

DOCKETED

Docket Number:	15-AFC-01
Project Title:	Puente Power Project
TN #:	216897
Document Title:	Protocols for Surveying and Evaluating Impacts to Special Status Native Plant Populations and Natural Communities
Description:	N/A
Filer:	Marichka Haws
Organization:	California Energy Commission
Submitter Role:	Commission Staff
Submission Date:	4/7/2017 3:42:29 PM
Docketed Date:	4/7/2017

Protocols for Surveying and Evaluating Impacts to Special Status Native Plant Populations and Natural Communities

State of California
CALIFORNIA NATURAL RESOURCES AGENCY
Department of Fish and Game
November 24, 2009¹

INTRODUCTION AND PURPOSE

The conservation of special status native plants and their habitats, as well as natural communities, is integral to maintaining biological diversity. The purpose of these protocols is to facilitate a consistent and systematic approach to the survey and assessment of special status native plants and natural communities so that reliable information is produced and the potential of locating a special status plant species or natural community is maximized. They may also help those who prepare and review environmental documents determine when a botanical survey is needed, how field surveys may be conducted, what information to include in a survey report, and what qualifications to consider for surveyors. The protocols may help avoid delays caused when inadequate biological information is provided during the environmental review process; assist lead, trustee and responsible reviewing agencies to make an informed decision regarding the direct, indirect, and cumulative effects of a proposed development, activity, or action on special status native plants and natural communities; meet California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)² requirements for adequate disclosure of potential impacts; and conserve public trust resources.

DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND GAME TRUSTEE AND RESPONSIBLE AGENCY MISSION

The mission of the Department of Fish and Game (DFG) is to manage California's diverse wildlife and native plant resources, and the habitats upon which they depend, for their ecological values and for their use and enjoyment by the public. DFG has jurisdiction over the conservation, protection, and management of wildlife, native plants, and habitat necessary to maintain biologically sustainable populations (Fish and Game Code §1802). DFG, as trustee agency under CEQA §15386, provides expertise in reviewing and commenting on environmental documents and makes protocols regarding potential negative impacts to those resources held in trust for the people of California.

Certain species are in danger of extinction because their habitats have been severely reduced in acreage, are threatened with destruction or adverse modification, or because of a combination of these and other factors. The California Endangered Species Act (CESA) provides additional protections for such species, including take prohibitions (Fish and Game Code §2050 *et seq.*). As a responsible agency, DFG has the authority to issue permits for the take of species listed under CESA if the take is incidental to an otherwise lawful activity; DFG has determined that the impacts of the take have been minimized and fully mitigated; and, the take would not jeopardize the continued existence of the species (Fish and Game Code §2081). Surveys are one of the preliminary steps to detect a listed or special status plant species or natural community that may be impacted significantly by a project.

DEFINITIONS

Botanical surveys provide information used to determine the potential environmental effects of proposed projects on all special status plants and natural communities as required by law (i.e., CEQA, CESA, and Federal Endangered Species Act (ESA)). Some key terms in this document appear in **bold font** for assistance in use of the document.

For the purposes of this document, **special status plants** include all plant species that meet one or more of the following criteria³:

¹ This document replaces the DFG document entitled "Guidelines for Assessing the Effects of Proposed Projects on Rare, Threatened and Endangered Plants and Natural Communities."

² <http://ceres.ca.gov/ceqa/>

³ Adapted from the East Alameda County Conservation Strategy available at http://www.fws.gov/sacramento/EACCS/Documents/080228_Species_Evaluation_EACCS.pdf

- Listed or proposed for listing as threatened or endangered under ESA or candidates for possible future listing as threatened or endangered under the ESA (50 CFR §17.12).
- Listed⁴ or candidates for listing by the State of California as threatened or endangered under CESA (Fish and Game Code §2050 *et seq.*). A species, subspecies, or variety of plant is **endangered** when the prospects of its survival and reproduction in the wild are in immediate jeopardy from one or more causes, including loss of habitat, change in habitat, over-exploitation, predation, competition, disease, or other factors (Fish and Game Code §2062). A plant is **threatened** when it is likely to become endangered in the foreseeable future in the absence of special protection and management measures (Fish and Game Code §2067).
- Listed as rare under the California Native Plant Protection Act (Fish and Game Code §1900 *et seq.*). A plant is **rare** when, although not presently threatened with extinction, the species, subspecies, or variety is found in such small numbers throughout its range that it may be endangered if its environment worsens (Fish and Game Code §1901).
- Meet the definition of rare or endangered under CEQA §15380(b) and (d). Species that may meet the definition of rare or endangered include the following:
 - ♦ Species considered by the California Native Plant Society (CNPS) to be “rare, threatened or endangered in California” (Lists 1A, 1B and 2);
 - ♦ Species that may warrant consideration on the basis of local significance or recent biological information⁵;
 - ♦ Some species included on the California Natural Diversity Database’s (CNDDB) *Special Plants, Bryophytes, and Lichens List* (California Department of Fish and Game 2008)⁶.
- Considered a **locally significant species**, that is, a species that is not rare from a statewide perspective but is rare or uncommon in a local context such as within a county or region (CEQA §15125 (c)) or is so designated in local or regional plans, policies, or ordinances (CEQA Guidelines, Appendix G). Examples include a species at the outer limits of its known range or a species occurring on an uncommon soil type.

Special status natural communities are communities that are of limited distribution statewide or within a county or region and are often vulnerable to environmental effects of projects. These communities may or may not contain special status species or their habitat. The most current version of the Department’s *List of California Terrestrial Natural Communities*⁷ indicates which natural communities are of special status given the current state of the California classification.

Most types of wetlands and riparian communities are considered special status natural communities due to their limited distribution in California. These natural communities often contain special status plants such as those described above. These protocols may be used in conjunction with protocols formulated by other agencies, for example, those developed by the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers to delineate jurisdictional wetlands⁸ or by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to survey for the presence of special status plants⁹.

⁴ Refer to current online published lists available at: <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata>.

⁵ In general, CNPS List 3 plants (plants about which more information is needed) and List 4 plants (plants of limited distribution) may not warrant consideration under CEQA §15380. These plants may be included on special status plant lists such as those developed by counties where they would be addressed under CEQA §15380. List 3 plants may be analyzed under CEQA §15380 if sufficient information is available to assess potential impacts to such plants. Factors such as regional rarity vs. statewide rarity should be considered in determining whether cumulative impacts to a List 4 plant are significant even if individual project impacts are not. List 3 and 4 plants are also included in the California Natural Diversity Database’s (CNDDB) *Special Plants, Bryophytes, and Lichens List*. [Refer to the current online published list available at: <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata>.] Data on Lists 3 and 4 plants should be submitted to CNDDB. Such data aids in determining or revising priority ranking.

⁶ Refer to current online published lists available at: <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata>.

⁷ <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata/vegcamp/pdfs/natcomlist.pdf>. The rare natural communities are asterisked on this list.

⁸ <http://www.wetlands.com/regs/tpge02e.htm>

⁹ U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Survey Guidelines available at <http://www.fws.gov/sacramento/es/protocol.htm>

BOTANICAL SURVEYS

Conduct botanical surveys prior to the commencement of any activities that may modify vegetation, such as clearing, mowing, or ground-breaking activities. It is appropriate to conduct a botanical field survey when:

- Natural (or naturalized) vegetation occurs on the site, and it is unknown if special status plant species or natural communities occur on the site, and the project has the potential for direct or indirect effects on vegetation; or
- Special status plants or natural communities have historically been identified on the project site; or
- Special status plants or natural communities occur on sites with similar physical and biological properties as the project site.

SURVEY OBJECTIVES

Conduct field surveys in a manner which maximizes the likelihood of locating special status plant species or special status natural communities that may be present. Surveys should be **floristic in nature**, meaning that every plant taxon that occurs on site is identified to the taxonomic level necessary to determine rarity and listing status. "Focused surveys" that are limited to habitats known to support special status species or are restricted to lists of likely potential species are not considered floristic in nature and are not adequate to identify all plant taxa on site to the level necessary to determine rarity and listing status. Include a list of plants and natural communities detected on the site for each botanical survey conducted. More than one field visit may be necessary to adequately capture the floristic diversity of a site. An indication of the prevalence (estimated total numbers, percent cover, density, etc.) of the species and communities on the site is also useful to assess the significance of a particular population.

SURVEY PREPARATION

Before field surveys are conducted, compile relevant botanical information in the general project area to provide a regional context for the investigators. Consult the CNDDDB¹⁰ and BIOS¹¹ for known occurrences of special status plants and natural communities in the project area prior to field surveys. Generally, identify vegetation and habitat types potentially occurring in the project area based on biological and physical properties of the site and surrounding ecoregion¹², unless a larger assessment area is appropriate. Then, develop a list of special status plants with the potential to occur within these vegetation types. This list can serve as a tool for the investigators and facilitate the use of reference sites; however, special status plants on site might not be limited to those on the list. Field surveys and subsequent reporting should be comprehensive and floristic in nature and not restricted to or focused only on this list. Include in the survey report the list of potential special status species and natural communities, and the list of references used to compile the background botanical information for the site.

SURVEY EXTENT

Surveys should be comprehensive over the entire site, including areas that will be directly or indirectly impacted by the project. Adjoining properties should also be surveyed where direct or indirect project effects, such as those from fuel modification or herbicide application, could potentially extend offsite. Pre-project surveys restricted to known CNDDDB rare plant locations may not identify all special status plants and communities present and do not provide a sufficient level of information to determine potential impacts.

FIELD SURVEY METHOD

Conduct surveys using **systematic field techniques** in all habitats of the site to ensure thorough coverage of potential impact areas. The level of effort required per given area and habitat is dependent upon the vegetation and its overall diversity and structural complexity, which determines the distance at which plants can be identified. Conduct surveys by walking over the entire site to ensure thorough coverage, noting all plant taxa

¹⁰ Available at <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata/cnddb>

¹¹ <http://www.bios.dfg.ca.gov/>

¹² Ecological Subregions of California, available at <http://www.fs.fed.us/r5/projects/ecoregions/toc.htm>

observed. The level of effort should be sufficient to provide comprehensive reporting. For example, one person-hour per eight acres per survey date is needed for a comprehensive field survey in grassland with medium diversity and moderate terrain¹³, with additional time allocated for species identification.

TIMING AND NUMBER OF VISITS

Conduct surveys in the field at the time of year when species are both evident and identifiable. Usually this is during flowering or fruiting. Space visits throughout the growing season to accurately determine what plants exist on site. Many times this may involve multiple visits to the same site (e.g. in early, mid, and late-season for flowering plants) to capture the floristic diversity at a level necessary to determine if special status plants are present¹⁴. The timing and number of visits are determined by geographic location, the natural communities present, and the weather patterns of the year(s) in which the surveys are conducted.

REFERENCE SITES

When special status plants are known to occur in the type(s) of habitat present in the project area, observe reference sites (nearby accessible occurrences of the plants) to determine whether those species are identifiable at the time of the survey and to obtain a visual image of the target species, associated habitat, and associated natural community.

USE OF EXISTING SURVEYS

For some sites, floristic inventories or special status plant surveys may already exist. Additional surveys may be necessary for the following reasons:

- Surveys are not current¹⁵; or
- Surveys were conducted in natural systems that commonly experience year to year fluctuations such as periods of drought or flooding (e.g. vernal pool habitats or riverine systems); or
- Surveys are not comprehensive in nature; or fire history, land use, physical conditions of the site, or climatic conditions have changed since the last survey was conducted¹⁶; or
- Surveys were conducted in natural systems where special status plants may not be observed if an annual above ground phase is not visible (e.g. flowers from a bulb); or
- Changes in vegetation or species distribution may have occurred since the last survey was conducted, due to habitat alteration, fluctuations in species abundance and/or seed bank dynamics.

NEGATIVE SURVEYS

Adverse conditions may prevent investigators from determining the presence of, or accurately identifying, some species in potential habitat of target species. Disease, drought, predation, or herbivory may preclude the presence or identification of target species in any given year. Discuss such conditions in the report.

The failure to locate a known special status plant occurrence during one field season does not constitute evidence that this plant occurrence no longer exists at this location, particularly if adverse conditions are present. For example, surveys over a number of years may be necessary if the species is an annual plant having a persistent, long-lived seed bank and is known not to germinate every year. Visits to the site in more

¹³ Adapted from U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service kit fox survey guidelines available at www.fws.gov/sacramento/es/documents/kitfox_no_protocol.pdf

¹⁴ U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Survey Guidelines available at <http://www.fws.gov/sacramento/es/protocol.htm>

¹⁵ Habitats, such as grasslands or desert plant communities that have annual and short-lived perennial plants as major floristic components may require yearly surveys to accurately document baseline conditions for purposes of impact assessment. In forested areas, however, surveys at intervals of five years may adequately represent current conditions. For forested areas, refer to "Guidelines for Conservation of Sensitive Plant Resources Within the Timber Harvest Review Process and During Timber Harvesting Operations", available at <https://r1.dfg.ca.gov/portal/Portals/12/THPBotanicalGuidelinesJuly2005.pdf>

¹⁶ U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Survey Guidelines available at http://www.fws.gov/ventura/speciesinfo/protocols_guidelines/docs/botanicalinventories.pdf

than one year increase the likelihood of detection of a special status plant especially if conditions change. To further substantiate negative findings for a known occurrence, a visit to a nearby reference site may ensure that the timing of the survey was appropriate.

REPORTING AND DATA COLLECTION

Adequate information about special status plants and natural communities present in a project area will enable reviewing agencies and the public to effectively assess potential impacts to special status plants or natural communities¹⁷ and will guide the development of minimization and mitigation measures. The next section describes necessary information to assess impacts. For comprehensive, systematic surveys where no special status species or natural communities were found, reporting and data collection responsibilities for investigators remain as described below, excluding specific occurrence information.

SPECIAL STATUS PLANT OR NATURAL COMMUNITY OBSERVATIONS

Record the following information for locations of each special status plant or natural community detected during a field survey of a project site.

- A detailed map (1:24,000 or larger) showing locations and boundaries of each special status species occurrence or natural community found as related to the proposed project. Mark occurrences and boundaries as accurately as possible. Locations documented by use of global positioning system (GPS) coordinates must include the datum¹⁸ in which they were collected;
- The site-specific characteristics of occurrences, such as associated species, habitat and microhabitat, structure of vegetation, topographic features, soil type, texture, and soil parent material. If the species is associated with a wetland, provide a description of the direction of flow and integrity of surface or subsurface hydrology and adjacent off-site hydrological influences as appropriate;
- The number of individuals in each special status plant population as counted (if population is small) or estimated (if population is large);
- If applicable, information about the percentage of individuals in each life stage such as seedlings vs. reproductive individuals;
- The number of individuals of the species per unit area, identifying areas of relatively high, medium and low density of the species over the project site; and
- Digital images of the target species and representative habitats to support information and descriptions.

FIELD SURVEY FORMS

When a special status plant or natural community is located, complete and submit to the CNDDDB a California Native Species (or Community) Field Survey Form¹⁹ or equivalent written report, accompanied by a copy of the relevant portion of a 7.5 minute topographic map with the occurrence mapped. Present locations documented by use of GPS coordinates in map and digital form. Data submitted in digital form must include the datum²⁰ in which it was collected. If a potentially undescribed special status natural community is found on the site, document it with a Rapid Assessment or Relevé form²¹ and submit it with the CNDDDB form.

VOUCHER COLLECTION

Voucher specimens provide verifiable documentation of species presence and identification as well as a public record of conditions. This information is vital to all conservation efforts. Collection of voucher specimens should

¹⁷ Refer to current online published lists available at: <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata>. For Timber Harvest Plans (THPs) please refer to the "Guidelines for Conservation of Sensitive Plant Resources Within the Timber Harvest Review Process and During Timber Harvesting Operations", available at <https://r1.dfg.ca.gov/portal/Portals/12/THPBotanicalGuidelinesJuly2005.pdf>

¹⁸ NAD83, NAD27 or WGS84

¹⁹ <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata>

²⁰ NAD83, NAD27 or WGS84

²¹ http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata/vegcamp/veg_publications_protocols.asp

be conducted in a manner that is consistent with conservation ethics, and is in accordance with applicable state and federal permit requirements (e.g. incidental take permit, scientific collection permit). Voucher collections of special status species (or suspected special status species) should be made only when such actions would not jeopardize the continued existence of the population or species.

Deposit voucher specimens with an indexed regional herbarium²² no later than 60 days after the collections have been made. Digital imagery can be used to supplement plant identification and document habitat. Record all relevant permittee names and permit numbers on specimen labels. A collecting permit is required prior to the collection of State-listed plant species²³.

BOTANICAL SURVEY REPORTS

Include reports of botanical field surveys containing the following information with project environmental documents:

- **Project and site description**

- ♦ A description of the proposed project;
- ♦ A detailed map of the project location and study area that identifies topographic and landscape features and includes a north arrow and bar scale; and,
- ♦ A written description of the biological setting, including vegetation²⁴ and structure of the vegetation; geological and hydrological characteristics; and land use or management history.

- **Detailed description of survey methodology and results**

- ♦ Dates of field surveys (indicating which areas were surveyed on which dates), name of field investigator(s), and total person-hours spent on field surveys;
- ♦ A discussion of how the timing of the surveys affects the comprehensiveness of the survey;
- ♦ A list of potential special status species or natural communities;
- ♦ A description of the area surveyed relative to the project area;
- ♦ References cited, persons contacted, and herbaria visited;
- ♦ Description of reference site(s), if visited, and phenological development of special status plant(s);
- ♦ A list of all taxa occurring on the project site. Identify plants to the taxonomic level necessary to determine whether or not they are a special status species;
- ♦ Any use of existing surveys and a discussion of applicability to this project;
- ♦ A discussion of the potential for a false negative survey;
- ♦ Provide detailed data and maps for all special plants detected. Information specified above under the headings "Special Status Plant or Natural Community Observations," and "Field Survey Forms," should be provided for locations of each special status plant detected;
- ♦ Copies of all California Native Species Field Survey Forms or Natural Community Field Survey Forms should be sent to the CNDDDB and included in the environmental document as an Appendix. It is not necessary to submit entire environmental documents to the CNDDDB; and,
- ♦ The location of voucher specimens, if collected.

²² For a complete list of indexed herbaria, see: Holmgren, P., N. Holmgren and L. Barnett. 1990. Index Herbariorum, Part 1: Herbaria of the World. New York Botanic Garden, Bronx, New York. 693 pp. Or: <http://www.nybg.org/bsci/ih/ih.html>

²³ Refer to current online published lists available at: <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/biogeodata>.

²⁴ A vegetation map that uses the National Vegetation Classification System (<http://biology.usgs.gov/npsveg/nvcs.html>), for example *A Manual of California Vegetation*, and highlights any special status natural communities. If another vegetation classification system is used, the report should reference the system, provide the reason for its use, and provide a crosswalk to the National Vegetation Classification System.

- **Assessment of potential impacts**

- ♦ A discussion of the significance of special status plant populations in the project area considering nearby populations and total species distribution;
- ♦ A discussion of the significance of special status natural communities in the project area considering nearby occurrences and natural community distribution;
- ♦ A discussion of direct, indirect, and cumulative impacts to the plants and natural communities;
- ♦ A discussion of threats, including those from invasive species, to the plants and natural communities;
- ♦ A discussion of the degree of impact, if any, of the proposed project on unoccupied, potential habitat of the species;
- ♦ A discussion of the immediacy of potential impacts; and,
- ♦ Recommended measures to avoid, minimize, or mitigate impacts.

QUALIFICATIONS

Botanical consultants should possess the following qualifications:

- Knowledge of plant taxonomy and natural community ecology;
- Familiarity with the plants of the area, including special status species;
- Familiarity with natural communities of the area, including special status natural communities;
- Experience conducting floristic field surveys or experience with floristic surveys conducted under the direction of an experienced surveyor;
- Familiarity with the appropriate state and federal statutes related to plants and plant collecting; and,
- Experience with analyzing impacts of development on native plant species and natural communities.

SUGGESTED REFERENCES

- Barbour, M., T. Keeler-Wolf, and A. A. Schoenherr (eds.). 2007. Terrestrial vegetation of California (3rd Edition). University of California Press.
- Bonham, C.D. 1988. Measurements for terrestrial vegetation. John Wiley and Sons, Inc., New York, NY.
- California Native Plant Society. Most recent version. Inventory of rare and endangered plants (online edition). California Native Plant Society, Sacramento, CA. Online URL <http://www.cnps.org/inventory>.
- California Natural Diversity Database. Most recent version. Special vascular plants, bryophytes and lichens list. Updated quarterly. Available at www.dfg.ca.gov.
- Elzinga, C.L., D.W. Salzer, and J. Willoughby. 1998. Measuring and monitoring plant populations. BLM Technical Reference 1730-1. U.S. Dept. of the Interior, Bureau of Land Management, Denver, Colorado.
- Leppig, G. and J.W. White. 2006. Conservation of peripheral plant populations in California. *Madroño* 53:264-274.
- Mueller-Dombois, D. and H. Ellenberg. 1974. Aims and methods of vegetation ecology. John Wiley and Sons, Inc., New York, NY.
- U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 1996. Guidelines for conducting and reporting botanical inventories for federally listed plants on the Santa Rosa Plain. Sacramento, CA.
- U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 1996. Guidelines for conducting and reporting botanical inventories for federally listed, proposed and candidate plants. Sacramento, CA.
- Van der Maarel, E. 2005. Vegetation Ecology. Blackwell Science Ltd., Malden, MA.