<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>DOCKETED</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Docket Number:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Title:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TN #:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Document Title:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Filer:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organization:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Submitter Role:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Submission Date:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Docketed Date:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Study of Barriers and Solutions to Energy Efficiency, Renewables, and Contracting Opportunities Among Low-Income Customers and Disadvantaged Communities

The Clean Energy and Pollution Reduction Act of 2015 Senate Bill 350 Barriers Study
Commitment to Diversity

The Energy Commission adopted a resolution strengthening its commitment to diversity in energy programs, policy and planning by engaging with disadvantaged and underrepresented groups throughout the state.

Commitment to Equity

“California’s energy transformation must be built with strong equity components, and rooted in community-driven processes that will benefit all Californians, especially the most vulnerable communities.”

-Communities for a Better Environment
Purpose

Provide an Overview of the SB 350 Barriers Study
• Requirements, Process and Public Engagement
• Barriers and Solutions: Energy Efficiency and Renewable
• Barriers and Solutions: Small Business

Provide an opportunity for Public Comment
• Barriers and Solutions
• Recommendations
REQUIREMENTS, PROCESS AND PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT:

ALANA MATHEWS
SB 350 Barriers Study Requirements

Barriers to and opportunities for:

- Solar photovoltaic energy generation and renewable energy
- Contracting opportunities for small businesses
- Energy efficiency and weatherization investments
SB 350 Barriers Study Process

- Literature Review
- Public Engagement
- Solutions and Opportunities
- Recommendations
SB 350 Barriers Study Public Engagement

- 3 Public Workshops
- 2 Collaborative workshops with CARB and EJAC
- 3 Stakeholder Roundtable Discussions
- 7 Community Stakeholder Meetings
- Barriers Study Webpage
- Social Media Outreach
## SB 350 Stakeholder Community Meeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Stakeholder Meetings</th>
<th>Communities for a Better Environment</th>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>August 3: Los Angeles</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Distrust/ Misinformation</td>
<td>• Partner with Community Based Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Solar Panels are cost-prohibitive because of conservative energy usage</td>
<td>• Community Solar or Mobile Solar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Require solar on all new affordable housing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Partner with Community Based Organizations
- Community Solar or Mobile Solar
- Require solar on all new affordable housing
## SB 350 Stakeholder Community Meeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Stakeholder Meetings</th>
<th>The Leadership Counsel For Justice and Accountability</th>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>August 5: Fresno</td>
<td>• Simplify eligibility requirements for all programs</td>
<td>• Use same criteria as other low-income programs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Poor outreach/education efforts</td>
<td>• More flexible hours; multiple languages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• More options for those living in mobile homes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 18: San Bernadino</td>
<td>• Swamp cooler limitations and ineligibility</td>
<td>• Allow option to trade out Swamp Coolers; eliminate 10year rule</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Renters cannot authorize needed upgrades</td>
<td>• Create a split incentive with rent control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## SB 350 Stakeholder Community Meeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Stakeholder Meetings</th>
<th>Asian Pacific Environmental Network</th>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>August 19: Oakland</td>
<td>• Language barriers</td>
<td>• In instead of printing info/post on website</td>
<td>• Count economic unit not just household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Combined family incomes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 24: Los Angeles</td>
<td>• Lack of information and education</td>
<td>• Create toolkits</td>
<td>• Deploy/demonstration projects in DAC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Unclear metrics for success</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Energy education, benefits for conservation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Asian Pacific Environmental Network meetings
- **August 19: Oakland**
  - Language barriers
  - Combined family incomes

- **August 24: Los Angeles**
  - Lack of information and education
  - Unclear metrics for success
# SB 350 Stakeholder Community Meeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Stakeholder Meetings</th>
<th>Sierra CAMP/Sierra Business Council</th>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **August 22:** South Lake Tahoe/Sierra Mountain Region | | - Limited definition of renewables = limited funding  
- Non-inclusive definition of DAC | - Consider forest waste as a renewable source of energy  
- Future programs should consider income, access and seasonal energy demands |
| **August 31:** Redwood Valley Northern Circle Indian Housing Authority | | - Income eligible but homes are not  
- Working poor challenge  
- Lack of Collaboration | - Funding set aside for tribal DAC  
- Increase the income eligibility amount  
- Create one stop shopping |
BARRIERS AND SOLUTIONS: ENERGY EFFICIENCY AND RENEWABLE ENERGY

Jordan Scavo
Bill Pennington
Structure of the Study

• Chapter 1-Introduction & methodology
• Chapter 2-Program descriptions
• Chapter 3-Barriers to efficiency and renewables
• Chapter 4-Potential solutions for efficiency and renewables
• Chapter 5-Small business contracting
Types of Barriers

- Structural & Financial Barriers
- Community Access Barriers
- Policy and Program Barriers
Financial and Other Structural cont’d

- Building age
- Low homeownership rate
- Lack of capital, lack of credit

California Low-Income Housing

- Single-Family Homes: 6
- Multifamily Housing: 51
- Mobile Homes: 43

Source: Evergreen Economics, 2013b
Multifamily Housing
Structural Barriers

• Metering: Master-meter vs submetered
• Common areas vs tenant spaces
• Diverse building characteristics
• Budgeting processes
• Lack of information
Community Access Barriers

• Outreach
• Education
• Transaction costs
Policies and Program Barriers

- Program reach limitations
- Barriers to collaboration
- Tax Credits
- Rate setting and regulatory challenges
- Insecure or inadequate program funding
- Data limitations
- Unrecognized non-energy benefits
Potential Solutions for Financial & Other Structural Barriers

Direct Government Investment
- Direct install programs
- Tax credits
- Direct loans

Encourage Private Capital
- Loan-Loss Reserve
- Subsidies
Leveraging Private Capital

California Low-Income Homeownership Status

- 64% Own
- 33% Rent
- 3% Other

Financing Mechanisms
- Owners: PACE, PPAs, leases
- Renters: On-bill PAYS

Source: Evergreen Economics, 2013b
Target Renters and Hard-to Reach Customers

- Address split incentives
- Encourage community solar
- Target multifamily housing
Potential Solutions for Community Access Barriers

- Framing
- Community responsive marketing
- Points of contact
Potential Solutions for Policy and Program Barriers

- Establish consistent eligibility criteria
- Improve understanding of community needs
- Choose effective program administration
- Make programs easier to use
Potential Solutions for Policy and Program Barriers

- Integrate programs and services
- Improve coordination across programs
- Re-institute tax credits for clean energy
- Consider modifications to CARE to promote efficiency or renewables
Potential Solutions for Policy and Program Barriers

- Provide consistent and adequate program funding
- Implement data recommendations from Existing Buildings Energy Efficiency Action Plan
- Incorporate non-energy benefits in cost-effectiveness tests
BARRIERS AND SOLUTIONS: SMALL BUSINESS CONTRACTING OPPORTUNITIES

ESTEBAN GUERRERO
Process for Contracting Chapter

Input from experts
• Diverse small businesses, environmental justice & equity community, academia
• State agencies/departments

Scarce literature
Contracting Barriers – Lack of Access to Information

• ... about existing bids

• ... about funding and funding criteria

• ... on small businesses in low-income and disadvantaged communities

• Insufficient focused outreach
Contracting Barriers – Technical Assistance and Workforce Needs

• Solicitation process

• Specialization issues

• Workforce recruitment and retention
Contracting Barriers – Financial Obstacles & Other Concerns

- Cost structure
- Self-financing
- Insufficient private funding available
- Pattern of winning ↔ pattern of discouragement
- Need for tighter controls around 25% target
Contracting - Potential Solutions

- Follow-up data collection and analysis

- An overarching small-business supply chain strategy

- Partnerships with Community-Based Organizations to provide information and train local workforce
  - CBOs have built community trust, and
  - CBOs are dedicated to skills development for community progress
Contracting - Potential Solutions (cont’d)

- Alternative funding strategies and tracking metrics
  - Track grants to small businesses
  - Take lessons learned from successful programs and policies, e.g., CPUC’s General Order 156

- Greater coordination among state agencies/departments

- Special focus on increasing access to information and contracting opportunities
Contracting - Potential Solutions (cont’d)

• Support clean-energy job placement & workforce development
  – Collaborate with Labor & Workforce Development Agency, the Workforce Development Board, and the Employment Development Department
  – Roadmap with recommendations to improve clean energy workforce and job placement policies
Guiding Questions

- Are there any important barriers that are not identified in the draft study?

- Are there any important solutions that are not identified in the draft study?

- What would you identify as high-priority recommendations the final study should include to address these barriers?

*Please be as specific as possible and include relevant details, such as suggested funding amounts and proposed schedule.*
Public Comments

We will start with comments in the room, and then open up for comments from those participating via WebEx

• In the room - Submit a blue card with your name and question. We will call you to the microphone in the order comments were received.

• WebEx – Type your question into the ‘chat’ function and we will unmute you to ask your question once it is your turn.

• Please keep comments to under 5 minutes each.
Written Comments

- Written comments on the draft report are due Thursday September 29 by 4:00 p.m.

- E-comments can be submitted at the following link: https://efiling.energy.ca.gov/Ecomment/Ecomment.aspx?docketnumber=16-OIR-02

- Please focus on specific recommendations for the study when framing your written comments.
More Information:
www.energy.ca.gov/sb350/barriers_report/index.html

Please contact the Public Adviser, Alana Mathews
Amathews@energy.ca.gov
916.654.4489