February 25, 2013

Mr. Robert Oglesby
Executive Director
California Energy Commission
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Re: Hydrogen Energy California Power Plant Project (08-AFC-8A) - Clarification Of Scope Of Request For Confidential Treatment Of Emissions Data Filed With California Energy Commission

Dear Mr. Oglesby:

The purpose of this letter is to clarify the scope of a prior request for confidential treatment of certain emissions data filed with the California Energy Commission in connection with the Hydrogen Energy California Power Plant Project (Project). That confidentiality request was narrowly tailored to protect certain limited trade secret and proprietary data provided by the vendor of the Project’s turbines and related equipment. Applicant is submitting this clarification at the request of the Kern County Planning and Community Development Department.

As background, on August 3, 2012, the Sierra Club issued Data Request No. 24 regarding certain data about the Project’s estimated emissions of criteria pollutants, greenhouse gases and toxic air contaminants. Applicant initially objected to the request because it called for the disclosure of certain trade secret and proprietary information from the equipment vendor. The confidential information related to uncontrolled nitrous oxides emissions from the Project’s turbine and heat recovery steam generator (HRSG) when combusting hydrogen-rich fuel and natural gas, as well as exhaust gas volume to the HRSG and feedstock dryer stacks. The confidential information represents only a very small portion of the Project’s emissions data. The vast majority of the Project’s emissions data had been made available to the public and was more than adequate to evaluate the environmental impacts of the Project.

In response to Applicant’s objection, the Sierra Club filed a Motion to Compel, and on November 2, 2012, the CEC Committee for the Project issued the Committee Ruling on Intervenor Sierra Club’s Motion To Compel Data Responses (Committee Ruling) requiring HECA to respond to Sierra Club Data Request No. 24 after entering into a non-disclosure agreement with the Sierra Club. In December 2012, subject to an executed non-disclosure
agreement, HECA provided emissions spreadsheets, including the confidential information, to the Sierra Club in response to Sierra Club Data Request No. 24 and the Committee Ruling.\(^1\)

On January 8, 2013, HECA filed the same emissions spreadsheets provided to the Sierra Club with the CEC with a request that the confidential information be protected as such.\(^2\) Updated versions of the confidential emissions spreadsheets were provided to the CEC and Sierra Club on January 10, 2013.\(^3\) On the same day, HECA docketed with the CEC a non-confidential, public version of the emissions spreadsheets that contained all of the emissions data associated with the Project with the exception of the confidential information.\(^4\) The CEC approved HECA’s confidentiality request on January 23, 2012.\(^5\)

By this letter, Applicant seeks to clarify that the request for confidentiality submitted on January 8, 2013 and approved by the CEC on January 23, 2013 was narrowly tailored to protect only the limited trade secret and proprietary data provided by the vendor of the Project’s turbines and related equipment.\(^6\) All other emissions data is contained in the public version of the spreadsheets docketed on January 10, 2013 and was not covered by the request for confidentiality approved by the CEC.

If you have any further questions about this letter or otherwise, please do not hesitate to contact me at 714-755-8105.

Very truly yours,

Michael J. Carroll
of LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

cc: Lorelei H. Oviatt, AICP, Director
Kern County Planning and Community Development Department

Jacquelyn R. Kitchen, Supervising Planner
Kern County Planning and Community Development Department

---


\(^2\) Id., Docket No. 69075.

\(^3\) Id., Docket No. 69136

\(^4\) Id., Docket No. 69092.

\(^5\) Id., Docket No. 69231.

\(^6\) See id., Docket No. 69075.
STATE OF CALIFORNIA
ENERGY RESOURCES
CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

In the Matter of: ) Docket No. 08-AFC-08A

REVISED APPLICATION FOR ) PROOF OF SERVICE
CERTIFICATION FOR THE HYDROGEN ) (February 11, 2013)
ENERGY CALIFORNIA POWER PLANT )
PROJECT ("HECA") )

APPLICANT

Marisa Mascaro
SCS Energy LLC
30 Monument Square, Suite 235
Concord, MA 01742
mmascaro@scsenergyllc.com

Tiffany Rau
2629 Manhattan Avenue, PMB# 187
Hermosa Beach, CA 90254
Trau@heca.com

George Landman
Director of Finance and Regulatory Affairs
Hydrogen Energy California, LLC
500 Sansome Street, Suite 750
San Francisco, CA 94111
glandman@heca.com

APPLICANT'S CONSULTANT

Dale Shileikis
Vice President
Energy Services Manager
Major Environmental Programs
URS Corporation
One Montgomery Street, Suite 900
San Francisco, CA 94104-4538
dale_shileikis@urscorp.com
HYDROGEN ENERGY CALIFORNIA PROJECT  
CEC Docket No. 08-AFC-08A

INTERESTED AGENCIES

California ISO  
e-recipient@caiso.com

Marni Weber  
Department of Conservation  
Office of Governmental and Environmental Relations  
(Department of Oil, Gas & Geothermal Resources)  
801 K Street MS 2402  
Sacramento, CA 95814-3530  
Marni.Weber@conservation.ca.gov

INTERVENORS

California Unions for Reliable Energy  
Thomas A. Enslow

Marc D. Joseph  
Adams Broadwell Joseph & Cardozo  
520 Capitol Mall, Suite 350  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
tenslow@adamsbroadwell.com

Tom Frantz  
Association of Irritated Residents  
30100 Orange Street  
Shafter, CA 93263  
tfrantz@bak.rr.com

Andrea Issod  
Matthew Vespa  
Kern-Kaweah Chapter  
Of the Sierra Club  
85 Second St, Second Floor  
San Francisco, California 94105  
andrea.issod@sierraclub.org  
matt.vespa@sierraclub.org

Timothy O'Connor, Esq.  
Environmental Defense Fund (EDF)  
1107 Ninth St., Suite 540  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
toconnor@edf.org
George Peridas
Natural Resources Defense Council
111 Sutter Street, 20th Fl.
San Francisco, CA 94104
gperidas@nrdc.org

Benjamin McFarland
Kern County Farm Bureau, Inc.
801 South Mt. Vernon Avenue
Bakersfield, CA 93307
bmcfarland@kerncfb.com

Chris Romanini
HECA Neighbors
P.O. Box 786
Buttonwillow, CA 93206
roman93311@aol.com
HYDROGEN ENERGY CALIFORNIA PROJECT
CEC Docket No. 08-AFC-08A

ENERGY COMMISSION STAFF

Robert Worl
Project Manager
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, California 95814-5512
robert.worl@energy.ca.gov

John Heiser
Associate Project Manager
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, California 95814-5512
john.heiser@energy.ca.gov

Lisa De Carlo
Staff Counsel
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, California 95814-5512
lisa.decarlo@energy.ca.gov

ENERGY COMMISSION – PUBLIC ADVISOR

Blake Roberts
Assistant Public Adviser
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
publicadviser@energy.ca.gov

OTHER ENERGY COMMISSION PARTICIPANTS

(Listed for convenience only. After docketing, the Docket Unit will provide a copy to the persons listed below):

Karen Douglas
Commissioner and Presiding Member
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, California 95814-5512
karen.douglas@energy.ca.gov

Andrew McAllister
Commissioner and Associate Member
CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, California 95814-5512
andrew.mcallister@energy.ca.gov
DECLARATION OF SERVICE

I, Paul Kihm, declare that on February 25, 2013, I served and filed copies of the attached:

LETTER FROM MICHAEL CARROLL TO ROBERT O'GLESBY RE CLARIFICATION OF SCOPE OF REQUEST FOR CONFIDENTIAL TREATMENT OF EMISSIONS DATA

to all parties identified on the Proof of Service List above in the following manner:

California Energy Commission Docket Unit

☒ Transmission via electronic mail to:

CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
Attn: DOCKET NO. 08-AFC-08A
1516 Ninth Street, MS-4
Sacramento, California 95814-5512
docket@energy.ca.gov

For Service to All Other Parties

☒ Transmission via electronic mail to all email addresses on the Proof of Service list.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on February 25, 2013, at Costa Mesa, California.

Paul Kihm