DOCKETED

Docket Number:	00-AFC-14C
Project Title:	El Segundo Power Redevelopment Project Compliance
TN #:	201467
Document Title:	Data to Supplement Project Owner's Response to Data Request 61
Description:	N/A
Filer:	Dee Hutchinson
Organization:	Locke Lord LLP
Submitter Role:	Applicant Representative
Submission Date:	12/23/2013 12:17:26 PM
Docketed Date:	12/23/2013

Locke Lord LLP
Attorneys & Counselors

500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1800
Sacramento, CA 95814
Telephone: 916-930-2500
Fax: 916-930-2501
www.lockelord.com

John A. McKinsey
Direct Telephone: 916-930-2527
Direct Fax: 916-720-0443
jmckinsey@lockelord.com

December 23, 2013

VIA E-FILING

El Segundo Energy Center Petition to Amend (00-AFC-14C)
Craig Hoffman, Project Manager
California Energy Commission
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512

Re: El Segundo Energy Center Petition to Amend (00-AFC-14C)
Data to Supplement Project Owner's Response to Data Request 61

Dear Mr. Hoffman:

On September 12, 2013, El Segundo Energy Center, LLC ("**ESEC LLC**") responded to the California Energy Commission staff's ("**Staff**") Data Request Set 1 (Nos. 1 – 83) regarding ESEC LLC's Petition to Amend the El Segundo Energy Center project (00-AFC-14C) (the "**PTA**"). At the October 1, 2013 Workshop to clarify data regarding the PTA, Staff requested supplemental data related to its Data Request 61. Accordingly, ESEC LLC submits the enclosed, supplemental responses to Data Request 61, which are supplemented by the confidential data enclosed in the Application for Confidential Designation of Biological Resources Record dated and filed concurrently herewith, under separate cover.

In this submission, ESEC LLC provides thorough responses to Data Request 61, including new and revised tables and analysis. As noted in enclosed response BR-A, the Table BR-1 is intended to replace Table 3.2-1 of the PTA, and Confidential Figure BR-1 submitted concurrently herewith is intended to replace Figure 3.2-1 of the PTA.

Please contact me or my colleague Allison Harris if there are questions about the enclosed responses.

Locke Lord LLP

By: _____
John A. McKinsey
Attorneys for El Segundo Energy Center LLC

JAM:awph
Enclosures

SAC 449156v.1

El Segundo Energy Center
Petition to Amend

(00-AFC-14C)

Biological Resources
Data Responses

(Response to CEC Requests for Supplemental Data Dated October 1, 2013)

Submitted to

California Energy Commission

Prepared by

El Segundo Energy Center LLC

With Assistance from

CH2MHILL®

2485 Natomas Park Drive
Suite 600
Sacramento, CA 95833

December 20, 2013

Contents

Introduction

Attached is El Segundo Energy Center LLC's (ESEC LLC) response to Biological Resources data requested by California Energy Commission Staff (Staff) at the October 1, 2013 Workshop for the El Segundo Energy Center (ESEC) Petition to Amend (PTA) (00-AFC-14C).

Biological Resources Data Responses

Responses to Staff's Workshop Requests

On October 1, 2013, California Energy Commission (CEC) staff held a workshop to clarify Staff's data requests and ESEC LLC's data responses regarding the proposed modifications to ESEC, as set forth in the PTA (the Proposed Project). At that workshop, Staff requested supplemental data for several of ESEC LLC's data responses. The following information addresses Staff requests concerning Biological Resources.

DATA REQUEST

BR-A. Special-status Plant and Wildlife Species (DR61): Will the project potentially impact the species shown as present in the region on Table 3.2-1 on page 3-60 of the PTA? Staff needs this data before it can eliminate these species as potentially impacted by the project.

Response: Table 3.2-1 in the PTA was prepared using the California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDB) search of the United States Geological Survey (USGS) Venice Quadrangle (Quad). However, this table was also supplemented with information from the United States Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) *Species by County Report for Los Angeles County* (USFWS, 2013), which is not considered to be an appropriate regional species search because it lists special-status species for the entire county known to occur in various ecoregions. Because this list was used to supplement information on special-status species within the vicinity of ESEC, a number of species were inappropriately identified as having the potential to occur within the Proposed Project area.

In November 2013, CH2M HILL conducted an updated CNDDB search for special-status species documented within a 1-mile and 10-mile radius of ESEC and the Proposed Project site (CDFW, 2013), see Table BR-1 for the results of this search. Table BR-1 accurately lists habitat requirements, occurrence potential, and identifies whether suitable habitat is present at the Proposed Project site for those special-status species listed on occurrence records obtained from the November 2013 CNDDB search. Therefore, Table BR-1 replaces Table 3.2-1 of the PTA, as it (a) correctly identifies special-status plant and animal species within a 1-mile and a 10-mile radius of the ESEC with the potential to occur within the Proposed Project site, (b) provides an appropriate regional species search, and (c) includes updated species designations for listed species. In addition, to support this request, Confidential Figure BR-1, which depicts CNDDB search results within 1-mile of ESEC, will be submitted separately under a request for confidentiality. As the data in Confidential Figure BR-1 illustrates the information provided in Table BR-1, it replaces Figure 3.2-1 of the PTA.

The ESEC site is entirely developed. In its current state, and as it will be amended by the Proposed Project, ESEC does not contain suitable habitat for special-status plant and animal species. The occurrence potential for special-status species previously documented in the region is provided in Table BR-1. The majority of these species are not expected to occur or have been extirpated from the area. Four special-status species are identified in Table BR-1 as having the potential to occur at the Proposed Project site, but the Proposed Project is not expected to directly affect any special-status species:

1. Monarch butterfly (*Danaus plexippus*) – Low to Moderate Potential,
2. California brown pelican (*Pelecanus occidentalis californicus*) – Low to Moderate Potential,
3. California least tern (*Sternula antillarum browni*) – Not Expected to Low Potential, and
4. Belding's savannah sparrow (*Passerculus sandwichensis beldingi*) – Not Expected to Low Potential.

Monarch butterfly has been documented within 1 mile of ESEC. The monarch butterfly's primary host plant (milkweed), for both larval and adult stages, is unlikely to occur within the Proposed Project area, therefore, the species is not expected to breed on the project property or be affected by construction of the Proposed Project or the continued operation of ESEC as modified by the Proposed Project.

California brown pelicans are considered common in the Venice Quad; however, their primary roosting habitat is the breakwater at Marina del Rey and they use nearshore waters for foraging (CDFW, 2013). The nearest documented nesting site for brown pelicans is the Channel Islands (CDFW, 2013). While it is possible they could fly over the Proposed Project site, they would be unlikely to roost on the site or otherwise be affected by construction of the Proposed Project or the continued operation of ESEC as modified by the Proposed Project. Therefore, the Proposed Project is not expected to affect nesting or foraging habitat for the California brown pelican. Additional information regarding monarch butterfly and California brown pelican is provided in Data Response BR-C below.

California least tern was documented at Dockweiler State Beach in 1996, over 4 miles from the Proposed Project site (CDFW, 2013). However, due to the lack of suitable nesting or foraging habitat at ESEC now, and as it will be amended by the Proposed Project, this species is not expected to regularly occur in the area or within the Proposed Project site, and is unlikely to use the site or to otherwise be affected by construction of the Proposed Project or the operation of ESEC as modified by the Proposed Project.

Belding's savannah sparrow has been documented within the Ballona Wetlands and occurs in salt marshes (CDFW, 2013). ESEC does not currently, and as amended by the Proposed Project, will not contain suitable habitat for the Belding's savannah sparrow. Therefore, this species is not expected to be impacted by construction of the Proposed Project or the operation of ESEC as modified by the Proposed Project.

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Plants				
Aphanisma *Aphanisma blitoides*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/1B.2	**Not Expected.** Occurs in coastal dunes and coastal sage scrub. Multiple occurrence records for this species were documented in Palos Verdes (CDFW, 2013).	N
Ballona cinquefoil *Potentilla multijuga*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/1A	**Extirpated.** This species is presumed to be extinct in California and historically occurred in meadows and seeps (CDFW, 2013).	N
Beach spectaclepod *Dithyrea maritima*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/ST/1B.1	**Extirpated[c].** Occurs in coastal dunes and coastal scrub. Historical records for this species have been documented in El Segundo, Play del Ray and on the dunes near Santa Monica; the majority of these occurrence records are presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Brand's star phacelia *Phacelia stellaris*	—/—/1B.1	FC/—/1B.1	**Not Expected[b].** Occurs in coastal dunes and coastal scrub. Historical occurrence records for this species have been documented within Playa del Rey in 1909 and in the general vicinity of El Segundo in 1932 (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Braunton's milk-vetch *Astragalus brauntonii*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FE/—/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in closed-cones coniferous forest, chaparral, coastal scrub, and valley and foothill grassland. Historical records for this species (1904, 1930) were documented in Brentwood and Santa Monica, presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
California Orcutt grass *Orcuttia californica*	—/—/1B.1	FE/SE/1B.1	**Extirpated.** Occurs in vernal pools. A historical record (1946) for this species was documented in the vicinity of Western Avenue and Rosecrans Avenue, but this population has been extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Coastal dunes milk-vetch *Astragalus tene*r var. *titi*	—/—/1B.1	FE/SE/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated[b].** Occurs in coastal bluff scrub and coastal dunes. A historical record for this species was documented in 1903 in Hyde Park in Santa Monica, but is possibly extirpated (CDFW, 2013b).	N
Coulter's goldfields *Lasthenia glabrata* ssp. *coulteri*	—/—/1B.1	—/—/1B.1	**Not Expected[b].** Occurs in coastal salt marshes, playas, valley and foothill grasslands and vernal pools. Historical records for this species have been documented in the Ballona Wetlands (1934) and in the vicinity of El Segundo (1930; CDFW, 2013).	N
Coastal goosefoot *Chenopodium littoreum*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/1B.2	**Extirpated.** Occurs in coastal dunes. A historical record for this species was documented in Playa del Ray in 1904 and this occurrence has been extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Davidson's saltscale *Atriplex serenana* var. *davidsonii*	—/—/1B.2	—/—/1B.2	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in coastal bluff scrub and coastal scrub. A historical record for this species was documented in 1902 in the vicinity of Cienega and is possibly extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Gambel's water cress *Nasturtium gambelii*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FE/ST/1B.1	**Extirpated.** Occurs in marshes and swamps. A historical record for this species was documented in 1904 in Cienega, but is presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Los Angeles sunflower *Helianthus nuttallii* ssp. *parishii*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/1A	**Extirpated.** Occurs in coastal salt and freshwater marshes and swamps, historical within southern California. Last documented in 1903 in Cienega, but has been extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Marsh sandwort *Arenaria paludicola*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FE/SE/1B.1	**Extirpated.** Occurs in marshes and swamps. A historical record for this species was documented in 1900 in the vicinity of Cienega, but has been extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Mud nama *Nama stenocarpum*	NRL	—/—/2B.2	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in marshes and swamps. A historical record for this species was documented in 1902 in the vicinity of Santa Monica (CDFW, 2013).	N
Orcutt's pincushion *Chaenactis glabriuscula* var. *orcuttiana*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/1B.1	**Not Expected[b].** Occurs in coastal bluff scrub and coastal dunes. Species was documented in 2010 in Sand Dune Park, Manhattan Beach (CDFW, 2013).	N
Parish's brittlescale *Atriplex parishii*	—/—/1B.1	—/—/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in alkali meadows, vernal pools, chenopod scrub and playas in fine soils. Undated collection was documented in the vicinity of Santa Monica and Redondo (CDFW, 2013).	N
Prostrate vernal pool *navarretia* *Navarretia prostrata*	—/S2.1/NRL[c]	—/—/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated[b].** Occurs in coastal salt marshes, playas, valley and foothill grasslands and vernal pools. A historical record for this species was documented in 1944 in Manhattan Beach and is possibly extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Salt marsh bird's-beak *Chloropyron maritimum* ssp. *maritimum*	—/S2.1/—	FE/SE/1B.1	**Extirpated.** Occurs in coastal salt marsh and coastal dunes. An undated record for this species was documented in the vicinity of Santa Monica, but is presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Salt Spring checkerbloom *Sidalcea neomexicana*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/2B.2	**Extirpated.** Occurs in alkali playas, brackish marshes, chaparral, coastal scrub, lower montane coniferous forest and Mojavean desert scrub. A historical record for this species was documented in 1936 in the vicinity of Santa Monica (CDFW, 2013).	N
San Bernardino aster *Symphyotrichum defoliatum*	—/—/1B.2	—/—/1B.2	**Extirpated.** Occurs in meadows, seeps, marshes, swamps, coastal scrub, cismontane woodland, lower montane coniferous forest and grasslands. Historical records for this species were documented (1902, 1930) in the vicinity of Cienega and Gardena, presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
San Fernando Valley spineflower *Chorizanthe parryi* var. *fernandina*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FC/SE/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in sandy soils within coastal scrub habitats. A historical record for this species was documented in 1901 in the vicinity of Ballona Harbor and is possibly extirpated from the area (CDFW, 2013).	N
Santa Barbara morning-glory *alystegia sepium* ssp. *binghamiae*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/—/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in coastal marshes. A historical record for this species was documented in 1899 near Ceinega, but is possibly extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
South coast saltscale *Atriplex pacifica*	—/—/1B.2	—/—/1B.2	**Not Expected.** Occurs in coastal scrub, coastal bluff scrub, playas and chenopod scrub. A historical record for this species was documented in 1903 in the vicinity of Redondo (CDFW, 2013).	N
Spreading navarretia *Navarretia fossalis*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FT/—/1B.1	**Extirpated.** Occurs in vernal pools, chenopod scrub, marshes, swamps and playas. A historical record for this species was documented in 1906 in the vicinity of Inglewood (CDFW, 2013).	N
Southern tarplant *Centromadia parryi* ssp. *australi*s	—/—/1B.1	—/—/1B.1	**Not Expected.** Occurs on the margins in marshes and swamps, valley and foothill grasslands. This species was documented in the Ballona Wetlands in 1997 (CDFW, 2013).	N
Ventura Marsh milk-vetch *Astragalus pycnostachyus* var. *lanosissimus*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FE/FT/1B.1	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Occurs in coastal salt marsh habitats. A historical record for this species was documented in the Ballona Wetlands in 1951 and presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Invertebrates				
Belkin's dune tabanid fly *Brennania belkini*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1S2/—	**Not Expected[b].** Inhabits coastal sand dunes in southern California. Multiple historical occurrence records for this species have been documented within the USGS Venice Quad (CDFW, 2013).	N
Busck's gallmoth *Carolella busckana*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/SH/—	**Not Expected to Extirpated[b].** Type locality is the El Segundo Dunes; however, this species is presumed to be extirpated (CDFW, 2013).	N
Dorothy's El Segundo Dune weevil *Trigonoscuta dorothea*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits coastal sand dunes in southern California. An occurrence record for this species in the Ballona Wetlands was documented din 2001 (CDFW, 2013).	N
El Segundo blue butterfly *Euphilotes battoides allyni*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FE/S1/—	**Not Expected[b].** Inhabits El Segundo dune habitat in southern California. Multiple occurrence records for this species have been documented at the Chevron Butterfly Preserve and the Los Angeles International Airport (LAX) dunes butterfly preserve (CDFW, 2013).	N
El Segundo flower-loving fly *Rhaphiomidas terminatus terminatus*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Species was presumed to be extinct, but was rediscovered in Upper Malaga Canyon (CDFW, 2013).	N
Gertsch's socalchemmis spider *Socalchemmis gertschi*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Known from only two localities in Los Angeles County, in Brentwood and Topanga Canyon (CDFW, 2013).	N
Globose dune beetle *Coelus globosus*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits coastal sand dunes. This species was last documented in 2001 within the Ballona Wetlands (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Henne's eucosman moth *Eucosma hennei*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Species is endemic to the El Segundo Dunes and was last documented in 1984 (CDFW, 2013).	N
Lange's El Segundo Dune weevil *Onychobaris langei*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits El Segundo dune habitat in southern California. A historical occurrence record for this species was documented in 1938 in the El Segundo Dunes (CDFW, 2013).	N
Mimic tryonia (=California brackishwater snail) *Tryonia imitator*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S2S3/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits coastal lagoon, estuaries and salt marshes from Sonoma to San Diego Counties (CDFW, 2013). According to CDFW (2013), a historical occurrence record for this species was documented in 1974 within the Ballona Wetlands.	N
Monarch butterfly *Danaus plexippus*	—/S3/—	—/S3/—	**Low to Moderate Potential[b].** Winters in wind-protected tree groves with nectar and an available water source. This species has been observed within Ballona Wetlands (CDFW, 2013) and has the potential to fly over the Proposed Project site.	Y
Palos Verdes blue butterfly *Glaucopsyche lygdamus palosverdesensis*	FE/S1/—	FE/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in cool, fog-shrouded, seaward side of Palos Verdes Hills in Los Angeles County on the host plant of locoweed (*Astragalus trichopodus* var. *lonchus*). Some recorded occurrences of this species have been extirpated and the remaining localities have been suppressed.	N
Sandy beach tiger beetle *Cicindela hirticollis gravida*	—/S1/—	—/S1/—	**Extirpated[b].** Inhabits the margins of non-brackish water along the coast of California. Multiple historical records for this species have been documented within the USGS Venice Quad; however, these occurrences have been extirpated.	N
Senile tiger beetle *Cicindela senilis frosti*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected to Extirpated[b].** Inhabits marine shoreline and salt marshes. This species is difficult to detect during surveys because populations naturally exist at extremely low levels and is presumed to be extirpated in the area (CDFW, 2013).	N
Wandering (=saltmarsh) skipper *Panoquina errans*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S1/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits southern California salt marshes and requires saltgrass for larval development (CDFW, 2013). According to CDFW (2013), this species was documented in the Ballona Wetlands in 2010.	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Fish				
Mohave tui chub *Siphateles bicolor mohavensis*	FE/SE/—	FE/SE/—	**Extirpated**. Endemic to the Mojave River Basin in alkaline, mineralized waters in deep pools or ponds. A historical record for this species was documented in 1976 in the South Coast Botanic Garden Refugium, Palos Verdes and was a transplant outside of the species' native habitat and range (CDFW, 2013).	N
Reptiles				
Coast horned lizard *Phrynosoma blainvillii*	—/SSC, S3, S4/—	—/SSC/—	**Extirpated.** Inhabits a wide variety of habitats along sandy washes with scattered low bushes. An occurrence record for this species was documented in 1986 in El Nido (CDFW, 2013).	N
Silvery legless lizard *Anniella pulchra pulchra*	NRL	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in sandy or loose loamy soils under sparse vegetation. This species was documented in 2009 in the vicinity of Torrance (CDFW, 2013).	N
Two-striped garter snake *Thamnophis hammondii*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Highly aquatic species, found in or adjacent to permanent freshwater sources, along streams with rocky bed and riparian vegetation. This species was last documented in 2010 (CDFW, 2013).	N
Western pond turtle *Emys marmorata*	NRL	S/SSC/—	**Not Expected to Extirpated.** Highly aquatic and occurs in ponds, marshes, river, streams and irrigation ditches with macrophytes. A historical record for this species was documented in 1941 within Play del Rey, but is possibly extirpated in the area (CDFW, 2013).	N
Birds				
Bank swallow *Riparia riparia*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/ST/—	**Extirpated.** Occurs in riparian and lowland habitats west of the desert region. A historical record for this species was documented in 1907 in the Pacific Palisades, but has been extirpated from the area (CDFW, 2013).	N
Belding's savannah sparrow *Passerculus sandwichensis beldingi*	—/SE/—	—/SE/—	**Not Expected to Low Potential.** Inhabits coastal salt marshes and nests in pickleweed (Salicornia ssp.). An occurrence record for this species was documented in 2001 within the Ballona Wetlands (CDFW, 2013).	N
Burrowing owl Athene cunicularia	NRL	BCC/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits open, dry annual or perennial grasslands, deserts and scrublands with low-growing vegetation. An occurrence record for this species was last documented in 2010 within the Ballona Wetlands (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
California black rail *Laterallus jamaicensis coturniculus*	Not included in 2007 PTA	FT/FP/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits freshwater marshes, wet meadows and saltwater marshes that border larger bays. A historical occurrence record for this species was documented in 1928 within Playa del Rey (CDFW, 2013).	N
California brown pelican *Pelecanus occidentalis californicus*	FE/SE/—	—/FP/—	**Low to Moderate Potential.** Communal rooster that nests on coastal islands. An occurrence record for this species was documented in 2000 at Marina del Rey breakwater (CDFW, 2013).	N
California least tern *Sternula antillarum browni*	FE/SE/—	FE/SE; FP/—	**Not Expected to Low Potential.** Colonial breeder that nests on base or sparsely vegetated, flat substrates, such as sand beaches, alkali flats, landfills or paved areas. An occurrence record for this species was last documented in 1996 at Dockweiler State Beach over 4 miles from the ESEC site (CDFW, 2013).	N
Coastal California gnatcatcher *Polioptila californica californica*	FT/SSC/—	FT/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Obligate resident in coastal sage scrub communities below 2,500 feet in southern California. An occurrence record for this species was last documented in 1980 in Baldwin Hills (CDFW, 2013).	N
Southwestern willow flycatcher *Empidonax traillii extimus*	NRL	FE/SE/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in riparian woodlands in southern California. A historical record for this species was documented in 1894 in the general vicinity of Los Angeles (CDFW, 2013).	N
Swainson's hawk *Buteo swainsoni*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/ST/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in grasslands with scattered trees, juniper-sage flats, riparian areas, savannahs, and agricultural fields or ranch lands. Historical records for this species were documented (1896, 1904) in Santa Monica and Los Angeles, but this species is presumed to be extirpated from the area (CDFW, 2013).	N
Tricolored blackbird *Agelaius tricolor*	—/SSC/—	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in freshwater marshes, riparian scrublands and forests; requires an open water source. This species was documented in the Madrona Marsh in 1981-1982 (CDFW, 2013).	N
Western snowy plover *Charadrius alexandrinus nivosus*	FT/—/—	FT/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits sandy beaches, salt pond levees and shores of large alkali lakes and needs sandy, gravelly or friable soils for nesting. Historical records for this species have been documented in 1904 at Ballona Beach and in 1914 at Playa del Rey and; species has been extirpated from the area (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Mammals				
Hoary bat *Lasiurus cinereus*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S4?/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in open habitats or habitat mosaics and roosts in dense foliage of medium-sized trees; requires a water source. A historical record for this species was documented in 1939 near Culver City (CDFW, 2013).	N
Pacific pocket mouse *Perognathus longimembris pacificus*	FE/SSC/—	FE/SSC/—	**Extirpated[b].** Occurs on narrow coastal plains and prefers fine alluvial sands. A historical record for this species was documented in 1938; however, the Pacific pocket mouse has been extirpated from the area (CDFW, 2013).	N
Pallid bat *Antrozous pallidus*	NRL	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in deserts, grasslands, shrublands, woodlands and forests; roosts within rocky habitats. A historical record for this species was documented in 1932 in the vicinity of Palms, near Culver City (CDFW, 2013).	N
Pocketed free-tailed bat *Nyctinomops femorosaccus*	—/S2S3/—	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in a variety of habitats in southern California in pine-juniper woodlands, desert scrub, palm oasis, desert wash and desert riparian habitats in rocky areas with high cliffs. (CDFW, 2013).	N
Silver-haired bat *Lasionycteris noctivagans*	Not included in 2007 PTA	—/S3S4/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in coastal and montane forests; forages over streams, ponds and open brushy areas; roosts in hollow trees, beneath bark and abandoned woodpecker holes. This species was documented in 1985 in west Los Angeles (CDFW, 2013).	N
Southern California saltmarsh shrew *Sorex ornatus salicornicus*	—/—/—	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Occurs in coastal marshes in Los Angeles, Orange and Ventura counties. This species was last documented in 1991 in the Ballona Wetlands (CDFW, 2013).	N
South coast marsh vole *Microtus californicus stephensi*	—/—/—	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits tidal marshes in Los Angeles, Orange and southern Ventura counties. This species was last detected in 2009 at the Ballona Wetlands (CDFW, 2013).	N

TABLE BR-1
CNDDB Search Results for Potentially Occurring Special-Status Species within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC

Species Name	2007 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	2013 Federal/State/ Other Status[a]	Occurrence Potential[b]	Suitable Habitat (Y/N)
Western mastiff bat *Eumops perotis californicus*	NRL	—/SSC/—	**Not Expected.** Inhabits open, semi-arid to arid habitats, including coniferous and deciduous woodlands, coastal scrub, grasslands and chaparral; roosts in crevices or cliff faces, trees, etc. Historical records for this species were documented in the vicinity of southwestern Los Angeles, Palms, Gardena and Santa Monica (CDFW, 2013).	N

Source: California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). 2013. California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDB) search for the occurrence records within 1 and 10 miles of the ESEC. November.
Notes:
[a] Key to Status Designations:

1. Federal Designations: (FE) Federally Endangered, (FT) Federally Threatened, (FPE) Federally Proposed Endangered, (FPT) Federally Proposed Threatened, (FSC) Species of Concern, (FC) Candidate, (S) Sensitive, (BCC) Birds of Conservation Concern
2. State Designations (SE) State Endangered, (ST) State Threatened, (SR) State Rare, (SSC) Species of Special Concern, (CFP) Fully Protected Species
3. State Ranking
   i. S1 = Less than 6 EOs OR less than 1,000 individuals OR less than 2,000 acres
      S1.1 = very threatened
      S1.2 = threatened
      S1.3 = no current threats known
   ii. S2 = 6-20 EOs OR 1,000-3,000 individuals OR 2,000-10,000 acres
      S2.1 = very threatened
      S2.2 = threatened
      S2.3 = no current threats known
   iii. S3 = 21-100 EOs or 3,000-10,000 individuals OR 10,000-50,000 acres
      S3.1 = very threatened
      S3.2 = threatened
      S3.3 = no current threats known
   iv. S4 = Apparently secure within California; this rank is clearly lower than S3 but factors exist to cause some concern; i.e. there is some threat, or somewhat narrow habitat. NO THREAT RANK.
   v. S5 = Demonstrably secure to ineradicable in California. NO THREAT RANK.
   vi. SH = All California sites are historical).
4. California Rare Plant Ranks (formerly known as California Native Plant Society (CNPS) Designations): (1A) Presumed extinct in California; (1B) Rare, threatened, or endangered in California and elsewhere; (2) Rare, threatened, or endangered in California, but more common elsewhere; (3) More information is needed; (4) Limited distribution; (.1) Seriously endangered in California; (.2) Fairly endangered in California; (.3) Not very endangered in California.

[b] Species have been documented within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC.
[c] NRL = no rank/designation was previously listed.

DATA REQUEST

BR-B. Special-status Plant and Wildlife Species (DR61): Has a biologist determined whether bats are living at the ESEC facility?

Response: CH2M HILL's November 2013 CNDDB search of the USGS Venice Quad did not produce any occurrence records for bats (CDFW, 2013). There is also limited suitable roosting and foraging habitat within and adjacent to ESEC in its current state, and as it will be modified by the Proposed Project. Therefore, no bats are expected to be roosting or foraging at the facility, and implementation of the Proposed Project is not expected to impact bats. Consequently, no bat surveys have been conducted for the Proposed Project.

DATA REQUEST

BR-C. Special-status Plant and Wildlife Species (DR61): Will the ESEC project impact pelicans, Monarch butterfly, or owls? If not, why will it not impact these species?

Response: We have excerpted the response to this supplemental data request from MBC Applied Environmental Sciences' December 19, 2013 combined response (MBC Supplemental Responses). The entire MBC Supplemental Responses are included as Attachment BR-1 hereto.

California brown pelican

California brown pelican (*Pelecanus occidentalis californicus*) is a seabird that roosts on land at night (Baird, 1993), with the greatest numbers in the Southern California Bight occurring on Santa Barbara Island (55 miles from the El Segundo Generating Station [ESGS]). It was originally listed as endangered by the state and federal governments due to low reproductive output linked with pollution by hydrocarbons, which led to a population decline (Baird, 1993). The banning of the pesticide DDT and protection of brown pelican nesting areas from human disturbance during the breeding season encouraged population growth. This species was delisted by the state and federal governments in 2009 (CDFW, 2013a).

Brown pelicans occur along the Pacific coast from California to Chile and the Atlantic coast from North Carolina through the Caribbean to South America. The breeding distribution of the California subspecies of the brown pelican ranges from the Channel Islands of southern California southward to Isla Isabela and Islas Tres Marias off Nayarit, Mexico, and Isla Ixtapa off Acapulco, Guerrero, Mexico. Between breeding seasons, pelicans may range as far north as Vancouver Island, British Columbia, and south to Central America. Brown pelicans are plunge divers, feeding primarily on fish in open waters nearshore and in harbors. Northern anchovy (*Engraulis mordax*) constitute a significant portion of their diet.

Pelicans forage mostly in relatively shallow, warm waters within 20 kilometers of the coast (Baird, 1993). Their habitat includes shallow waters (bays), nearshore waters, and beaches, and they are sometimes seen well out to sea. They nest on islands, which may either be bare and rocky or covered with mangroves and other trees. Strays may occasionally appear on freshwater lakes (Kaufman, 1996). The California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDB) notes that the second largest roost of brown pelicans in southern California occurs along the Marina del Rey breakwater, upcoast from the project site; between 601 and 1,642 individuals were counted during night-time surveys between 1991 and 2000 (CDFW, 2013b).

One California brown pelican was observed during biological surveys off the ESGS in November 2006; it was foraging (plunge-diving) offshore near the rock groin terminus (Shaw, 2007). MBC biologists conducted numerous biological surveys at the ESGS (and along the bike path seaward of the plant) in 2011 and 2012 and, while brown pelicans flew over the generating station during at least one of those surveys, no records document brown pelicans roosting within the site.

In summary, brown pelicans are considered common in the Venice Quadrangle, which includes the ESGS. However, their primary habitat is the breakwater at Marina del Rey (for roosting) and the nearshore waters (for foraging). The nearest nesting site is the Channel Islands. While it is possible they could fly over the project site, they would be unlikely to roost on the project property, or otherwise be affected by project construction or operation.

Monarch Butterfly

Monarch butterfly (*Danaus plexippus*) is a winged insect classified as "G5 S3" by the CDFWs Special Animals List (CDFW, 2011). The "G5" denotes a global conservation status representing "Population or stand demonstrably secure to ineradicable due to being commonly found in the world," which is the highest level of stability in this particular ranking. The "S3" denotes a mid-range state ranking denoting "21–100 elemental occurrences or 3,000–10,000 individuals OR 10,000–50,000 acres" (CDFW, 2007).

Monarch butterflies occur from southern Canada south through all of the United States, Central America, and most of South America; they also occur in Australia, Hawaii, and other Pacific Islands (BMNA, 2013). Adult monarch butterflies make massive migrations from August to October, flying thousands of miles south to hibernate along the California coast and in central Mexico. Some are known to overwinter along the Gulf coast or south Atlantic coast. Along the way, they stop to feed on flower nectar and to roost together at night. Most have mated before they leave for the north in the spring, and females lay eggs along the way.

Milkweeds are the host plant for the caterpillar stage, including common milkweed (*Asclepias syriaca*), swamp milkweed (*A. incarnata*), and showy milkweed (*A. speciosa*). None of these species occurs naturally in southern California. Most milkweeds contain cardiac glycosides, which are stored in the bodies of both the caterpillar and adult. These poisons are distasteful and emetic to birds and other vertebrate predators. After tasting a monarch, a predator might associate the bright warning colors of the adult or caterpillar with an unpleasant meal, and avoid monarchs in the future. Adult monarchs get nectar from all milkweeds. Early in the season before milkweeds bloom, monarchs visit a variety of flowers including dogbane, lilac, red clover, lantana, and thistles. In the fall, adults visit composites including goldenrods, blazing stars, ironweed, and tickseed sunflower.

In summary, monarch butterflies are not considered threatened or endangered, and the global population is considered secure, but the state-wide assessment results from either limited occurrence or habitat. However, their primary host plant (milkweed), for both larval and adult stages, is unlikely to occur within the [ESEC] plant. While it is possible they could fly over the project site, they would be unlikely to breed on project property, or to be affected by project construction and operation.

Owls

No threatened or endangered owls occur in the vicinity of the [Proposed] Project site. Burrowing owl (*Athene cunicularia*) has been observed in the vicinity of Ballona Creek, but has not been observed near the project site (CDFW, 2013b). Other owls that occur in southern California, such as barn owls (Tytonidae) and typical owls (Strigidae), could forage, roost, and/or nest at the project site. Owls that nest on the ground or within vegetation were not observed during three nesting bird and vegetation surveys at the ESGS in 2011 and 2012 (MBC, 2011a, b). Barn owls typically nest in open or semi-open country in lowlands; however, they can nest in forests or urban areas if good, open foraging territory is nearby (Kaufman, 1996). Barn owls could nest in un-used or abandoned structures. However, the Biological Resources Conditions of Certification will ensure that no significant impacts will occur to owls and that such impacts are also minimized.

DATA REQUEST

BR-D. Special-status Plant and Wildlife Species (DR61): How can avian nesting on the ESEC plant be prevented?

Response: Avian nesting within the area of the Proposed Project is expected to be limited, because there is a lack of suitable nesting habitat within the Proposed Project area. However, the Applicant may use various bird control methods, such as plastic bird spikes, sound deterrents, and bird repellents, as needed, should nesting birds be observed at the site of the Proposed Project.

DATA REQUEST

BR-E. Special-status Plant and Wildlife Species (DR61): Staff expressed concern about the effect of noise and vibration on sensitive or protected species, and requested additional data related to the impacts of demolition and construction on sensitive or protected habitats.

Response: ESEC LLC's use of ESEC, and its anticipated use of ESEC as it will be amended by the Proposed Project, is consistent with existing and planned land uses as well as city zoning designations at and in the

area surrounding the plant site. This heavily developed area exhibits high ambient noise levels influenced by a number of sources, both natural (surf and wind) and anthropogenic (an urban setting that includes traffic, the existing generating station, industrial facilities, and other typical urban noise sources). Furthermore, as previously noted, the ESEC facility as it will be modified by the Proposed Project will continue to lack suitable nesting and foraging habitat for special-status species. Therefore, although noise, vibrations and increased traffic from construction activities related to the Proposed Project may temporarily disturb wildlife species, activities associated with the Proposed Project would not result in the removal of any natural vegetation or sensitive wildlife habitat. Wildlife species with the potential to occur within the Proposed Project vicinity are primarily expected to be common species that are protected under the Migratory Bird Treaty Act (MBTA), such as house finch (*Carpodacus mexicanus*), American crow (*Corvus brachyrhynchos*), Brewer's blackbird (*Euphagus cyanocephalus*); however, these species are adapted to and thrive in urban areas. Potential effects on special-status species from construction of the Proposed Project and continued operation of the ESEC as modified by the Proposed Project are discussed in more detail in the following paragraphs.

Noise and vibration from site preparation, construction and demolition for the Proposed Project could temporarily discourage wildlife from foraging and nesting in areas adjacent to the Proposed Project area. However, as previously noted, no special-status species have been observed within ESEC. Furthermore, existing baseline noise conditions at the site and in the surrounding area include operational noise associated with the existing ESEC facility, roadway traffic, and operational noise from several adjacent industrial facilities (including the Chevron Marine Terminal, the Hyperion Wastewater Treatment Plant, and the Los Angeles Department of Water and Power Scattergood Generating Station). Therefore, it is expected that noise and vibrations associated with the Proposed Project would not adversely affect wildlife because wildlife (especially urban wildlife) usually become accustomed to routine background noise.

Foraging Habitat

ESEC does not, and following implementation of the Proposed Project will not, provide foraging habitat for special-status wildlife species, and thus, the Proposed Project will not cause the loss of any foraging habitat.

Nesting Birds

ESEC does not, and following implementation of the Proposed Project will not, contain suitable nesting habitat for special-status avian species. However, open sandy beaches in the immediate vicinity of ESEC could provide suitable nesting habitat for special-status birds and other bird species that are protected by state and federal regulations, including those protected by the MBTA and CDFW codes. Onsite landscaping (trees and shrubs) may provide nesting opportunities for common avian species, such as house finch, Anna's hummingbird (*Calypte anna*) and mourning dove (*Zenaida macroura*). Open ground, such as parking lots and gravel, within the Proposed Project may also be used by killdeer (*Charadrius vociferous*) for nesting. However, the Proposed Project is not expected to significantly affect nesting birds because ESEC and the surrounding area do not, and following implementation of the Proposed Project will still not, contain marginal habitat, and the species that would nest there have likely acclimated to the routine disturbance associated with operation of the existing ESEC facility and adjacent industrial facilities.

In summary, the Proposed Project will not result in the permanent loss of nesting habitat for any migratory or resident birds, and temporary impacts to nesting birds as a result of increased noise and construction or demolition activities is not expected to occur.

Sensitive Habitat (Note: the following data is excerpted from the MBC Supplemental Responses in Attachment BR-1).

Critical habitat for western snowy plover (*Charadrius alexandrius nivosus*) was designated upcoast from the ESGS in 2005, and potential impacts from demolition, construction, and operation of the [Proposed Project at] ESEC were evaluated during the Petition to Amend and subsequent Data Requests (Shaw, 2007). It was determined during this [PTA] proceeding that these [Proposed Project] activities would not affect western snowy plover. While project demolition, construction, and operation activities will cause noise and increased

activity onsite, the snowy plover nests on broad beaches and is accustomed to human activities and industrial noise. During snowy plover surveys, 13 snowy plovers were observed during winter-spring 2007 at Dockweiler North, which is at the western end of the Los Angeles International Airport runways (SWCA et al., 2007). A 2007 report noted:

> "*Potential threats to wintering Snowy Plovers at Dockweiler State Beach North include vehicle strikes, beach grooming, off-leash dogs, and human-influenced predators. If nesting occurred, nesting Snowy Plovers would also face threats from trampling of nests by beach goers, and predation by off-leash dogs and local wildlife attracted to trash such as feral cats, raccoons, American Crows, and Common Ravens. Dockweiler State Beach North is below the flight pattern for Los Angeles International Airport and received less use by the public than similar beaches north and south.*"

For Dockweiler South, immediately upcoast of the ESGS [the same report noted]:

> "*Potential threats to wintering Snowy Plovers at Dockweiler State Beach South include vehicle strikes, beach grooming, off-leash dogs, and human-influenced predators. If nesting occurred, nesting Snowy Plovers would also face threats from trampling of nests by beach goers, and predation by off-leash dogs and local wildlife attracted to trash such as feral cats, raccoons, American Crows, and Common Ravens."*

Based on the available information of the biology of the western snowy plover and the description of the Proposed Project, the potential for impacts due to human disturbance is very low. No activities associated with the Proposed Project are proposed within the area designated as Critical Habitat, or on the adjacent beach seaward of ESEC. Units 3&4 are more than 250 meters from the southern edge of the Critical Habitat. Despite ongoing operations at ESEC (and the Scattergood Generating Station, just upcoast from ESEC), snowy plovers continue to roost at Dockweiler South (Ryan Ecological Consulting et al., 2010).

References

A definition for "USFWS, 2013" was not included in the PTA. Therefore, the reference is now being included in the record as the following:

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS). 2013. Environmental Conservation Online System, Species by County Report for Los Angeles County. November.

California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). 2013. CNDDB search for the occurrence records within 1 and 10 miles of ESEC. November.

MBC Applied Environmental Sciences (MBC). 2013. CEC Data Request Petition to Amend (00-AFC-014C). December 19, 2013.

U.S. United Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS). 2013. Environmental Conservation Online System, Species by County Report for Los Angeles County. November.

Attachment BR-1
MBC Applied Environmental Sciences
Memorandum Dated December 19, 2013

19 December 2013

Robert Mason
CH2M Hill
1000 Wilshire, Ste. 2100
Los Angeles, CA 90017
(949) 439-5312

Subject: CEC Data Request
Petition to Amend (00-AFC-014C)

Dear Mr. Mason:

The attached information is submitted in response to California Energy Commission (CEC) supplemental data requests that were relayed verbally earlier this month.

Please let me know if you have any questions or need any more information.

Sincerely,

MBC *Applied Environmental Sciences*

Shane Beck
President

Data Request 61

"*Staff indicates we need to provide an addendum in the form of a Data Response to the Biological section of the PTA. PTA notes pelican and Monarch Butterfly and that suitable habitat exists at the site. Is there a potential for the PTA to impact these species or not? There is no conclusion in the PTA as to impacts to butterfly/pelican habitat*."

California brown pelican

California brown pelican (*Pelecanus occidentalis californicus*) is a seabird that roosts on land at night (Baird 1993), with the greatest numbers in the Southern California Bight occurring on Santa Barbara Island (55 miles from the El Segundo Generating Station [ESGS]). It was originally listed as endangered by the State and Federal governments due to low reproductive output linked with pollution by hydrocarbons, which led to a population decline (Baird 1993).The banning of the pesticide DDT and protection of brown pelican nesting areas from human disturbance during the breeding season encouraged population growth. This species was delisted as endangered by the State and Federal governments in 2009 (CDFW 2013a).

Brown pelicans occur along the Pacific coast from California to Chile and the Atlantic coast from North Carolina through the Caribbean to South America. The breeding distribution of the California subspecies of the brown pelican ranges from the Channel Islands of southern California southward to Isla Isabela and Islas Tres Marias off Nayarit, Mexico, and Isla Ixtapa off Acapulco, Guerrero, Mexico. Between breeding seasons, pelicans may range as far north as Vancouver Island, British Columbia, and south to Central America. Brown pelicans are plunge divers, feeding primarily on fish in open waters nearshore and in harbors. Northern anchovy (*Engraulis mordax*) comprise a significant portion of their diet.

Pelicans forage mostly in relatively shallow, warm waters within 20 km of the coast (Baird 1993). Their habitat includes shallow waters (bays), nearshore waters, beaches, and they are sometimes seen well out to sea. They nest on islands, which may be either be bare and rocky or covered with mangroves and other trees. Strays may occasionally appear on freshwater lakes (Kaufman 1996). The California Natural Diversity Database (CNDDB) notes that the second largest roost of brown pelicans occurs along the Marina del Rey breakwater, upcoast from the project site; between 601 and 1,642 individuals were counted during night-time surveys between 1991 and 2000 (CDFW 2013b).

One California brown pelican was observed during biological surveys off the ESGS in November 2006; it was foraging (plunge-diving) offshore near the rock groin terminus (Shaw 2007). MBC biologists conducted numerous biological surveys at the ESGS (and along the bike path seaward of the plant) in 2011 and 2012, and while brown pelicans flew over the generating station during at least one of those surveys, we have no records of brown pelicans roosting within the site.

In summary, brown pelicans are considered common in the Venice Quadrangle, which includes the ESGS. However, their primary roosting habitat is the breakwater at Marina del Rey (for roosting), and the nearshore waters (for foraging). The nearest nesting site is the Channel Islands. While it is possible they could fly over the ESGS, they would be unlikely to roost on plant property, or to otherwise be affected by construction or operation of the proposed project.

Monarch butterfly

Monarch butterfly (*Danaus plexippus*) is a winged insect classified as "G5 S3" by the California Department of Fish and Wildlife's Special Animals List (CDFW 2011). The "G5" denotes a global

conservation status representing “Population or stand demonstrably secure to ineradicable due to being commonly found in the world”, which is the highest level of stability in this particular ranking. The “S3” denotes a mid-range state ranking denoting “21-100 elemental occurrences or 3,000-10,000 individuals OR 10,000-50,000 acres” (CDFW 2007).

Monarch butterflies occur from Southern Canada south through all of the United States, Central America, and most of South America; they also occur in Australia, Hawaii, and other Pacific Islands (BMNA 2013). Adult Monarchs make massive migrations from August-October, flying thousands of miles south to hibernate along the California coast and in central Mexico. Some are known to overwinter along the Gulf coast or south Atlantic coast. Along the way, Monarchs stop to feed on flower nectar and to roost together at night. Most have mated before they leave for the north in the spring, and females lay eggs along the way.

Milkweeds are the host plant for the caterpillar stage, including common milkweed (*Asclepias syriaca*), swamp milkweed (*A. incarnata*), and showy milkweed (*A. speciosa*). Most milkweeds contain cardiac glycosides which are stored in the bodies of both the caterpillar and adult. These poisons are distasteful and emetic to birds and other vertebrate predators. After tasting a Monarch, a predator might associate the bright warning colors of the adult or caterpillar with an unpleasant meal, and avoid Monarchs in the future. Adult Monarchs get nectar from all milkweeds. Early in the season before milkweeds bloom, Monarchs visit a variety of flowers including dogbane, lilac, red clover, lantana, and thistles. In the fall adults visit composites including goldenrods, blazing stars, ironweed, and tickseed sunflower.

In summary, Monarch butterflies are not considered threatened or endangered, and the global population is considered secure, but the state-wide assessment results from either limited occurrence or habitat. However, their primary host plants (milkweed) for both larval and adult stages is unlikely to occur within the plant. While it is possible they could fly over the ESGS, they would be unlikely to breed on plant property, or to be affected by construction and operation of proposed project.

From Amy Fuller (CH2M Hill via phone 10/22/13):

Owls

There are no threatened or endangered owls in the vicinity of the ESGS. Burrowing owl (*Athene cunicularia*) has been observed in the vicinity of Ballona Creek, but has not been observed near the project site (CDFW 2013_). Other owls that occur in southern California, such as barn owls (Tytonidae) and typical owls (Strigidae), could forage, roost, and/or nest at the ESGS. Owls that nest on the ground or within vegetation were not observed during three nesting bird and vegetation surveys at the ESGS in 2011 and 2012 (MBC 2011a,b). Barn owls typically nest in open or semi-open country in lowlands; however, they can nest in forests or urban areas if good, open foraging territory is nearby (Kaufman 1996). Barn owls could nest in un-used or abandoned structures. The Biological Resources Conditions of Certification will ensure no significant impacts will occur to owls and that such impacts are also minimized.

Sensitive Habitat

Critical Habitat for western snowy plover (*Charadrius alexandrius nivosus*) was designated upcoast from the ESGS in 2005, and potential impacts from demolition, construction, and operation of the El Segundo Energy Center were evaluated during the Petition to Amend and subsequent Data Requests (Shaw 2007). It was determined during this proceeding that these activities would not affect western snowy plover. While there will be noise, increased activity, etc. associated with demolition, construction, and operation, the snowy plover nests on broad

beaches and is accustomed to human activities and industrial noise. During snowy plover surveys, 13 snowy plovers were observed during winter-spring 2007 at Dockweiler North, which is at the western end of the Los Angeles International Airport runways (SWCA et al. 2007). A 2007 report noted:

"*Potential threats to wintering Snowy Plovers at Dockweiler State Beach North include vehicle strikes, beach grooming, off-leash dogs, and human-influenced predators. If nesting occurred, nesting Snowy Plovers would also face threats from trampling of nests by beach goers, and predation by off-leash dogs and local wildlife attracted to trash such as feral cats, raccoons, American Crows, and Common Ravens. Dockweiler State Beach North is below the flight pattern for Los Angeles International Airport and received less use by the public than similar beaches north and south.*"

For Dockweiler South, immediately upcoast of the ESGS: "*Potential threats to wintering Snowy Plovers at Dockweiler State Beach South include vehicle strikes, beach grooming, off-leash dogs, and human-influenced predators. If nesting occurred, nesting Snowy Plovers would also face threats from trampling of nests by beach goers, and predation by off-leash dogs and local wildlife attracted to trash such as feral cats, raccoons, American Crows, and Common Ravens.*"

Based on the available information of the biology of the western snowy plover and the proposed project description, the potential for impacts due to human disturbance is very low. There are no activities proposed within the area designated as Critical Habitat, or on the adjacent beach seaward of the ESGS. Units 3&4 are more than 250 m from the southern edge of the Critical Habitat. Despite ongoing operations at the ESGS (and the Scattergood Generating Station, just upcoast from the ESGS), snowy plovers continue to roost at Dockweiler South (Ryan Ecological Consulting et al. 2010).

References:

Baird, P.H. 1993. Birds. Chapter 10 *in*: Ecology of the Southern California Bight: A synthesis and interpretation (M.D. Dailey, D.J. Reish, and J.W. Anderson [eds.]). U.C. Press, Berkeley, CA. 926 p.

Butterflies and Moths of North America. 2013. Web site: http://www.butterfliesandmoths.org/species/Danaus-plexippus . Accessed 22 Oct. 2013.

California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). 2007. How to Read RareFind 3 Reports. Calif. Nat. Diversity Database. Feb. 7, 2007. 6 p.

California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). 2011. Special Animals List – January 2011. 60 p.

California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). 2013a. State & Federally Listed Endangered and Threatened Animals of California. CDFW, Biogeographic Data Branch, Calif. Nat. Diversity Database. October 2013. 14 p.

California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW). 2013b. California Natural Diversity Database: Full Report for Selected Elements, Venice Quad. 21 October 2013. 56 p.

Kaufman, K. 1996. Lives of North American Birds. Houghton Mifflin Co., Boston, MA. 675 p.

Master, L., D. Faber-Langendoen, R. Bittman, G.A. Hammerson, B. Heidel, J. Nichols, L. Ramsay, and A. Tomaino. 2009. NatureServe Conservation Status Assessments: Factors for Assessing Extinction Risk. NatureServe, Arlington, VA.

MBC Applied Environmental Sciences (MBC). 2011a. El Segundo Power Redevelopment Project: Nesting Bird Survey. Prepared for El Segundo Energy Center LLC, El Segundo, CA. June 12, 2011. 4 p. plus photos.

MBC Applied Environmental Sciences (MBC). 2011b. El Segundo Power Redevelopment Project: Second Nesting Bird Survey. Prepared for El Segundo Energy Center LLC, El Segundo, CA. July 21, 2011. 3 p.

Ryan Ecological Consulting, os Angeles Audobon, Santa Monica Bay Audobon, and Plegadis LLC. 2010. The Western Snowy Plover in Los Angeles County, California. Prepared for Calif. Dept. of Fish and Game, Office of Spill Prev. and Resp. Feb. 15, 2010. 136 p.

Shaw Environmental, Inc. 2007. Petition to Amend Final Commission Decision for the El Segundo Power Redevelopment Project: CEC-800-2005-001-CMF. Prepared for ESP II LLC, El Segundo, CA. June 18, 2007.

SWCA Environmental Consultants, Los Angeles Audobon, and Santa Monica Bay Audobon. 2007. The Western Snowy Plover in Los Angeles County, California: Winter-Spring 2007. Prepared for Calif. Dept. of Fish and Game, Office of Spill Prev. and Resp. Oct. 8, 2007. 71 p.