

DOCKETED

Docket Number:	12-AFC-02C
Project Title:	Huntington Beach Energy Project - Compliance
TN #:	237482
Document Title:	Item 4_Order Approving a Petition to Modify Visual Screening System
Description:	N/A
Filer:	Patty Paul
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	4/16/2021 2:32:37 PM
Docketed Date:	4/16/2021

STATE OF CALIFORNIA
STATE ENERGY RESOURCES
CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

**HUNTINGTON BEACH ENERGY
PROJECT**

**AES HUNTINGTON BEACH ENERGY,
LLC**

Docket No. 12-AFC-2C

**ORDER APPROVING APETITION
TO MODIFY VISUAL SCREENING
SYSTEM**

On November 6, 2020, AES Huntington Beach Energy, LLC, filed a petition to amend with the California Energy Commission (CEC) requesting to modify Condition of Certification **VIS-1** of the Huntington Beach Energy Project (HBEP) to replace the approved architectural screening structure (“spherical ball wall”) with a mural-based design treatment for screening and enhancing views of the project site.

The HBEP is a nominal 844-megawatt (MW), natural gas-fired, combined-cycled, and simple cycle gas turbine electric generating facility that was certified by the CEC on May 31, 2017. The 644 MW combined cycle gas turbine generator began operation on June 25, 2020. The facility is located at 21730 Newland Street, Huntington Beach.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

CEC staff has reviewed the petition pursuant to Title 20, California Code of Regulations, section 1769 (Post Certification Amendments and Changes) and concluded that the modifications to Condition of Certification VIS-1 proposed by the applicant would not result in a significant impact to the environment, or cause the project to not comply with applicable laws, ordinances, regulations, and standards (LORS). Based on those conclusions, staff recommends approval of the petition by the CEC pursuant to Section 1749(a)(4).

ENERGY COMMISSION FINDINGS

Based on staff’s analysis, the CEC finds that the proposed modification will not result in any significant impacts to public health and safety, or to the environment. The CEC finds that:

- The proposed modification(s) would not change the findings in the final Commission Decision pursuant to Title 20, California Code of Regulations, section 1748;
- There would be no new or additional unmitigated, significant environmental impacts associated with the proposed modification; and
- The facility would remain in compliance with all LORS.

CONCLUSION AND ORDER

The CEC hereby adopts staff's recommendations and approves the following changes to the May 2017 Commission's Revised Final Decision for the Huntington Beach Energy Project Amendment. New language is shown as **bold and underlined**, and deleted language is shown in ~~strikethrough~~.

VIS-1 VISUAL SCREENING AND ENHANCEMENT PLAN FOR PROJECT STRUCTURES – PROJECT OPERATION

~~Prior to the start of construction, the project owner shall prepare and submit a Preliminary Visual Screening and Enhancement Plan for Project Structures (Preliminary Plan) that includes methods and materials to visually screen and treat surfaces of publicly visible power plant structures.~~

On November 2, 2020, the City of Huntington Beach adopted Resolution 2020-81 supporting a mural-based architectural treatment for the HBEP. The project owner shall implement a mural-based architectural treatment for the HBEP, consistent with the City of Huntington Beach's adopted Resolution 2020-81. The project owner shall prepare and submit a Final Design Plan depicting architectural treatments to be applied to publicly visible power plant structures of the combined-cycle gas turbine (CCGT) generators.

The Preliminary **Final Design** Plan shall include:

- ~~Revised general arrangement/site plan to scale showing locations of and corridor spaces for the architectural screens/sphere walls.~~
- ~~Information on how the architectural screens will comply with City Specification No. 401 and achieve consistency with the City's adopted Resolution No. 2016-27.~~
- ~~Identity of the design firm that will plan and implement the architectural screening plan.~~
- ~~Information on how surfaces of the 50-foot-tall acoustical wall, air cooled condenser, and exhaust stacks will be treated to coordinate visually with the architectural screens.~~

- Visual simulations using key observation points (KOPs) 1, 4, and 5 to accurately represent views of the architectural screens depicted on the site plan.
- **Descriptions of the surface treatment method and materials.**
- **Description of the construction method and materials for the 10-foot-tall visual screen.**
- **Inventory of project structures and facilities that will be part of the mural design, including the sound wall and the 10-foot-tall visual screen; and specifications for height, length, and width or diameter for each structure or facility.**
- **Accurately scaled site plan with project structures and other design elements clearly labeled.**
- **Final renderings of the mural-based architectural treatments from key observation points (KOPs) 1 and 4. Prepare 11-inch by 17-inch photographic simulations that accurately represent views of the surface treatments and the 10-foot-tall visual screen from KOPs 1 and 4.**
- **Description of the project owner's commitment to prepare and submit a supplement to the Final Design Plan to add an architectural treatment to the publicly visible structures of the simple-cycle gas turbine (SCGT) generators or any other new power plant structures on the site.**

Prior to the start of commissioning the combined-cycle gas turbine (CCGT) units, the project owner shall prepare and submit a Detailed Visual Screening and Enhancement Plan (Detailed Plan) that includes evidence of review by a California-licensed structural or civil engineer and an assessment of the feasibility and structural integrity of the architectural and decorative screening elements contained in the Detailed Plan. The California-licensed engineer shall review and sign the Detailed Plan. Any design changes recommended by the California-licensed engineer to ensure the structural soundness and safety of the project and the architectural design elements shall be incorporated in the Detailed Plan before its submittal to the compliance project manager (CPM).

The project owner shall not submit **the Final Design Plan to the CPM for approval.** instructions for architectural screens and other structures and colors and finishes to manufacturers or vendors of project structures, or perform final field treatment on any structures; **The project owner shall not authorize the start of the artist's work on the mural-based architectural**

treatments until written approval of the final **Final Design** Detailed Plan is received from the CPM. Modifications to the final **Final Design** Detailed Plan shall not occur without the CPM's approval.

~~The Detailed Plan shall be consistent with Resolution No. 2016-27 adopted by the City of Huntington Beach City Council recommending visual enhancements for the site. Surface treatments for publicly visible power plant structures shall be included in the Detailed Plan. Proposed surface treatments shall minimize the potential visual effects of glare from project surfaces. Methods to visually screen and enhance the project site shall visually unify the project to the extent practicable while maintaining compliance with the City's adopted resolution.~~

The transmission structures for the on-site 230-kV transmission line shall have a surface treatment that enables them to blend with the environment to the greatest extent feasible, and the finish shall appear as a matte patina. Unpainted exposed lagging and surfaces of steel structures that are visible to the public shall be embossed or otherwise treated to reduce glare.

~~The Detailed Plan shall meet the following minimum content requirements:-~~

- ~~• Inventory of major project structures, sound/acoustical walls, and buildings specifying the architectural and decorative screening structures and materials to visually screen and enhance those structures. The inventory shall specify height, length, and width or diameter for each major structure, and an accurately scaled site plans and elevation views shall be included in the Plan with architectural and project structures clearly identified.-~~
- ~~• Color brochures, color chips, and/or physical samples for each proposed color and finish that will be applied to architectural screening structures and directly to power plant structures (e.g., paint scheme and finish types for the air cooled condenser, the exhaust stacks, and the sound wall). Proposed colors must be identified by vendor, name, and number, or according to a universal designation system. Electronic files showing proposed colors may not be submitted in place of original samples.-~~
- ~~• Physical sample of the plastic material that will be used to fabricate the spheres for the City's recommended sphere walls.-~~
- ~~• Electronic files and a set of print copies of 11-inch by 17-inch (or larger, if necessary) color visual simulations at life-size scale showing the architectural screening structures and surface treatments proposed for the project. KOP 1, KOP 4, and KOP 5 shall be used to prepare images showing the completed Detailed Plan for Project Structures.-~~

- ~~Schedule for completing construction of architectural and decorative screening structures and the surface treatments for publicly visible power plant structures during the construction timeline.~~
- ~~Procedure and maintenance schedule to ensure that surface treatments and architectural structures are well maintained and consistent with the approved Detailed Plan for the life of the project.~~

Verification: At least 60 calendar days prior to the start of construction **implementation of the mural-based architectural treatments for the combined-cycle gas turbine (CCGT) generators**, the project owner shall submit a Preliminary Visual Screening and Enhancement **Final Design** Plan for Project Structures (~~Preliminary Plan~~) to the CPM for review and approval. The project owner shall, simultaneously with the submission to the CPM, submit seven copies of the Preliminary **Final Design** Plan to the City of Huntington Beach Planning and Building Department for review and comment. A different time frame for submitting the Preliminary **Final Design** Plan is allowed by agreement between the project owner and the CPM.

~~If the CPM determines that the Preliminary Plan requires revisions, the project owner shall provide an updated version with the specified revision(s) for review and approval by the CPM. Copies of the revised Preliminary Plan (if it is required) shall be provided to the City for review and comment. City staff requires seven copies of the revised Plan or Supplement.~~

The project owner shall provide the CPM with copies of the transmittal letters submitted to the City requesting timely reviews of the Preliminary Plan and any revisions. The City shall be allowed 30 calendar days following receipt of the stated plans **Final Design Plan** to provide comments to the project owner and to the CPM. In the absence of comments within that timeframe, ~~or a request from the City for an extension of time,~~ the CPM may deem the Preliminary **Final Design** Plan and any revisions acceptable to the City.

At least 60 calendar days ~~before the start of commissioning the CCGT units~~ **prior to the start of installation of the mural-based architectural treatment**, the project owner shall **provide the CPM with the detailed schedule proposed by the artist commissioned to paint the mural-based architectural treatment**, prepare and submit the Detailed Plan to the CPM for review and approval. The review, comment, and approval process for the Detailed Plan shall be exactly the same as described above for the Preliminary Plan **The project owner shall provide the CPM with a monthly compliance report documenting the artist's progress on the mural-based architectural treatment.**

The Plan elements pertaining to screening and enhancement of the CCGT units, including the easternmost and middle screens, shall be implemented within 12 months of completing demolition of the HBGS Units 1 and 2. The Plan elements pertaining to

screening and enhancement of the simple-cycle gas turbine (SCGT) units shall be implemented within 12 months of beginning commercial operation of the SCGT units.

The project owner shall verify in writing when the Detailed Plan elements pertaining to **mural-based architectural treatment for** the CCGT units are implemented and the facility is ready for inspection **generators is completed. The project owner shall provide 11-inch by 17-inch photographic images showing the completed murals from KOPs 1 and 4.** The project owner shall obtain separate written confirmations from the CPM that the project complies with the Detailed Visual Screening and Enhancement Plan for Project Structures following completion of Plan elements for the CCGT units and later for the SCGT units **Final Design Plan.**

At least 60 calendar days prior to the start of construction of the simple-cycle gas turbine (SCGT) generators, the project owner shall prepare and submit a supplement to the Final Design Plan depicting surface or architectural treatments to ensure visual screening of publicly visible power facility structures or foundations. The review, comment, and approval process for the supplemental plan shall be the same as described above for the Final Design Plan.

The **After completion of the mural-based architectural treatment for the CCGT generators the** project owner shall provide a status report regarding maintenance of the **mural-based** architectural screens and surface treatments in the Annual Compliance Report for the project.

At a minimum, the report shall include:

- Descriptions of the condition of the **mural-based** architectural screening structures and treated surfaces of publicly visible structures at the power plant site **treatments.**
- Descriptions of major maintenance and painting work required to maintain the original condition of **the mural-based** architectural screening structures and treated surfaces **treatments** during the reporting year.
- Electronic photographs showing the results of maintenance and painting work.

The Annual Compliance Report shall incorporate reporting on future visual screening and enhancement of publicly visible power facility structures or foundations in the area of the SCGT generators or elsewhere on the site the same as the reporting requirements described above for the CCGT generators.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

CERTIFICATION

The undersigned Secretariat to the Commission does hereby certify that the foregoing is a full, true, and correct copy of an Order duly and regularly adopted at a meeting of the California Energy Commission held on April 14, 2021.

AYE: Hochschild, Douglas, McAllister, Monahan, Gunda

NAY: NONE

ABSENT: NONE

ABSTAIN: NONE



Patricia Carlos
Secretariat