

BEFORE THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION FOR THE  
EASTSHORE ENERGY CENTER IN HAYWARD  
BY TIERRA ENERGY OF TEXAS

DOCKET No. 06-AFC-6

<b>DOCKET</b>	
06-AFC-6	
<b>DATE</b>	APR 01 2008
<b>RECD.</b>	APR 01 2008

**DENIAL OF "SECTION 1231 COMPLAINT -- ROBERT SARVEY"**

Introduction and Summary

On March 6, 2008, Intervenor Robert Sarvey filed a complaint against Susan Gefter, the Hearing Officer in the Eastshore proceeding ("Sarvey Complaint"). The gravamen of the complaint is that in refusing to qualify Mr. Sarvey as an expert witness in the field of air quality, Ms. Gefter demonstrated bias and denied Mr. Sarvey an opportunity to be heard. The complaint asks for relief in the form of a new air quality hearing conducted by a different hearing officer.

We deny the complaint. Ms. Gefter demonstrated no bias, Mr. Sarvey was not harmed, and the relief sought would add nothing to the proceeding.

Background

On December 17, 2007, the Eastshore Committee held an evidentiary hearing on air quality and other issues. Before the hearing, Mr. Sarvey and other parties had submitted pre-filed, written testimony. When it was Mr. Sarvey's turn to testify, the following occurred:

HEARING OFFICER GEFTER: . . . So Mr. Sarvey, if you would like to present direct testimony now. I know that you have offered yourself as an expert witness on air quality. As you know, I haven't ever qualified you as an expert witness on air quality, however, I will qualify you as an expert intervenor and very knowledgeable in our proceedings. So if you want to, you know, be sworn in I'll take your testimony.

MR. SARVEY: I'd have to object to your not qualifying me as an expert witness. I have the educational background and the experience.

HEARING OFFICER GEFTER: I know and other hearing officers have qualified you but I won't. However, I will accept your testimony and if you want to be sworn I will swear you in.

MR. SARVEY: I'll do so under objection.

HEARING OFFICER GEFTER: Okay.

Whereupon, ROBERT SARVEY was duly sworn.

(12/17/07 RT 107:20 – 108:24.)

“Any person” may file a complaint with the Commission, “alleging a violation of a statute, regulation, order, program, or decision adopted, administered, or enforced by the commission.” (Cal. Code Regs., tit. 20, § 1231.) The Commission’s regulations specify the required contents of complaints and the procedures whereby they are considered. (*Id.*, §§ 1230 - 1237.)

### Analysis

We note initially that Mr. Sarvey should have sought relief from Ms. Gefter’s comments by filing a timely appeal to the full Commission. (See Cal. Code Regs., tit. 20, § 1215.) However, we will proceed on the assumption that the Sarvey Complaint is an appropriate filing.

We find nothing improper in Ms. Gefter’s ruling that Mr. Sarvey did not qualify as an air quality expert. While Mr. Sarvey has considerable experience (see Ex. 800, Testimony, Declaration, and Resume of Robert Sarvey, p. 5), he has no educational or other training in the field. (See *idem.*) That other hearing officers have so qualified Mr. Sarvey is not dispositive; different decision-makers can draw different, but still reasonable, conclusions from the same facts.

Moreover, any error in Ms. Gefter’s ruling would be irrelevant. The Sarvey Complaint presents no evidence or argument that specifies or explains how Mr. Sarvey has been harmed by the ruling – as might have been the case, for example, had his testimony been rejected or its weight expressly discounted. In fact, Mr. Sarvey’s oral testimony was heard, and his written testimony and all exhibits he proffered were received into the record – including an exhibit that was late-filed and to which the Applicant objected. (12/17/07 RT 107:25 – 114:7; 183:18 – 184:7.) In addition, we have reviewed Mr. Sarvey’s testimony and exhibits, along with all other materials in the record. Our review has been no less thorough than it would have been if Mr. Sarvey had been qualified as an air quality “expert” in the proceeding, and the issues he raises will be addressed in the Presiding Member’s Proposed Decision (“PMPD”). Therefore, there is no justification for any relief.

In addition, a new hearing conducted by a different hearing officer would be a redundant waste of time. All the parties, including Mr. Sarvey, have had a full opportunity to present testimony and cross-examine the testimony of other parties, and, as we noted above, Mr. Sarvey can point to nothing in the record demonstrating that Ms. Geffer's recognition of his alleged qualification as an air quality expert would have changed anything. We also note that it is the Governor's appointees to the Energy Commission who ultimately decide which witnesses are qualified and what weight to give to testimony received in these proceedings.

The Sarvey Complaint also takes issue with statements made in the Applicant's and Staff's briefs. Those matters are clearly outside the scope of a complaint proceeding and should be (and, we are confident, will be) dealt with by Mr. Sarvey in his briefs and his comments on the PMPD.

### Conclusion

The Sarvey Complaint lacks merit. It is **denied** with prejudice (i.e., no other complaint concerning the same matter may be filed). [See Cal. Code Regs., tit. 20, § 1232 subd. (a)(1).] Mr. Sarvey, may, of course, appeal this ruling to the full Commission. (See Cal. Code Regs., tit. 20, § 1215.)

Dated April 1, 2008, at Sacramento, California.



---

JEFFREY D. BYRON  
Commissioner and Presiding Member  
Eastshore AFC Committee

Proof of Service List (Revised on 1/18/08)  
filed with Original Document. Mailed from  
Sacramento on April 1, 2008).

**BEFORE THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION  
FOR THE EASTSHORE ENERGY CENTER  
IN CITY OF HAYWARD  
BY TIERRA ENERGY**

**Docket No. 06-AFC-6**

**PROOF OF SERVICE  
(Revised 1/18/2008)**

**INSTRUCTIONS: All parties shall either (1) send an original signed document plus 12 copies or (2) mail one original signed copy AND e-mail the document to the address for the Docket as shown below, AND (3) all parties shall also send a printed or electronic copy of the document, which includes a proof of service declaration to each of the individuals on the proof of service list shown below:**

**CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION**

Attn: Docket No. 06-AFC-6  
1516 Ninth Street, MS-4  
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512  
[docket@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:docket@energy.state.ca.us)

**APPLICANT**

Greg Trewitt, Vice President  
Tierra Energy  
710 S. Pearl Street, Suite A  
Denver, CO 80209  
[greg.trewitt@tierraenergy.com](mailto:greg.trewitt@tierraenergy.com)

Harry Rubin, Executive Vice President  
RAMCO Generating Two  
1769 Orvietto Drive  
Roseville, CA 95661  
[hmrenergy@msn.com](mailto:hmrenergy@msn.com)

**COUNSEL FOR APPLICANT**

Jane Luckhardt, Esq.  
Downey Brand Law Firm  
555 Capitol Mall, 10th Floor  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[jluckhardt@downeybrand.com](mailto:jluckhardt@downeybrand.com)

**APPLICANT'S CONSULTANTS**

David A. Stein, PE  
Vice President  
CH2M HILL  
155 Grand Avenue, Suite 1000  
Oakland, CA 94612  
[dstein@ch2m.com](mailto:dstein@ch2m.com)

**INTERESTED AGENCIES**

Jennifer Scholl  
Senior Program Manager  
CH2M HILL  
610 Anacapa Street, Suite B5  
Santa Barbara, CA 93101  
[jscholl@ch2m.com](mailto:jscholl@ch2m.com)

Larry Tobias  
CA Independent System Operator  
151 Blue Ravine Road  
Folsom, CA 95630  
[ltobias@caiso.com](mailto:ltobias@caiso.com)

## **INTERVENORS**

Greg Jones, City Manager  
Maureen Conneely, City Attorney  
City of Hayward  
777 B Street  
Hayward, California 94541  
[greg.jones@hayward-ca.gov](mailto:greg.jones@hayward-ca.gov)  
[michael.sweeney@hayward-ca.gov](mailto:michael.sweeney@hayward-ca.gov)  
[maureen.conneely@hayward-ca.gov](mailto:maureen.conneely@hayward-ca.gov)  
[david.rizk@hayward-ca.gov](mailto:david.rizk@hayward-ca.gov)

Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP.  
Att: Diana Graves, Esq  
Att: Michael Hindus, Esq  
50 Fremont Street  
San Francisco, CA 94120  
[diana.graves@pillsburylaw.com](mailto:diana.graves@pillsburylaw.com)  
[michael.hindus@pillsburylaw.com](mailto:michael.hindus@pillsburylaw.com)  
[ronald.vanbuskirk@pillsburylaw.com](mailto:ronald.vanbuskirk@pillsburylaw.com)

Paul N. Haavik  
25087 Eden Avenue  
Hayward, CA 94545  
[lindampaulh@msn.com](mailto:lindampaulh@msn.com)

James Sorensen, Director  
Alameda County Development Agency  
Att: Chris Bazar & Cindy Horvath  
224 West Winton Ave., Rm 110  
Hayward CA 94544  
[james.sorensen@acgov.org](mailto:james.sorensen@acgov.org)  
[chris.bazar@acgov.org](mailto:chris.bazar@acgov.org)  
[cindy.horvath@acgov.org](mailto:cindy.horvath@acgov.org)

Charlotte Lofft & Susan Sperling  
Chabot College Faculty Association  
25555 Hesperian Way  
Hayward, CA 94545  
[clofft@chabotcollege.edu](mailto:clofft@chabotcollege.edu)  
[ssperling@chabotcollege.edu](mailto:ssperling@chabotcollege.edu)

Law Office of Jewell J. Hargleroad  
Jewell J. Hargleroad, Esq  
1090 B Street, No. 104  
Hayward, CA 94541  
[jewellhargleroad@mac.com](mailto:jewellhargleroad@mac.com)

Jay White, Nancy Van Huffel,  
Wulf Bieschke, & Suzanne Barba  
San Lorenzo Village Homes Assn.  
377 Paseo Grande  
San Lorenzo, CA 94580  
[jwhite747@comcast.net](mailto:jwhite747@comcast.net)  
[slzvha@aol.com](mailto:slzvha@aol.com)  
[wulf@vs-comm.com](mailto:wulf@vs-comm.com)  
[suzbarba@comcast.net](mailto:suzbarba@comcast.net)

Richard Winnie, Esq.  
Alameda County Counsel  
Att: Andrew Massey, Esq.  
1221 Oak Street, Rm 463  
Oakland, CA 94612  
[richard.winnie@acgov.org](mailto:richard.winnie@acgov.org)  
[andrew.massey@acgov.org](mailto:andrew.massey@acgov.org)

Libert Cassidy Whitmore  
Att: Laura Schulkind, Esq.  
Att: Arlin B. Kachalia, Esq.  
153 Townsend Street, Suite 520  
San Francisco, CA 94107  
[lschulkind@lcwlegal.com](mailto:lschulkind@lcwlegal.com)  
[akachalia@lcwlegal.com](mailto:akachalia@lcwlegal.com)

Robert Sarvey  
501 W. Grantline Rd  
Tracy, CA, 95376  
[Sarveybob@aol.com](mailto:Sarveybob@aol.com)

**ENERGY COMMISSION**

Jeffrey D. Byron  
Commissioner and Presiding Member  
[jbyron@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:jbyron@energy.state.ca.us)

Susan Gefter, Hearing Officer  
[sgefter@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:sgefter@energy.state.ca.us)

Bill Pfanner, Project Manager  
[bpfanner@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:bpfanner@energy.state.ca.us)

Caryn Holmes, Staff Counsel  
[cholmes@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:cholmes@energy.state.ca.us)

Public Adviser  
[pao@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:pao@energy.state.ca.us)


**DECLARATION OF SERVICE**

I, Maggie Read, declare that on April 1, 2008, I deposited copies of the attached Denial of "Section 1231 Complaint -- Robert Sarvey" in the United States mail at Sacramento, CA, with first-class postage thereon fully prepaid and addressed to those identified on the Proof of Service list above.

**OR**

Transmission via electronic mail was consistent with the requirements of the California Code of Regulations, title 20, sections 1209, 1209.5, and 1210. All electronic copies were sent to all those identified on the Proof of Service list above.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.



MAGGIE READ