects of electric would do for their routes
4 within their schools, helping to dispel the rumors, and help
5 them realize that electric will work within our markets.

6 2018 and 2019 we really saw the focus around
7 reliability of the product. How is the electric being
8 supported? How is the uptime performance? What is the
9 telematics delivering as far as the information and how these
10 buses are performing. We're fortunate with Blue Bird to have
11 Cummins as the electric provider so a school district can
12 take their bus to any local Cummins dealer who has
13 technicians that have been trained and are able to work on
14 those vehicles.

15 And now in 2020, we're really seeing the change in
16 focus is moving towards the affordability. A lot of grants
17 continue to drive the zero emission and put a focus on that
18 which has been great to see the adoption start to increase.
19 There's certainly a rise in acceptance of the technology,
20 people are seeing that it's working. They're hearing that
21 it's working, and that's an important part of this growth.
22 And there's a continued importance around a savings with fuel
23 and maintenance cost.

24 So looking forward, really this becomes a matter of
25 sustainability. How do we get the pricing to a point where

1 the total cost of ownership absolutely makes sense for every
2 school district? And that's going to continue to develop
3 with V2G technology, with taking advantage of different
4 programs that the Air Resources Board has in place like low
5 carbon fuel credits. We're going to see continued
6 innovations with manufacturers that will enable further
7 range, will enable more applications within the school
8 districts. And training and really supporting those
9 districts is going to remain a critical component to make
10 sure that that integration of technology into their plates
11 enables a school district to have a successful deployment.

12 We can move on to the next slide.

13 So really everything that's happening, I feel that if
14 you compare this to a marathon, we're really just running out
15 the starting gate as far as the deployment of electric and
16 we're taking some amazing first steps towards this future.

17 Similarly, I would like to thank the Energy
18 Commission for the school bus replacement program, this is a
19 great program with a focus on our school districts and the
20 sensitive receptors. We're seeing over 231 electric buses
21 awarded through this grant which is just an amazing concept
22 and an amazing start.

23 It's important to realize, too, of the 231 buses,
24 there were over 1500 buses that were requested for
25 replacement and the number of diesel buses and even older CNG

1 buses or buses with older technology still needing to be
2 replaced created a difficult burden for school districts who
3 have a lot of concerns over budget crises, especially in
4 light of the COVID situation and how that's going to affect
5 them. So the funding towards these programs is going to be
6 critical to continue that adoption in the near future.

7 We're grateful as well for the Air Resources Board
8 and their focus and continued support around these programs
9 to help school districts in this regard.

10 And that's it for me. I appreciate the time,
11 appreciate the opportunity to be a part of this panel.

12 So thank you.

13 MS. VATER: Thank you, Brandon.

14 Next up we have Macy Neshati with Antelope Valley
15 Transit Authority. Macy?

16 MR. NESHATI: Sorry about that.

17 MS. VATER: Perfect. Thank you.

18 MR. NESHATI: I just -- yeah, sorry.

19 Thank you very much for this opportunity,
20 distinguished commissioners, members of the panel, people
21 listening in.

22 We started converting our fleet in earnest in 2016
23 and we've just -- we're just a couple of hundred thousand
24 miles short of 3 million miles. We would have been there
25 this month if we hadn't had this slow down to COVID-19.

1 I just want to give you a couple of things to think
2 about. You know, when we past 2 million miles, we did some
3 calculations and realized that we saved 29,000 pounds of PM,
4 2.5 are being dumped into the atmosphere. We avoided 37,000
5 grams of NOx. We avoided 12 million pounds of CO₂ emissions.
6 And we saved \$801,000 over our diesel fuel consumption versus
7 electric.

8 So there's in a real quick snapshot there, there's
9 economics and there's environmental benefits. We started out
10 doing this for environmental benefits but soon realized the
11 amazing economic benefits.

12 At this point today we're at 58 buses which converts
13 our entire local fixed route transit fleet to 100 percent
14 electric. We have 25 more buses we need to purchase to
15 covert our commuter fleet, the big old coaches than run from
16 here down to L.A. And we hope to award that contract this
17 coming Tuesday at our board meeting. So that will get those
18 25 coming and we will be 100 percent on both sides of the
19 fleet. So the unlimited savings that I just gave you are
20 from just the local transit fleet.

21 So there's a couple of things I wanted to emphasize
22 just from our -- what we've learned. One is that it's been a
23 great initiative on the part of the state of California and
24 Energy Commission and CARB to give incentives and help kick
25 start this program. Because once we got going on it, the

1 benefits become so obvious that -- I believe a very quick
2 quarter will become self-sustaining.

3 I set my slide up here to show you our average
4 consumption per mile. The reason is significant. If you
5 look back eight months, you see some pretty tall spikes
6 there. And if you look at the last four months, it's become
7 very steady, very smooth.

8 And what that is is in real estate we talk about the
9 three Ls, I'm sure you're familiar with that, location,
10 location, location. In electrification I've decided that the
11 key to successful implementation is the three Ts, training,
12 training, training. The more you train, the more educated
13 your operators are, the more educated your technicians are,
14 the more educated your dispatchers are, the more successful
15 you will be and the faster you arrive at those successful
16 numbers.

17 Our operators have to learn a different way to drive
18 a bus. You have to understand and appreciate the health
19 benefits to them and to the public. And that a little bit of
20 behavior modification and some incentivizing led to a
21 remarkable drop in fuel consumption and then flattened that
22 line. And it -- those numbers, our savings will increase
23 greatly.

24 So I would stress to you that anybody who is
25 undertaking this conversion which is virtually all the

1 transit fleets in California by mandate, really needs to
2 start early on even before the first bus arrives and start
3 educating and getting buy-in throughout the whole
4 organization. That's been critical to our success.

5 Next slide, please. Thank you.

6 This is just a quick demonstration, again, of some of
7 the economics. In large, had we been all the way electric,
8 we would have spent \$38,000 in fuel cost and maintenance. If
9 we'd stayed all diesel, we would have spent 374,000. So you
10 can see the stark difference, we would have saved \$336,000.
11 As it is, we were mostly electric in March, our savings over
12 a pure diesel fleet is \$223,080 just for that market. And
13 that's not including the LCFS credits. If we add those in,
14 the average fuel cost actually at this point positive about
15 22 cents a mile.

16 And the last slide.

17 There's a lot of common myths about the liability of
18 the electric bus, oh my gosh, are they going to be reliable?
19 Are they going to break down? What are we going to do? And
20 I tell people, you know, electric buses have been around
21 really since the turn of the century in 1890 or thereabouts.
22 Portland rolled out its first electric trolley. Now granted
23 it was on steel wheels and it was connected to an overhead
24 cable system, but you get rid of the steel wheels and you
25 take the cable system off the roof of the bus and put it on

1 the bus in the form a transformation from that to a battery
2 system, the propulsion system has been around for a long
3 time.

4 So here's a 12-month glance at what our electric
5 availability which is a green line. The average for 12
6 months is 94 percent availability, pure average throughout
7 the nation of 77 percent, our target is 90 percent, we're
8 beating our target. You can see our diesel fleet in yellow
9 has been as low as 70 percent. 100 percent is actually a
10 false number because that -- we didn't run any in that month
11 so it's not accurate to have, that 100 percent should just be
12 no run.

13 So that's our experience. We are advocates of this
14 program. We've over last the year probably given 30 or 35
15 tours through our facility showing off our -- not showing off
16 but showing our infrastructure, our charging systems, our
17 buses, our routes to transit systems throughout California,
18 to the East Coast, and throughout South America, and some of
19 our friends to the north in Canada have all been through our
20 facility. We welcome anyone and everyone to come by and see
21 what we're doing and how we're doing it.

22 But we hope to be living proof that it works. And
23 for us, the next -- the next exciting challenge is to go all
24 solar and 100 percent off grid of our charging capabilities.
25 And we awarded a contract to a company and we're now

1 finalizing our strategy of how we're going to do that. But
2 it's going to take about 40 acres of land and about 24
3 million kilowatts a year. And we're really looking forward
4 to getting that done in the next 18 months and maybe not
5 being a burden on the California electric grid.

6 And with that I'll wrap it up and hopefully I stayed
7 in my time limit and (indiscernible).

8 MS. VATER: Fantastic. Thank you, Macy.

9 Cris with LA Metro, go ahead and begin.

10 MR. LIBAN: All right. Thank you so much for the
11 opportunity, Commissioners, as well as CEC staff for being
12 here. Just wanted to mention that, you know, while I might
13 be referencing publicly available information, the comments I
14 have today for you, are my own. Again, my name is Cris
15 Liban. I'm the Chief Officer of LA Metro.

16 So just to focus on our organization and what we are,
17 you know, we're a state charge special jurisdiction. We're
18 not a county agency. We currently have a budget of about
19 \$7 billion, 2300 buses, CNG buses, that is, the largest in
20 the country. And about 43 percent of that currently run on
21 renewable natural gas with a full RNG portfolio by the end of
22 this year.

23 We're a multimodal agency. We also work on planning
24 function, a little bit construction function, in addition to
25 the transit that we operate. We also plan for highway

1 programs for CalTrans and beginning this year, we'll be
2 building some highways for CalTrans.

3 We operate, express lanes, bike share, car share, and
4 provide funding for what we call the Muni, here in the L.A.
5 County.

6 We have a -- we're a multi-revenue organization.
7 Most of our revenue comes from sales tax. Some of them come
8 from farebox revenues, express wings, grants, and we also
9 have revenue coming in from the LCFS sales from the clean
10 fuel that we use (indiscernible) as propulsion power.

11 A couple of building equity are key pillars in our
12 activities. We have documents that include a how will and
13 travel study and equity platform for all of our planning and
14 construction in operating activities. We have a long
15 recertification plan as well as studio, the master plan that
16 will be out in its final form later this year.

17 We also have a CBO engagement program that we're
18 completing, a community-based organization, that is.

19 With our situation right now, we used to move
20 approximately 1.2 million people a day, but since March, that
21 number has gone down to by about 70 to 80 percent. And then
22 in addition to that, because of this pandemic, in the next
23 six months, we're actually going to see a structural deficit
24 of about \$1.8 billion. And even with some assistance from
25 the CARES Act, we're still looking at approximately a billion

1 dollars in structural deficit.

2 So in a time that we're essentially trying to adjust,
3 make adjustments not only on our service, but seeing some of
4 the projects that we are working on and the activities that
5 we're doing as an agency.

6 In addition to that, in the context of our meeting
7 today, we are - our board is very aggressive zero emission
8 bus program. You know, by 2030, our goal is to be a hundred
9 percent ZEB, in your status state mandate. And we also are
10 looking at that in context of resiliency in our operations
11 toward managing resiliency. So those two topics might be of
12 interest later on during your discussion.

13 From operations adjustments, we have enhanced
14 cleaning, our patrons enter from the back, we have
15 splashguards in the bus operator area. We'll also have an
16 enhanced Sunday service.

17 In terms of operational challenges or after we
18 somehow reopen as a state, you know, there are these public
19 perceptions in riding transit in a post-COVID world. Social
20 distancing will also limit, you know, our bus and rail
21 capacity, the ridership. Even though we want to pack as many
22 people as we can to serve as many people as we can during
23 peak times, specifically, that would be a challenge, given
24 social distancing.

25 There's also a conversation about the lesser use of

1 transit. You know, there's cheaper fuel, fossil fuel out
2 there. A lot of people are out of work. People are
3 commuting less in general, and telecommuting might be here
4 for a while. So in a sense, now we have a recovery task
5 force that was established by a senior leadership here at LA
6 Metro. And it's going to look at and allow us to work
7 through some of these challenges.

8 In terms of the challenge for electrification, just
9 wanted to mention it sort of quickly. I won't go into
10 details. Infrastructure, speaking footprint, charging
11 equipment, cost of infrastructure. The bus itself
12 interoperability is a big issue for us. Charging logistics
13 and protocols and then as well as the delivery of those
14 buses. Cost of operations, our energy cost, our electricity
15 cost in particular will at least double you know once we pull
16 electrify and then workforce development.

17 So something that we're really grappling on and
18 struggling with is, you know, what does the tipping point
19 look like and what does -- what does that look like in terms
20 of all these different factors that I mentioned here.

21 So just to conclude, in addition to our
22 transportation and transit system and all the things we do,
23 we also run electric vehicles chargers here in our agency,
24 how we have a newly master planned development. We're also
25 leading the effort in the movement master plan, some of those

1 items you might have heard as an issue and we're struggling
2 with that and looking for solutions for these here as we
3 improve and complete our master plan.

4 So with that, I conclude my remarks and ready to
5 answer any questions or expand on any of the items that I
6 have indicated here.

7 Thank you again for the opportunity and ready for any
8 questions.

9 MS. VATER: Thank you, Cris, that was really great.
10 Brittany, with Proterra, you're up.

11 MS. CAPLIN: Thanks, Michelle. And thank you to the
12 CEC for hosting this conversation today, we really appreciate
13 it.

14 My name is Brittany Caplin, I'm the director of
15 government relations and public affairs for Proterra.
16 Proterra is the leader in the design and manufacture of zero-
17 emission electric transit vehicles as well as being an EV
18 technology solutions provider for commercial applications
19 such as electric school buses, electric coach buses, and
20 electric delivery trucks.

21 Just a quick additional background on Proterra; to
22 date, we have sold more than 950 electric transit buses in
23 about 43 U.S. states and Canadian provinces. Our
24 headquarters are here in Burlingame and we also have a
25 manufacturing facility in City of Industry in Los Angeles

1 County. And we have about 25 customers that have deployed
2 vehicles in California.

3 Next slide, please.

4 So one thing that I wanted to quickly point out is
5 that a lot of our attention in the EV space goes to the
6 electric passenger vehicle. But what this graph is showing
7 us from research from Bloomberg BNEF is that electric transit
8 buses continue to lead the EV market. They are -- they are a
9 great application of electric vehicle technology and you can
10 see there's leadership across the U.S. from major cities and
11 states adopting mandates and goals to go 100 percent zero-
12 emission with their transit fleets. And, of course, to bring
13 up California which has been a global leader in this space
14 with the ICT mandate.

15 And thank you so much CEC and CARB for advocating for
16 EVs and making California a leader.

17 Next slide, please.

18 So as we can see from the HD ZEV market today,
19 there's a lot of barriers that have been eliminated when it
20 comes to zero-emission electric transit buses. We have
21 improved range. Vehicles are now getting around 150 to 200
22 miles of range, which meets the needs of most transit
23 agencies across the country. There's proven performance with
24 our transit vehicles. The Proterra electric transit bus gets
25 about 25 miles per gallon equivalent compared to a diesel

1 bus. And it delivers nearly twice the horsepower and five
2 times better fuel efficiency.

3 So now we're seeing a transition to electric transit
4 buses, not just because of the environment and public health
5 benefits but because of the performance of the vehicle and
6 helping to instill that competence with customers that they
7 know their electric transit bus can meet the needs of their
8 route.

9 There's also been a sharp decline in battery costs
10 which is helping to lower the upfront cost of the vehicle.
11 And they'll also see, like my colleagues have pointed out, a
12 lower total cost of ownership with electric vehicles due to
13 the maintenance and fuel savings throughout the lifetime of
14 the vehicle.

15 We're also seeing a move towards charging
16 standardization so we know that the chargers that we're
17 putting in for the vehicles can be used for all EV fleets
18 that a city or state is using. And my photos here is of the
19 beautiful fleet deployment from San Jose Airport which has a
20 dozen buses lined up with a dozen chargers, it's very cool,
21 highly highly encourage everyone to go check it out. So
22 what's really important right now is that we can't lose this
23 momentum. And I know that the COVID situation has thrown a
24 lot of challenges in the way of our transit agencies.

25 We have a big opportunity to make investments in an

1 area that's not only helping to clean up our air and help the
2 public health within our communities, but it can also be a
3 huge job creator. So electric vehicles, according to a
4 recent study from NREL, EVs are going to contribute around
5 100,000 jobs per year through the next two decades. And
6 that's going to be a huge opportunity for us to capitalize on
7 pairing with all the benefits of EV.

8 But we still have some challenges as well. One of
9 the biggest challenges that we hear from customers is that
10 they're comfortable with the vehicle, they're comfortable
11 with the EV technology, but they are not comfortable managing
12 the infrastructure and managing the energy ecosystem. And
13 Proterra's unique in the sense that we build to be battery
14 technology. We build the vehicle. We also build our
15 chargers and we manage the deployment and installation of the
16 infrastructure. And we view this as a whole system because
17 EVs go beyond just operating one vehicle.

18 Next slide, please, Michelle.

19 So this is the future that we see for customers in
20 California. We see an opportunity for renewable energy
21 charging. We see an opportunity to maximize space and lower
22 upfront costs of the infrastructure installation by smart
23 planning. We see chargers that have V2G capability that are
24 intelligent and can manage charging time. And we see it as
25 being universal and scalable as well.

1 So looking forward to this conversation and thank you
2 again for having me.

3 MS. VATER: Thank you, Brittany. So that concludes
4 the presentations we have for this afternoon.

5 Commissioners, I'd like to open it up to you, if you
6 have any questions for the panelists at this time.

7 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Yes, this is Commissioner
8 Monahan for the Energy Commission. There I am. And I do
9 have a few questions.

10 Thanks to all the panelists, that was really
11 excellent and a good overview of all the different issues.
12 And I have a number of questions actually. Well one for each
13 panelist. I'm going to go quickly through them.

14 So Nate, you talked about the leasing of batteries
15 and that's something that I've heard in contextual terms but
16 I didn't know it was actually happening. Can you give me an
17 example across the country where that's happening? Or I'm
18 assuming you're talking about a utility leasing a battery to
19 the bus company? Or how is it working? How does that work?

20 MR. BAGUIO: Yeah. There are different concepts out
21 there but we're getting a lot of interest from utilities.
22 And you're exactly right, Commissioner Monahan, they're not
23 necessarily interested in the vehicle but what is going to
24 happen to that battery afterwards. And also how they're
25 seeing this, you know, as electric vehicles are -- the

1 adoption rates are going up.

2 The amount of energy that is in a community or a city
3 is compelling. And being able to offset those peak use times
4 and then the second step being able to use those batteries as
5 storage later on. So we're seeing a lot of interest. There
6 was a high profile one in Virginia with Dominion Energy
7 financing school buses, but behind that they're really
8 looking at the battery operation. There are pilots in
9 Florida, New York, as well as California, obviously, that are
10 building in this capability. And, again, a plan to use those
11 batteries. Almost like an iPhone plan where you have a
12 certain availability of power, once it reaches a certain
13 threshold, they'll switch them out and move them to their
14 second life.

15 So really excited to hear these conversations and I
16 think you're going to see a lot more of that moving forward.

17 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: And is this mostly in the
18 school bus arena or is it also happening in the transit bus
19 side?

20 MR. BAGUIO: It --

21 MS. CAPLIN: I can step in here.

22 MR. BAGUIO: Yeah, go ahead, Brittany. I was going
23 to let you --

24 MS. CAPLIN: Sorry, Nate. Thank you, Commissioner.
25 Good question.

1 So we have about a dozen Proterra customers that are
2 utilizing battery leasing right now. And as Nate mentioned,
3 there's a lot of benefits with that. It helps lower the
4 upfront cost and then transit agency customers pay for the
5 battery over the lifetime of the vehicle.

6 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Fascinating. I mean, because
7 that really does, I mean, when we're talking about the -- the
8 only difference, the challenge of course is that the vehicles
9 cost more and that they should save. (indiscernible) is TCO
10 takes a long time to be able to accrue and a lot of school
11 districts, cashed out school districts just can't look out
12 that far in terms of financing. So this really -- if this is
13 unlocked in a large scale, that could really help accelerate
14 electric transportation broadly.

15 MS. CAPLIN: Uh-huh.

16 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Is that a fair statement?

17 MS. CAPLIN: Yes, and we've seen with our battery
18 leasing program. It puts the price of the vehicle on cost
19 parity with a diesel vehicle.

20 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Hmm, fascinating.

21 MR. BAGUIO: And I know this is --

22 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Go ahead.

23 MR. BAGUIO: I'm sorry. Yeah, I know this is the
24 moving people section, but, you know, as our, you know, the
25 truck market is emerging and just the amount of energy on

1 those particular vehicles, I think that's only going to
2 accelerate this conversation as well.

3 MS. CAPLIN: Uh-huh. Plus I would add the second
4 life opportunity, they're also exciting. Because even though
5 the battery is not usable for transit, it still has a very,
6 very long life cycle within the battery. And so we think
7 that there's exciting opportunities with energy storage by
8 stacking up those batteries.

9 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Uh-huh. Interesting.

10 So my next question is for Brandon. Although I think
11 also other folks will have something to say about this.

12 But Brandon, you mentioned the V2G as being part of
13 this co-cost of ownership question, right? As we try to
14 figure out how to bring electric transportation into cost
15 parity with conventional vehicles. There are all these
16 different elements in total cost of ownership especially in
17 school buses, but I'm also hearing -- actually Brittany with
18 Proterra maybe this is (indiscernible) the transit bus side.
19 The V2G capability brings some interesting economic
20 opportunities and we probably got it more for the school
21 buses, of course, because our investment is in California and
22 the fact that school buses may be idle during the times of
23 day when we have a lot of curtailed renewable energy.

24 We could have this happy marriage where these
25 vehicles absorb our curtailed renewable energy allowing us to

1 actually accelerate our goals for a clean electricity system.

2 I'm just curious about how much both the users of the
3 buses and the bus manufacturers are thinking about V2G as
4 being an important aspect of that cost equation.

5 MR. BLUHM: Great question, Commissioner Monahan. I
6 appreciate the opportunity to answer this.

7 Really, to me, V2G is going to be the bridge in
8 getting us from where we are today to where we want to go with
9 this technology. And even though it's fairly new here in
10 this state, you know over in Europe, V2G has been integrated
11 for over a decade. So the model is there. But there's still
12 some pieces that need to happen with utility companies and
13 then the PUCs to really make those inner connections
14 available and be able to properly monetize that.

15 But for the school side, the route length and the
16 ability to have these buses sitting with that amount of
17 battery, it could be really managed as there are needs in the
18 grid is just probably you couldn't find a better scenario to
19 really take advantage of that technology.

20 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Also my ears perked up when
21 Macy said that when you include the LCFS as 22 cents per mile
22 positive which you're actually getting 22 cents per mile.
23 Did I hear that right, Macy? And so the LCFS value is that
24 high?

25 MR. NESHATI: Can you hear me?

1 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Yes, now we can.

2 MR. NESHATI: Yeah. You know, it's -- it's like a
3 little stock market out there and the credits are fluctuating
4 value depending on what's going on in the economy at any
5 point in time. But, yeah, the last couple batteries we sold,
6 we spread it out over 18 months and there were only electric
7 buses in earnest and it really turned into a positive number.

8 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Thank you. Could you give me
9 an sense of just how many miles your fleet is traveling in a
10 month to get an understanding?

11 MR. NESHATI: Yeah, about 165,000.

12 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Oh. All right. This is my
13 last question. And it's for Brittany, but I think others
14 might have thoughts on this as well.

15 So, you know, we at the Energy Commission are very
16 focused on promoting charging at the right times of day to be
17 able to help us integrate renewables and, you know, provide
18 other grid services. And we're worried, you know, with the
19 big electricity load that's unmanaged where we have to
20 provide more baseload electricity that makes it harder for us
21 to integrate renewables and reach our clean energy bill.

22 So I'm curious about how you all are thinking about
23 vehicle grid integration as you develop these smart charging
24 capabilities, and also whether in the transit bus world,
25 whether the V2G is an important part of vehicle grid

1 integration.

2 MS. CAPLIN: Great question, Commissioner.

3 So we think that the absolute most important thing
4 for transit agencies right now is the planning process. If
5 they don't have a thorough planning process for full fleet
6 electrification, that's where we start to see the higher cost
7 of maybe installing infrastructure and needing to move it.
8 Or installing too many chargers than what they actually need.
9 And then that's not only causing a spike in the energy use,
10 but it's expensive to install as well. So a proper planning
11 and fleet modeling session where you can really look at what
12 chargers are needed is key.

13 The other thing about infrastructure and energy use
14 is there's opportunities now to use multi-dispenser chargers.
15 So having multiple dispensers to one power control systems
16 unit and that will help lower the amount of overall energy
17 use. With that planning and proper utilization, we just
18 recently did a large scale deployment and we're expecting to
19 see 75 percent lower cost just because we did smart planning
20 and smart utilization.

21 A V2G is a really interesting opportunity as is VGI.
22 All of Proterra's chargers are V2G hardware capable.
23 Something that we are continuing to push within the industry
24 is a standard around the software for V2G so that still needs
25 to catch up. But we also have smart charging where you're

1 able to monitor against your demand charges, specifically for
2 some parts in California. And you can see when your spikes
3 are and better plan. We will soon move to a situation where
4 that's all done digitally and the chargers will be smart
5 enough to turn themselves off and turn themselves back on to
6 avoid peak times.

7 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: I mean it begs the question
8 with me, then is Proterra moving towards V2G in the buses
9 themselves with a battery, the bus battery?

10 MS. CAPLIN: Yes.

11 MR. BAGUIO: And, Commissioner Monahan, one of the
12 other exciting things that we've seen, there was a grant
13 program with the California Air Resources Board called the
14 Clean Mobility in Schools Grant. And what it really did was
15 pushed all of these different technologies together from, you
16 know, the electric mowers to the school buses, to the solar
17 panels. You know, and it was exciting to hear Macy talk
18 about how he's trying to have off-grid power.

19 But it was really to put challenge the private sector
20 to be innovative and like Brittany said plan on how all of
21 these different technologies need to think about one another
22 in order to maximize not only what's there presently in the
23 grid but also grow effectively so that all of these
24 technologies are complementing one another. And, or at the
25 very least aware of one another when they plan. So it's

1 exciting to see programs like that popping up.

2 MR. LIBAN: Yeah, I just want to weigh in as well on
3 the comments been made so far. Maybe this is unique to us
4 because of our size as an organization. You know, a lot of,
5 actually all of our bus depots, communities have grown around
6 them and, you know, while we have a commitment to electrify
7 fleet by 2030, part of the challenge there is, it's already
8 been mentioned, how do you actually, you know, put in the
9 electrical infrastructure in such a constrained space where
10 buses are essentially within inches of each other right now
11 and there's not a whole lot of space around to maneuver. And
12 during this transition, we need to move, you know, if not
13 millions of people every day, hundreds of thousands of people
14 every day.

15 So really the point I'm trying to make there is, you
16 know, we have been monitoring a significant number of the
17 opportunities and how people throughout the country, even the
18 world, you know, have actually adopted electric bus and zero-
19 emission vehicles. And, you know, we're struggling in the
20 context of, you know, how do we, again, you know, keep all
21 these people moving?

22 We operate within a 5,000 square mile area of Los
23 Angeles. And, you know, in certain times of the day, we need
24 to bring some of our buses from say the south bay area of
25 southern California of Los Angeles County to the San Fernando

1 Valley. And, you know, by the time, you know, based on the
2 current modeling, by the time, you know, that bus gets in
3 San Fernando Valley, you know, it might not necessarily have
4 the full charge that it needs to run, you know, the route
5 that it was being called for to serve all of our riders over
6 there.

7 So it's a lot of not only planning on infrastructure,
8 not only on the technologies are available to us, I did
9 mention earlier about the transition, you know, aspect of
10 this. There's no tailpipe emission, but the grid is still
11 not as clean as we want it be. You know, when you look at
12 our vehicle greenhouse emissions reductions, we've tried to
13 look at it on a whole life cycle point of view and discount,
14 if you may, you know, some of these tailpipe benefits, you
15 know, that we might be enjoying, you know, once we full
16 electrify the 2300 bus fleet that we have.

17 I think the last point I wanted to just mention there
18 that I might have just glossed over is the whole context of
19 workforce development. You know, we have an aging workforce
20 within our agency. We have a lot of these folks, you know,
21 or 5,000 or so maintenance workers who we need to retrain.
22 We need -- many of them are used to maintaining a natural gas
23 vehicle and now with the electrification, we need to somehow
24 move all those folks to some form of skill set. Not
25 necessarily all of them might want to go and maintain

1 electric buses for whatever reason that they might have.

2 And the other point there, too, is that in terms of
3 the number of buses we have, we anticipate a number of buses
4 we need, electric buses we need, to actually be more than
5 what we have right now simply because of this
6 interoperability issue across significant number of square
7 miles we operate in.

8 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Thanks, Cris. I guess it
9 works -- comes back to the three Ts, training, training,
10 training.

11 So I know that Commissioner Douglas has a question.
12 And Commissioner Inman does as well. So I'll pass it over to
13 Commissioner Douglas.

14 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Really just a brief question.
15 I wanted to see, I know Cris spoke recently about the impacts
16 of COVID-19 on transit generally and I just wanted to ask.
17 In the current environment, you know, what are steps that can
18 be taken to, from your perspective, to maintain momentum to
19 the shift to zero-emission buses and also vehicle to grid?
20 You know, what are -- what are we potentially needing to do
21 differently or better or more of to keep the momentum and
22 keep this moving forward?

23 MR. LIBAN: Yeah, that's an interesting question.

24 I mentioned this in the -- my concluding remarks for
25 the last question that, you know, we might need more buses in

1 the next, you know, as we transition from natural gas to
2 ZEVs. But, you know, the types of buses may be different
3 from what we are looking at right now. I don't want to
4 preempt, you know, the recovery task force, the LA Metro
5 recovery task force's recommendation to the Metro board in
6 the next few months but, you know, a lot more people are not
7 necessarily traveling right now.

8 You know, as I joked around, you know, I miss my bus
9 ride every morning. For those folks who might be traveling
10 on our system, those are the folks who are dependent on the
11 system. Those who are chance users of the system might not
12 necessarily use that anymore. With social distancing maybe
13 becoming the norm for a little bit of time, you know, we
14 can't pack at peak times. And so it's really going into a
15 direction wherein we need to rethink not only how our service
16 looks like, but how we operate the service.

17 Going back to your question in terms of, you know,
18 increasing or I mean at least maintaining the momentum, you
19 know, we have a commitment of a 2030 zero-emission bus fleet.
20 At this point of time, as I speak to you, there is no change
21 in that commitment. We actually have a structural deficit
22 that we're anticipating. I did mention that earlier. It's a
23 publicly available piece of information up to \$1.8 billion.

24 We had a meeting with OEMs, you know, I think late
25 last year and we put notices that anticipated decrease in the

1 per bus cost will most likely not happen. And so, you know,
2 if I had my crystal ball, I think, you know, people will
3 still be concerned about the benefits that electric buses or
4 ZEVs or similar types of vehicles and people will be
5 continually interested in those.

6 But, you know, the volume, the number, the upgrading
7 of those, and the types of those types of fleets out there
8 will most likely significantly change, given the environment
9 we're in right now. So specifically the fiscal environment
10 that we're in right now if these piece of equipment are going
11 to consistently be at the price that they will be.

12 You know, obviously it's my opinion, I did mention
13 earlier, just for the record that, you know, we have a
14 recovery task force within LA Metro. And the task force,
15 looking at all the different angles on how this might look
16 service-wise, as well as operation-wise for our agency.

17 MR. BLUHM: Commissioner Douglas, if I could add, you
18 know, on the school bus side, we've seen a huge adoption
19 primarily driven through the funding that has been available.
20 And in light of COVID and how that's going to affect school
21 districts and their budgets, you know, Commissioner Monahan
22 mentioned school districts sometimes have a difficult time
23 looking at the total cost of ownership over the actual
24 initial investment, right. They're not built like a business
25 where it's about the profitability for -- or the long-term

1 cost. It all comes down to that acquisition cost and how
2 much is really available in their fiscal budget. So the
3 funding and a continued support in that regard is going to be
4 critical, especially right now in light of the challenges
5 which is just as difficult in light of, you know, state
6 budgets and what's happened as well due to this crisis.

7 So it's an interesting dilemma, but we certainly
8 don't want to see the brakes put on this momentum that we're
9 all seeing in this regard. That would be the worst thing to
10 have happened is this great forward push kind of come to a
11 stuttered stop.

12 MS. CAPLIN: Uh-huh. I'd love to echo those comments
13 as well. With transit agencies, we know that ridership is
14 down but also sources of their funding like gas tax, sales
15 tax, are not coming in at the same strength that they were
16 previously before COVID as well. So we're anticipating a lot
17 of transit agencies are going to be using their earmarked
18 funding to keep their operations moving as opposed to making
19 investments in new vehicles.

20 So one of the things that we want to keep seeing is
21 funding opportunities for transit agencies so they can invest
22 in their emission vehicle. Like Brandon just said, we really
23 don't want to lose this momentum right now and also the
24 Coronavirus pandemic is showing us how -- it's showing us the
25 benefit of getting ICE and diesel-powered vehicles off the

1 road.

2 And we so appreciate the CEC's infrastructure grant
3 that'll be coming out soon as well as the blueprint grant to
4 help some transit agencies offset the upfront cost of
5 infrastructure and that's going to be a continued important
6 role to play not just for the funding but with information
7 sharing as well so that transit agencies can make smart
8 decisions and potentially spend less in the long run.

9 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: All right. Thank you.

10 MR. BAGUIO: Just I'd like to echo those as well, but
11 I think one of the things is this continued investment is
12 going to help us, you know, dig our way out. I think zero-
13 emission vehicles, the supply chain, the manufacturing that's
14 happening here in California, it's not just been asked to
15 help offset budgets, but I think that the economic
16 development that the zero-emission industry brings to
17 California is going to help contribute. So it's not just all
18 one ask, but it's a mechanism to help us contribute to this
19 recovery as well.

20 MR. NESHATI: If I may, from a different transit
21 perspective and than my colleague at LA MTA, we're in, you
22 know, mind you this is, if you want a program to succeed,
23 you'll think of a million ways to make it succeed. If you're
24 not committed to the program, you'll think of a million
25 obstacles to prevent it from succeeding. We're committed to

1 zero-emission fleet and as we encounter problems and
2 obstacles, we work to overcome them and keep moving forward.

3 I don't see a choice in not electrifying the whole
4 country, the whole world. So we cannot continue to burn
5 fossil fuels and expect to be a viable planet in a few more
6 generations or centuries.

7 Commissioner Douglas, she also asked specifically in
8 your question about vehicle to grid. And I think that --
9 that has a lot of potential in passenger cars where they're
10 parked all day and can spear the energy back to the grid when
11 you have sunshine and you're building is solar and you've got
12 an overcapacity of power. And certainly school buses, in the
13 many school districts, you know, have a couple-hour run in
14 the morning and six hours of quiet time and a couple-hour run
15 in the afternoon so batteries can easily be committed to the
16 grid for several hours as I see it.

17 Transit, for most fleets, run all day until the wee
18 hours in the night. Our fleet runs from about 5 in the
19 morning until midnight. So the only time we have to charge
20 is, you know, that midnight to 4:30, 5:00 in the morning. We
21 don't have any opportunity to give the power back so while it
22 may not, in my view in talking to many of our transit
23 colleagues, the V2G isn't a really a great fit for transit
24 per se, but it certainly has potential and a great
25 opportunity in a lot of other fleets and a lot of other

1 electrical vehicle applications.

2 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: That makes sense. Thanks.

3 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Commissioner Inman, did you
4 have any questions?

5 Well, you can chime in if she has a question later.

6 So Michelle, why don't we turn it over to you. I
7 know we've eaten into a lot of the time that we had
8 originally anticipated for you. For you to --

9 MS. VATER: That's okay.

10 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: I'm going to take -- I'm going
11 to just take an executive decision and say, we had talked
12 about ending it 2:50, but why don't we say closer to 2:55 or
13 even 3:00, if the discussion is going, but.

14 MS. VATER: Yeah, I mean, I touched on a lot already.

15 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: Unless that's all the
16 questions that you were going to ask. Sorry about that,
17 Michelle.

18 MS. VATER: No, you guys touched on everything. I
19 think we're done. No, I'm just kidding.

20 Commissioner Inman, will you chime if you have a
21 question.

22 We've talked a lot about, you guys have answered a
23 lot of questions that we have already discussed and that I
24 wanted to pose for you. I do want to sort of bring back
25 towards the moving people and incorporate the people back

1 into it. But I did want to ask Cris a question and open it
2 up to you guys as well.

3 Cris, being in LA, you mentioned lack of space. And
4 I know that is not just with transit, it's with schools,
5 installing the charging infrastructure for their fleet is --
6 it's not easy. And you can't just snap and have more space
7 created.

8 So have you -- what are the viable options that you
9 guys have come up with like can you elaborate on what your
10 plans are as you grow your fleet?

11 MR. LIBAN: Yeah, so there's -- there's a lot of
12 technologies out there. You know, there's catenary
13 technology that we're looking at, there's, you know, en route
14 charging technology that we're going to build into our
15 Orange-Salina-Fullerton, our silver line, for example.
16 There's also, you know, a way to kind of do, you know,
17 charging at the divisions where you have as little
18 infrastructure as possible.

19 So, yeah, there's a lot of technology. And part of
20 the challenge too, you know, and I respect what Macy
21 mentioned earlier in terms of the obstacles that, you know,
22 that we face. Believe me, we are racking our brains out in
23 terms of all of these challenges relative to zero-emission
24 buses. But, you know, the size of our fleet is the one that
25 is actually limiting us in our ability to actually have a

1 wholesale solution, you know, across the system.

2 You know, what might be good for one location where,
3 you know, for example in Sun Valley where they have a little
4 bit of space and, you know, the type of infrastructure we can
5 put in for EVs, might not necessarily be true, you know, for
6 areas near Silver Lake or in South LA. Because, you know, for
7 whatever reason, we can't do that.

8 So that's kind of like, you know, where we are in
9 those. We're also looking at, you know, what does the
10 battery look like, right, on those buses? I did mention
11 earlier just some thoughts that are floating around. You
12 know, are these types of buses that we are using right now,
13 given the new normal, if you may, of social distancing and
14 maybe more fleets. Are the sizes of the buses that we're
15 using right now, are those still the appropriate sizes of
16 buses that we need to kind of go out there and deliver people
17 where they need to go.

18 And obviously, of course, you know, farebox recovery
19 is only up to 30 cents per dollar, you know. With the
20 structural deficit we have with the number of people that we
21 can put into those buses after we come out of this, you know,
22 that would significantly come down even with an increase in
23 the number of buses that might be traveling throughout LA.
24 So.

25 MS. VATER: Okay, great. Anybody else have any

1 comments in regards to that? Maybe a new innovative
2 technology. Otherwise, we can move out.

3 So we've touched on a lot of the barriers in the
4 heavy duty sector. The programs and some grants that have
5 been available that can assist companies and the state attain
6 our zero-emission vehicle goals. So I just want to turn it
7 back a little bit on equity and people. And how can the
8 state and public and private entities ensure that this
9 electrification in transit and school supports our state
10 goals of equality and equity in disadvantaged communities?
11 We touched on it a little bit earlier, but if you guys have
12 any thoughts in that direction and how we can engage the
13 community in this as we move towards fully electric.

14 MR. LIBAN: Well I can start. You know, I did
15 mention earlier our how women travel study. You know,
16 there's a lot of good points in there wherein, you know, the
17 planning of infrastructure needs to shift a little bit in
18 terms of what and how women might use, you know, the transit
19 system as well as those affiliated infrastructures,
20 especially with the transit systems.

21 The other part there, too, is that, you know,
22 there's -- there has always been a big push, you know, to put
23 more funding, project funding into those applications that
24 have a vulnerable communities component to it. You know,
25 I've seen that, for example, in EV charger applications, I've

1 seen that in some of these climate change applications that,
2 you know, we put in alongside with the communities like
3 Watts, communities like South LA, just, you know, wherein
4 Watts part of.

5 And, I think the challenge, though, is that, you
6 know, are we -- and I just pose this out there maybe for the
7 commissioners to actually think about, you know, the
8 challenge, you know, has there been a wholesale in like a
9 measurement of what might be the dollar return on whatever,
10 you know, is the benefit that's been expected, you know, for
11 those funding. You know, on the health benefits, for
12 example, of those investments. An economic development
13 that's essentially stirred up in those locations.

14 You know, we're trying to do that in sources we can
15 in a lot of our construction sites. You know, we try to kind
16 of quantify, you know, avoided hospital visits for example.
17 Or what are the economic benefits to small businesses, the
18 increase in land values that might impact the, you know, home
19 and housing equity challenges in those areas.

20 So I just want to put it out there because when we're
21 looking at, you know, and I've been seeing a lot of these
22 kinds of investments and, you know, we haven't really seen
23 anything more concrete and maybe wholesale study on that.
24 So.

25 MR. BLUHM: I would add, Michelle, that, you know, I

1 think the Energy Commission and the way that a lot of the
2 grant programs are put together as well as local air
3 districts and car really put an emphasis on the disadvantaged
4 communities and a focus on making sure that these deployments
5 are focused around those areas. And most of the electric
6 deployments that we've seen within the state have really been
7 within those communities.

8 I think it's important for the communities to realize
9 that whether it's an electric truck, transit bus, a school
10 bus, whatever it is, these deployments really do need to be
11 celebrated because it is much more than just helping a
12 transit agency or a school district, it is helping our
13 community. So it's certainly something that we strive to
14 make sure that that recognition is there for the community
15 and that it's something that can be celebrated.

16 MR. BAGUIO: I mean, one of the other important
17 things that's happening is training programs, job training
18 programs. We've worked with the community college districts
19 and school districts as well to train the vehicle technician
20 of the future, or even the bus driver of the future to, you
21 know, kind of open up the perception and the view of, you
22 know, the transportation is turning into the tech industry
23 and to just kind of add of what Macy was saying, training,
24 training, training, is really going to be an important part
25 to again to the economic development of some underserved

1 communities where these buses are deployed.

2 As Brandon said, there is a lot of focus of them
3 going into disadvantaged communities or free and reduced
4 lunch areas, and then backing that up with on-the-job
5 training will just, you know, kind of build on that effect
6 of, you know, working with communities.

7 MS. VATER: Thank you. Sorry, I'm having technical
8 difficulties, it seems like. I appreciate that insight.

9 It looks like we're about 2:51ish. That is all of my
10 questions. You guys touched on a lot of different topics
11 today in this moving people workshop. So I really appreciate
12 your input, your ideas, suggestions.

13 I am going to turn it back over to Heather for public
14 comment.

15 MS. RAITT: Great. Thank you, Michelle. Thank you
16 panelists for all of that great discussion.

17 So, yeah, we're going to move on to public comments
18 and we're asking for one person per organization to comment
19 for a maximum of three minutes per speaker.

20 And if you're on the Zoom platform, you can use the
21 raise hand feature. I see we have a number of people who've
22 done that already, and we will unmute your line. We'll let
23 you know of each time. And before you making your comments,
24 if you could spell your name, identify your name and
25 affiliation, and spell out your name out loud for our court

1 recorder for the record.

2 And then if you're on the phone line and you're not
3 using the Zoom platform, just press Star 9 and that will
4 raise your hand to let us know you want to make a comment.

5 And Dorothy Murimi from our Public Advisor's office
6 will go ahead and conduct that for us. Thank you, Dorothy.

7 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Heather.

8 As Heather said, once your name or last four digits
9 have been called, you'll be unmuted. Please unmute, make
10 sure you're unmuted on your end as well.

11 So first public commenter, we have CTE11. Please
12 state your name and spell it. Thank you.

13 MS. LEVIN: Yes, this is Jaimie Levin, spelled
14 J-A-I-M-I-E; Levin, L-E-V-I-N. I'm with the Center for
15 Transportation and the Environment.

16 We're heavily engaged in both deploying fuel cell
17 electric and battery electric transit buses here in
18 California and around the country. And we're also quite
19 engaged in transition planning to help transit agencies make
20 the transition to zero-emission to meet the innovative clean
21 transit regulation.

22 It was great to hear the presentations. I was
23 especially impressed with the advances that Macy and Antelope
24 have made with battery electric buses in their fleet. But I
25 wanted to emphasize, and I know Michelle and Commissioner

1 Monahan are planning a fuel cell workshop for IEPR later, but
2 I wanted -- but regardless, I wanted to emphasize, there are
3 two electric buses. The battery electric that we all speak
4 of, but the fuel cell electric and we will absolutely need
5 both of these technologies to meet the innovative clean
6 transition regulation.

7 Fuel cell electric buses are going to play a major
8 role. Our organization has recently deployed 20 of these new
9 fuel cell electric buses in Orange County in AC Transit,
10 reaching upwards of 300 miles of range. So the vehicle
11 performance is really showing its worth in the fuel cell
12 technology.

13 But to really address Commissioner Douglas' question
14 and concern, I think what we have to look at is how can we
15 best leverage scarce funding? And it is scarcer because of
16 COVID and the impact on the state budget. And scalability is
17 a big factor in all of this. How does all of this technology
18 and zero-emission buses scale to handle not just a few buses,
19 but 100, 200, 300 buses at a single operating division?

20 And we've got to move in that direction to fund
21 projects that will show cost efficiency and operational
22 efficiency. And this very much relies on how the
23 infrastructure systems operate in the fueling recharging
24 systems.

25 CEC plays a big role in bridge funding helping us

1 move towards these new technologies. And so we've got some
2 major challenges ahead of us, but we very much appreciate
3 CEC's interest now in transit and in heavy duty fueling and
4 we look forward to working with staff and with CARB to effect
5 a zero-emission future that will not only include battery
6 electric, but very importantly fuel cell electric
7 technologies.

8 Thank you.

9 MS. MURIMI: Thank you. Next we have Tim Sasseen.
10 Tim.

11 Tim, if you can unmute on your end, you have the
12 floor.

13 Okay, we will come back to Tim. There might be some
14 technical difficulties.

15 Christian Peeples. And folks when you're done with
16 your comment, please lower your hand. Just click that button
17 and it will take off your hand. Thank you.

18 MR. PEEPLES: Great, thank you.

19 MS. MURIMI: Christian.

20 MR. PEEPLES: My name is Chris Peeples, P-E-E-P-L-E-
21 S.

22 And I'm elected at-large director of the Alameda-Contra Costa
23 Transit District.

24 We provide bus service on the east side of the San
25 Francisco Bay to about 1.4 million people using about 600

1 buses and 2400 employees. We have been operating hydrogen
2 fuel cell heavy-duty electric buses for almost 20 years.
3 We've now run hydrogen fuel stacks to failure. They've
4 lasted over 32,000 hours which is better than the 25,000
5 hours that DOE and DOT set as a goal for them. We have then
6 rebuilt them in-house and one of them is actually running a
7 bus as we speak today. We're working on trying to get that
8 documented and get that public.

9 A few years ago, the American Public Transportation
10 Association, Bus and Paratransit Conference was in Reno,
11 Nevada, so we drove a bus from Oakland to Reno, Nevada and
12 back. Going up, it had to refuel in West Sac but coming
13 back, it made it all the way from Reno to Oakland on one
14 refueling. Our newer buses which are made by New Flyer have
15 about a 300-mile range as Jaimie mentioned and they refuel in
16 under 10 minutes. So they're really a one-to-one replacement
17 for diesel.

18 We're in the process of starting up a 30-bus by
19 30-bus by 30-bus by 30-bus, 30 battery electric, 30 fuel cell
20 electric, 30 diesel electric, and 30 diesel test so we'll
21 have some real world work on this stuff. But we've got few
22 hydrogen fuel cell electric buses that are out there working.
23 We've accumulated several, or well about 30 million miles on
24 them and they work. And we are really looking for CEC to
25 help us provide the infrastructure for in raising that fleet

1 because we've got the CPUC money to provide the
2 infrastructure for the battery electric so we need some kind
3 of equivalent so we can provide infrastructure for the fuel
4 cell electric.

5 Thank you very much.

6 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, sir. Next we have Diane
7 Moss.

8 MS. MOSS: Thank you. I just -- I saw in a chat that
9 Tim is ready to speak and just have his screen frozen so I
10 would love to defer my time back to him and come later, if he
11 is available because I know he was eager to speak. So.

12 MS. MURIMI: Oh, thank you very much, Diane. We can
13 go ahead and check --

14 MS. MOSS: What's that?

15 MS. MURIMI: I said, thank you very much, Diane. We
16 can go ahead and check Tim's audio now.

17 Tim Sasseen?

18 MR. SASSEEN: Okay, I think got through that time.
19 Okay. It says I'm talking. Fantastic. Thank you so much.

20 Thank you, Commissioner Monahan, everyone at the CEC,
21 everyone in attendance for these great meetings. It's been
22 really productive. Thank you so much.

23 Obviously I'd like to speak to the other electric
24 bus, fuel cell electric buses. Conspicuously absent so far
25 except for the comments and one of the reasons may be because

1 of cost. And that situation has changed quite a bit in
2 recent years. Fuel cell electric buses have made massive
3 cost advances by limited deployments relative to battery
4 counterparts.

5 In 2010, a fleet of 20 fuel cell electric buses was
6 deployed in Vancouver at \$2 million each. This reduced to
7 just \$1.3 million in 2017. And the last Department General
8 Services contract released for zero-emission buses had a
9 price for just over one million for fuel cell electric buses
10 which was within 11 percent of the closest battery electric
11 bus to create our operational capability. This cost
12 reduction came almost exclusively from design advances from
13 field experience going back more than 20 years.

14 Fuel cell manufacturers are only now just beginning
15 to implement the sort of very high-volume role to role
16 manufacturing processes that drove down battery prices so
17 rapidly over the last five years. Even ahead of this, our
18 latest generation of fuel cell modules have reduced cost,
19 weight, and volume, all by 35 percent or more while extending
20 lifetime by nearly the same amount.

21 Recycling costs which still remain a concern for
22 batteries are minimized as 97 percent of our platinum is
23 recycled. Fuel cell electric buses are electric buses but
24 with about a sixth or less of the batteries of the battery
25 bus while providing superior range and operational capability

1 with no performance degradation from full tank to empty, cold
2 weather to hot. The lifetime cost of this small battery pack
3 is also improved as fuel cells maintain the batteries in a
4 state of charge in a narrow band reducing stresses that can
5 rapidly degrade battery packs.

6 Hydrogen storage tanks are the other additional cost
7 component. And they have big cost decreases in store as
8 carbon fiber, precursor fiber costs are rapidly reducing and
9 radical new architectures allow performance to vehicle
10 packaging (indiscernible).

11 Servicing costs are also rapidly reducing. NREL's
12 estimates for service costs for AC Transit's 2010 fuel cell
13 buses were about a buck 61 a mile. While they found for the
14 2014 buses at SunLine, they were a buck 25 per mile for the
15 first prototypes, then dropping drastically to 32 cents per
16 mile for later models equal or better than the CNG costs.

17 These will drop even further through new technician
18 training that's going to happen at the West Coast Center of
19 Excellence at SunLine, as well as at AC Transit through their
20 advanced training facility. And from the latest
21 maintainability advances in the newest buses.

22 All of this is confirmed by recent studies by groups
23 like Deloitte and McKinsey, which show fuel cell electric bus
24 total cost of operations dropping below that, not only of
25 diesel and CNG, but also in battery electric buses before the

1 end of the decade, as soon as 2027. This TCO advantage comes
2 not only from rapidly dropping capital in fuel costs, but
3 from the lower operational costs of operating a bus with
4 equivalent capabilities to diesel and CNG buses that our
5 transit systems were designed for.

6 Thank you very much.

7 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Tim Sasseen. Next we'll go
8 on to Diane Moss.

9 MS. MOSS: Hi. Thank you so much. Diane Moss,
10 policy director for California Hydrogen Business Council.

11 And I just -- I'm going to stay very brief and thank
12 the Commission so much for having this important
13 conversation. And echoing Tim and some other commenters
14 today, just wanted to echo the call for a diverse set of
15 technologies as we tackle this challenge of transitioning to
16 zero-emissions, electric vehicles, in the important sector of
17 moving people around.

18 I also was going to call on that McKinsey study that
19 showed that by the end of the decade fuel cell electric
20 vehicles and bus, and battery electric vehicles in urban use
21 are probably going to cost about the same. Or fuel cell
22 electric buses beating them out when longer ranges are
23 needed.

24 And also they point out that some of the -- some of
25 the in the shorter ranges, that there's going to be a

1 dependence on variables like electricity costs and fuel costs
2 and space limitations. Very location-specific variables that
3 are uncertain at this point. And so a reason why it's
4 important for policymakers to keep both types of electric
5 zero emission bus technologies in view when making policy and
6 having conversations like this.

7 And I just touched briefly also, Commissioner
8 Monahan, you brought up an issue dear to my heart which is
9 how does all of this fit into integrating renewables? And we
10 do talk a lot about VGI, something that I've worked on for a
11 long time in the electric, the battery electric sector. But
12 one of the benefits I also want to point out in the hydrogen
13 fuel cell technology arena is that in here, renewable
14 electricity can be taken, for example, when there's more
15 solar wind then's needed to be made to use hydrogen. I mean
16 to produce hydrogen from that electricity that can be used a
17 later time. And that ability to integrate renewables at a
18 separate time for when it's needed for transportation as one
19 of the, I think, really exciting things about including
20 hydrogen fuel cell electric vehicles in the conversation.

21 So with that, I'm going to leave it to, I know
22 there's a bunch of other speakers who want to speak. And
23 just thank you so much and I look forward to continuing the
24 conversation.

25 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Diane.

1 Next we'll have Nico B. followed by SVLG.

2 As a reminder, please state and spell your name.

3 Thank you.

4 MR. BOUWKAMP: Hello?

5 MS. MURIMI: Hi, we can hear you.

6 MR. BOUWKAMP: Okay. My name is Nico Bouwkamp.

7 N-I-C-O; B-O-U-W-K-A-M-P. I'm the technical programmer
8 manager with the California Fuel Cell Partnership. And
9 previously I've also been creating the bus team at our
10 organization.

11 Thank you for the opportunity to comment and we
12 appreciate CEC's continued participation in the CEC. In the
13 context of this workshop and the focus on the 2020 IEPR
14 updates and planning for the future based on current trends,
15 I'd like to make a few comments.

16 From my understanding is that transit is all about
17 providing a reliable service to riders with the least
18 complexity and the maximum performance vehicles within the
19 budget that has been allotted to them. One trend that has not
20 been mentioned much during this workshop and that would be
21 good to hear more about maybe in future workshops is the
22 impact of the innovative clean transit rule by ARB. Transit
23 agencies are currently in a scramble to organize around that
24 and decide on what the mix of vehicles is. If it's battery
25 electric or fuel cell buses or a mix of the two and how they

1 can continue their operations that are within the budgets
2 that have been allotted to them. And that's all largely
3 relying on FTA and regional funding.

4 In this context with regards to hydrogen, I won't get
5 into the details too much because I think the four previous
6 speakers have mentioned this as well. But hydrogen
7 infrastructure appears more challenging but has delivered as
8 well as emphasized by AC Transit for transit heavy-duty bus
9 applications in the past, in the last 20 years. With that,
10 I'd also like to point out that for cost reduction which is
11 an important trend to follow as well and maybe track at some
12 point is that both battery electric and fuel cell bus
13 electric buses have similar drivetrains and this is important
14 to reduce the cost of both of these bus technologies, as well
15 as the development of the electric drivetrain components
16 supplier base which is very important to move towards the
17 future where the costs are so manageable.

18 One last point that I want to -- like to bring up is
19 that it's not clear to me how these discussions and these
20 workshops and info provided both feed into the updated 2020
21 IEPR updates.

22 So I'll leave you with that. I think there are
23 plenty of other comments to consider and we're looking
24 forward to working with the CEC in this regard. And we're
25 also looking forward to provide our input here in the fuel

1 cell and hydrogen-specific workshops in the future.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Nico.

4 Next SLVG and Hugh Wynn afterwards.

5 MS. SICKLER: Thank you so much. This is Heidi
6 Sickler with the Silicon Valley Leadership Group. Thank you,
7 Commissioners, for the opportunity.

8 Don't have a comment so much as a question for Cris
9 Liban, who I know from my time at LA Metro when I was working
10 for the former L.A. mayor there on transportation policy, and
11 also for Macy. Really interested in your feedback on how
12 transit agencies can partner with utilities and cities on
13 deployment of microgrids to provide backup power. You know,
14 along with being in the age of COVID, we're also in the age
15 of power safety, power shutoff. So I'd love to get your
16 thoughts on the type of guidance or tools that public transit
17 agencies are looking for from either local organizations or
18 agencies to be able to deploy those microgrids and also to
19 provide resource adequacy as you pull in more and more
20 renewables.

21 Those are just some thoughts and questions. Thank
22 you.

23 MS. MURIMI: Could you spell your name. Sorry.

24 MS. SICKLER: Of course. Commissioner Monahan knows
25 me. I'm one of your advisor committee members on the Clean

1 Transport Advisory Committee. Heidi, S-I-C-K-L-E-R.

2 MS. MURIMI: Thank you.

3 Next we have -- let's go to Al Cioffi. I hope I'm
4 saying that right. Al Cioffi.

5 MR. CIOFFI: Yeah, hi, can you hear me?

6 MS. MURIMI: Yes, we can. Go ahead.

7 MR. CIOFFI: Okay. Hi, my name is Al Cioffi. It's
8 spelled C, as in Charles, I-O, two Fs, as in Frank, I. I am
9 with Plug Power.

10 And what I'd like to do is I'd like to make two
11 points in support of consideration for the alternative
12 electronic technology which is fuel cell electric technology.

13 Just a couple of points about Plug Power. Our
14 business is built completely by supplying fuel cell electric
15 drive products into the forklift business. Now our customers
16 exclusively today operate electric forklifts which means that
17 they're running batteries in their fork trucks. And we have
18 33,000 units that are deployed throughout the U.S. and now
19 actually throughout the world. It is estimated that 30
20 percent of the groceries in the United States are touched by
21 in some way shape or form by a Plug Power enabled vehicle.

22 Now our customers, as I mentioned, they will run
23 battery electric technology. 33,000 times they have
24 willingly replaced their battery electric technology with
25 fuel cell electric technology and these are people like

1 Kroeger, Walmart, and Amazon. So these aren't -- these are
2 some very large logistically intense companies. And the
3 reason why they willingly replace them is because the fuel
4 cell electric has demonstrated to provide significant
5 operational and management efficiencies and management
6 improvements. They're able simply to move more product in
7 their facilities by using a fuel cell electric than a battery
8 electric technology.

9 Those same issues are also present and will be
10 present in on road vehicles that move goods, that move
11 people, and move basically anything. So I would like to
12 offer that I would be willing to participate either one-on-
13 one or with any public forum to take people through in-depth
14 this value proposition we have and show you why fuel cell
15 electric vehicles are worthy of equal consideration with
16 battery electric vehicles. We don't profess that we can
17 solve every single problem but we solve quite a number of
18 problems.

19 The other thing that we do is we also provide the
20 fuel. We currently provide about 24 tons of hydrogen daily
21 for customers. By the end of this year, it will be 32 tons a
22 day. We have recently announced that we will be moving into
23 production of our own hydrogen and that will be 100 percent
24 green hydrogen. Many industry analysts expect and project
25 the price of hydrogen and green hydrogen to drop below the \$2

1 a kilogram rate which is going to be equivalent to about \$1
2 diesel gallon equivalent. The infrastructure costs our
3 customers find also are about 80 to 90 percent lower with
4 hydrogen than they are with battery electrics. And to the
5 point that was made earlier, hydrogen fueling station is a
6 perfect microgrid enabler.

7 So I would look forward to engaging with anyone in
8 the future in getting more in-depth thoughts on this topic.

9 Thank you.

10 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Al.

11 Next we have Nick Mitica (phonetic), followed by
12 Rajiv Singhal.

13 Nick, and please spell your name. Thank you. Nick
14 Mitica, are you on the line? No. We'll go on to Rajiv
15 Singhal. Rajiv?

16 MR. SINGHAL: Yeah. Can you hear me?

17 MS. MURIMI: Yes, we can hear you. Go ahead.

18 MR. SINHAL: This is Rajiv Singhal; R-A-J-I-V;
19 S-I-N-G-H-A-L.

20 Thanks for giving me this opportunity to make a
21 comment. So I just wanted to touch base on two things.
22 Number one, there's a discussion about the second life
23 battery and second discussion was about the smart charging.
24 And we work for a company called Mobility House and we've
25 been doing this for over 10 years where we help fleets

1 monetize their zero first and second life batteries. And we
2 also have programs under leasing where we work with different
3 finance companies and energy service companies to provide
4 those programs.

5 Number two, the smart charging, we charge some of the
6 biggest fleets in the Europe currently, 150 buses in a single
7 fleet, all electric buses, where we use our software we
8 charge the buses smart fleet. Just wanted to share that, so
9 that's been there and Europe is pretty heading in that
10 technology and we're bringing that to the U.S. now the last
11 couple of years.

12 And I have a question for AVTA, I'm not sure if they
13 can answer right now or I don't know how it works, but I just
14 wanted to learn what sort of charge and energy management
15 AVTA is using for their 58-bus fleet currently.

16 Thank you.

17 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Rajiv.

18 Next we have Ray Pingle followed by Kristian Corby.

19 Ray.

20 MR. PINGLE: Hi, can you hear me?

21 MS. MURIMI: Yes, we can. Go ahead.

22 MR. PINGLE: So Ray Pingle; R-A-Y; P-I-N-G-L-E. I'm
23 with Sierra Club California.

24 So when CARB was going through the innovative clean
25 transit rulemaking, I was a participant in the subcommittee

1 on total cost of ownership, so I have some insight and
2 experience on total cost of ownership. And I wanted to talk
3 about that with respect to battery-electric buses. And first
4 of all, I would like to congratulate Macy and AVTA on the
5 phenomenal progress they've been making in their transit
6 agency. They really are not only pioneers but the gold
7 standard, in my view, of how to do it right.

8 And I think I was very delighted to see the facts and
9 figures that Macy presented, which is a proof statement for
10 the very significant fuel and maintenance savings that can be
11 realized with battery electric buses.

12 So the fuel costs and maintenance costs can be in the
13 neighborhood of 50 percent of the total cost of ownership of
14 a transit bus over its lifetime. So savings in these two
15 areas are really critical. When we talk about the fuel cost,
16 first of all, just the raw cost of electricity, according to
17 some CARB TCO studies, is actually lower than the cost of
18 fossil fuels to begin with, so there are savings to be
19 realized there.

20 And then as Macy pointed out, the low-carbon fuel
21 standard incentives can be tremendous, and in fact, we
22 modeled out the impact of LCSF and different transit
23 agencies, and some transit agencies, the LCSF credits can
24 actually pay for the entire cost of the fuel, and in some
25 cases more. So transit agencies can actually realize net

1 income, if you will, from LCSF.

2 And then what Macy's doing is putting up solar when
3 he completes that project, his -- not only will his
4 electricity costs become even lower, he'll have net --
5 further net savings from excess LCSF, but the LCSF credit is
6 greater because he's getting this electricity from renewable
7 energy.

8 And then when you look at what's happening with the
9 utilities, they're putting forward new tariff structures to
10 stabilize and lower demand charges, they're coming up with
11 new -- other new tariffs that are going to benefit heavy-duty
12 vehicles. So the fuel savings, and actually even some cases
13 net revenue generated from using electricity can be
14 phenomenal.

15 Just very quickly on fuel cell vehicles. So fuel
16 cell vehicles can be fine, it can compete with some pros and
17 cons of battery electric, but the most important thing is
18 they need to be fueled with green hydrogen because
19 conventional hydrogen has a higher greenhouse gas output per
20 mile than fossil fuels do, so that's the most important thing
21 for hydrogen-fuel vehicles. They need to be using green
22 electrolyzed hydrogen.

23 Thank you very much.

24 MS. MURIMI: Thank you.

25 Next, we have Kristian Corby. Please spell and state

1 your name. Followed by David Warren.

2 Kristian.

3 MR. CORBY: Hi, this is Kristian Corby with CalETC.
4 My name is spelled with a K, so it's K-R-I-S-T-I-A-N, and
5 it's Corby, C-O-R-B-Y.

6 Can you guys hear me?

7 MS. MURIMI: Yes we can, sir. Go ahead.

8 MR. CORBY: Okay, great. So I just wanted to say that
9 CalETC really appreciates and supports the CEC's work in this
10 area, and we want to recognize that these are really
11 challenging times with the pandemic that we're all
12 experiencing right now, and that that is going to have some
13 very significant effects on the funding that becomes
14 available for these projects, including electric buses, which
15 are so necessary during these times and so ready to convert
16 to zero-emission.

17 So we just wanted to emphasize that we have a really
18 broad coalition of support for these incentives and really
19 hope that we are able to see the State budget reflect that
20 even during these really difficult times.

21 We also wanted to call for a public private
22 partnership that addresses some of the infrastructure
23 challenges that were discussed today. We really see that
24 space constraints can be really difficult and funding can
25 also be difficult there. There are certainly a lot of

1 challenges that CalETC and its utility members have -- we
2 really started to appreciate and we're working really hard to
3 try to streamline those processes and come up with unique and
4 creative solutions for them. So we think a public private
5 partnership would be really great in that -- in that respect
6 to help -- help build -- build on those ideas.

7 Also just, I've been working a lot on the act rule
8 that's coming out from CARB right now and I really see these
9 electric buses being a great way to help meet a lot of the
10 sales targets that are going to be coming out for those as
11 well. So I just wanted to show how these projects at the CEC
12 and CARB, really there's so much overlapping and beneficial
13 characteristics to them.

14 Thank you.

15 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Kristian.

16 Next we'll have David Warren. Followed by Lauren
17 Skiver.

18 Please state and spell your name. Thank you.

19 Go ahead, David.

20 MR. WARREN: Good afternoon, this is David Warren
21 from New Flyer. Spelled D-A-V-I-D; W-A-R-R-E-N. I'm the
22 director of sustainability and transportation for our
23 company.

24 And I have two comments to make. One related to
25 battery electric and the second related to fuel cell

1 electric. New Flyer's a manufacturer of transit buses and we
2 produce all types of propulsion systems, including trolley
3 electric used by San Francisco Muni. We have fuel cell
4 electric buses deployed at AC Transit. Chris Peeples
5 mentioned that. And we also have battery electric buses at
6 AC Transit. And then LA Metro on the panel, we have battery
7 electric buses in Southern California as well as other
8 locations.

9 My comment on battery electric is that our company,
10 New Flyer, as well as Proterra, and other battery bus
11 manufacturers worked extremely hard on standards so that our
12 charging equipment was interoperable. That you could charge
13 a New Flyer or Proterra, anybody's bus off of the same
14 charging equipment. We've demonstrated at New Flyer that we
15 can charge a Chevy Bolt off of our charging equipment, and so
16 on the light-duty side. And I see no reason that the heavy-
17 duty trucks where you discussed yesterday won't be able to
18 charge off of the same type of equipment.

19 The en route charging, perhaps, that's going to be a
20 little bit different, but the standard that was put in place,
21 3105, may work for utility and work trucks very well. So I
22 just want to emphasize that the investments that CEC is
23 making in an infrastructure for battery electric vehicles can
24 apply to all types.

25 Now my comment regarding the fuel cell electric buses

1 is that a fuel cell electric bus and when I say bus, vehicle,
2 is essentially a very close variant to a battery electric
3 vehicle. The architecture is essentially the same. The fuel
4 cell is added to essentially be an on-board battery charger.

5 So the technology is from a user's standpoint, is
6 very compatible. It's not extremely different. The
7 infrastructure certainly is. And all the comments that have
8 been made by multiple public speakers today regarding the
9 fuel cell technology, we at New Flyer, strongly support the
10 fuel cell buses.

11 And one reason it hasn't been mentioned today, and I
12 know my time is running out, is that the weight of a battery
13 electric bus can be quite extensive. We carry up to 7,000
14 pounds of batteries on a bus for a long-range bus. In
15 California, Assembly Bill 1250 provides some exemptions for
16 transit buses to deal with weight. And the heaviest
17 configuration transit bus we manufacture is a battery
18 electric bus.

19 So fuel cell buses generally carry 38 kilograms of
20 hydrogen. You obviously have to have tank and infrastructure
21 or storage system on board to carry hydrogen, but the actual
22 configuration of a fuel cell electric bus is substantially
23 less than a battery electric bus.

24 Thank you very much.

25 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, David.

1 Next we have Lauren Skiver.

2 MS. SKIVER: Thank you. Lauren Skiver, S-K-I-V-E-R.
3 CEO, general manager for SunLine Transit Agency.

4 I'd like to comment on two past comments and I want
5 to thank the Commission and the CEC for having this meeting.

6 SunLine is zero-emission technology agnostic. We run
7 both all battery electric and fuel cell electric buses. On
8 the comment about microgrid, I did want to highlight that
9 SunLine currently has a project to create a solar to hydrogen
10 microgrid. The first phase will be a solar farm that will
11 run our 900-kilogram electrolyzer. The second phase will be
12 a solar to hydrogen for storage. We believe one of the best
13 ways to store renewable and green electricity is through the
14 use of hydrogen. And the third, we hope in the future will
15 be a truck stop dedicated to clean hydrogen and possibly
16 electricity available to trucks traveling along the I-10
17 between our location and the L.A. basin.

18 We think that it's going to take both of these
19 technologies to accomplish the state's goals and we believe
20 there's room for both. I think that transit is going to have
21 to look at a mix of propulsions to be successful in their ICT
22 plans and we're happy to continue that work at our location.

23 Thank you for the opportunity to speak today.

24 MS. MURIMI: Thank you, Lauren.

25 And, folks on the line, if you want to make a public

1 comment, please press Star 9. At this time, there's no more
2 public comment.

3 I'll hand it over to Heather. Thank you, Heather.

4 MS. RAITT: Hi. Thanks, Dorothy. Sorry it took me a
5 moment to get to unmute.

6 So thank you. That concludes our public comment.

7 And so Commissioners I don't know if you have any
8 closing remarks you'd like to make.

9 COMMISSIONER MONAHAN: So this is Commissioner
10 Monahan. Just a quick thank you to everybody for joining
11 this. Again, we're learning how to use Zoom and integrate
12 telephones and trying to make this more dynamic. I think our
13 next -- for next time, we'll utilize the Q&A function, trying
14 to get more questions coming live into the -- into the
15 discussion from the folks on the phone. Or just
16 participating via video.

17 I also want to, I mean, there's been a lot of public
18 comment around the need to have hydrogen as a solution in the
19 heavy-duty spaces. I couldn't agree more so I, too, think
20 it's important that we think of both fuels, hydrogen and
21 electricity from the grid as potential solutions for cleaning
22 up our diesel good movement, people movement, and offer
23 equipment sector.

24 So just want to reiterate that we are not trying to
25 exclude hydrogen and fuel cells from the discussion and we'll

1 make a special effort to especially during the hydrogen
2 workshop and throughout just so continue to explore the role
3 of fuel cells and hydrogen. Especially, I think, in the
4 medium- and heavy-duty space where we have a big need from a
5 public health standpoint to electrify and clean up.

6 So thanks for the panel. So that was a really good
7 discussion. And to Michelle, for facilitating that. So,
8 yeah, just appreciate everybody joining in for this
9 discussion.

10 Commissioner Douglas, do you have anything to say?

11 COMMISSIONER DOUGLAS: Just -- just that I appreciate
12 everyone's participation. I think the clock form worked
13 well. I think we were able to have a very great and
14 productive workshop. Everything went smoothly so that's
15 fantastic.

16 Thanks everyone.

17 (Thereupon, the Hearing was adjourned at 3:31 p.m.)

18 --oOo--

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were reported by me, a certified electronic court reporter and a disinterested person, and was under my supervision thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 23rd day of June, 2020.



MARTHA L. NELSON, CERT**367

TRANSCRIBER'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the testimony in the foregoing hearing was taken at the time and place therein stated; that the testimony of said witnesses were transcribed by me, a certified transcriber.

And I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties to said hearing nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in said caption.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 23rd day of June, 2020.



Jill Jacoby
Certified Transcriber
AAERT No. CERT**D-633